EXECUTIVE SUMMARY - ENFORCEMENT MATTER

Page 1 of 2

DOCKET NO.: 2008-1701-AIR-E TCEQ ID: RN105088629 CASE NO.: 36726

RESPONDENT NAME: Permian Enterprises, Ltd.

ORDER TYPE:						
X_1660 AGREED ORDER	FINDINGS AGREED ORDER	FINDINGS ORDER FOLLOWING SOAH HEARING				
findings default order	_SHUTDOWN ORDER	_IMMINENT AND SUBSTANTIAL ENDANGERMENT ORDER				
AMENDED ORDER	_EMERGENCY ORDER					
CASE TYPE:						
<u>X</u> AIR	MULTI-MEDIA (check all that apply)	INDUSTRIAL AND HAZARDOUS WASTE				
PUBLIC WATER SUPPLY	PETROLEUM STORAGE TANKS	OCCUPATIONAL CERTIFICATION				
WATER QUALITY	SEWAGE SLUDGE	UNDERGROUND INJECTION CONTROL				
MUNICIPAL SOLID WASTE	RADIOACTIVE WASTE	DRY CLEANER REGISTRATION				
SITE WHERE VIOLATION(S) OCCURRED: Permian Enterprises Pipe Yard, 2900 Sargent, Odessa, Ector County						
TYPE OF OPERATION: Internal pipe coa	ting company					
SMALL BUSINESS: Yes X	_No					
OTHER SIGNIFICANT MATTERS: There are no complaints. There is no record of additional pending enforcement actions regarding this facility location.						
INTERESTED PARTIES: No one other than the ED and the Respondent has expressed an interest in this matter.						
COMMENTS RECEIVED: The Texas Register comment period expired on February 16, 2009. No comments were received.						
CONTACTS AND MAILING LIST: TCEQ Attorney/SEP Coordinator: None TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Mr. John Muennink, Enforcement Division, Enforcement Team 5, MC R-14, (361) 825-3423; Ms. Cari-Michel La Caille, Enforcement Division, MC 219, (512) 239-1387 Respondent: Mr. Raymond Marrero, Director of Operations, Permian Enterprises, Ltd., 2121 West Murphy Street, Odessa, Texas 79763 Mr. Donald E. Wood, President, Permian Enterprises GP LLC, and General Partner, Permian Enterprises, Ltd., 2121 West Murphy Street, Odessa, Texas 79763 Respondent's Attorney: Not represented by counsel on this enforcement matter						

RESPONDENT NAME: Permian Enterprises, Ltd.

DOCKET NO.: 2008-1701-AIR-E

VIOLATION SUMMARY CHART:					
VIOLATION INFORMATION	PENALTY CONSIDERATIONS	CORRECTIVE ACTIONS TAKEN/REQUIRED			
Type of Investigation: Complaint Routine Enforcement Follow-up	Total Assessed: \$1,000 Total Deferred: \$200 X Expedited Settlement	Ordering Provisions: The Order will require the Respondent to:			
Records Review Date(s) of Complaints Relating to this Case: None	Financial Inability to Pay SEP Conditional Offset: \$0	a. Within 30 days after the effective date of this Agreed Order, obtain authorization to operate a heat cleaning and surface coating operation; and			
Date of Investigation Relating to this Case: October 2, 2008 Date of NOV/NOE Relating to this Case: October 24, 2008 (NOE)	Total Paid to General Revenue: \$800 Site Compliance History Classification High X Average Poor	b. Within 45 days after the date of this Agreed Order, submit written certification to demonstrate compliance with Ordering Provision a.			
Background Facts: This was a routine investigation.	Person Compliance History Classification High X Average Poor				
AIR Failure to obtain authorization prior to	Major Source: Yes X No Applicable Penalty Policy: September 2002	and the second of the second o			
operating a heat cleaning and surface coating operation. Specifically, during the investigation conducted on October 2, 2008, TCEQ investigators documented that					
the Respondent failed to obtain authorization for operations being conducted at the site [30 Tex. ADMIN. CODE §§ 116.110(a), 106.433, and 106.495 and Tex. Health & Safety Code					
\$\\$ 382.0518(a) and 382.085(b)].					

Additional ID No(s).: N/A

Penalty Calculat	ion Worksheet (PCW)
TCEO	FOW Revision June 12, 2000
DATES Assigned 27-Oct-2008 PCW 28-Oct-2008 Screening 28-Oct-2008	08 EPA Due
RESPONDENT/FACILITY INFORMATION	
Respondent Permian Enterprises, Ltd.	
Reg. Ent. Ref. No. RN105088629 Facility/Site Region 7-Midland	Major/Minor Source Minor
Facility Site Region 17-initiality	majornamor Socice Namor
CASE INFORMATION	
Enf./Case ID No. 36726	No. of Violations 1
Docket No. 2008-1701-AIR-E	Order Type 1660
Media Program(s) Air Multi-Media	Government/Non-Profit No Enf. Coordinator John Muennink
Multi-Media	EC's Team Enforcement Team 5
Admin. Penalty \$ Limit Minimum \$0 Maximum	\$10,000
Penalty Calcu	ulation Section
TOTAL BASE PENALTY (Sum of violation base pena	Ities) Subtotal 1 \$1,000
ADJUSTMENTS (+/-) TO SUBTOTAL 1	
Subtotals 2-7 are obtained by multiplying the Total Base Penalty (Subtotal	
Compliance History 0.	0% Enhancement Subtotals 2, 3, & 7 \$0
Notes No enhancement due to an averag	e performer classification.
Culpability No 0.	0% Enhancement Subtotal 4 \$0
Culpability No 0.	0% Ennancement Subtotal 4
Notes The Respondent does not mee	t the culpability criteria.
Good Faith Effort to Comply Total Adjustments	Subtotal 5 \$0
	0% Enhancement* Subtotal 6 \$0 sped at the Total EB \$ Amount
Approx. Cost of Compliance \$3,000	
SUM OF SUBTOTALS 1-7	Final Subtotal \$1,000
OTHER FACTORS AS JUSTICE MAY REQUIRE Reduces or enhances the Final Subtotal by the indicated percentage.	0.0% Adjustment \$0
Notes	
	Final Penalty Amount \$1,000
STATUTORY LIMIT ADJUSTMENT	Final Assessed Penalty \$1,000
DEFENDAL STATE OF THE STATE OF	20.0% Reduction Adjustment -\$200
DEFERRAL Reduces the Final Assessed Penalty by the indicted percentage. (Enter number only	MCRA TO TO THE RESERVE AS
Notes Deferral offered for expen	dited settlement.
PAYABLE PENALTY	\$800

	Screen	ing Date 28-Oct-2008 Docket No. 2008-1701-AIR-E			PCV
		pondent Permian Enterprises, Ltd.	Policy R	Revision 2 (Septe	ember 20
		se ID No. 36726	. P	CW Revision Ju	une 12, 2
g. Ei		ence No. RN105088629	and the second	Fig.	
		[Statute] Air	1.00		
	Ent. Coc	ordinator John Muennink	* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *		
	1	Compliance History Worksheet	ili. Biling a standardayada		
		Site Enhancement (Subtotal 2) Number of	Enter Number Here	Adjust.	
	NOVs	Written NOVs with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (number of NOVs meeting criteria)	0	70%3A	
		Other written NOVs	0	0%	
		Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (number of orders meeting criteria)	0	0%	
	Orders	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	A. 1700	0%	
	udgments d Consent	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (number of judgements or consent decrees meeting criteria)	0	0%	
1	d Consent Decrees	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%	
		Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (number of counts)	0	0%	
E	missions	Chronic excessive emissions events (number of events)	0	0%	
	Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which notices were submitted)		0%	
		Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which violations were disclosed)	0	0%	
		Plea	se Enter Yes or No		
		Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%	
ľ	Other	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%	
: 63		Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%	
		Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%	
		Adjustment P	ercentage (Si	ubtotal 2)	09
eat Vi	iolator (Su			, ,	
	No	Adjustment P	ercentage (Si	ubtotal 3) [0%
nplian	ce History	Person Classification (Subtotal 7)			

>> Compliance History Summary

Compliance History No enhancement due to an average performer classification.

Total Adjustment Percentage (Subtotals 2, 3, & 7)

Screening	Date 28-Oct-2008	Docket No. 2008-1701-AIR-E	PCW .
Respor	ndent Permian Enterp	rises, Ltd. Policy	Revision 2 (September 2002)
Case II	D No. 36726		PCW Revision June 12, 2008
Reg. Ent. Referenc		•	
Media [Sta			
	nator John Muennink	·	
Violation N	umber 1		₹
Rule	Cite(s) 30 Tex. Admin.	Code §§ 116.110(a), 106.433 and 106.495, Tex. Health & Safety Code § 382.0518(a) and 382.085(b)	§
Violation Desc	rintion operation. Sp	ain authorization prior to operating a heat cleaning and surface coating ecifically, during the investigation conducted on October 2, 2008, TCEQ cumented that the Respondent failed to obtain authorization for operation being conducted at the site.	S
		Base Penalt	y \$10,000
>> Environmental, Prope	rty and Human He		
_	alaasa Maine	Harm	
OR R	elease Major Actual I	Moderate Minor	
F., S	otential	Percent 0%	hrand PMMh
			-
>>Programmatic Matrix Falsific	ation Major	Moderate Minor	Ann Commission and Conference on Conference
Faisiile	cation Major x	Percent 10%	town A development
			Transition of the state of the
Matrix			à cân de men
Notes	The Resp	ondent failed to meet 100% of the rule requirement.	and the state of t
abilitating and		Adjustment \$9,00	o
A 1-W LANGE CONTROL A 1-WARRANT I REPORTED - CONTROL OF CONTROL CONTRO			£1 000
			\$1,000
Violation Events			
× 1			
Numb	er of Violation Events	1 26 Number of violation days	
	daily		
•	monthly		
mark on		X Violation Base Penalt	y \$1,000
with a	Schliehhaar		Arrange en
	annual single event		
		·	
. One qua	arterly event is recommo	ended based on the investigation date of October 2, 2008 to the screening	
ono que	artory ovoricio rocomini	date of October 28, 2008.	
<u>Limina de la companya dela companya dela companya dela companya de la companya d</u>			
Good Faith Efforts to Co	mply	0.0% Reduction	\$0
hida ka		Before NOV NOV to EDPRP/Settlement Offer	
	Extraordinary		
	Ordinary		
	N/A _	X (mark with x)	•
	Notes	The Respondent does not meet the good faith criteria for this	
	/	violation.	
COLUMN TO THE RESERVE OF THE PARTY OF THE PA		Violation Subtota	\$1,000
Economic Benefit (EB) fo	or this violation	Statutory Limit Test	
Es	stimated EB Amount	\$86 Violation Final Penalty Tota	\$1,000
		This violation Final Assessed Penalty (adjusted for limits	\$1,000
		AND ADMINISTRATION OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PROP	The second secon

	E	conomic l	Benefit W	orks	heet		
Respondent	Permian Enterp	orises, Ltd.					
Case ID No.	36726						
Reg. Ent. Reference No.							
Media						T	Years of
Violation No.						Percent Interest	Depreciation
Violation No.						1	.2
						5.0	15
`	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Onetime Costs	EB Amount
Item Description	No commas or \$					7 244.14	
Delayed Costs							
Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.00	\$0	\$0.	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Engineering/construction				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Other (as needed)	\$3,000	2-Oct-2008	30-Apr-2009	0.58	\$86	n/a	\$86
Notes for DELAYED costs Avoided Costs	Required is	s the date of the inv	estigation. Final	Date is th complete	ne estimated date ed.	surface coating ope that corrective meas one-time avoided of	ures will be
Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Supplies/equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Financial Assurance [2]				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs [3]				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Notes for AVOIDED costs							
	ŀ						

Compliance History Report CN602508863 Permian Enterprises, Ltd. Classification: AVERAGE Customer/Respondent/Owner-Operator: Regulated Entity: RN105088629 PERMIAN ENTERPRISES PIPE YARD Classification: AVERAGE BY **DEFAULT** ID Number(s): 2900 SARGENT, ODESSA, TX, 79766 Rating Date: 9/1/2008 Repeat Violator: NO Location: TCEQ Region: REGION 07 - MIDLAND Date Compliance History Prepared: October 28, 2008 Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History: Enforcement October 28, 2003 to October 28, 2008 Compliance Period: TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding this Compliance History John Muennink Phone: (361) 825-3423 Name: Site Compliance History Components 1. Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five year compliance period? 2. Has there been a (known) change in ownership of the site during the compliance period? Nο N/A 3. If Yes, who is the current owner? 4. if Yes, who was/were the prior owner(s)? N/A 5. When did the change(s) in ownership occur? N/A Components (Multimedia) for the Site: Final Enforcement Orders, court judgements, and consent decrees of the state of Texas and the federal government. N/A В. Any criminal convictions of the state of Texas and the federal government. Chronic excessive emissions events. C. N/A D. The approval dates of investigations. (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.) E. Written notices of violations (NOV). (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.) N/A F. Environmental audits. G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs). H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program. l. J. Early compliance.

N/A Sites Outside of Texas N/A

Rating: 2.84

Site Rating: 3.01

en de la compressión de la com

Texas Commission on Environmental Quality



IN THE MATTER OF AN	§	BEFORE THE
ENFORCEMENT ACTION	§	
CONCERNING	§	TEXAS COMMISSION ON
PERMIAN ENTERPRISES, LTD.	§	
RN105088629	§	ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY
	Ū	•

AGREED ORDER DOCKET NO. 2008-1701-AIR-E

I. JURISDICTION AND STIPULATIONS

At its ______ agenda, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("the Commission" or "TCEQ") considered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement action regarding Permian Enterprises, Ltd. ("the Respondent") under the authority of TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE ch. 382 and TEX. WATER CODE ch. 7. The Executive Director of the TCEQ, through the Enforcement Division, and the Respondent appear before the Commission and together stipulate that:

- 1. The Respondent owns and operates an internal pipe coating company at 2900 Sargent in Odessa, Ector County, Texas (the "Plant").
- 2. The Plant consists of one or more sources as defined in TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.003(12).
- 3. The Commission and the Respondent agree that the Commission has jurisdiction to enter this Agreed Order, and that the Respondent is subject to the Commission's jurisdiction.
- 4. The Respondent received notice of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations") on or about October 29, 2008.
- 5. The occurrence of any violation is in dispute and the entry of this Agreed Order shall not constitute an admission by the Respondent of any violation alleged in Section II ("Allegations"), nor of any statute or rule.
- 6. An administrative penalty in the amount of One Thousand Dollars (\$1,000) is assessed by the Commission in settlement of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations"). The Respondent has paid Eight Hundred Dollars (\$800) of the administrative penalty and Two Hundred Dollars (\$200) is deferred contingent upon the Respondent's timely and satisfactory compliance with all

• the terms of this Agreed Order. The deferred amount will be waived upon full compliance with the terms of this Agreed Order. If the Respondent fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with all requirements of this Agreed Order, the Executive Director may require the Respondent to pay all or part of the deferred penalty.

- 7. Any notice and procedures, which might otherwise be authorized or required in this action, are waived in the interest of a more timely resolution of the matter.
- 8. The Executive Director of the TCEQ and the Respondent have agreed on a settlement of the matters alleged in this enforcement action, subject to the approval of the Commission.
- 9. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that the Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Agreed Order.
- 10. This Agreed Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order, whichever is later.
- 11. The provisions of this Agreed Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Agreed Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.

II. ALLEGATIONS

As owner and operator of the Plant, the Respondent is alleged to have failed to obtain authorization prior to operating a heat cleaning and surface coating operation, in violation of 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE §§ 116.110(a), 106.433 and 106.495, TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §§ 382.0518(a) and 382.085(b), as documented during an investigation conducted on October 2, 2008. Specifically, during the investigation conducted on October 2, 2008, TCEQ investigators documented that the Respondent failed to obtain authorization for operations being conducted at the site.

III. DENIALS

The Respondent generally denies each allegation in Section II ("Allegations").

IV. ORDERING PROVISIONS

1. It is, therefore, ordered by the TCEQ that the Respondent pay an administrative penalty as set forth in Section I, Paragraph 6 above. The payment of this administrative penalty and the Respondent's compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order resolve only the allegations in Section II. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective action or penalties for violations which are not raised here. Administrative penalty payments shall be made payable to "TCEQ" and shall be sent with the notation "Re: Permian Enterprises, Ltd., Docket No. 2008-1701-AIR-E" to:

Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214 Texas Commission on Environmental Quality P.O. Box 13088 Austin, Texas 78711-3088

- 2. It is further ordered that the Respondent shall undertake the following technical requirements:
 - a. Within 30 days after the effective date of this Agreed Order, obtain authorization to operate a heat cleaning and surface coating operation, in accordance with 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE §§ 106.433 and 106.495; and
 - b. Within 45 days after the date of this Agreed Order, submit written certification to demonstrate compliance with Ordering Provision No. 2.a.

The certification shall be notarized by a State of Texas Notary Public and contain the following language:

"I certify under penalty of law that I have personally examined and am familiar with the information submitted and all attached documents, and that based on my inquiry of those individuals immediately responsible for obtaining the information, I believe that the submitted information is true, accurate and complete. I am aware that there are significant penalties for submitting false information, including the possibility of fine and imprisonment for knowing violations."

The certification shall be submitted to:

Order Compliance Team
Enforcement Division, MC 149A
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 13087
Austin, Texas 78711-3087

with a copy to:

Air Section, Manager Midland Regional Office Texas Commission on Environmental Quality 3300 North A Street, Building 4, Suite 107 Midland, Texas 79705-5404

- 3. The provisions of this Agreed Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Respondent. The Respondent is ordered to give notice of the Agreed Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Plant operations referenced in this Agreed Order.
- 4. If the Respondent fails to comply with any of the Ordering Provisions in this Agreed Order within the prescribed schedules, and that failure is caused solely by an act of God, war, strike, riot, or other catastrophe, the Respondent's failure to comply is not a violation of this Agreed Order. The Respondent shall have the burden of establishing to the Executive Director's satisfaction that such

•

•

an event has occurred. The Respondent shall notify the Executive Director within seven days after the Respondent becomes aware of a delaying event and shall take all reasonable measures to mitigate and minimize any delay.

- 5. The Executive Director may grant an extension of any deadline in this Agreed Order or in any plan, report, or other document submitted pursuant to this Agreed Order, upon a written and substantiated showing of good cause. All requests for extensions by the Respondent shall be made in writing to the Executive Director. Extensions are not effective until the Respondent receives written approval from the Executive Director. The determination of what constitutes good cause rests solely with the Executive Director.
- 6. This Agreed Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against the Respondent in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the OAG to: (1) enforce the terms of this Agreed Order; or (2) pursue violations of a statute within the Commission's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by the Commission under such a statute.
- 7. This agreement may be executed in multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single original instrument. Any executed signature page to this Agreement may be transmitted by facsimile transmission to the other parties, which shall constitute an original signature for all purposes.
- 8. Under 30 Tex. ADMIN. CODE § 70.10(b), the effective date is the date of hand-delivery of the Order to the Respondent, or three days after the date on which the Commission mails notice of the Order to the Respondent, whichever is earlier. The Chief Clerk shall provide a copy of this Agreed Order to each of the parties.

١ -

SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

For the Commission				r
For the Executive Director		Date	1/9/2009	

I, the undersigned, have read and understand the attached Agreed Order. I am authorized to agree to the attached Agreed Order on behalf of the entity indicated below my signature, and I do agree to the terms and conditions specified therein. I further acknowledge that the TCEQ, in accepting payment for the penalty amount, is materially relying on such representation.

I also understand that failure to comply with the Ordering Provisions, if any, in this order and/or failure to timely pay the penalty amount, may result in:

- A negative impact on compliance history;
- Greater scrutiny of any permit applications submitted;
- Referral of this case to the Attorney General's Office for contempt, injunctive relief, additional penalties, and/or attorney fees, or to a collection agency;
- Increased penalties in any future enforcement actions:
- Automatic referral to the Attorney General's Office of any future enforcement actions; and
- TCEQ seeking other relief as authorized by law.

In addition, any falsification of any compliance documents may result in criminal prosecution.

Name (Printed or typed) Authorized Representative of

Permian Enterprises, Ltd.

President PEGP. LLC
Title General Partner for
Permian Enterprises, Ltd

Instructions: Send the original, signed Agreed Order with penalty payment to the Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section at the address in Section IV, Paragraph 1 of this Agreed Order.

.