

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY - ENFORCEMENT MATTER**

**DOCKET NO.:** 2008-1677-PST-E    **TCEQ ID:** RN104959697    **CASE NO.:** 36697  
**RESPONDENT NAME:** Costco Wholesale Corporation dba Costco Gasoline Station 636

<b>ORDER TYPE:</b>		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 1660 AGREED ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> FINDINGS AGREED ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> FINDINGS ORDER FOLLOWING SOAH HEARING
<input type="checkbox"/> FINDINGS DEFAULT ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> SHUTDOWN ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> IMMINENT AND SUBSTANTIAL ENDANGERMENT ORDER
<input type="checkbox"/> AMENDED ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> EMERGENCY ORDER	
<b>CASE TYPE:</b>		
<input type="checkbox"/> AIR	<input type="checkbox"/> MULTI-MEDIA (check all that apply)	<input type="checkbox"/> INDUSTRIAL AND HAZARDOUS WASTE
<input type="checkbox"/> PUBLIC WATER SUPPLY	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> PETROLEUM STORAGE TANKS	<input type="checkbox"/> OCCUPATIONAL CERTIFICATION
<input type="checkbox"/> WATER QUALITY	<input type="checkbox"/> SEWAGE SLUDGE	<input type="checkbox"/> UNDERGROUND INJECTION CONTROL
<input type="checkbox"/> MUNICIPAL SOLID WASTE	<input type="checkbox"/> RADIOACTIVE WASTE	<input type="checkbox"/> DRY CLEANER REGISTRATION
<p><b>SITE WHERE VIOLATION(S) OCCURRED:</b> Costco Gasoline Station 636, 270 West Highway 67, Duncanville, Dallas County</p> <p><b>TYPE OF OPERATION:</b> Wholesale store with retail sales of gasoline</p> <p><b>SMALL BUSINESS:</b>    <input type="checkbox"/> Yes    <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p><b>OTHER SIGNIFICANT MATTERS:</b> There are no complaints. There is no record of additional pending enforcement actions regarding this facility location.</p> <p><b>INTERESTED PARTIES:</b> No one other than the ED and the Respondent has expressed an interest in this matter.</p> <p><b>COMMENTS RECEIVED:</b> The <i>Texas Register</i> comment period expired on March 2, 2009. No comments were received.</p> <p><b>CONTACTS AND MAILING LIST:</b>  <b>TCEQ Attorney/SEP Coordinator:</b> None  <b>TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator:</b> Mr. Mike Pace, Enforcement Division, Enforcement Team 6, MC R-04, (817) 588-5933; Ms. Cari-Michel La Caille, Enforcement Division, MC 219, (512) 239-1387  <b>Respondent:</b> Mr. Dennis Bock, Compliance Manager, Costco Wholesale Corporation, 999 Lake Drive, Issaquah, Washington 98027  <b>Respondent's Attorney:</b> Not represented by counsel on this enforcement matter</p>		

DOCKET NO.: 2008-1677-PST-E

VIOLATION SUMMARY CHART:		
VIOLATION INFORMATION	PENALTY CONSIDERATIONS	CORRECTIVE ACTIONS TAKEN/REQUIRED
<p><b>Type of Investigation:</b>  <input type="checkbox"/> Complaint  <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Routine  <input type="checkbox"/> Enforcement Follow-up  <input type="checkbox"/> Records Review</p> <p><b>Date(s) of Complaints Relating to this Case:</b> None</p> <p><b>Date of Investigation Relating to this Case:</b> September 23, 2008</p> <p><b>Date of NOV/NOE Relating to this Case:</b> October 16, 2008 (NOE)</p> <p><b>Background Facts:</b> This was a routine investigation.</p> <p><b>WASTE</b></p> <p>Failed to verify proper operation of the Stage II equipment at least once every 12 months or upon major system replacement or modification, whichever occurs first. Specifically, the Stage II annual system compliance testing had not been conducted [30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 115.245(2) and TEX. HEALTH &amp; SAFETY CODE § 382.085(b)].</p>	<p><b>Total Assessed:</b> \$5,601</p> <p><b>Total Deferred:</b> \$1,120  <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Expedited Settlement  <input type="checkbox"/> Financial Inability to Pay</p> <p><b>SEP Conditional Offset:</b> \$0</p> <p><b>Total Paid to General Revenue:</b> \$4,481</p> <p><b>Site Compliance History Classification</b>  <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High <input type="checkbox"/> Average <input type="checkbox"/> Poor</p> <p><b>Person Compliance History Classification</b>  <input type="checkbox"/> High <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Average <input type="checkbox"/> Poor</p> <p><b>Major Source:</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p><b>Applicable Penalty Policy:</b> September 2002</p>	<p><b>Corrective Actions Taken:</b></p> <p>The Executive Director recognizes that the TCEQ DFW Regional Office received documentation on October 27, 2008, verifying that the Respondent successfully conducted the required annual testing of the Stage II equipment.</p>

Additional ID No(s): PST 78225



## Penalty Calculation Worksheet (PCW)

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

PCW Revision October 30, 2008

<b>DATES</b>	Assigned	20-Oct-2008	Screening	21-Oct-2008	EPA Due
	PCW	22-Oct-2008			

<b>RESPONDENT/FACILITY INFORMATION</b>			
Respondent	Costco Wholesale Corporation dba Costco Gasoline Station 636		
Reg. Ent. Ref. No.	RN104959697		
Facility/Site Region	4-Dallas/Fort Worth	Major/Minor Source	Major

<b>CASE INFORMATION</b>			
Enf./Case ID No.	36697	No. of Violations	1
Docket No.	2008-1677-PST-E	Order Type	1660
Media Program(s)	Petroleum Storage Tank	Government/Non-Profit	No
Multi-Media		Enf. Coordinator	Mike Pace
		EC's Team	Enforcement Team 6
Admin. Penalty \$ Limit	Minimum	\$0	Maximum
			\$10,000

### Penalty Calculation Section

**TOTAL BASE PENALTY (Sum of violation base penalties)** **Subtotal 1**

**ADJUSTMENTS (+/-) TO SUBTOTAL 1**

Subtotals 2-7 are obtained by multiplying the Total Base Penalty (Subtotal 1) by the indicated percentage.

**Compliance History**  Enhancement **Subtotals 2, 3, & 7**

Notes

**Culpability**   Enhancement **Subtotal 4**

Notes

**Good Faith Effort to Comply Total Adjustments** **Subtotal 5**

**Economic Benefit**  Enhancement\* **Subtotal 6**

Total EB Amounts	<input type="text" value="\$1,101"/>	<small>*Capped at the Total EB \$ Amount</small>
Approx. Cost of Compliance	<input type="text" value="\$1,000"/>	

**SUM OF SUBTOTALS 1-7** **Final Subtotal**

**OTHER FACTORS AS JUSTICE MAY REQUIRE**  **Adjustment**

Reduces or enhances the Final Subtotal by the indicated percentage.

Notes

**Final Penalty Amount**

**STATUTORY LIMIT ADJUSTMENT** **Final Assessed Penalty**

**DEFERRAL**  Reduction **Adjustment**

Reduces the Final Assessed Penalty by the indicated percentage. (Enter number only, e.g. 20 for 20% reduction.)

Notes

**PAYABLE PENALTY**

Screening Date 21-Oct-2008

Docket No. 2008-1677-PST-E

PCW

Respondent Costco Wholesale Corporation dba Costco Gasoline Stat

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

Case ID No. 36697

PCW Revision October 30, 2008

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN104959697

Media [Statute] Petroleum Storage Tank

Enf. Coordinator Mike Pace

### Compliance History Worksheet

>> Compliance History Site Enhancement (Subtotal 2)

Component	Number of...	Enter Number Here	Adjust.
NOVs	Written NOV's with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (number of NOV's meeting criteria)	0	0%
	Other written NOV's	0	0%
Orders	Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (number of orders meeting criteria)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%
Judgments and Consent Decrees	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (number of judgements or consent decrees meeting criteria)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%
Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (number of counts)	0	0%
Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (number of events)	0	0%
Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which notices were submitted)	0	0%
	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which violations were disclosed)	0	0%
<i>Please Enter Yes or No</i>			
Other	Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%
	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%
	Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%
	Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 2) 0%

>> Repeat Violator (Subtotal 3)

No

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 3) 0%

>> Compliance History Person Classification (Subtotal 7)

Average Performer

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 7) 0%

>> Compliance History Summary

Compliance History Notes

No adjustment due to compliance history.

Total Adjustment Percentage (Subtotals 2, 3, & 7) 0%

**Screening Date** 21-Oct-2008 **Docket No.** 2008-1677-PST-E **PCW**  
**Respondent** Costco Wholesale Corporation dba Costco Gasoline Station 636 *Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)*  
**Case ID No.** 36697 *PCW Revision October 30, 2008*  
**Reg. Ent. Reference No.** RN104959697  
**Media [Statute]** Petroleum Storage Tank  
**Enf. Coordinator** Mike Pace  
**Violation Number**   
**Rule Cite(s)**   
**Violation Description**   
**Base Penalty**

**>> Environmental, Property and Human Health Matrix**

Release	Harm			Percent
	Major	Moderate	Minor	
Actual	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text" value="50%"/>
Potential	<input type="text" value="x"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	

**>> Programmatic Matrix**

Falsification	Major	Moderate	Minor	Percent
<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text" value="0%"/>

**Matrix Notes**

**Adjustment**

**Violation Events**

Number of Violation Events   Number of violation days

mark only one with an x

daily	<input type="text"/>
weekly	<input type="text"/>
monthly	<input type="text"/>
quarterly	<input type="text"/>
semiannual	<input type="text"/>
annual	<input type="text" value="x"/>
single event	<input type="text"/>

**Violation Base Penalty**

**Good Faith Efforts to Comply**

Reduction

	Reduction	
	Before NOV	NOV to EDPRP/Settlement Offer
Extraordinary	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Ordinary	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text" value="x"/>
N/A	<input type="text"/>	(mark with x)

**Notes**

**Violation Subtotal**

**Economic Benefit (EB) for this violation**

**Statutory Limit Test**

**Estimated EB Amount**

**Violation Final Penalty Total**

**This violation Final Assessed Penalty (adjusted for limits)**

## Economic Benefit Worksheet

**Respondent** Costco Wholesale Corporation dba Costco Gasoline Station 636  
**Case ID No.** 36697  
**Reg. Ent. Reference No.** RN104959697  
**Media** Petroleum Storage Tank  
**Violation No.** 1

<b>Percent Interest</b>	<b>Years of Depreciation</b>
5.0	15

Item Description	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Onetime Costs	EB Amount
------------------	-----------	---------------	------------	-----	----------------	---------------	-----------

**Delayed Costs**

Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Engineering/construction				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0

Notes for DELAYED costs

**Avoided Costs**

ANNUALIZE [1] avoided costs before entering item (except for one-time avoided costs)

Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Supplies/equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Financial Assurance [2]				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs [3]	\$1,000	23-Sep-2007	27-Oct-2008	2.01	\$101	\$1,000	\$1,101
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0

Notes for AVOIDED costs

Estimated cost for annual testing to verify proper operation of the Stage II equipment. The date required is one year prior to the investigation date and the final date is the compliance date.

Approx. Cost of Compliance

\$1,000

TOTAL

\$1,101

# Compliance History Report

Customer/Respondent/Owner-Operator:	CN600259410 Costco Wholesale Corporation	Classification: AVERAGE	Rating: 0.87
Regulated Entity:	RN104959697 Costco Gasoline Station 636	Classification: HIGH	Site Rating: 0.00
ID Number(s):	PETROLEUM STORAGE TANK REGISTRATION	REGISTRATION	78225
Location:	270 W HIGHWAY 67, DUNCANVILLE, TX, 75137	Rating Date: 9/1/2008	Repeat Violator: NO
TCEQ Region:	REGION 04 - DFW METROPLEX		
Date Compliance History Prepared:	October 20, 2008		
Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History:	Enforcement		
Compliance Period:	October 20, 2003 to October 20, 2008		

TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding this Compliance History

Name: Mike Pace Phone: 588-5933

### Site Compliance History Components

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| 1. Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five year compliance period? | No  |
| 2. Has there been a (known) change in ownership of the site during the compliance period?    | No  |
| 3. If Yes, who is the current owner?   | N/A |
| 4. If Yes, who was/were the prior owner(s)?  | N/A |
| 5. When did the change(s) in ownership occur?  | N/A |

### Components (Multimedia) for the Site :

- A. Final Enforcement Orders, court judgements, and consent decrees of the state of Texas and the federal government.  
N/A
  - B. Any criminal convictions of the state of Texas and the federal government.  
N/A
  - C. Chronic excessive emissions events.  
N/A
  - D. The approval dates of investigations. (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.)
 

1	05/31/2006	(480526)
2	10/16/2008	(704198)
  - E. Written notices of violations (NOV). (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.)  
N/A
  - F. Environmental audits.  
N/A
  - G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs).  
N/A
  - H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates.  
N/A
  - I. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program.  
N/A
  - J. Early compliance.  
N/A
- Sites Outside of Texas  
N/A



TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



IN THE MATTER OF AN  
ENFORCEMENT ACTION  
CONCERNING  
COSTCO WHOLESALE  
CORPORATION DBA COSTCO  
GASOLINE STATION 636  
RN104959697

§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§

BEFORE THE  
  
TEXAS COMMISSION ON  
  
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

AGREED ORDER  
DOCKET NO. 2008-1677-PST-E

I. JURISDICTION AND STIPULATIONS

At its \_\_\_\_\_ agenda, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("the Commission" or "TCEQ") considered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement action regarding Costco Wholesale Corporation dba Costco Gasoline Station 636 ("the Respondent") under the authority of TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE ch. 382 and TEX. WATER CODE ch. 7. The Executive Director of the TCEQ, through the Enforcement Division, and the Respondent appear before the Commission and together stipulate that:

1. The Respondent owns and operates a wholesale store with retail sales of gasoline at 270 West Highway 67 in Duncanville, Dallas County, Texas (the "Station").
2. The Station consists of one or more sources as defined in TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.003(12).
3. The Commission and the Respondent agree that the Commission has jurisdiction to enter this Agreed Order, and that the Respondent is subject to the Commission's jurisdiction.
4. The Respondent received notice of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations") on or about October 21, 2008.
5. The occurrence of any violation is in dispute and the entry of this Agreed Order shall not constitute an admission by the Respondent of any violation alleged in Section II ("Allegations"), nor of any statute or rule.



6. An administrative penalty in the amount of Five Thousand Six Hundred One Dollars (\$5,601) is assessed by the Commission in settlement of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations"). The Respondent has paid Four Thousand Four Hundred Eighty-One Dollars (\$4,481) of the administrative penalty and One Thousand One Hundred Twenty Dollars (\$1,120) is deferred contingent upon the Respondent's timely and satisfactory compliance with all the terms of this Agreed Order. The deferred amount will be waived upon full compliance with the terms of this Agreed Order. If the Respondent fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with all requirements of this Agreed Order, the Executive Director may require the Respondent to pay all or part of the deferred penalty.
7. Any notice and procedures, which might otherwise be authorized or required in this action, are waived in the interest of a more timely resolution of the matter.
8. The Executive Director of the TCEQ and the Respondent have agreed on a settlement of the matters alleged in this enforcement action, subject to the approval of the Commission.
9. The Executive Director recognizes that the TCEQ Dallas/Fort Worth Regional Office received documentation on October 27, 2008, verifying that the Respondent successfully conducted the required annual testing of the Stage II equipment.
10. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that the Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Agreed Order.
11. This Agreed Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order, whichever is later.
12. The provisions of this Agreed Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Agreed Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.

## II. ALLEGATIONS

As owner and operator of the Station, the Respondent is alleged to have failed to verify proper operation of the Stage II equipment at least once every 12 months or upon major system replacement or modification, whichever occurs first, in violation of 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 115.245(2) and TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.085(b), as documented during an investigation conducted on September 23, 2008. Specifically, the Stage II annual system compliance testing had not been conducted.

## III. DENIALS

The Respondent generally denies each allegation in Section II ("Allegations").



#### IV. ORDERING PROVISIONS

1. It is, therefore, ordered by the TCEQ that the Respondent pay an administrative penalty as set forth in Section I, Paragraph 6 above. The payment of this administrative penalty and the Respondent's compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order resolve only the allegations in Section II. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective action or penalties for violations which are not raised here. Administrative penalty payments shall be made payable to "TCEQ" and shall be sent with the notation "Re: Costco Wholesale Corporation dba Costco Gasoline Station 636, Docket No. 2008-1677-PST-E" to:

Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section  
Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214  
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 13088  
Austin, Texas 78711-3088

2. The provisions of this Agreed Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Respondent. The Respondent is ordered to give notice of the Agreed Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Station operations referenced in this Agreed Order.
3. This Agreed Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against the Respondent in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the OAG to: (1) enforce the terms of this Agreed Order; or (2) pursue violations of a statute within the Commission's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by the Commission under such a statute.
4. This agreement may be executed in multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single original instrument. Any executed signature page to this Agreement may be transmitted by facsimile transmission to the other parties, which shall constitute an original signature for all purposes.
5. Under 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 70.10(b), the effective date is the date of hand-delivery of the Order to the Respondent, or three days after the date on which the Commission mails notice of the Order to the Respondent, whichever is earlier. The Chief Clerk shall provide a copy of this Agreed Order to each of the parties.



### SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

\_\_\_\_\_  
For the Commission

John Sullivan  
For the Executive Director

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date 1/30/2009

I, the undersigned, have read and understand the attached Agreed Order. I am authorized to agree to the attached Agreed Order on behalf of the entity indicated below my signature, and I do agree to the terms and conditions specified therein. I further acknowledge that the TCEQ, in accepting payment for the penalty amount, is materially relying on such representation.

I also understand that failure to comply with the Ordering Provisions, if any, in this order and/or failure to timely pay the penalty amount, may result in:

- A negative impact on compliance history;
- Greater scrutiny of any permit applications submitted;
- Referral of this case to the Attorney General's Office for contempt, injunctive relief, additional penalties, and/or attorney fees, or to a collection agency;
- Increased penalties in any future enforcement actions;
- Automatic referral to the Attorney General's Office of any future enforcement actions; and
- TCEQ seeking other relief as authorized by law.

In addition, any falsification of any compliance documents may result in criminal prosecution.

Dennis Boek  
Signature

Dec 12, 2008  
Date

Dennis Boek  
Name (Printed or typed)

Compliance Manager  
Title

Authorized Representative of  
Costco Wholesale Corporation dba Costco Gasoline Station 636

**Instructions:** Send the original, signed Agreed Order with penalty payment to the Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section at the address in Section IV, Paragraph 1 of this Agreed Order.

