

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY - ENFORCEMENT MATTER

DOCKET NO.: 2008-1949-EAQ-E **TCEQ ID:** RN105635460 **CASE NO.:** 36964

RESPONDENT NAME: Pavilion Assisted Living, LLC

ORDER TYPE:		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 1660 AGREED ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> FINDINGS AGREED ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> FINDINGS ORDER FOLLOWING SOAH HEARING
<input type="checkbox"/> FINDINGS DEFAULT ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> SHUTDOWN ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> IMMINENT AND SUBSTANTIAL ENDANGERMENT ORDER
<input type="checkbox"/> AMENDED ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> EMERGENCY ORDER	
CASE TYPE:		
<input type="checkbox"/> AIR	<input type="checkbox"/> MULTI-MEDIA (check all that apply)	<input type="checkbox"/> INDUSTRIAL AND HAZARDOUS WASTE
<input type="checkbox"/> PUBLIC WATER SUPPLY	<input type="checkbox"/> PETROLEUM STORAGE TANKS	<input type="checkbox"/> OCCUPATIONAL CERTIFICATION
<input type="checkbox"/> WATER QUALITY	<input type="checkbox"/> SEWAGE SLUDGE	<input type="checkbox"/> UNDERGROUND INJECTION CONTROL
<input type="checkbox"/> MUNICIPAL SOLID WASTE	<input type="checkbox"/> RADIOACTIVE WASTE	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> EDWARDS AQUIFER
<p>SITE WHERE VIOLATION(S) OCCURRED: Pavilion at Great Hills, located west of Highway 183, east of Jollyville Road, and south of Oak Knoll Drive, Austin, Travis County</p> <p>TYPE OF OPERATION: Construction site</p> <p>SMALL BUSINESS: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>OTHER SIGNIFICANT MATTERS: There are no complaints. There is no record of additional pending enforcement actions regarding this facility location.</p> <p>INTERESTED PARTIES: No one other than the ED and the Respondent has expressed an interest in this matter.</p> <p>COMMENTS RECEIVED: The <i>Texas Register</i> comment period expired on May 4, 2009. No comments were received.</p> <p>CONTACTS AND MAILING LIST: TCEQ Attorney/SEP Coordinator: None TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Mr. Harvey Wilson, Enforcement Division, Enforcement Team 3, MC 169, (512) 239-0321; Ms. Cari-Michel La Caille, Enforcement Division, MC 219, (512) 239-1387 Respondent: Mr. Paul T. DeNucci, Registered Agent/Manager, Pavilion Assisted Living, LLC, 6601 Vaught Ranch Road, Suite 100, Austin, Texas 78730 Respondent's Attorney: Not represented by counsel on this enforcement matter</p>		

VIOLATION SUMMARY CHART:

VIOLATION INFORMATION	PENALTY CONSIDERATIONS	CORRECTIVE ACTIONS TAKEN/REQUIRED
<p>Type of Investigation: <input type="checkbox"/> Complaint <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Routine <input type="checkbox"/> Enforcement Follow-up <input type="checkbox"/> Records Review</p> <p>Date(s) of Complaints Relating to this Case: None</p> <p>Date of Investigation Relating to this Case: November 5, 2008</p> <p>Date of NOV/NOE Relating to this Case: December 5, 2008 (NOE)</p> <p>Background Facts: This was a routine investigation.</p> <p>WATER</p> <p>Failure to obtain approval of modifications to a Water Pollution Abatement Plan prior to beginning a regulated activity over the Edwards Aquifer Recharge Zone. Specifically, the investigator observed evidence of non permitted construction on the 3.26 acre lot prior to December 5, 2008, when the modification to the existing Edwards Aquifer Protection Program ("EAPP") Plan No. 11-08100801 was approved [30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 213.4(j)].</p>	<p>Total Assessed: \$750</p> <p>Total Deferred: \$150 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Expedited Settlement <input type="checkbox"/> Financial Inability to Pay</p> <p>SEP Conditional Offset: \$0</p> <p>Total Paid to General Revenue: \$600</p> <p>Site Compliance History Classification <input type="checkbox"/> High <input type="checkbox"/> Average <input type="checkbox"/> Poor</p> <p>Person Compliance History Classification <input type="checkbox"/> High <input type="checkbox"/> Average <input type="checkbox"/> Poor</p> <p>Major Source: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>Applicable Penalty Policy: September 2002</p>	<p>Corrective Actions Taken:</p> <p>The Executive Director recognizes that on December 5, 2008, the Respondent received approval of the modifications to the existing EAPP Plan No. 11-08100801.</p>

Additional ID No(s): 11-08100801



Penalty Calculation Worksheet (PCW)

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

PCW Revision October 30, 2008

TCEQ

DATES	Assigned	15-Dec-2008			
	PCW	22-Dec-2008	Screening	22-Dec-2008	EPA Due

RESPONDENT/FACILITY INFORMATION	
Respondent	Pavilion Assisted Living, LLC
Reg. Ent. Ref. No.	RN105635460
Facility/Site Region	11-Austin
Major/Minor Source	Minor

CASE INFORMATION			
Enf./Case ID No.	36964	No. of Violations	1
Docket No.	2008-1949-EAQ-E	Order Type	1660
Media Program(s)	Edwards Aquifer	Government/Non-Profit	No
Multi-Media	Water Quality	Enf. Coordinator	Harvey Wilson
		EC's Team	Enforcement Team 3
Admin. Penalty \$ Limit Minimum	\$0	Maximum	\$10,000

Penalty Calculation Section

TOTAL BASE PENALTY (Sum of violation base penalties)	Subtotal 1	\$1,000
---	-------------------	---------

ADJUSTMENTS (+/-) TO SUBTOTAL 1	
Subtotals 2-7 are obtained by multiplying the Total Base Penalty (Subtotal 1) by the indicated percentage.	

Compliance History	0.0% Enhancement	Subtotals 2, 3, & 7	\$0
---------------------------	------------------	--------------------------------	-----

Notes: No change due to no previous compliance history.

Culpability	No	0.0% Enhancement	Subtotal 4	\$0
--------------------	----	------------------	-------------------	-----

Notes: The Respondent does not meet the culpability criteria.

Good Faith Effort to Comply Total Adjustments	Subtotal 5	\$250
--	-------------------	-------

Economic Benefit	0.0% Enhancement*	Subtotal 6	\$0
-------------------------	-------------------	-------------------	-----

Total EB Amounts: \$12
 Approx. Cost of Compliance: \$3,000
 *Capped at the Total EB \$ Amount

SUM OF SUBTOTALS 1-7	Final Subtotal	\$750
-----------------------------	-----------------------	-------

OTHER FACTORS AS JUSTICE MAY REQUIRE	0.0%	Adjustment	\$0
---	------	-------------------	-----

Reduces or enhances the Final Subtotal by the indicated percentage.

Notes:

Final Penalty Amount	\$750
-----------------------------	-------

STATUTORY LIMIT ADJUSTMENT	Final Assessed Penalty	\$750
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	-------

DEFERRAL	20.0%	Reduction	Adjustment	-\$150
-----------------	-------	-----------	-------------------	--------

Reduces the Final Assessed Penalty by the indicated percentage. (Enter number only; e.g. 20 for 20% reduction.)

Notes: Deferral offered for expedited settlement.

PAYABLE PENALTY	\$600
------------------------	-------

Screening Date 22-Dec-2008 Docket No. 2008-1949-EAQ-E

PCW

Respondent Pavilion Assisted Living, LLC

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

Case ID No. 36964

PCW Revision October 30, 2008

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN105635460

Media [Statute] Edwards Aquifer

Enf. Coordinator Harvey Wilson

Compliance History Worksheet

>> Compliance History Site Enhancement (Subtotal 2)

Component	Number of...	Enter Number Here	Adjust.
NOVs	Written NOVs with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (number of NOVs meeting criteria)	0	0%
	Other written NOVs	0	0%
Orders	Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (number of orders meeting criteria)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%
Judgments and Consent Decrees	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (number of judgements or consent decrees meeting criteria)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%
Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (number of counts)	0	0%
Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (number of events)	0	0%
Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which notices were submitted)	0	0%
	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which violations were disclosed)	0	0%

Please Enter Yes or No

Other	Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%
	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%
	Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%
	Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 2) 0%

>> Repeat Violator (Subtotal 3)

N/A

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 3) 0%

>> Compliance History Person Classification (Subtotal 7)

N/A

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 7) 0%

>> Compliance History Summary

Compliance
History
Notes

No change due to no previous compliance history.

Total Adjustment Percentage (Subtotals 2, 3, & 7) 0%

Screening Date 22-Dec-2008 **Docket No.** 2008-1949-EAQ-E **PCW**
Respondent Pavilion Assisted Living, LLC *Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)*
Case ID No. 36964 *PCW Revision October 30, 2008*
Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN105635460
Media [Statute] Edwards Aquifer
Enf. Coordinator Harvey Wilson

Violation Number
Rule Cite(s)
Violation Description
Base Penalty

>> Environmental, Property and Human Health Matrix

OR	Harm			Percent
	Release	Major	Moderate	
Actual	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text" value="0%"/>
Potential	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	

>> Programmatic Matrix

	Falsification	Major	Moderate	Minor	Percent
	<input type="text"/>	<input checked="" type="text" value="x"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text" value="10%"/>

Matrix Notes
Adjustment

Violation Events

Number of Violation Events **Number of violation days**
mark only one with an x
 daily
 weekly
 monthly
 quarterly
 semiannual
 annual
 single event
Violation Base Penalty

One monthly event is recommended from November 5, 2008, the date the violation was documented until December 5, 2008, the compliance date.

Good Faith Efforts to Comply **25.0% Reduction**

	Before NOV	NOV to EDPRP/Settlement Offer
Extraordinary	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Ordinary	<input checked="" type="text" value="x"/>	<input type="text"/>
N/A	<input type="text"/>	(mark with x)

Notes
Violation Subtotal

Economic Benefit (EB) for this violation **Statutory Limit Test**
Estimated EB Amount **Violation Final Penalty Total**
This violation Final Assessed Penalty (adjusted for limits)

Economic Benefit Worksheet

Respondent: Pavilion Assisted Living, LLC
Case ID No.: 36964
Reg. Ent. Reference No.: RN105635460
Media: Edwards Aquifer
Violation No.: 1

Percent Interest	Years of Depreciation
5.0	15

Item Description	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Onetime Costs	EB Amount
No commas or \$							

Delayed Costs

Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Engineering/construction				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs	\$3,000	5-Nov-2008	5-Dec-2008	0.08	\$12	n/a	\$12
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0

Notes for DELAYED costs

The estimated cost to prepare, submit the application and obtain approval of modification to an Edwards Aquifer WPAP. Date required is the date the violation was documented. Final date is the date of compliance.

Avoided Costs

ANNUALIZE [1] avoided costs before entering item (except for one-time avoided costs)

Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Supplies/equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Financial Assurance [2]				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs [3]				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0

Notes for AVOIDED costs

Approx. Cost of Compliance

\$3,000

TOTAL

\$12

Compliance History Report

Customer/Respondent/Owner-Operator: CN603415357 Pavilion Assisted Living, LLC Classification: Rating:

Regulated Entity: RN105635460 PAVILION AT GREAT HILLS Classification: Site Rating:

ID Number(s): EDWARDS AQUIFER REGISTRATION 11-08100801

Location: W OF HWY 183 EAST OF JOLLYVILLE RD AND SOUTH OF OAK KNOLL DRIVE

TCEQ Region: REGION 11 - AUSTIN

Date Compliance History Prepared: December 19, 2008

Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History: Enforcement

Compliance Period: December 19, 2003 to December 19, 2008

TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding this Compliance History

Name: Harvey Wilson Phone: 239 - 0321

Site Compliance History Components

1. Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five year compliance period? Yes
2. Has there been a (known) change in ownership of the site during the compliance period? No
3. If Yes, who is the current owner? N/A
4. If Yes, who was/were the prior owner(s)? N/A
5. When did the change(s) in ownership occur? N/A

Components (Multimedia) for the Site :

- A. Final Enforcement Orders, court judgements, and consent decrees of the state of Texas and the federal government.
N/A
- B. Any criminal convictions of the state of Texas and the federal government.
N/A
- C. Chronic excessive emissions events.
N/A
- D. The approval dates of investigations. (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.)
1 12/08/2008 (706797)
- E. Written notices of violations (NOV). (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.)
N/A
- F. Environmental audits.
N/A
- G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs).
N/A
- H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates.
N/A
- I. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program.
N/A
- J. Early compliance.
N/A

Sites Outside of Texas

N/A

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



IN THE MATTER OF AN
ENFORCEMENT ACTION
CONCERNING
PAVILION ASSISTED LIVING, LLC
RN105635460

§
§
§
§
§

BEFORE THE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON

ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

**AGREED ORDER
DOCKET NO. 2008-1949-EAQ-E**

I. JURISDICTION AND STIPULATIONS

At its _____ agenda, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("the Commission" or "TCEQ") considered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement action regarding Pavilion Assisted Living, LLC ("the Respondent") under the authority of TEX. WATER CODE chs. 7 and 26. The Executive Director of the TCEQ, through the Enforcement Division, and the Respondent appear before the Commission and together stipulate that:

1. The Respondent owns and operates a construction site located west of Highway 183, east of Jollyville Road, and south of Oak Knoll Drive in Austin, Travis County, Texas, (the "Site").
2. The Respondent has caused, suffered, allowed or permitted the discharge of any waste or the performance of any activity in violation of TEX. WATER CODE ch. 26 or any rule, permit, or order of the Commission.
3. The Commission and the Respondent agree that the Commission has jurisdiction to enter this Agreed Order, and that the Respondent is subject to the Commission's jurisdiction.
4. The Respondent received notice of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations") on or about December 10, 2008.
5. The occurrence of any violation is in dispute and the entry of this Agreed Order shall not constitute an admission by the Respondent of any violation alleged in Section II ("Allegations"), nor of any statute or rule.
6. An administrative penalty in the amount of Seven Hundred Fifty Dollars (\$750) is assessed by the Commission in settlement of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations"). The Respondent has paid Six Hundred Dollars (\$600) of the administrative penalty and One Hundred Fifty Dollars

(\$150) is deferred contingent upon the Respondent's timely and satisfactory compliance with all the terms of this Agreed Order. The deferred amount will be waived upon full compliance with the terms of this Agreed Order. If the Respondent fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with all requirements of this Agreed Order, the Executive Director may require the Respondent to pay all or part of the deferred penalty.

7. Any notice and procedures, which might otherwise be authorized or required in this action, are waived in the interest of a more timely resolution of the matter.
8. The Executive Director of the TCEQ and the Respondent have agreed on a settlement of the matters alleged in this enforcement action, subject to the approval of the Commission.
9. The Executive Director recognizes that on December 5, 2008, the Respondent received approval of the modifications to the existing Edwards Aquifer Protection Program ("EAPP") Plan No. 11-08100801.
10. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that the Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Agreed Order.
11. This Agreed Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order, whichever is later.
12. The provisions of this Agreed Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Agreed Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.

II. ALLEGATIONS

As owner and operator of the Site, the Respondent is alleged to have failed to obtain approval of modifications to a Water Pollution Abatement Plan ("WPAP") prior to beginning a regulated activity over the Edwards Aquifer Recharge Zone, in violation of 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 213.4(j), as documented during an investigation conducted on November 5, 2008. Specifically, the investigator observed evidence of non permitted construction on the 3.26 acre lot prior to December 5, 2008, when the modification to the existing Plan No. EAPP 11-08100801 was approved.

III. DENIALS

The Respondent generally denies each allegation in Section II ("Allegations").

IV. ORDERING PROVISIONS

1. It is, therefore, ordered by the TCEQ that the Respondent pay an administrative penalty as set forth in Section I, Paragraph 6 above. The payment of this administrative penalty and the Respondent's compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order resolve only the allegations in Section II. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective action or penalties for violations which are not raised here. Administrative penalty payments shall be made payable to "TCEQ" and shall be sent with the notation "Re: Pavilion Assisted Living, LLC, Docket No. 2008-1949-EAQ-E" to:

Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section
Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 13088
Austin, Texas 78711-3088
2. The provisions of this Agreed Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Respondent. The Respondent is ordered to give notice of the Agreed Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Site operations referenced in this Agreed Order.
3. This Agreed Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against the Respondent in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the OAG to: (1) enforce the terms of this Agreed Order; or (2) pursue violations of a statute within the Commission's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by the Commission under such a statute.
4. This Agreed Order may be executed in multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single original instrument. Any executed signature page to this Agreed Order may be transmitted by facsimile transmission to the other parties, which shall constitute an original signature for all purposes under this Agreed Order.
5. Under 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 70.10(b), the effective date is the date of hand-delivery of the Order to the Respondent, or three days after the date on which the Commission mails notice of the Order to the Respondent, whichever is earlier. The Chief Clerk shall provide a copy of this Agreed Order to each of the parties.

SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

For the Commission

John Szallier
For the Executive Director

4/2/2009
Date

I, the undersigned, have read and understand the attached Agreed Order. I am authorized to agree to the attached Agreed Order on behalf of the entity indicated below my signature, and I do agree to the terms and conditions specified therein. I further acknowledge that the TCEQ, in accepting payment for the penalty amount, is materially relying on such representation.

I also understand that failure to comply with the Ordering Provisions, if any, in this order and/or failure to timely pay the penalty amount, may result in:

- A negative impact on compliance history;
- Greater scrutiny of any permit applications submitted;
- Referral of this case to the Attorney General's Office for contempt, injunctive relief, additional penalties, and/or attorney fees, or to a collection agency;
- Increased penalties in any future enforcement actions;
- Automatic referral to the Attorney General's Office of any future enforcement actions; and
- TCEQ seeking other relief as authorized by law.

In addition, any falsification of any compliance documents may result in criminal prosecution.

Paul T. DeNucci
Signature

2/26/09
Date

PAUL T. DENUCCI
Name (Printed or typed)
Authorized Representative of
Pavilion Assisted Living, LLC

MGR.
Title

Instructions: Send the original, signed Agreed Order with penalty payment to the Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section at the address in Section IV, Paragraph 1 of this Agreed Order.