

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY - ENFORCEMENT MATTER**

**DOCKET NO.: 2009-0336-PST-E TCEQ ID: RN104308127 CASE NO.: 37268**

**RESPONDENT NAME: CIRCLE K STORES INC. dba Circle K Store 2701418**

<b>ORDER TYPE:</b>		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 1660 AGREED ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> FINDINGS AGREED ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> FINDINGS ORDER FOLLOWING SOAH HEARING
<input type="checkbox"/> FINDINGS DEFAULT ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> SHUTDOWN ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> IMMINENT AND SUBSTANTIAL ENDANGERMENT ORDER
<input type="checkbox"/> AMENDED ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> EMERGENCY ORDER	
<b>CASE TYPE:</b>		
<input type="checkbox"/> AIR	<input type="checkbox"/> MULTI-MEDIA (check all that apply)	<input type="checkbox"/> INDUSTRIAL AND HAZARDOUS WASTE
<input type="checkbox"/> PUBLIC WATER SUPPLY	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> PETROLEUM STORAGE TANKS	<input type="checkbox"/> OCCUPATIONAL CERTIFICATION
<input type="checkbox"/> WATER QUALITY	<input type="checkbox"/> SEWAGE SLUDGE	<input type="checkbox"/> UNDERGROUND INJECTION CONTROL
<input type="checkbox"/> MUNICIPAL SOLID WASTE	<input type="checkbox"/> RADIOACTIVE WASTE	<input type="checkbox"/> DRY CLEANER REGISTRATION
<p><b>SITE WHERE VIOLATION(S) OCCURRED:</b> Circle K Store 2701418, 3910 Dyer Street, El Paso, El Paso County</p> <p><b>TYPE OF OPERATION:</b> Convenience store with retail sales of gasoline</p> <p><b>SMALL BUSINESS:</b> <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p><b>OTHER SIGNIFICANT MATTERS:</b> There are no complaints. There is no record of additional pending enforcement actions regarding this facility location.</p> <p><b>INTERESTED PARTIES:</b> No one other than the ED and the Respondent has expressed an interest in this matter.</p> <p><b>COMMENTS RECEIVED:</b> The <i>Texas Register</i> comment period expired on August 3, 2009. No comments were received.</p> <p><b>CONTACTS AND MAILING LIST:</b>  <b>TCEQ Attorney/SEP Coordinator:</b> None  <b>TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator:</b> Mr. Steven Lopez, Enforcement Division, Enforcement Team 6, MC 128, (512) 239-1896; Ms. Cari-Michel La Caille, Enforcement Division, MC 219, (512) 239-1387  <b>Respondent:</b> Ms. Ruth Bulmer, Compliance Specialist, CIRCLE K STORES INC., P.O. Box 52085, Phoenix, Arizona 85072  Ms. Theresa A. Denney, Environmental Compliance Supervisor, CIRCLE K STORES INC., P.O. Box 52085, Phoenix, Arizona 85072  <b>Respondent's Attorney:</b> Not represented by counsel on this enforcement matter</p>		

VIOLATION SUMMARY CHART:		
VIOLATION INFORMATION	PENALTY CONSIDERATIONS	CORRECTIVE ACTIONS TAKEN/REQUIRED
<p><b>Type of Investigation:</b>  <input type="checkbox"/> Complaint  <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Routine  <input type="checkbox"/> Enforcement Follow-up  <input type="checkbox"/> Records Review</p> <p><b>Date(s) of Complaints Relating to this Case:</b> None</p> <p><b>Date of Investigation Relating to this Case:</b> February 24, 2009</p> <p><b>Date of NOV/NOE Relating to this Case:</b> March 9, 2009 (NOE)</p> <p><b>Background Facts:</b> This was a routine investigation.</p> <p><b>WASTE</b></p> <p>Failure to verify proper operation of the Stage II vapor space manifold and dynamic back pressure at least once every 36 months or upon major system replacement or modification, whichever occurs first. Specifically, the Stage II triennial compliance testing had not been conducted [30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 115.245(2) and TEX. HEALTH &amp; SAFETY CODE § 382.085(b)].</p>	<p><b>Total Assessed:</b> \$3,246</p> <p><b>Total Deferred:</b> \$649  <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Expedited Settlement  <input type="checkbox"/> Financial Inability to Pay</p> <p><b>SEP Conditional Offset:</b> \$0</p> <p><b>Total Paid to General Revenue:</b> \$2,597</p> <p><b>Site Compliance History Classification</b>  <input type="checkbox"/> High <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Average <input type="checkbox"/> Poor</p> <p><b>Person Compliance History Classification</b>  <input type="checkbox"/> High <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Average <input type="checkbox"/> Poor</p> <p><b>Major Source:</b> <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p><b>Applicable Penalty Policy:</b> September 2002</p>	<p><b>Corrective Actions Taken:</b></p> <p>The Executive Director recognizes that the Respondent successfully conducted the required triennial testing of the Stage II equipment on February 25, 2009.</p>

Additional ID No(s): PST 5462



# Penalty Calculation Worksheet (PCW)

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

PCW Revision October 30, 2008

**TCEQ**

<b>DATES</b>	Assigned	9-Mar-2009	Screening	10-Mar-2009	EPA Due	
	PCW	11-Mar-2009				

**RESPONDENT/FACILITY INFORMATION**

Respondent	CIRCLE K STORES INC. dba Circle K Store 2701418		
Reg. Ent. Ref. No.	RN104308127		
Facility/Site Region	6-El Paso	Major/Minor Source	Minor

**CASE INFORMATION**

Enf./Case ID No.	37268	No. of Violations	1
Docket No.	2009-0336-PST-E	Order Type	1660
Media Program(s)	Petroleum Storage Tank	Government/Non-Profit	No
Multi-Media		Enf. Coordinator	Steven Lopez
		EC's Team	Enforcement Team 6
Admin. Penalty \$ Limit Minimum	\$0	Maximum	\$10,000

## Penalty Calculation Section

**TOTAL BASE PENALTY (Sum of violation base penalties)** **Subtotal 1**

**ADJUSTMENTS (+/-) TO SUBTOTAL 1**

Subtotals 2-7 are obtained by multiplying the Total Base Penalty (Subtotal 1) by the indicated percentage.

**Compliance History**  Enhancement **Subtotals 2, 3, & 7**

Notes

**Culpability**   Enhancement **Subtotal 4**

Notes

**Good Faith Effort to Comply Total Adjustments** **Subtotal 5**

**Economic Benefit**  Enhancement **Subtotal 6**

Total EB Amounts  \*Capped at the Total EB \$ Amount  
Approx. Cost of Compliance

**SUM OF SUBTOTALS 1-7** **Final Subtotal**

**OTHER FACTORS AS JUSTICE MAY REQUIRE**  **Adjustment**

Reduces or enhances the Final Subtotal by the indicated percentage.

Notes

**Final Penalty Amount**

**STATUTORY LIMIT ADJUSTMENT** **Final Assessed Penalty**

**DEFERRAL**  Reduction **Adjustment**

Reduces the Final Assessed Penalty by the indicated percentage. (Enter number only; e.g. 20 for 20% reduction.)

Notes

**PAYABLE PENALTY**

Screening Date 10-Mar-2009

Docket No. 2009-0336-PST-E

PCW

Respondent CIRCLE K STORES INC. dba Circle K Store 2701418

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

Case ID No. 37268

PCW Revision October 30, 2008

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN104308127

Media [Statute] Petroleum Storage Tank

Enf. Coordinator Steven Lopez

### Compliance History Worksheet

>> Compliance History Site Enhancement (Subtotal 2)

Component	Number of...	Enter Number Here	Adjust.
NOVs	Written NOVs with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (number of NOVs meeting criteria)	1	5%
	Other written NOVs	1	2%
Orders	Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (number of orders meeting criteria)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%
Judgments and Consent Decrees	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (number of judgements or consent decrees meeting criteria)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%
Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (number of counts)	0	0%
Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (number of events)	0	0%
Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which notices were submitted)	0	0%
	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which violations were disclosed)	0	0%
Please Enter Yes or No			
Other	Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%
	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%
	Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%
	Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 2) 7%

>> Repeat Violator (Subtotal 3)

No

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 3) 0%

>> Compliance History Person Classification (Subtotal 7)

Average Performer

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 7) 0%

>> Compliance History Summary

Compliance History Notes

Enhancement for one previous NOV with a same or similar violation and one NOV with a dissimilar violation.

Total Adjustment Percentage (Subtotals 2, 3, & 7) 7%

**Screening Date** 10-Mar-2009 **Docket No.** 2009-0336-PST-E **PCW**  
**Respondent** CIRCLE K STORES INC. dba Circle K Store 2701418 *Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)*  
**Case ID No.** 37268 *PCW Revision October 30, 2008*  
**Reg. Ent. Reference No.** RN104308127  
**Media [Statute]** Petroleum Storage Tank  
**Enf. Coordinator** Steven Lopez

**Violation Number**   
**Rule Cite(s)**   
**Violation Description**

**Base Penalty**

>> **Environmental, Property and Human Health Matrix**

Release	Harm			Percent
	Major	Moderate	Minor	
Actual	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text" value="25%"/>
Potential	<input type="text" value="x"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	

>> **Programmatic Matrix**

Falsification	Major	Moderate	Minor	Percent
<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text" value="0%"/>

**Matrix Notes**

**Adjustment**

**Violation Events**

**Number of Violation Events**   **Number of violation days**

<i>mark only one with an x</i>	daily	<input type="text"/>
	weekly	<input type="text"/>
	monthly	<input type="text"/>
	quarterly	<input type="text"/>
	semiannual	<input type="text"/>
	annual	<input type="text"/>
	single event	<input type="text" value="x"/>

**Violation Base Penalty**

**Good Faith Efforts to Comply**

**25.0% Reduction**  
 Before NOV    NOV to EDRP/Settlement Offer

Extraordinary	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Ordinary	<input type="text" value="x"/>	<input type="text"/>
N/A	<input type="text"/>	(mark with x)

**Notes**

**Violation Subtotal**

**Economic Benefit (EB) for this violation**

**Statutory Limit Test**

**Estimated EB Amount**

**Violation Final Penalty Total**

**This violation Final Assessed Penalty (adjusted for limits)**

## Economic Benefit Worksheet

**Respondent** CIRCLE K STORES INC. dba Circle K Store 2701418  
**Case ID No.** 37268  
**Reg. Ent. Reference No.** RN104308127  
**Media** Petroleum Storage Tank  
**Violation No.** 1

<b>Percent Interest</b>	<b>Years of Depreciation</b>
5.0	15

Item Description	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Onetime Costs	EB Amount
<b>Delayed Costs</b>							
Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Engineering/construction				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0

Notes for DELAYED costs

**Avoided Costs** ANNUALIZE [1] avoided costs before entering item (except for one-time avoided costs)

Item Description	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Onetime Costs	EB Amount
Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Supplies/equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Financial Assurance [2]				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs [3]	\$1,000	24-Feb-2006	25-Feb-2009	3.92	\$196	\$1,000	\$1,196
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0

Notes for AVOIDED costs

Estimated avoided cost for triennial testing of the Stage II equipment. The Date Required is three years prior to the investigation date. The Final Date is the compliance date.

<b>Approx. Cost of Compliance</b>	\$1,000	<b>TOTAL</b>	\$1,196
-----------------------------------	---------	--------------	---------

# Compliance History Report

Customer/Respondent/Owner-Operator: CN600134456 CIRCLE K STORES INC. Classification: AVERAGE Rating: 1.93  
Regulated Entity: RN104308127 Circle K Store 2701418 Classification: AVERAGE Site Rating: 1.50  
ID Number(s): PETROLEUM STORAGE TANK REGISTRATION 5462  
REGISTRATION  
AIR NEW SOURCE PERMITS ACCOUNT NUMBER EE1098Q  
Location: 3910 DYER ST, EL PASO, TX, 79930  
TCEQ Region: REGION 06 - EL PASO  
Date Compliance History Prepared: March 10, 2009  
Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History: Enforcement  
Compliance Period: March 10, 2004 to March 10, 2009  
TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding this Compliance History  
Name: Steven Lopez Phone: 512-239-1896

## Site Compliance History Components

1. Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five year compliance period? Yes
2. Has there been a (known) change in ownership of the site during the compliance period? No
3. If Yes, who is the current owner? N/A
4. If Yes, who was/were the prior owner(s)? N/A
5. When did the change(s) in ownership occur? N/A
6. Rating Date: 9/1/2008 Repeat Violator: NO

## Components (Multimedia) for the Site :

- A. Final Enforcement Orders, court judgements, and consent decrees of the state of Texas and the federal government.

N/A

- B. Any criminal convictions of the state of Texas and the federal government.

N/A

- C. Chronic excessive emissions events.

N/A

- D. The approval dates of investigations. (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.)

1	03/02/2007	(538275)
2	02/19/2008	(618112)
3	04/30/2008	(654405)
4	10/02/2008	(704264)
5	03/05/2009	(737392)

- E. Written notices of violations (NOV). (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.)

Date: 02/07/2007 (538275) CN600134456  
Self Report? NO Classification: Moderate  
Citation: 30 TAC Chapter 115, SubChapter C 115.242(3)(L)  
Description: Failure to maintain the Stage II Vapor Recovery System in proper operating condition.

Date: 04/30/2008 (654405) CN600134456  
Self Report? NO Classification: Moderate  
Citation: 30 TAC Chapter 115, SubChapter C 115.245(2)  
Description: Failure to conduct annual Stage II testing within the preceding twelve months.

F. Environmental audits.

N/A

G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs).

N/A

H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates.

N/A

I. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program.

N/A

J. Early compliance.

N/A

Sites Outside of Texas

N/A

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



IN THE MATTER OF AN  
ENFORCEMENT ACTION  
CONCERNING  
CIRCLE K STORES INC. DBA  
CIRCLE K STORE 2701418  
RN104308127

§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§

BEFORE THE  
TEXAS COMMISSION ON  
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

AGREED ORDER  
DOCKET NO. 2009-0336-PST-E

I. JURISDICTION AND STIPULATIONS

At its \_\_\_\_\_ agenda, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("the Commission" or "TCEQ") considered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement action regarding CIRCLE K STORES INC. dba Circle K Store 2701418 ("the Respondent") under the authority of TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE ch. 382 and TEX. WATER CODE ch. 7. The Executive Director of the TCEQ, through the Enforcement Division, and the Respondent appear before the Commission and together stipulate that:

1. The Respondent owns and operates a convenience store with retail sales of gasoline at 3910 Dyer Street in El Paso, El Paso County, Texas (the "Station").
2. The Station consists of one or more sources as defined in TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.003(12).
3. The Commission and the Respondent agree that the Commission has jurisdiction to enter this Agreed Order, and that the Respondent is subject to the Commission's jurisdiction.
4. The Respondent received notice of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations") on or about March 14, 2009.
5. The occurrence of any violation is in dispute and the entry of this Agreed Order shall not constitute an admission by the Respondent of any violation alleged in Section II ("Allegations"), nor of any statute or rule.
6. An administrative penalty in the amount of Three Thousand Two Hundred Forty-Six Dollars (\$3,246) is assessed by the Commission in settlement of the violations alleged in Section II

("Allegations"). The Respondent has paid Two Thousand Five Hundred Ninety-Seven Dollars (\$2,597) of the administrative penalty and Six Hundred Forty-Nine Dollars (\$649) is deferred contingent upon the Respondent's timely and satisfactory compliance with all the terms of this Agreed Order. The deferred amount will be waived upon full compliance with the terms of this Agreed Order. If the Respondent fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with all requirements of this Agreed Order, the Executive Director may require the Respondent to pay all or part of the deferred penalty.

7. Any notice and procedures, which might otherwise be authorized or required in this action, are waived in the interest of a more timely resolution of the matter.
8. The Executive Director of the TCEQ and the Respondent have agreed on a settlement of the matters alleged in this enforcement action, subject to the approval of the Commission.
9. The Executive Director recognizes that the Respondent successfully conducted the required triennial testing of the Stage II equipment on February 25, 2009.
10. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that the Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Agreed Order.
11. This Agreed Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order, whichever is later.
12. The provisions of this Agreed Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Agreed Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.

## II. ALLEGATIONS

As owner and operator of the Station, the Respondent is alleged to have failed to verify proper operation of the Stage II vapor space manifold and dynamic back pressure at least once every 36 months or upon major system replacement or modification, whichever occurs first, in violation of 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 115.245(2) and TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.085(b), as documented during an investigation conducted on February 24, 2009. Specifically, the Stage II triennial compliance testing had not been conducted.

## III. DENIALS

The Respondent generally denies each allegation in Section II ("Allegations").

#### IV. ORDERING PROVISIONS

1. It is, therefore, ordered by the TCEQ that the Respondent pay an administrative penalty as set forth in Section I, Paragraph 6 above. The payment of this administrative penalty and the Respondent's compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order resolve only the allegations in Section II. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective action or penalties for violations which are not raised here. Administrative penalty payments shall be made payable to "TCEQ" and shall be sent with the notation "Re: CIRCLE K STORES INC. dba Circle K Store 2701418, Docket No. 2009-0336-PST-E" to:

Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section  
Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214  
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 13088  
Austin, Texas 78711-3088

2. The provisions of this Agreed Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Respondent. The Respondent is ordered to give notice of the Agreed Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Station operations referenced in this Agreed Order.
3. This Agreed Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against the Respondent in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the OAG to: (1) enforce the terms of this Agreed Order; or (2) pursue violations of a statute within the Commission's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by the Commission under such a statute.
4. This Agreed Order may be executed in multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single original instrument. Any executed signature page to this Agreed Order may be transmitted by facsimile transmission to the other parties, which shall constitute an original signature for all purposes under this Agreed Order.
5. Under 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 70.10(b), the effective date is the date of hand-delivery of the Order to the Respondent, or three days after the date on which the Commission mails notice of the Order to the Respondent, whichever is earlier. The Chief Clerk shall provide a copy of this Agreed Order to each of the parties.

## SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

\_\_\_\_\_  
For the Commission

*John S. Sullivan*  
For the Executive Director

7/13/2009  
Date

I, the undersigned, have read and understand the attached Agreed Order. I am authorized to agree to the attached Agreed Order on behalf of the entity indicated below my signature, and I do agree to the terms and conditions specified therein. I further acknowledge that the TCEQ, in accepting payment for the penalty amount, is materially relying on such representation.

I also understand that failure to comply with the Ordering Provisions, if any, in this order and/or failure to timely pay the penalty amount, may result in:

- A negative impact on compliance history;
- Greater scrutiny of any permit applications submitted;
- Referral of this case to the Attorney General's Office for contempt, injunctive relief, additional penalties, and/or attorney fees, or to a collection agency;
- Increased penalties in any future enforcement actions;
- Automatic referral to the Attorney General's Office of any future enforcement actions; and
- TCEQ seeking other relief as authorized by law.

In addition, any falsification of any compliance documents may result in criminal prosecution.

*Theresa A. Denney*  
Signature

5/21/2009  
Date

Theresa A Denney  
Name (Printed or typed)  
Authorized Representative of  
CIRCLE K STORES INC. dba Circle K Store 2701418

Environmental Compliance  
Title  
Supervisor

**Instructions:** Send the original, signed Agreed Order with penalty payment to the Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section at the address in Section IV, Paragraph 1 of this Agreed Order.