EXECUTIVE SUMMARY - ENFORCEMENT MATTER

DOCKET NO.: 2009-0328-PST-E **TCEQ ID:** RN101543593 **CASE NO.:** 37255

RESPONDENT NAME: Taisseer Al-Aqqad dba Best Food Store

ORDER TYPE:		
X 1660 AGREED ORDER	__FINDINGS AGREED ORDER	__FINDINGS ORDER FOLLOWING SOAH HEARING
__FINDINGS DEFAULT ORDER	__SHUTDOWN ORDER	__IMMINENT AND SUBSTANTIAL ENDANGERMENT ORDER
__AMENDED ORDER	__EMERGENCY ORDER	
CASE TYPE:		
__AIR	__MULTI-MEDIA (check all that apply)	__INDUSTRIAL AND HAZARDOUS WASTE
__PUBLIC WATER SUPPLY	X PETROLEUM STORAGE TANKS	__OCCUPATIONAL CERTIFICATION
__WATER QUALITY	__SEWAGE SLUDGE	__UNDERGROUND INJECTION CONTROL
__MUNICIPAL SOLID WASTE	__RADIOACTIVE WASTE	__DRY CLEANER REGISTRATION

SITE WHERE VIOLATION(S) OCCURRED: Best Food Store, 3576 West Seminary Drive, Fort Worth, Tarrant County

TYPE OF OPERATION: Convenience store with retail sales of gasoline

SMALL BUSINESS: X **Yes** ___ **No**

OTHER SIGNIFICANT MATTERS: There are no complaints. There is no record of additional pending enforcement actions regarding this facility location.

INTERESTED PARTIES: No one other than the ED and the Respondent has expressed an interest in this matter.

COMMENTS RECEIVED: The *Texas Register* comment period expired on September 7, 2009. No comments were received.

CONTACTS AND MAILING LIST:

TCEQ Attorney/SEP Coordinator: None
TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Mr. Thomas Greimel, Enforcement Division, Enforcement Team 6, MC 128, (512) 239-5690; Ms. Cari-Michel La Caille, Enforcement Division, MC 219, (512) 239-1387
Respondent: Mr. Taisseer Al-Aqqad, Owner, Best Food Store, 3576 West Seminary Drive, Fort Worth, Texas 76133
Respondent's Attorney: Not represented by counsel on this enforcement matter

VIOLATION SUMMARY CHART:

VIOLATION INFORMATION	PENALTY CONSIDERATIONS	CORRECTIVE ACTIONS TAKEN/REQUIRED
Type of Investigation: __ Complaint X Routine __ Enforcement Follow-up __ Records Review **Date(s) of Complaints Relating to this Case:** None **Date of Investigation Relating to this Case:** December 31, 2008 **Date of NOV/NOE Relating to this Case:** February 26, 2009 (NOE) **Background Facts:** This was a routine investigation. **WASTE** Failure to verify proper operation of the Stage II equipment at least once every 12 months or upon major system replacement or modification, whichever occurs first. Specifically, the Stage II annual system compliance testing had not been conducted [30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 115.245(2) and TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.085(b)].	**Total Assessed:** $3,021 **Total Deferred:** $604 X Expedited Settlement __Financial Inability to Pay **SEP Conditional Offset:** $0 **Total Paid to General Revenue:** $2,417 **Site Compliance History Classification** __ **High** X **Average** __ **Poor** **Person Compliance History Classification** __ **High** X **Average** __ **Poor** **Major Source:** __ Yes X No **Applicable Penalty Policy:** September 2002	**Corrective Actions Taken:** The Executive Director recognizes that the City of Fort Worth, a TCEQ contractor, received documentation verifying that the Respondent successfully conducted the required annual testing of the Stage II equipment on January 1, 2009.

Additional ID No(s).: 73778

Penalty Calculation Worksheet (PCW)

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002) — *PCW Revision October 30, 2008*

TCEQ

DATES					
Assigned	3-Mar-2009				
PCW	14-Apr-2009	Screening	5-Mar-2009	EPA Due	

RESPONDENT/FACILITY INFORMATION

Respondent	Taisseer Al-Aqqad dba Best Food Store		
Reg. Ent. Ref. No.	RN101543593		
Facility/Site Region	4-Dallas/Fort Worth	Major/Minor Source	Minor

CASE INFORMATION

Enf./Case ID No.	37255	No. of Violations	1
Docket No.	2009-0328-PST-E	Order Type	1660
Media Program(s)	Petroleum Storage Tank	Government/Non-Profit	No
Multi-Media		Enf. Coordinator	Thomas Greimel
		EC's Team	Enforcement Team 6
Admin. Penalty $ Limit Minimum	$0	Maximum	$10,000

Penalty Calculation Section

TOTAL BASE PENALTY (Sum of violation base penalties) — *Subtotal 1* — $2,500

ADJUSTMENTS (+/-) TO SUBTOTAL 1

Subtotals 2-7 are obtained by multiplying the Total Base Penalty (Subtotal 1) by the indicated percentage.

Compliance History — 2.0% Enhancement — *Subtotals 2, 3, & 7* — $50

Notes: Enhancement for one previous NOV without same or similar violations.

Culpability — No — 0.0% Enhancement — *Subtotal 4* — $0

Notes: The Respondent does not meet the culpability criteria.

Good Faith Effort to Comply Total Adjustments — *Subtotal 5* — $625

Economic Benefit — 0.0% Enhancement* — *Subtotal 6* — $0

Total EB Amounts: $1,096
Approx. Cost of Compliance: $1,000
**Capped at the Total EB $ Amount*

SUM OF SUBTOTALS 1-7 — *Final Subtotal* — $1,925

OTHER FACTORS AS JUSTICE MAY REQUIRE — 56.9% — *Adjustment* — $1,096

Reduces or enhances the Final Subtotal by the indicated percentage.

Notes: Recommended enhancement to capture the avoided cost of compliance associated with the violation.

Final Penalty Amount — $3,021

STATUTORY LIMIT ADJUSTMENT — *Final Assessed Penalty* — $3,021

DEFERRAL — 20.0% Reduction — *Adjustment* — -$604

Reduces the Final Assessed Penalty by the indicted percentage. *(Enter number only; e.g. 20 for 20% reduction.)*

Notes: Deferral offered for expedited settlement.

PAYABLE PENALTY — $2,417

Screening Date 5-Mar-2009 **Docket No.** 2009-0328-PST-E **PCW**

Respondent Taisseer Al-Aqqad dba Best Food Store

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

Case ID No. 37255

PCW Revision October 30, 2008

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101543593

Media [Statute] Petroleum Storage Tank

Enf. Coordinator Thomas Greimel

Compliance History Worksheet

>> Compliance History *Site* Enhancement (Subtotal 2)

Component	Number of...	Enter Number Here	Adjust.
NOVs	Written NOVs with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (*number of NOVs meeting criteria*)	0	0%
	Other written NOVs	1	2%
Orders	Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (*number of orders meeting criteria*)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%
Judgments and Consent Decrees	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (*number of judgements or consent decrees meeting criteria*)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%
Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (*number of counts*)	0	0%
Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (*number of events*)	0	0%
Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 *(number of audits for which notices were submitted)*	0	0%
	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (*number of audits for which violations were disclosed*)	0	0%
		Please Enter Yes or No	
Other	Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%
	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%
	Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%
	Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 2) 2%

>> Repeat Violator (Subtotal 3)

No

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 3) 0%

>> Compliance History Person Classification (Subtotal 7)

Average Performer

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 7) 0%

>> Compliance History Summary

Compliance History Notes

Enhancement for one previous NOV without same or similar violations.

Total Adjustment Percentage (Subtotals 2, 3, & 7) 2%

Screening Date 5-Mar-2009 **Docket No.** 2009-0328-PST-E **PCW**

Respondent Taisseer Al-Aqqad dba Best Food Store

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

Case ID No. 37255

PCW Revision October 30, 2008

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101543593

Media [Statute] Petroleum Storage Tank

Enf. Coordinator Thomas Greimel

Violation Number 1

Rule Cite(s) 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 115.245(2) and Tex. Health & Safety Code § 382.085(b)

Violation Description Failed to verify proper operation of the Stage II equipment at least once every 12 months or upon major system replacement or modification, whichever occurs first. Specifically, the Stage II annual system compliance testing had not been conducted.

Base Penalty $10,000

>> Environmental, Property and Human Health Matrix

OR	Harm		
Release	Major	Moderate	Minor
Actual			
Potential	x		

Percent 25%

>>Programmatic Matrix

Falsification	Major	Moderate	Minor

Percent 0%

Matrix Notes: Human health or the environment will or could be exposed to pollutants which would exceed levels that are protective of human health or environmental receptors as a result of the violation.

Adjustment $7,500

$2,500

Violation Events

Number of Violation Events 1 — 365 Number of violation days

mark only one with an x

daily	
weekly	
monthly	
quarterly	
semiannual	
annual	x
single event	

Violation Base Penalty $2,500

One annual event is recommended for the 12-month period preceding the December 31, 2008 investigation.

Good Faith Efforts to Comply

25.0% Reduction $625

	Before NOV	NOV to EDPRP/Settlement Offer
Extraordinary		
Ordinary	x	
N/A		(mark with x)

Notes: The Respondent came into compliance on January 1, 2009.

Violation Subtotal $1,875

Economic Benefit (EB) for this violation

Estimated EB Amount $1,096

Statutory Limit Test

Violation Final Penalty Total $3,021

This violation Final Assessed Penalty (adjusted for limits) $3,021

Economic Benefit Worksheet

Respondent Taisseer Al-Aqqad dba Best Food Store
Case ID No. 37255
Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101543593
Media Petroleum Storage Tank
Violation No. 1

Percent Interest	Years of Depreciation
5.0	15

Item Description	Item Cost (No commas or $)	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Onetime Costs	EB Amount
Delayed Costs							
Equipment				0.00	$0	$0	$0
Buildings				0.00	$0	$0	$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	$0	$0	$0
Engineering/construction				0.00	$0	$0	$0
Land				0.00	$0	n/a	$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	$0	n/a	$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	$0	n/a	$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	$0	n/a	$0
Permit Costs				0.00	$0	n/a	$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	$0	n/a	$0
Notes for DELAYED costs							
Avoided Costs	ANNUALIZE [1] avoided costs before entering item (except for one-time avoided costs)						
Disposal				0.00	$0	$0	$0
Personnel				0.00	$0	$0	$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	$0	$0	$0
Supplies/equipment				0.00	$0	$0	$0
Financial Assurance [2]				0.00	$0	$0	$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs [3]	$1,000	31-Dec-2007	1-Jan-2009	1.92	$96	$1,000	$1,096
Other (as needed)				0.00	$0	$0	$0
Notes for AVOIDED costs	Estimated avoided cost to conduct annual testing to verify proper operation of the Stage II equipment. Date Required is one year prior to the investigation date. Final Date is the date of compliance.						

Approx. Cost of Compliance $1,000

TOTAL $1,096

Compliance History Report

Customer/Respondent/Owner-Operator:	CN600812614	Al-Aqqad, Taisseer	Classification: AVERAGE	Rating: 2.00
Regulated Entity:	RN101543593	Best Food Store	Classification: AVERAGE	Site Rating: 2.00

ID Number(s): PETROLEUM STORAGE TANK REGISTRATION REGISTRATION 73778

Location: 3576 W SEMINARY DR, FORT WORTH, TX, 76133

TCEQ Region: REGION 04 - DFW METROPLEX

Date Compliance History Prepared: March 04, 2009

Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History: Enforcement

Compliance Period: March 04, 2004 to March 04, 2009

TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding this Compliance History

Name: Thomas Greimel Phone: (512) 239-5690

Site Compliance History Components

1. Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five year compliance period?	Yes
2. Has there been a (known) change in ownership of the site during the compliance period?	No
3. If Yes, who is the current owner?	N/A
4. if Yes, who was/were the prior owner(s)?	N/A
5. When did the change(s) in ownership occur?	N/A

6. Rating Date: 9/1/2008 Repeat Violator: NO

Components (Multimedia) for the Site :

A. Final Enforcement Orders, court judgements, and consent decrees of the state of Texas and the federal government.

N/A

B. Any criminal convictions of the state of Texas and the federal government.

N/A

C. Chronic excessive emissions events.

N/A

D. The approval dates of investigations. (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.)

1 12/15/2006 (518834)
2 02/26/2009 (723705)

E. Written notices of violations (NOV). (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.)

Date: 12/15/2006 (518834)
Self Report? NO Classification: Moderate
Citation: 30 TAC Chapter 115, SubChapter C 115.222(1)
Description: Regular unleaded drop tube was too short.
Self Report? NO Classification: Moderate
Citation: 30 TAC Chapter 115, SubChapter C 115.242(3)(A)
Description: Failure to install swivel adapters.

F. Environmental audits.

N/A

G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs).

N/A

H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates.

N/A

I. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program.

N/A

J. Early compliance.

N/A

Sites Outside of Texas

N/A

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

IN THE MATTER OF AN	§	**BEFORE THE**
ENFORCEMENT ACTION	§	
CONCERNING	§	**TEXAS COMMISSION ON**
TAISSEER AL-AQQAD DBA BEST	§	
FOOD STORE	§	
RN101543593	§	**ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY**

AGREED ORDER
DOCKET NO. 2009-0328-PST-E

I. JURISDICTION AND STIPULATIONS

At its _____ agenda, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("the Commission" or "TCEQ") considered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement action regarding Taisseer Al-Aqqad dba Best Food Store ("the Respondent") under the authority of TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE ch. 382 and TEX. WATER CODE ch. 7. The Executive Director of the TCEQ, through the Enforcement Division, and the Respondent appear before the Commission and together stipulate that:

1. The Respondent owns and operates a convenience store with retail sales of gasoline at 3576 West Seminary Drive in Fort Worth, Tarrant County, Texas (the "Station").

2. The Station consists of one or more sources as defined in TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.003(12).

3. The Commission and the Respondent agree that the Commission has jurisdiction to enter this Agreed Order, and that the Respondent is subject to the Commission's jurisdiction.

4. The Respondent received notice of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations") on or about March 3, 2009.

5. The occurrence of any violation is in dispute and the entry of this Agreed Order shall not constitute an admission by the Respondent of any violation alleged in Section II ("Allegations"), nor of any statute or rule.

6. An administrative penalty in the amount of Three Thousand Twenty-One Dollars ($3,021) is assessed by the Commission in settlement of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations").

The Respondent has paid Two Thousand Four Hundred Seventeen Dollars ($2,417) of the administrative penalty and Six Hundred Four Dollars ($604) is deferred contingent upon the Respondent's timely and satisfactory compliance with all the terms of this Agreed Order. The deferred amount will be waived upon full compliance with the terms of this Agreed Order. If the Respondent fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with all requirements of this Agreed Order, the Executive Director may require the Respondent to pay all or part of the deferred penalty.

7. Any notice and procedures, which might otherwise be authorized or required in this action, are waived in the interest of a more timely resolution of the matter.

8. The Executive Director of the TCEQ and the Respondent have agreed on a settlement of the matters alleged in this enforcement action, subject to the approval of the Commission.

9. The Executive Director recognizes that the City of Fort Worth, a TCEQ contractor, received documentation verifying that the Respondent successfully conducted the required annual testing of the Stage II equipment on January 1, 2009.

10. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that the Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Agreed Order.

11. This Agreed Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order, whichever is later.

12. The provisions of this Agreed Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Agreed Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.

II. ALLEGATIONS

As owner and operator of the Station, the Respondent is alleged to have failed to verify proper operation of the Stage II equipment at least once every 12 months or upon major system replacement or modification, whichever occurs first, in violation of 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 115.245(2) and TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.085(b), as documented during an investigation conducted on December 31, 2008. Specifically, the Stage II annual system compliance testing had not been conducted.

III. DENIALS

The Respondent generally denies each allegation in Section II ("Allegations").

IV. ORDERING PROVISIONS

1. It is, therefore, ordered by the TCEQ that the Respondent pay an administrative penalty as set forth in Section I, Paragraph 6 above. The payment of this administrative penalty and the Respondent's compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order resolve only the allegations in Section II. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective action or penalties for violations which are not raised here. Administrative penalty payments shall be made payable to "TCEQ" and shall be sent with the notation "Re: Taisseer Al-Aqqad dba Best Food Store, Docket No. 2009-0328-PST-E" to:

   Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section
   Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214
   Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
   P.O. Box 13088
   Austin, Texas 78711-3088

2. The provisions of this Agreed Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Respondent. The Respondent is ordered to give notice of the Agreed Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Station operations referenced in this Agreed Order.

3. This Agreed Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against the Respondent in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the OAG to: (1) enforce the terms of this Agreed Order; or (2) pursue violations of a statute within the Commission's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by the Commission under such a statute.

4. This Agreed Order may be executed in multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single original instrument. Any executed signature page to this Agreed Order may be transmitted by facsimile transmission to the other parties, which shall constitute an original signature for all purposes under this Agreed Order.

5. Under 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 70.10(b), the effective date is the date of hand-delivery of the Order to the Respondent, or three days after the date on which the Commission mails notice of the Order to the Respondent, whichever is earlier. The Chief Clerk shall provide a copy of this Agreed Order to each of the parties.

SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

For the Commission

For the Executive Director

Date 8/6/2009

I, the undersigned, have read and understand the attached Agreed Order. I am authorized to agree to the attached Agreed Order on behalf of the entity indicated below my signature, and I do agree to the terms and conditions specified therein. I further acknowledge that the TCEQ, in accepting payment for the penalty amount, is materially relying on such representation.

I also understand that failure to comply with the Ordering Provisions, if any, in this order and/or failure to timely pay the penalty amount, may result in:

- A negative impact on compliance history;
- Greater scrutiny of any permit applications submitted;
- Referral of this case to the Attorney General's Office for contempt, injunctive relief, additional penalties, and/or attorney fees, or to a collection agency;
- Increased penalties in any future enforcement actions;
- Automatic referral to the Attorney General's Office of any future enforcement actions; and
- TCEQ seeking other relief as authorized by law.

In addition, any falsification of any compliance documents may result in criminal prosecution.

Signature

Date 7-15-09

Taisseer Al-aqqad

Name (Printed or typed)
Authorized Representative of
Taisseer Al-Aqqad dba Best Food Store

Title owner

Instructions: Send the original, signed Agreed Order with penalty payment to the Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section at the address in Section IV, Paragraph 1 of this Agreed Order.