

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY - ENFORCEMENT MATTER

DOCKET NO.: 2010-1045-PST-E **TCEQ ID:** RN101630267 **CASE NO.:** 39943
RESPONDENT NAME: MUREE VALLEY INTERNATIONAL INC dba Circle M Food Mart

ORDER TYPE:		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 1660 AGREED ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> FINDINGS AGREED ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> FINDINGS ORDER FOLLOWING SOAH HEARING
<input type="checkbox"/> FINDINGS DEFAULT ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> SHUTDOWN ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> IMMINENT AND SUBSTANTIAL ENDANGERMENT ORDER
<input type="checkbox"/> AMENDED ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> EMERGENCY ORDER	
CASE TYPE:		
<input type="checkbox"/> AIR	<input type="checkbox"/> MULTI-MEDIA (check all that apply)	<input type="checkbox"/> INDUSTRIAL AND HAZARDOUS WASTE
<input type="checkbox"/> PUBLIC WATER SUPPLY	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> PETROLEUM STORAGE TANKS	<input type="checkbox"/> OCCUPATIONAL CERTIFICATION
<input type="checkbox"/> WATER QUALITY	<input type="checkbox"/> SEWAGE SLUDGE	<input type="checkbox"/> UNDERGROUND INJECTION CONTROL
<input type="checkbox"/> MUNICIPAL SOLID WASTE	<input type="checkbox"/> RADIOACTIVE WASTE	<input type="checkbox"/> DRY CLEANER REGISTRATION
<p>SITE WHERE VIOLATION(S) OCCURRED: Circle M Food Mart, 3401 Saint Francis Avenue, Dallas, Dallas County</p> <p>TYPE OF OPERATION: Convenience store with retail sales of gasoline</p> <p>SMALL BUSINESS: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>OTHER SIGNIFICANT MATTERS: There are no complaints. There is no record of additional pending enforcement actions regarding this facility location.</p> <p>INTERESTED PARTIES: No one other than the ED and the Respondent has expressed an interest in this matter.</p> <p>COMMENTS RECEIVED: The <i>Texas Register</i> comment period expired on October 18, 2010. No comments were received.</p> <p>CONTACTS AND MAILING LIST: TCEQ Attorney/SEP Coordinator: None TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Mr. Thomas Greimel, Enforcement Division, Enforcement Team 7, MC 128, (512) 239-5690; Ms. Laurie Eaves, Enforcement Division, MC 219, (512) 239-4495 Respondent: Mr. Kurram A. Sharif, Owner, Circle M Food Mart, 3995 Parker Road, Wylie, Texas 75098 Respondent's Attorney: Not represented by counsel on this enforcement matter</p>		

VIOLATION SUMMARY CHART:		
VIOLATION INFORMATION	PENALTY CONSIDERATIONS	CORRECTIVE ACTIONS TAKEN/REQUIRED
<p>Type of Investigation: <input type="checkbox"/> Complaint <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Routine <input type="checkbox"/> Enforcement Follow-up <input type="checkbox"/> Records Review</p> <p>Date(s) of Complaints Relating to this Case: None</p> <p>Date of Investigation Relating to this Case: May 24, 2010</p> <p>Date of NOV/NOE Relating to this Case: May 26, 2010 (NOE)</p> <p>Background Facts: This was a routine investigation.</p> <p>WASTE</p> <p>Failed to verify proper operation of the Stage II equipment at least once every 12 months [30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 115.245(2) and TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.085(b)].</p>	<p>Total Assessed: \$2,173</p> <p>Total Deferred: \$434 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Expedited Settlement <input type="checkbox"/> Financial Inability to Pay</p> <p>SEP Conditional Offset: \$0</p> <p>Total Paid (Due) to General Revenue: \$107 (remaining \$1,632 due in 16 monthly payments of \$102 each)</p> <p>Person Compliance History Classification <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High <input type="checkbox"/> Average <input type="checkbox"/> Poor</p> <p>Site Compliance History Classification <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High <input type="checkbox"/> Average <input type="checkbox"/> Poor</p> <p>Major Source: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>Applicable Penalty Policy: September 2002</p>	<p>Corrective Actions Taken:</p> <p>The Executive Director recognizes that the City of Dallas Air Pollution Control Program, a TCEQ contractor, received documentation verifying that the Respondent successfully conducted the required annual testing of the Stage II equipment on May 24, 2010.</p>

Additional ID No(s).: PST Facility ID No. 10466



Penalty Calculation Worksheet (PCW)

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

PCW Revision October 30, 2008

TCEQ

DATES	Assigned	1-Jun-2010			
	PCW	25-Jun-2010	Screening	21-Jun-2010	EPA Due

RESPONDENT/FACILITY INFORMATION	
Respondent	MUREE VALLEY INTERNATIONAL INC dba Circle M Food Mart
Reg. Ent. Ref. No.	RN101630267
Facility/Site Region	4-Dallas/Fort Worth
Major/Minor Source	Minor

CASE INFORMATION			
Enf./Case ID No.	39943	No. of Violations	1
Docket No.	2010-1045-PST-E	Order Type	1660
Media Program(s)	Petroleum Storage Tank	Government/Non-Profit	No
Multi-Media		Enf. Coordinator	Thomas Greimel
		EC's Team	Enforcement Team 7
Admin. Penalty \$ Limit Minimum	\$0	Maximum	\$10,000

Penalty Calculation Section

TOTAL BASE PENALTY (Sum of violation base penalties) Subtotal 1 \$2,500

ADJUSTMENTS (+/-) TO SUBTOTAL 1

Subtotals 2-7 are obtained by multiplying the Total Base Penalty (Subtotal 1) by the indicated percentage.

Compliance History -10.0% Reduction Subtotals 2, 3, & 7 -\$250

Notes Reduction due to high performer classification.

Culpability No 0.0% Enhancement Subtotal 4 \$0

Notes The Respondent does not meet the culpability criteria.

Good Faith Effort to Comply Total Adjustments Subtotal 5 \$625

Economic Benefit 0.0% Enhancement* Subtotal 6 \$0

Total EB Amounts \$548 *Capped at the Total EB \$ Amount
 Approx. Cost of Compliance \$500

SUM OF SUBTOTALS 1-7 Final Subtotal \$1,625

OTHER FACTORS AS JUSTICE MAY REQUIRE 33.7% Adjustment \$548

Reduces or enhances the Final Subtotal by the indicated percentage.

Notes Recommended enhancement to capture the avoided cost of compliance associated with the violation.

Final Penalty Amount \$2,173

STATUTORY LIMIT ADJUSTMENT Final Assessed Penalty \$2,173

DEFERRAL 20.0% Reduction Adjustment -\$434

Reduces the Final Assessed Penalty by the indicated percentage. (Enter number only; e.g. 20 for 20% reduction.)

Notes Deferral offered for expedited settlement.

PAYABLE PENALTY \$1,739

Screening Date 21-Jun-2010

Docket No. 2010-1045-PST-E

PCW

Respondent MUREE VALLEY INTERNATIONAL INC dba Circle M Fc

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

Case ID No. 39943

PCW Revision October 30, 2006

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101630267

Media [Statute] Petroleum Storage Tank

Enf. Coordinator Thomas Greimel

Compliance History Worksheet

>> Compliance History Site Enhancement (Subtotal 2)

Component	Number of...	Enter Number Here	Adjust.
NOVs	Written NOVs with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (number of NOVs meeting criteria)	0	0%
	Other written NOVs	0	0%
Orders	Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (number of orders meeting criteria)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%
Judgments and Consent Decrees	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (number of judgements or consent decrees meeting criteria)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%
Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (number of counts)	0	0%
Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (number of events)	0	0%
Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which notices were submitted)	0	0%
	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which violations were disclosed)	0	0%
<i>Please Enter Yes or No</i>			
Other	Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%
	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%
	Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%
	Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 2)

>> Repeat Violator (Subtotal 3)

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 3)

>> Compliance History Person Classification (Subtotal 7)

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 7)

>> Compliance History Summary

Compliance History Notes

Reduction due to high performer classification.

Total Adjustment Percentage (Subtotals 2, 3, & 7)

Screening Date 21-Jun-2010

Docket No: 2010-1045-PST-E

PCW

Respondent MUREE VALLEY INTERNATIONAL INC dba Circle M Food Mart

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

Case ID No: 39943

PCW Revision October 30, 2008

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101630267

Media [Statute] Petroleum Storage Tank

Enf. Coordinator Thomas Grelmel

Violation Number 1

Rule Cite(s)

30 Tex. Admin. Code § 115.245(2) and Tex. Health & Safety Code § 382.085(b)

Violation Description

Failed to verify proper operation of the Stage II equipment at least once every 12 months.

Base Penalty \$10,000

>> Environmental, Property and Human Health Matrix

OR

Release	Harm		
	Major	Moderate	Minor
Actual			
Potential	X		

Percent 25%

>> Programmatic Matrix

Falsification	Major	Moderate	Minor

Percent 0%

Matrix Notes

Human health or the environment will or could be exposed to pollutants which would exceed levels that are protective of human health or environmental receptors as a result of the violation.

Adjustment \$7,500

\$2,500

Violation Events

Number of Violation Events 1

366 Number of violation days

mark only one with an x

daily	
weekly	
monthly	
quarterly	
semiannual	
annual	X
single event	

Violation Base Penalty \$2,500

One annual event is recommended for the 12-month period preceding the May 24, 2010 investigation.

Good Faith Efforts to Comply

25.0% Reduction

\$625

	Before NOV	NOV to ED/PRP/Settlement
Extraordinary		
Ordinary	X	
N/A		(mark with x)

Notes

The Respondent came into compliance on May 24, 2010 prior to the Notice of Enforcement dated May 26, 2010.

Violation Subtotal \$1,875

Economic Benefit (EB) for this violation

Statutory Limit Test

Estimated EB Amount \$548

Violation Final Penalty Total \$2,173

This violation Final Assessed Penalty (adjusted for limits) \$2,173

Economic Benefit Worksheet

Respondent MUREE VALLEY INTERNATIONAL INC dba Circle M Food Mart

Case ID No. 39943

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101630267

Media: Petroleum Storage Tank

Violation No.: 1

Percent Interest	Years of Depreciation
5.0	16

Item Description	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Onetime Costs	EB Amount
------------------	-----------	---------------	------------	-----	----------------	---------------	-----------

Delayed Costs

Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Engineering/construction				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0

Notes for DELAYED costs

Avoided Costs

ANNUALIZE [1] avoided costs before entering item (except for one-time avoided costs)

Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Supplies/equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Financial Assurance [2]				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs [1]	\$500	24-May-2009	24-May-2010	1.92	\$48	\$500	\$548
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0

Notes for AVOIDED costs

Estimated avoided cost for conducting the required Stage II annual testing. The Date Required is one year prior to the investigation date. The Final Date is the compliance date.

Approx. Cost of Compliance

\$500

TOTAL

\$548

Compliance History Report

Customer/Respondent/Owner-Operator: CN603492398 MUREE VALLEY INTERNATIONAL INC Classification: HIGH Rating: 0.00
Regulated Entity: RN101630267 Circle M Food Mart Classification: HIGH Site Rating: 0.00
ID Number(s): PETROLEUM STORAGE TANK REGISTRATION 10466
REGISTRATION
Location: 3401 SAINT FRANCIS AVE, DALLAS, TX, 75228
TCEQ Region: REGION 04 - DFW METROPLEX
Date Compliance History Prepared: June 21, 2010
Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History: Enforcement
Compliance Period: June 21, 2005 to June 21, 2010
TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding this Compliance History
Name: Thomas Greimel Phone: (512) 239-5690

Site Compliance History Components

1. Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five year compliance period? Yes
2. Has there been a (known) change in ownership/operator of the site during the compliance period? Yes
3. If Yes, who is the current owner/operator? MUREE VALLEY INTERNATIONAL INC
4. If Yes, who was/were the prior owner(s)/operator(s) ?
Silwad, Inc.
Al Banna and Ai Banna Enterprise, Inc.
5. When did the change(s) in owner or operator occur?
4/1/2008
8/1/2006
6. Rating Date: 9/1/2009 Repeat Violator: NO

Components (Multimedia) for the Site :

- A. Final Enforcement Orders, court judgements, and consent decrees of the state of Texas and the federal government.
N/A
- B. Any criminal convictions of the state of Texas and the federal government.
N/A
- C. Chronic excessive emissions events.
N/A
- D. The approval dates of investigations. (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.)
1 06/15/2006 (482660)
2 07/22/2008 (685869)
3 05/25/2010 (824444)
- E. Written notices of violations (NOV). (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.)
N/A
- F. Environmental audits.
N/A
- G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs).
N/A
- H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates.
N/A
- I. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program.
N/A
- J. Early compliance.
N/A

Sites Outside of Texas

N/A

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



**IN THE MATTER OF AN
ENFORCEMENT ACTION
CONCERNING
MUREE VALLEY INTERNATIONAL
INC DBA CIRCLE M FOOD MART
RN101630267**

§
§
§
§
§
§

**BEFORE THE
TEXAS COMMISSION ON
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY**

**AGREED ORDER
DOCKET NO. 2010-1045-PST-E**

I. JURISDICTION AND STIPULATIONS

At its _____ agenda, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("the Commission" or "TCEQ") considered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement action regarding MUREE VALLEY INTERNATIONAL INC dba Circle M Food Mart ("the Respondent") under the authority of TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE ch. 382 and TEX. WATER CODE ch. 7. The Executive Director of the TCEQ, through the Enforcement Division, and the Respondent appear before the Commission and together stipulate that:

1. The Respondent owns and operates a convenience store with retail sales of gasoline at 3401 Saint Francis Avenue in Dallas, Dallas County, Texas (the "Station").
2. The Station consists of one or more sources as defined in TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.003(12).
3. The Commission and the Respondent agree that the Commission has jurisdiction to enter this Agreed Order, and that the Respondent is subject to the Commission's jurisdiction.
4. The Respondent received notice of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations") on or about May 31, 2010.
5. The occurrence of any violation is in dispute and the entry of this Agreed Order shall not constitute an admission by the Respondent of any violation alleged in Section II ("Allegations"), nor of any statute or rule.
6. An administrative penalty in the amount of Two Thousand One Hundred Seventy-Three Dollars (\$2,173) is assessed by the Commission in settlement of the violations alleged in Section II

("Allegations"). The Respondent has paid One Hundred Seven Dollars (\$107) of the administrative penalty and Four Hundred Thirty-Four Dollars (\$434) is deferred contingent upon the Respondent's timely and satisfactory compliance with all the terms of this Agreed Order. The deferred amount will be waived upon full compliance with the terms of this Agreed Order. If the Respondent fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with all requirements of this Agreed Order, including the payment schedule, the Executive Director may require the Respondent to pay all or part of the deferred penalty.

The remaining amount of One Thousand Six Hundred Thirty-Two Dollars (\$1,632) of the administrative penalty shall be payable in 16 monthly payments of One Hundred Two Dollars (\$102) each. The next monthly payment shall be paid within 30 days after the effective date of this Agreed Order. The subsequent payments shall each be paid not later than 30 days following the due date of the previous payment until paid in full. If the Respondent fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with the payment requirements of this Agreed Order, the Executive Director may, at the Executive Director's option, accelerate the maturity of the remaining installments, in which event the unpaid balance shall become immediately due and payable without demand or notice. In addition, the failure of the Respondent to meet the payment schedule of this Agreed Order constitutes the failure by the Respondent to timely and satisfactorily comply with all the terms of this Agreed Order.

7. Any notice and procedures, which might otherwise be authorized or required in this action, are waived in the interest of a more timely resolution of the matter.
8. The Executive Director of the TCEQ and the Respondent have agreed on a settlement of the matters alleged in this enforcement action, subject to the approval of the Commission.
9. The Executive Director recognizes that the City of Dallas Air Pollution Control Program, a TCEQ contractor, received documentation verifying that the Respondent successfully conducted the required annual testing of the Stage II equipment on May 24, 2010.
10. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that the Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Agreed Order.
11. This Agreed Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order, whichever is later.
12. The provisions of this Agreed Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Agreed Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.

II. ALLEGATIONS

As owner and operator of the Station, the Respondent is alleged to have failed to verify proper operation of the Stage II equipment at least once every 12 months, in violation of 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 115.245(2) and TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.085(b), as documented during an investigation conducted on May 24, 2010.

III. DENIALS

The Respondent generally denies each allegation in Section II ("Allegations").

IV. ORDERING PROVISIONS

1. It is, therefore, ordered by the TCEQ that the Respondent pay an administrative penalty as set forth in Section I, Paragraph 6 above. The payment of this administrative penalty and the Respondent's compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order resolve only the allegations in Section II. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective action or penalties for violations which are not raised here. Administrative penalty payments shall be made payable to "TCEQ" and shall be sent with the notation "Re: MUREE VALLEY INTERNATIONAL INC dba Circle M Food Mart, Docket No. 2010-1045-PST-E" to:

Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section
Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 13088
Austin, Texas 78711-3088
2. The provisions of this Agreed Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Respondent. The Respondent is ordered to give notice of the Agreed Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Station operations referenced in this Agreed Order.
3. This Agreed Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against the Respondent in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the OAG to: (1) enforce the terms of this Agreed Order; or (2) pursue violations of a statute within the Commission's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by the Commission under such a statute.
4. If the Respondent fails to comply with any of the Ordering Provisions in this Agreed Order within the prescribed schedules, and that failure is caused solely by an act of God, war, strike, riot, or other catastrophe, the Respondent's failure to comply is not a violation of this Agreed Order. The Respondent shall have the burden of establishing to the Executive Director's satisfaction that such an event has occurred. The Respondent shall notify the Executive Director within seven days after the Respondent becomes aware of a delaying event and shall take all reasonable measures to mitigate and minimize any delay.
5. The Executive Director may grant an extension of any deadline in this Agreed Order or in any plan, report, or other document submitted pursuant to this Agreed Order, upon a written and substantiated showing of good cause. All requests for extensions by the Respondent shall be made in writing to the Executive Director. Extensions are not effective until the Respondent receives written approval from the Executive Director. The determination of what constitutes good cause rests solely with the Executive Director.

6. This Agreed Order may be executed in multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single original instrument. Any executed signature page to this Agreed Order may be transmitted by facsimile transmission to the other parties, which shall constitute an original signature for all purposes under this Agreed Order.
7. Under 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 70.10(b), the effective date is the date of hand-delivery of the Order to the Respondent, or three days after the date on which the Commission mails notice of the Order to the Respondent, whichever is earlier. The Chief Clerk shall provide a copy of this Agreed Order to each of the parties.

SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

For the Commission

John Sredlin

For the Executive Director

9/23/2010

Date

I, the undersigned, have read and understand the attached Agreed Order. I am authorized to agree to the attached Agreed Order on behalf of the entity indicated below my signature, and I do agree to the terms and conditions specified therein. I further acknowledge that the TCEQ, in accepting payment for the penalty amount, is materially relying on such representation.

I also understand that failure to comply with the Ordering Provisions, if any, in this order and/or failure to timely pay the penalty amount, may result in:

- A negative impact on compliance history;
- Greater scrutiny of any permit applications submitted;
- Referral of this case to the Attorney General's Office for contempt, injunctive relief, additional penalties, and/or attorney fees, or to a collection agency;
- Increased penalties in any future enforcement actions;
- Automatic referral to the Attorney General's Office of any future enforcement actions; and
- TCEQ seeking other relief as authorized by law.

In addition, any falsification of any compliance documents may result in criminal prosecution.

Khuram Sharif

Signature

Aug 12 '10

Date

Khuram .A. Sharif

Name (Printed or typed)
Authorized Representative of
MUREE VALLEY INTERNATIONAL INC dba Circle M Food Mart

Owner

Title

Instructions: Send the original, signed Agreed Order with penalty payment to the Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section at the address in Section IV, Paragraph 1 of this Agreed Order.

