

Page 1 of 2

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY - ENFORCEMENT MATTER
DOCKET NO.: 2009-1563-AIR-E TCEQ ID: RN105460950 CASE NO.: 38407
RESPONDENT NAME: Josh Gafford

ORDER TYPE:		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 1660 AGREED ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> FINDINGS AGREED ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> FINDINGS ORDER FOLLOWING SOAH HEARING
<input type="checkbox"/> FINDINGS DEFAULT ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> SHUTDOWN ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> IMMEDIATE AND SUBSTANTIAL ENDANGERMENT ORDER
<input type="checkbox"/> AMENDED ORDER	<input type="checkbox"/> EMERGENCY ORDER	
CASE TYPE:		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> AIR	<input type="checkbox"/> MULTI-MEDIA (check all that apply)	<input type="checkbox"/> INDUSTRIAL AND HAZARDOUS WASTE
<input type="checkbox"/> PUBLIC WATER SUPPLY	<input type="checkbox"/> PETROLEUM STORAGE TANKS	<input type="checkbox"/> OCCUPATIONAL CERTIFICATION
<input type="checkbox"/> WATER QUALITY	<input type="checkbox"/> SEWAGE SLUDGE	<input type="checkbox"/> UNDERGROUND INJECTION CONTROL
<input type="checkbox"/> MUNICIPAL SOLID WASTE	<input type="checkbox"/> RADIOACTIVE WASTE	<input type="checkbox"/> DRY CLEANER REGISTRATION
<p>SITE WHERE VIOLATION(S) OCCURRED: Josh Gafford Poultry Farm 333, 7126 Farm-to-Market Road 39 North, Jewett, Leon County</p> <p>TYPE OF OPERATION: Poultry farm</p> <p>SMALL BUSINESS: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>OTHER SIGNIFICANT MATTERS: A complaint was received on July 23, 2009, alleging an off-property odor nuisance. There is no record of additional pending enforcement actions regarding this facility location.</p> <p>INTERESTED PARTIES: A complaint was received, but the complainant has not expressed a desire to protest this action or to speak at Agenda.</p> <p>COMMENTS RECEIVED: The <i>Texas Register</i> comment period expired on April 5, 2010. No comments were received.</p> <p>CONTACTS AND MAILING LIST: TCEQ Attorney/SEP Coordinator: None TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Mr. Kirk Schoppe, Enforcement Division, Enforcement Team 4, MC 149, (512) 239-0489; Ms. Laurie Eaves, Enforcement Division, MC 219, (512) 239-4495 Respondent: Mr. Josh Gafford, Owner/Operator, 7126 Farm-to-Market Road 39 North, Jewett, Texas 75846 Respondent's Attorney: Not represented by counsel on this enforcement matter</p>		

VIOLATION SUMMARY CHART:		
VIOLATION INFORMATION	PENALTY CONSIDERATIONS	CORRECTIVE ACTIONS TAKEN/REQUIRED
<p>Type of Investigation: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complaint <input type="checkbox"/> Routine <input type="checkbox"/> Enforcement Follow-up <input type="checkbox"/> Records Review</p> <p>Date(s) of Complaints Relating to this Case: July 23, 2009</p> <p>Date of Investigation Relating to this Case: July 23, 2009</p> <p>Date of NOV/NOE Relating to this Case: August 31, 2009 (NOE)</p> <p>Background Facts: This was a complaint investigation.</p> <p>AIR</p> <p>Failure to obtain permit authorization. Specifically, the Respondent was operating without having obtained the proper authorization prior to the construction or operation of a pathological waste incinerator [30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 116.110(a) and TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §§ 382.0518(a) and 382.085(b)].</p>	<p>Total Assessed: \$900</p> <p>Total Deferred: \$180 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Expedited Settlement <input type="checkbox"/> Financial Inability to Pay</p> <p>SEP Conditional Offset: \$0</p> <p>Total Paid (Due) to General Revenue: \$120 (remaining \$600 due in 6 monthly payments of \$100 each)</p> <p>Site Compliance History Classification <input type="checkbox"/> High <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Average <input type="checkbox"/> Poor</p> <p>Person Compliance History Classification <input type="checkbox"/> High <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Average <input type="checkbox"/> Poor</p> <p>Major Source: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p>Applicable Penalty Policy: September 2002</p>	<p>Corrective Actions Taken:</p> <p>The Executive Director recognizes that on September 4, 2009, the Respondent obtained permit authorization under 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 106.494 for the pathological waste incinerator at the Site.</p>

Additional ID No(s): N/A



Penalty Calculation Worksheet (PCW)

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

PCW Revision October 30, 2008

DATES	Assigned	8-Sep-2009	Screening	21-Sep-2009	EPA Due	
	PCW	21-Sep-2009				

RESPONDENT/FACILITY INFORMATION	
Respondent	Josh Gafford
Reg. Ent. Ref. No.	RN105460950
Facility/Site Region	9-Waco
Major/Minor Source	Minor

CASE INFORMATION			
Enf./Case ID No.	38407	No. of Violations	1
Docket No.	2009-1563-AIR-E	Order Type	1660
Media Program(s)	Air	Government/Non-Profit	No
Multi-Media		Enf. Coordinator	Kirk Schoppe
		EC's Team	Enforcement Team 4
Admin. Penalty \$ Limit Minimum	\$0	Maximum	\$10,000

Penalty Calculation Section

TOTAL BASE PENALTY (Sum of violation base penalties) Subtotal 1

ADJUSTMENTS (+/-) TO SUBTOTAL 1

Subtotals 2-7 are obtained by multiplying the Total Base Penalty (Subtotal 1) by the indicated percentage.

Compliance History Enhancement Subtotals 2, 3, & 7

Notes

Culpability Enhancement Subtotal 4

Notes

Good Faith Effort to Comply Total Adjustments Subtotal 5

Economic Benefit Enhancement* Subtotal 6

Total EB Amounts *Capped at the Total EB \$ Amount
Approx. Cost of Compliance

SUM OF SUBTOTALS 1-7 Final Subtotal

OTHER FACTORS AS JUSTICE MAY REQUIRE Adjustment

Reduces or enhances the Final Subtotal by the indicated percentage.

Notes

Final Penalty Amount

STATUTORY LIMIT ADJUSTMENT Final Assessed Penalty

DEFERRAL Reduction Adjustment

Reduces the Final Assessed Penalty by the indicated percentage. (Enter number only; e.g. 20 for 20% reduction.)

Notes

PAYABLE PENALTY

Screening Date 21-Sep-2009

Docket No. 2009-1563-AIR-E

PCW

Respondent Josh Gafford

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

Case ID No. 38407

PCW Revision October 30, 2008

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN105460950

Media [Statute] Air

Enf. Coordinator Kirk Schoppe

Compliance History Worksheet

>> Compliance History Site Enhancement (Subtotal 2)

Component	Number of...	Enter Number Here	Adjust.
NOVs	Written NOVs with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (number of NOVs meeting criteria)	0	0%
	Other written NOVs	0	0%
Orders	Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (number of orders meeting criteria)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%
Judgments and Consent Decrees	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (number of judgments or consent decrees meeting criteria)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%
Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (number of counts)	0	0%
Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (number of events)	0	0%
Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which notices were submitted)	0	0%
	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which violations were disclosed)	0	0%

Please Enter Yes or No

Other	Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%
	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%
	Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%
	Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 2) 0%

>> Repeat Violator (Subtotal 3)

No

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 3) 0%

>> Compliance History Person Classification (Subtotal 7)

Average Performer

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 7) 0%

>> Compliance History Summary

Compliance History Notes

No adjustment due to compliance history.

Total Adjustment Percentage (Subtotals 2, 3, & 7) 0%

Screening Date 21-Sep-2009

Docket No. 2009-1563-AIR-E

PCW

Respondent Josh Gafford

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

Case ID No. 38407

PCW Revision October 30, 2009

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN105460950

Media [Statute] Air

Enf. Coordinator Kirk Schoppe

Violation Number

1

Rule Cite(s)

30 Tex. Admin. Code § 116.110(a) and Tex. Health & Safety Code §§ 382.0518(a) and 382.085(b)

Violation Description

Failed to obtain permit authorization. Specifically, the Respondent was operating a pathological waste incinerator without having obtained the proper authorization prior to the construction or operation.

Base Penalty \$10,000

>> Environmental, Property and Human Health Matrix

OR

Release	Harm		
	Major	Moderate	Minor
Actual			
Potential			

Percent 0%

>> Programmatic Matrix

Falsification	Major	Moderate	Minor
	x		

Percent 10%

Matrix Notes

100% of the rule requirement not met.

Adjustment \$9,000

\$1,000

Violation Events

Number of Violation Events 1

43 Number of violation days

mark only one with an x	daily	
	weekly	
	monthly	
	quarterly	x
	semiannual	
	annual	
	single event	

Violation Base Penalty \$1,000

One quarterly event is recommended from the date of the investigation (July 23, 2009) to the date of authorization (September 4, 2009).

Good Faith Efforts to Comply

	10.0% Reduction	
	Before NOV	NOV to EDCRP/Settlement Offer
Extraordinary		
Ordinary		x
N/A		(mark with x)

\$100

Notes

The Respondent returned to compliance on September 4, 2009 and the NOE is dated August 31, 2009.

Violation Subtotal \$900

Economic Benefit (EB) for this violation

Estimated EB Amount \$6

Statutory Limit Test

Violation Final Penalty Total \$900

This violation Final Assessed Penalty (adjusted for limits) \$900

Economic Benefit Worksheet

Respondent Josh Gafford
Case ID No. 38407
Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN105460950
Media Air
Violation No. 1

Percent Interest	Years of Depreciation
5.0	15

Item Description	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Onetime Costs	EB Amount
Delayed Costs							
Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Engineering/construction				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs	\$1,000	23-Jul-2009	4-Sep-2009	0.12	\$6	n/a	\$6
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0

Notes for DELAYED costs Estimated cost for preparation and submittal of a Permit by Rule registration. Date required is the date of the investigation. Final date is the date of compliance.

Item Description	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Onetime Costs	EB Amount
Avoided Costs							
ANNUALIZE [1] avoided costs before entering item (except for one-time avoided costs)							
Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Supplies/equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Financial Assurance [2]				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs [3]				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0

Notes for AVOIDED costs

Approx. Cost of Compliance **TOTAL**
\$6

Compliance History Report

Customer/Respondent/Owner-Operator: CN603323254 GAFFORD, JOSH Classification: AVERAGE Rating: 2.00
Regulated Entity: RN105460950 JOSH GAFFORD POULTRY FARM Classification: AVERAGE Site Rating: 3.01
333 BY DEFAULT
ID Number(s): AIR NEW SOURCE PERMITS REGISTRATION 90433
Location: 7126 FM 39 N, JEWETT, TX,
TCEQ Region: REGION 09 - WACO
Date Compliance History Prepared: September 09, 2009
Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History: Enforcement
Compliance Period: September 09, 2004 to September 09, 2009
TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding this Compliance History
Name: Kirk Schoppe Phone: 239 - 0489

Site Compliance History Components

1. Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five year compliance period? Yes
2. Has there been a (known) change in ownership/operator of the site during the compliance period? No
3. If Yes, who is the current owner/operator? N/A
4. If Yes, who was/were the prior owner(s)/operator(s) ? N/A
5. When did the change(s) in owner or operator occur? N/A
6. Rating Date: 9/1/2009 Repeat Violator: NO

Components (Multimedia) for the Site :

- A. Final Enforcement Orders, court judgements, and consent decrees of the state of Texas and the federal government.
N/A
- B. Any criminal convictions of the state of Texas and the federal government.
N/A
- C. Chronic excessive emissions events.
N/A
- D. The approval dates of investigations. (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.)
N/A
- E. Written notices of violations (NOV). (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.)
N/A
- F. Environmental audits.
N/A
- G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs).
N/A
- H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates.
N/A
- I. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program.
N/A
- J. Early compliance.
N/A

Sites Outside of Texas

N/A

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



**IN THE MATTER OF AN
ENFORCEMENT ACTION
CONCERNING
JOSH GAFFORD
RN105460950**

§
§
§
§
§

**BEFORE THE
TEXAS COMMISSION ON
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY**

AGREED ORDER DOCKET NO. 2009-1563-AIR-E

I. JURISDICTION AND STIPULATIONS

At its agenda, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("the Commission" or "TCEQ") considered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement action regarding Josh Gafford ("the Respondent") under the authority of TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE ch. 382 and TEX. WATER CODE ch. 7. The Executive Director of the TCEQ, through the Enforcement Division, and the Respondent appear before the Commission and together stipulate that:

1. The Respondent owns and operates a poultry farm at 7126 Farm-to-Market Road 39 North in Jewett, Leon County, Texas (the "Site").
2. The Site consists of one or more sources as defined in TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.003(12).
3. The Commission and the Respondent agree that the Commission has jurisdiction to enter this Agreed Order, and that the Respondent is subject to the Commission's jurisdiction.
4. The Respondent received notice of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations") on or about September 5, 2009.
5. The occurrence of any violation is in dispute and the entry of this Agreed Order shall not constitute an admission by the Respondent of any violation alleged in Section II ("Allegations"), nor of any statute or rule.
6. An administrative penalty in the amount of Nine Hundred Dollars (\$900) is assessed by the Commission in settlement of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations"). The Respondent has paid One Hundred Twenty Dollars (\$120) of the administrative penalty and One Hundred Eighty Dollars (\$180) is deferred contingent upon the Respondent's timely and satisfactory

compliance with all the terms of this Agreed Order. The deferred amount will be waived upon full compliance with the terms of this Agreed Order. If the Respondent fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with all requirements of this Agreed Order, including the payment schedule, the Executive Director may require the Respondent to pay all or part of the deferred penalty.

The remaining amount of Six Hundred Dollars (\$600) of the administrative penalty shall be payable in 6 monthly payments of One Hundred Dollars (\$100) each. The next monthly payment shall be paid within 30 days after the effective date of this Agreed Order. The subsequent payments shall each be paid not later than 30 days following the due date of the previous payment until paid in full. If the Respondent fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with the payment requirements of this Agreed Order, the Executive Director may, at the Executive Director's option, accelerate the maturity of the remaining installments, in which event the unpaid balance shall become immediately due and payable without demand or notice. In addition, the failure of the Respondent to meet the payment schedule of this Agreed Order constitutes the failure by the Respondent to timely and satisfactorily comply with all the terms of this Agreed Order.

7. Any notice and procedures, which might otherwise be authorized or required in this action, are waived in the interest of a more timely resolution of the matter.
8. The Executive Director of the TCEQ and the Respondent have agreed on a settlement of the matters alleged in this enforcement action, subject to the approval of the Commission.
9. The Executive Director recognizes that on September 4, 2009, the Respondent obtained permit authorization under 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 106.494 for the pathological waste incinerator at the Site.
10. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that the Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Agreed Order.
11. This Agreed Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order, whichever is later.
12. The provisions of this Agreed Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Agreed Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.

II. ALLEGATIONS

As owner and operator of the Site, the Respondent is alleged to have failed to obtain permit authorization, in violation of 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 116.110(a) and TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §§ 382.0518(a) and 382.085(b), as documented during an investigation conducted on July 23, 2009. Specifically, the Respondent was operating without having obtained the proper authorization prior to the construction or operation of a pathological waste incinerator.

III. DENIALS

The Respondent generally denies each allegation in Section II ("Allegations").

IV. ORDERING PROVISIONS

1. It is, therefore, ordered by the TCEQ that the Respondent pay an administrative penalty as set forth in Section I, Paragraph 6 above. The payment of this administrative penalty and the Respondent's compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order resolve only the allegations in Section II. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective action or penalties for violations which are not raised here. Administrative penalty payments shall be made payable to "TCEQ" and shall be sent with the notation "Re: Josh Gafford, Docket No. 2009-1563-AIR-E" to:

Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section
Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 13088
Austin, Texas 78711-3088

2. The provisions of this Agreed Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Respondent. The Respondent is ordered to give notice of the Agreed Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Site operations referenced in this Agreed Order.
3. If the Respondent fails to comply with any of the Ordering Provisions in this Agreed Order within the prescribed schedules, and that failure is caused solely by an act of God, war, strike, riot, or other catastrophe, the Respondent's failure to comply is not a violation of this Agreed Order. The Respondent shall have the burden of establishing to the Executive Director's satisfaction that such an event has occurred. The Respondent shall notify the Executive Director within seven days after the Respondent becomes aware of a delaying event and shall take all reasonable measures to mitigate and minimize any delay.
4. The Executive Director may grant an extension of any deadline in this Agreed Order or in any plan, report, or other document submitted pursuant to this Agreed Order, upon a written and substantiated showing of good cause. All requests for extensions by the Respondent shall be made in writing to the Executive Director. Extensions are not effective until the Respondent receives written approval from the Executive Director. The determination of what constitutes good cause rests solely with the Executive Director.
5. This Agreed Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against the Respondent in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the OAG to: (1) enforce the terms of this Agreed Order; or (2) pursue violations of a statute within the Commission's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by the Commission under such a statute.
6. This Agreed Order may be executed in multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single original instrument. Any executed signature page to this Agreed Order may be transmitted by facsimile transmission to the other parties, which shall constitute an original signature for all purposes under this Agreed Order.

7. Under 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 70.10(b), the effective date is the date of hand-delivery of the Order to the Respondent, or three days after the date on which the Commission mails notice of the Order to the Respondent, whichever is earlier. The Chief Clerk shall provide a copy of this Agreed Order to each of the parties.

SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

For the Commission



For the Executive Director

3/16/2010
Date

I, the undersigned, have read and understand the attached Agreed Order. I am authorized to agree to the attached Agreed Order on behalf of the entity indicated below my signature, and I do agree to the terms and conditions specified therein. I further acknowledge that the TCEQ, in accepting payment for the penalty amount, is materially relying on such representation.

I also understand that failure to comply with the Ordering Provisions, if any, in this order and/or failure to timely pay the penalty amount, may result in:

- A negative impact on compliance history;
- Greater scrutiny of any permit applications submitted;
- Referral of this case to the Attorney General's Office for contempt, injunctive relief, additional penalties, and/or attorney fees, or to a collection agency;
- Increased penalties in any future enforcement actions;
- Automatic referral to the Attorney General's Office of any future enforcement actions; and
- TCEQ seeking other relief as authorized by law.

In addition, any falsification of any compliance documents may result in criminal prosecution.



Signature

MAR 20 2010
Date

JOSH GAFFORD

Name (Printed or typed)
Authorized Representative of
Josh Gafford

OWNER

Title

Instructions: Send the original, signed Agreed Order with penalty payment to the Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section at the address in Section IV, Paragraph 1 of this Agreed Order.

