

**Executive Summary – Enforcement Matter – Case No. 40995**

**City of Houston**

**RN102405149**

**Docket No. 2011-0088-PST-E**

**Order Type:**

1660 Agreed Order

**Findings Order Justification:**

N/A

**Media:**

PST

**Small Business:**

No

**Location(s) Where Violation(s) Occurred:**

Pard Herman Brown Maintenance Facility, 11600 Wallisville Road, Houston, Harris County

**Type of Operation:**

Fleet refueling facility

**Other Significant Matters:**

Additional Pending Enforcement Actions: No

Past-Due Penalties: No

Other: N/A

Interested Third-Parties: None

**Texas Register Publication Date:** May 6, 2011

**Comments Received:** No

***Penalty Information***

**Total Penalty Assessed:** \$2,300

**Amount Deferred for Expedited Settlement:** \$460

**Amount Deferred for Financial Inability to Pay:** \$0

**Total Paid to General Revenue:** \$1,840

**Total Due to General Revenue:** \$0

Payment Plan: N/A

**SEP Conditional Offset:** \$0

Name of SEP: N/A

**Compliance History Classifications:**

Person/CN - Average

Site/RN - Average

**Major Source:** No

**Statutory Limit Adjustment:** N/A

**Applicable Penalty Policy:** September 2002

**Executive Summary – Enforcement Matter – Case No. 40995**  
**City of Houston**  
**RN102405149**  
**Docket No. 2011-0088-PST-E**

***Investigation Information***

**Complaint Date(s):** N/A  
**Complaint Information:** N/A  
**Date(s) of Investigation:** January 5, 2011  
**Date(s) of NOE(s):** January 5, 2011

***Violation Information***

Failed to monitor underground storage tanks for releases at a frequency of at least once every month (not to exceed 35 days between each monitoring) [30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 334.50(b)(1)(A) and TEX. WATER CODE § 26.3475(c)(1)].

***Corrective Actions/Technical Requirements***

**Corrective Action(s) Completed:**

The Executive Director recognizes that on January 12, 2011, the Respondent submitted documentation demonstrating compliance with the tank release detection method at the Facility.

**Technical Requirements:**

N/A

***Litigation Information***

**Date Petition(s) Filed:** N/A  
**Date Answer(s) Filed:** N/A  
**SOAH Referral Date:** N/A  
**Hearing Date(s):** N/A  
**Settlement Date:** N/A

***Contact Information***

**TCEQ Attorney:** N/A  
**TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator:** Mr. Epifanio Villarreal, Enforcement Division, Enforcement Team 2, MC R-14, (361) 825-3425; Ms. Laurie Eaves, Enforcement Division, MC 219, (512) 239-4495  
**TCEQ SEP Coordinator:** N/A  
**Respondent:** Mr. Gabriel Mussio, Division Manager, City of Houston, P.O. Box 1562, Houston, Texas 77251  
**Respondent's Attorney:** N/A



# Penalty Calculation Worksheet (PCW)

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

PCW Revision October 30, 2008

**TCEQ**

<b>DATES</b>	<b>Assigned</b>	10-Jan-2011	<b>Screening</b>	10-Jan-2011	<b>EPA Due</b>	
	<b>PCW</b>	10-Jan-2011				

## RESPONDENT/FACILITY INFORMATION

<b>Respondent</b>	City of Houston				
<b>Reg. Ent. Ref. No.</b>	RN102405149				
<b>Facility/Site Region</b>	12-Houston	<b>Major/Minor Source</b>	Minor		

## CASE INFORMATION

<b>Enf./Case ID No.</b>	40995	<b>No. of Violations</b>	1	
<b>Docket No.</b>	2011-0088-PST-E	<b>Order Type</b>	1660	
<b>Media Program(s)</b>	Petroleum Storage Tank	<b>Government/Non-Profit</b>	Yes	
<b>Multi-Media</b>		<b>Enf. Coordinator</b>	Epifanio Villarreal	
		<b>EC's Team</b>	Enforcement Team 2	
<b>Admin. Penalty \$</b>	<b>Limit Minimum</b>	\$0	<b>Maximum</b>	\$10,000

## Penalty Calculation Section

**TOTAL BASE PENALTY (Sum of violation base penalties)** **Subtotal 1** **\$2,500**

### ADJUSTMENTS (+/-) TO SUBTOTAL 1

Subtotals 2-7 are obtained by multiplying the Total Base Penalty (Subtotal 1) by the indicated percentage.

**Compliance History** **2.0%** Enhancement **Subtotals 2, 3, & 7** **\$50**

Notes: Enhancement for one dissimilar NOV.

**Culpability** **No** **0.0%** Enhancement **Subtotal 4** **\$0**

Notes: The Respondent does not meet the culpability criteria.

**Good Faith Effort to Comply Total Adjustments** **Subtotal 5** **\$250**

**Economic Benefit** **0.0%** Enhancement\* **Subtotal 6** **\$0**

Total EB Amounts: \$34  
 Approx. Cost of Compliance: \$1,500  
 \*Capped at the Total EB \$ Amount

**SUM OF SUBTOTALS 1-7** **Final Subtotal** **\$2,300**

**OTHER FACTORS AS JUSTICE MAY REQUIRE** **0.0%** **Adjustment** **\$0**

Reduces or enhances the Final Subtotal by the indicated percentage.

Notes:

**Final Penalty Amount** **\$2,300**

**STATUTORY LIMIT ADJUSTMENT** **Final Assessed Penalty** **\$2,300**

**DEFERRAL** **20.0%** Reduction **Adjustment** **-\$460**

Reduces the Final Assessed Penalty by the indicted percentage. (Enter number only; e.g. 20 for 20% reduction.)

Notes: Deferral offered for expedited settlement.

**PAYABLE PENALTY** **\$1,840**

Screening Date 10-Jan-2011

Docket No. 2011-0088-PST-E

PCW

Respondent City of Houston

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

Case ID No. 40995

PCW Revision October 30, 2008

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN102405149

Media [Statute] Petroleum Storage Tank

Enf. Coordinator Epifanio Villarreal

### Compliance History Worksheet

#### >> Compliance History Site Enhancement (Subtotal 2)

Component	Number of...	Enter Number Here	Adjust.
NOVs	Written notices of violation ("NOVs") with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action ( <i>number of NOVs meeting criteria</i> )	0	0%
	Other written NOVs	1	2%
Orders	Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability ( <i>number of orders meeting criteria</i> )	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%
Judgments and Consent Decrees	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government ( <i>number of judgements or consent decrees meeting criteria</i> )	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%
Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government ( <i>number of counts</i> )	0	0%
Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events ( <i>number of events</i> )	0	0%
Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 ( <i>number of audits for which notices were submitted</i> )	0	0%
	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 ( <i>number of audits for which violations were disclosed</i> )	0	0%
<i>Please Enter Yes or No</i>			
Other	Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%
	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%
	Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%
	Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%

**Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 2)** 2%

#### >> Repeat Violator (Subtotal 3)

No

**Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 3)** 0%

#### >> Compliance History Person Classification (Subtotal 7)

Average Performer

**Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 7)** 0%

#### >> Compliance History Summary

Compliance History Notes

Enhancement for one dissimilar NOV.

**Total Adjustment Percentage (Subtotals 2, 3, & 7)** 2%

Screening Date 10-Jan-2011

Docket No. 2011-0088-PST-E

PCW

Respondent City of Houston

Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)

Case ID No. 40995

PCW Revision October 30, 2008

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN102405149

Media [Statute] Petroleum Storage Tank

Enf. Coordinator Epifanio Villarreal

Violation Number 1

Rule Cite(s) 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 334.50(b)(1)(A) and Tex. Water Code § 26.3475(c)(1)

Violation Description Failed to monitor underground storage tanks ("USTs") for releases at a frequency of at least once every month (not to exceed 35 days between each monitoring).

Base Penalty \$10,000

>> Environmental, Property and Human Health Matrix

OR

Release	Harm			Percent
	Major	Moderate	Minor	
Actual				25%
Potential	x			

>> Programmatic Matrix

Falsification	Harm			Percent
	Major	Moderate	Minor	
				0%

Matrix Notes Human health or the environment could be exposed to a significant amount of pollutants that would exceed levels protective of human health or environmental receptors.

Adjustment \$7,500

\$2,500

Violation Events

Number of Violation Events 1 Number of violation days 5

mark only one with an x	daily	
	weekly	
	monthly	x
	quarterly	
	semiannual	
	annual	
	single event	

Violation Base Penalty \$2,500

One monthly event is recommended from the January 5, 2011 investigation approval date to the January 10, 2011 screening date.

Good Faith Efforts to Comply

10.0% Reduction \$250

	Before NOV	NOV to EDPRP/Settlement Offer
Extraordinary		
Ordinary		x
N/A		(mark with x)

Notes The Respondent achieved compliance on January 12, 2011.

Violation Subtotal \$2,250

Economic Benefit (EB) for this violation

Statutory Limit Test

Estimated EB Amount \$34

Violation Final Penalty Total \$2,300

This violation Final Assessed Penalty (adjusted for limits) \$2,300

# Economic Benefit Worksheet

**Respondent** City of Houston  
**Case ID No.** 40995  
**Reg. Ent. Reference No.** RN102405149  
**Media** Petroleum Storage Tank  
**Violation No.** 1

Percent Interest	Years of Depreciation
5.0	15

Item Description	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Onetime Costs	EB Amount
------------------	-----------	---------------	------------	-----	----------------	---------------	-----------

No commas or \$

### Delayed Costs

Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Engineering/construction				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Other (as needed)	\$1,500	29-Jul-2010	12-Jan-2011	0.46	\$34	n/a	\$34

Notes for DELAYED costs

Estimated cost to provide release detection for the USTs at the Facility. The Date Required is the investigation date. The Final Date is the date of compliance.

### Avoided Costs

**ANNUALIZE [1] avoided costs before entering item (except for one-time avoided costs)**

Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Supplies/equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Financial Assurance [2]				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs [3]				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0

Notes for AVOIDED costs

Approx. Cost of Compliance	\$1,500	<b>TOTAL</b>	\$34
----------------------------	---------	--------------	------

# Compliance History

Customer/Respondent/Owner-Operator:	CN600128995 City of Houston	Classification: AVERAGE	Rating: 2.32
Regulated Entity:	RN102405149 PARD HERMAN BROWN MAINTENANCE FAC	Classification: AVERAGE	Site Rating: 0.60
ID Number(s):	PETROLEUM STORAGE TANK REGISTRATION	REGISTRATION	65256
Location:	11600 WALLISVILLE RD, HOUSTON, HARRIS COUNTY, TX		
TCEQ Region:	REGION 12 - HOUSTON		
Date Compliance History Prepared:	January 10, 2011		
Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History:	Enforcement		
Compliance Period:	January 10, 2006 to January 10, 2011		

TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding this Compliance History

Name: Epi Villarreal Phone: 361-825-3425

### Site Compliance History Components

1. Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five year compliance period? Yes
2. Has there been a (known) change in ownership/operator of the site during the compliance period? No
3. If Yes, who is the current owner/operator? N/A
4. If Yes, who was/were the prior owner(s)/operator(s)? N/A
5. When did the change(s) in owner or operator occur? N/A
6. Rating Date: 9/1/2010 Repeat Violator: NO

### Components (Multimedia) for the Site :

- A. Final Enforcement Orders, court judgments, and consent decrees of the State of Texas and the federal government.  
N/A
- B. Any criminal convictions of the state of Texas and the federal government.  
N/A
- C. Chronic excessive emissions events.  
N/A
- D. The approval dates of investigations. (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.)
 

1	04/23/2007	(556132)
2	07/26/2007	(567713)
3	10/29/2007	(598649)
4	08/05/2009	(763857)
5	01/05/2011	(879854)
- E. Written notices of violations (NOV). (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.)
 

Date:	07/26/2007 (567713)	CN600128995
Self Report?	NO	Classification: Moderate
Citation:	30 TAC Chapter 115, SubChapter C 115.242(3)	
Description:	30 Tex. Admin. Code Section 115.242 (3) - Failure to maintain the Stage II vapor recovery system in proper operating condition, as specified by the manufacturer and/or any applicable CARB Executive Order(s), and free of defects that would impair the effectiveness of the system. **** During the investigation the 103.1 test failed. The facility continued to dispense gas under a failed test.	
- F. Environmental audits.  
N/A
- G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs).

N/A

H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates.

N/A

I. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program.

N/A

J. Early compliance.

N/A

Sites Outside of Texas

N/A

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



**IN THE MATTER OF AN  
ENFORCEMENT ACTION  
CONCERNING  
CITY OF HOUSTON  
RN102405149**

§  
§  
§  
§  
§

**BEFORE THE  
TEXAS COMMISSION ON  
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY**

**AGREED ORDER  
DOCKET NO. 2011-0088-PST-E**

**I. JURISDICTION AND STIPULATIONS**

At its \_\_\_\_\_ agenda, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("the Commission" or "TCEQ") considered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement action regarding City of Houston ("the Respondent") under the authority of TEX. WATER CODE chs. 7 and 26. The Executive Director of the TCEQ, through the Enforcement Division, and the Respondent appear before the Commission and together stipulate that:

1. The Respondent owns and operates a fleet refueling facility at 11600 Wallisville Road, Houston, Harris County, Texas (the "Facility").
2. The Respondent's three underground storage tanks ("USTs") are not exempt or excluded from regulation under the Texas Water Code or the rules of the Commission.
3. The Commission and the Respondent agree that the Commission has jurisdiction to enter this Agreed Order, and that the Respondent is subject to the Commission's jurisdiction.
4. The Respondent received notice of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations") on or about January 10, 2011.
5. The occurrence of any violation is in dispute and the entry of this Agreed Order shall not constitute an admission by the Respondent of any violation alleged in Section II ("Allegations"), nor of any statute or rule.
6. An administrative penalty in the amount of Two Thousand Three Hundred Dollars (\$2,300) is assessed by the Commission in settlement of the violations alleged in Section

II ("Allegations"). The Respondent has paid One Thousand Eight Hundred Forty Dollars (\$1,840) of the administrative penalty and Four Hundred Sixty Dollars (\$460) is deferred contingent upon the Respondent's timely and satisfactory compliance with all the terms of this Agreed Order. The deferred amount will be waived upon full compliance with the terms of this Agreed Order. If the Respondent fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with all requirements of this Agreed Order, the Executive Director may require the Respondent to pay all or part of the deferred penalty.

7. Any notice and procedures, which might otherwise be authorized or required in this action, are waived in the interest of a more timely resolution of the matter.
8. The Executive Director of the TCEQ and the Respondent have agreed on a settlement of the matters alleged in this enforcement action, subject to the approval of the Commission.
9. The Executive Director recognizes that on January 12, 2011, the Respondent submitted documentation demonstrating compliance with the tank release detection method at the Facility.
10. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that the Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Agreed Order.
11. This Agreed Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order, whichever is later.
12. The provisions of this Agreed Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Agreed Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.

## **II. ALLEGATIONS**

As owner and operator of the Facility, the Respondent is alleged to have failed to monitor USTs for releases at a frequency of at least once every month (not to exceed 35 days between each monitoring), in violation of 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 334.50(b)(1)(A) and TEX. WATER CODE § 26.3475(c)(1), as documented during a record review conducted on January 5, 2011.

## **III. DENIALS**

The Respondent generally denies each allegation in Section II ("Allegations").

#### IV. ORDERING PROVISIONS

1. It is, therefore, ordered by the TCEQ that the Respondent pay an administrative penalty as set forth in Section I, Paragraph 6 above. The payment of this administrative penalty and the Respondent's compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order resolve only the allegations in Section II. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective action or penalties for violations which are not raised here. Administrative penalty payments shall be made payable to "TCEQ" and shall be sent with the notation "Re: City of Houston, Docket No. 2011-0088-PST-E" to:  
  

Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section  
Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214  
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 13088  
Austin, Texas 78711-3088
2. The provisions of this Agreed Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Respondent. The Respondent is ordered to give notice of the Agreed Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Facility operations referenced in this Agreed Order.
3. This Agreed Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against the Respondent in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the OAG to: (1) enforce the terms of this Agreed Order; or (2) pursue violations of a statute within the Commission's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by the Commission under such a statute.
4. This Agreed Order may be executed in separate and multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single instrument. Any page of this Agreed Order may be copied, scanned, digitized, converted to electronic portable document format ("pdf"), or otherwise reproduced and may be transmitted by digital or electronic transmission, including but not limited to facsimile transmission and electronic mail. Any signature affixed to this Agreed Order shall constitute an original signature for all purposes and may be used, filed, substituted, or issued for any purpose for which an original signature could be used. The term "signature" shall include manual signatures and true and accurate reproductions of manual signatures created, executed, endorsed, adopted, or authorized by the person or persons to whom the signatures are attributable. Signatures may be copied or reproduced digitally, electronically, by photocopying, engraving, imprinting, lithographing, electronic mail, facsimile transmission, stamping, or any other means or process which the Executive Director deems acceptable. In this paragraph exclusively, the terms "electronic transmission", "owner", "person", "writing", and "written" shall have the meanings assigned to them under TEX. BUS. ORG. CODE § 1.002.
5. Under 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 70.10(b), the effective date is the date of hand-delivery of the Order to the Respondent, or three days after the date on which the Commission mails notice of the Order to the Respondent, whichever is earlier. The Chief Clerk shall provide a copy of this Agreed Order to each of the parties.

## SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

\_\_\_\_\_  
For the Commission

John Szallier  
\_\_\_\_\_  
For the Executive Director

5/12/2011  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

I, the undersigned, have read and understand the attached Agreed Order. I am authorized to agree to the attached Agreed Order on behalf of the entity indicated below my signature, and I do agree to the terms and conditions specified therein. I further acknowledge that the TCEQ, in accepting payment for the penalty amount, is materially relying on such representation.

I also understand that failure to comply with the Ordering Provisions, if any, in this order and/or failure to timely pay the penalty amount, may result in:

- A negative impact on compliance history;
- Greater scrutiny of any permit applications submitted;
- Referral of this case to the Attorney General's Office for contempt, injunctive relief, additional penalties, and/or attorney fees, or to a collection agency;
- Increased penalties in any future enforcement actions;
- Automatic referral to the Attorney General's Office of any future enforcement actions; and
- TCEQ seeking other relief as authorized by law.

In addition, any falsification of any compliance documents may result in criminal prosecution.

[Signature]  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

4-01-11  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

Gabriel Mussio  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Name (Printed or typed)  
Authorized Representative of  
City of Houston

Division Manager  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Title

**Instructions:** Send the original, signed Agreed Order with penalty payment to the Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section at the address in Section IV, Paragraph 1 of this Agreed Order.