

Executive Summary – Enforcement Matter – Case No. 49610
SBBQ Operations LLC dba Sadler's Bar B Que Sales
RN101747905
Docket No. 2014-1656-AIR-E

Order Type:

1660 Agreed Order

Findings Order Justification:

N/A

Media:

AIR

Small Business:

No

Location(s) Where Violation(s) Occurred:

Sadler's Bar B Que Sales, 1206 North Frisco Street, Henderson, Rusk County

Type of Operation:

Meat processing and packing plant

Other Significant Matters:

Additional Pending Enforcement Actions: No

Past-Due Penalties: No

Other: N/A

Interested Third-Parties: The complainant has expressed an interest in this matter but does not wish to speak at Agenda.

Texas Register Publication Date: April 10, 2015

Comments Received: No

Penalty Information

Total Penalty Assessed: \$10,000

Amount Deferred for Expedited Settlement: \$2,000

Amount Deferred for Financial Inability to Pay: \$0

Total Paid to General Revenue: \$8,000

Total Due to General Revenue: \$0

Payment Plan: N/A

Supplemental Environmental Project ("SEP") Conditional Offset: \$0

Name of SEP: N/A

Compliance History Classifications:

Person/CN - N/A

Site/RN - N/A

Major Source: No

Statutory Limit Adjustment: N/A

Applicable Penalty Policy: April 2014

Investigation Information

Complaint Date(s): July 3, 2014 through December 23, 2014

Complaint Information: Alleged foul odors were emanating from the facility

Executive Summary – Enforcement Matter – Case No. 49610
SBBQ Operations LLC dba Sadler's Bar B Que Sales
RN101747905
Docket No. 2014-1656-AIR-E

Date(s) of Investigation: July 24, 2014 through August 5, 2014 and November 11, 2014

Date(s) of NOE(s): September 4, 2014

Violation Information

Failed to prevent nuisance odor conditions. Specifically, citizens collected evidence documenting strong to very strong, highly offensive odors from the Plant's wastewater treatment ponds on August 4, 7, 8, 13, 14, 18, 24, and 26, 2014 and TCEQ staff detected a light rancid grease odor downwind of the Plant's wastewater treatment ponds on August 4, 2014, resulting in nuisance odor conditions [30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 101.4 and TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.085(a) and (b)].

Corrective Actions/Technical Requirements

Corrective Action(s) Completed:

N/A

Technical Requirements:

The Order will require the Respondent to:

- a. Within 30 days, implement measures designed to prevent nuisance odor conditions; and
- b. Within 45 days, submit written certification to demonstrate compliance with a.

Litigation Information

Date Petition(s) Filed: N/A

Date Answer(s) Filed: N/A

SOAH Referral Date: N/A

Hearing Date(s): N/A

Settlement Date: N/A

Contact Information

TCEQ Attorney: N/A

TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Carol McGrath, Enforcement Division, Enforcement Team 4, MC R-13, (210) 403-4063; Candy Garrett, Enforcement Division, MC 219, (512) 239-1456

TCEQ SEP Coordinator: N/A

Respondent: Russell Munday, Vice President of Operations, SBBQ Operations LLC, 1206 North Frisco Street, Henderson, Texas 75652

Respondent's Attorney: N/A



Penalty Calculation Worksheet (PCW)

TCEQ

DATES	Assigned	4-Nov-2014	Screening	5-Nov-2014	EPA Due	
	PCW	5-Nov-2014				

RESPONDENT/FACILITY INFORMATION			
Respondent	SBBQ Operations LLC dba Sadler's Bar B Que Sales		
Reg. Ent. Ref. No.	RN101747905		
Facility/Site Region	5-Tyler	Major/Minor Source	Minor

CASE INFORMATION			
Enf./Case ID No.	49610	No. of Violations	1
Docket No.	2014-1656-AIR-E	Order Type	1660
Media Program(s)	Air	Government/Non-Profit	No
Multi-Media		Enf. Coordinator	Carol McGrath
		EC's Team	Enforcement Team 5
Admin. Penalty \$ Limit Minimum	\$0	Maximum	\$25,000

Penalty Calculation Section

TOTAL BASE PENALTY (Sum of violation base penalties)	Subtotal 1	\$10,000
---	-------------------	----------

ADJUSTMENTS (+/-) TO SUBTOTAL 1

Subtotals 2-7 are obtained by multiplying the Total Base Penalty (Subtotal 1) by the indicated percentage.

Compliance History	0.0% Enhancement	Subtotals 2, 3, & 7	\$0
---------------------------	------------------	--------------------------------	-----

Notes: No adjustments for Compliance History.

Culpability	No	0.0% Enhancement	Subtotal 4	\$0
--------------------	----	------------------	-------------------	-----

Notes: The Respondent does not meet the culpability criteria.

Good Faith Effort to Comply Total Adjustments	Subtotal 5	\$0
--	-------------------	-----

Economic Benefit	0.0% Enhancement*	Subtotal 6	\$0
-------------------------	-------------------	-------------------	-----

Total EB Amounts	\$209
Estimated Cost of Compliance	\$5,000

*Capped at the Total EB \$ Amount

SUM OF SUBTOTALS 1-7	Final Subtotal	\$10,000
-----------------------------	-----------------------	----------

OTHER FACTORS AS JUSTICE MAY REQUIRE	0.0%	Adjustment	\$0
---	------	-------------------	-----

Reduces or enhances the Final Subtotal by the indicated percentage.

Notes:

Final Penalty Amount \$10,000

STATUTORY LIMIT ADJUSTMENT	Final Assessed Penalty	\$10,000
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	----------

DEFERRAL	20.0% Reduction	Adjustment	-\$2,000
-----------------	-----------------	-------------------	----------

Reduces the Final Assessed Penalty by the indicated percentage. (Enter number only; e.g. 20 for 20% reduction.)

Notes:

Deferral offered for expedited settlement.

PAYABLE PENALTY	\$8,000
------------------------	---------

Screening Date 5-Nov-2014

Docket No. 2014-1656-AIR-E

PCW

Respondent SBBQ Operations LLC dba Sadler's Bar B Que Sales

Policy Revision 4 (April 2014)

Case ID No. 49610

PCW Revision March 26, 2014

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101747905

Media [Statute] Air

Enf. Coordinator Carol McGrath

Compliance History Worksheet

>> Compliance History Site Enhancement (Subtotal 2)

Component	Number of...	Enter Number Here	Adjust.
NOVs	Written notices of violation ("NOVs") with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (<i>number of NOVs meeting criteria</i>)	0	0%
	Other written NOVs	0	0%
Orders	Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (<i>number of orders meeting criteria</i>)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%
Judgments and Consent Decrees	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (<i>number of judgments or consent decrees meeting criteria</i>)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%
Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (<i>number of counts</i>)	0	0%
Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (<i>number of events</i>)	0	0%
Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (<i>number of audits for which notices were submitted</i>)	0	0%
	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (<i>number of audits for which violations were disclosed</i>)	0	0%

Please Enter Yes or No

Other	Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%
	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%
	Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%
	Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 2) 0%

>> Repeat Violator (Subtotal 3)

N/A

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 3) 0%

>> Compliance History Person Classification (Subtotal 7)

N/A

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 7) 0%

>> Compliance History Summary

Compliance History Notes

No adjustments for Compliance History.

Total Compliance History Adjustment Percentage (Subtotals 2, 3, & 7) 0%

>> Final Compliance History Adjustment

Final Adjustment Percentage *capped at 100% 0%

Screening Date 5-Nov-2014

Docket No. 2014-1656-AIR-E

PCW

Respondent SBBQ Operations LLC dba Sadler's Bar B Que Sales

Policy Revision 4 (April 2014)

Case ID No. 49610

PCW Revision March 26, 2014

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101747905

Media [Statute] Air

Enf. Coordinator Carol McGrath

Violation Number 1

Rule Cite(s) 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 101.4 and Tex. Health & Safety Code § 382.085(a) and (b)

Violation Description Failed to prevent nuisance odor conditions. Specifically, citizen collected evidence documented strong to very strong, highly offensive odors from the Plant's wastewater treatment ponds on August 4, 7, 8, 13, 14, 18, 24, and 26, 2014 and TCEQ staff detected a light rancid grease odor downwind of the Plant's wastewater treatment ponds on August 4, 2014, resulting in nuisance odor conditions.

Base Penalty \$25,000

>> Environmental, Property and Human Health Matrix

OR

Release	Harm			Percent
	Major	Moderate	Minor	
Actual			X	5.0%
Potential				

>> Programmatic Matrix

Falsification	Major	Moderate	Minor	Percent
				0.0%

Matrix Notes Human health or the environment has been exposed to insignificant amounts of pollutants.

Adjustment \$23,750

\$1,250

Violation Events

Number of Violation Events 8 Number of violation days 8

mark only one with an x

daily	
weekly	
monthly	
quarterly	
semiannual	
annual	
single event	X

Violation Base Penalty \$10,000

Eight single events are recommended, one for each day a nuisance odor was documented.

Good Faith Efforts to Comply

0.0%

Reduction \$0

Before NOE/NOV NOE/NOV to EDRP/Settlement Offer

Extraordinary		
Ordinary		
N/A	X	(mark with x)

Notes The Respondent does not meet the good faith criteria for this violation.

Violation Subtotal \$10,000

Economic Benefit (EB) for this violation

Statutory Limit Test

Estimated EB Amount \$209

Violation Final Penalty Total \$10,000

This violation Final Assessed Penalty (adjusted for limits) \$10,000

Economic Benefit Worksheet

Respondent SBBQ Operations LLC dba Sadler's Bar B Que Sales
Case ID No. 49610
Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101747905
Media Air
Violation No. 1

Percent Interest	Years of Depreciation
5.0	15

Item Description	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Onetime Costs	EB Amount
No commas or \$							

Delayed Costs

Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Engineering/Construction				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Other (as needed)	\$5,000	4-Aug-2014	5-Jun-2015	0.84	\$209	n/a	\$209

Notes for DELAYED costs

Estimated cost to implement measures designed to prevent nuisance odor conditions. The Date Required is the first date a nuisance was documented. The Final Date is the expected date of compliance.

Avoided Costs

ANNUALIZE [1] avoided costs before entering item (except for one-time avoided costs)

Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Supplies/Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Financial Assurance [2]				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs [3]				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0

Notes for AVOIDED costs

Approx. Cost of Compliance

\$5,000

TOTAL

\$209

The TCEQ is committed to accessibility.

To request a more accessible version of this report, please contact the TCEQ Help Desk at (512) 239-4357.



Compliance History Report

PUBLISHED Compliance History Report for CN604696609, RN101747905, Rating Year 2014 which includes Compliance History (CH) components from September 1, 2009, through August 31, 2014.

Customer, Respondent, or Owner/Operator: CN604696609, SBBQ Operations, LLC **Classification:** N/A **Rating:** N/A

Regulated Entity: RN101747905, SADLER'S BAR B QUE SALES **Classification:** N/A **Rating:** N/A

Complexity Points: N/A **Repeat Violator:** N/A

CH Group: 14 - Other

Location: 1206 N FRISCO ST., HENDERSON, TX. 75652-6924, RUSK COUNTY

TCEQ Region: REGION 05 - TYLER

ID Number(s):

AIR QUALITY NON PERMITTED ID NUMBER R05

Compliance History Period: September 01, 2009 to August 31, 2014 **Rating Year:** 2014

Rating Date: 09/01/2014

Date Compliance History Report Prepared: November 25, 2014

Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History: Enforcement

Component Period Selected: November 25, 2009 to November 25, 2014

TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding This Compliance History.

Name: Carol McGrath

Phone: (210) 403-4063

Site and Owner/Operator History:

- 1) Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five year compliance period? YES
- 2) Has there been a (known) change in ownership/operator of the site during the compliance period? NO
- 3) If **YES** for #2, who is the current owner/operator? N/A
- 4) If **YES** for #2, who was/were the prior owner(s)/operator(s)? N/A
- 5) If **YES**, when did the change(s) in owner or operator occur? N/A

Components (Multimedia) for the Site Are Listed in Sections A - J

A. Final Orders, court judgments, and consent decrees: N/A

B. Criminal convictions: N/A

C. Chronic excessive emissions events: N/A

D. The approval dates of investigations (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

Item 1 May 20, 2010 (798177)

E. Written notices of violations (NOV) (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

A notice of violation represents a written allegation of a violation of a specific regulatory requirement from the commission to a regulated entity. A notice of violation is not a final enforcement action, nor proof that a violation has actually occurred.

N/A

F. Environmental audits: N/A

G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs): N/A

H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates: N/A

I. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program: N/A

J. Early compliance: N/A

Sites Outside of Texas: N/A

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



IN THE MATTER OF AN
ENFORCEMENT ACTION
CONCERNING
SBBQ OPERATIONS LLC DBA
SADLER'S BAR B QUE SALES
RN101747905

§
§
§
§
§
§

BEFORE THE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON

ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

AGREED ORDER
DOCKET NO. 2014-1656-AIR-E

I. JURISDICTION AND STIPULATIONS

On _____, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("the Commission" or "TCEQ") considered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement action regarding SBBQ Operations LLC dba Sadler's Bar B Que Sales ("Respondent") under the authority of TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE ch. 382 and TEX. WATER CODE ch. 7. The Executive Director of the TCEQ, through the Enforcement Division, and the Respondent together stipulate that:

1. The Respondent owns and operates a meat processing and packing plant located at 1206 North Frisco Street in Henderson, Rusk County, Texas (the "Plant").
2. The Plant consists of one or more sources as defined in TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.003(12).
3. The Executive Director and the Respondent agree that the Commission has jurisdiction to enter this Agreed Order, and that the Respondent is subject to the Commission's jurisdiction.
4. The Respondent received notice of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations") on or about September 9, 2014.
5. The occurrence of any violation is in dispute and the entry of this Agreed Order shall not constitute an admission by the Respondent of any violation alleged in Section II ("Allegations"), nor of any statute or rule.
6. An administrative penalty in the amount of Ten Thousand Dollars (\$10,000) is assessed by the Commission in settlement of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations").

The Respondent has paid Eight Thousand Dollars (\$8,000) of the administrative penalty and Two Thousand Dollars (\$2,000) is deferred contingent upon the Respondent's timely and satisfactory compliance with all the terms of this Agreed Order. The deferred amount will be waived upon full compliance with the terms of this Agreed Order. If the Respondent fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with all requirements of this Agreed Order, the Executive Director may require the Respondent to pay all or part of the deferred penalty.

7. Any notice and procedures, which might otherwise be authorized or required in this action, are waived in the interest of a more timely resolution of the matter.
8. The Executive Director and the Respondent agree on a settlement of the matters alleged in this enforcement action, subject to final approval in accordance with 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 70.10(a).
9. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that the Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Agreed Order.
10. This Agreed Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order, whichever is later.
11. The provisions of this Agreed Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Agreed Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.

II. ALLEGATIONS

As owner and operator of the Plant, the Respondent is alleged to have failed to prevent nuisance odor conditions, in violation of 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 101.4 and TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.085(a) and (b) as documented during an investigation conducted from July 24 through August 5, 2014 and a record review conducted on November 11, 2014. Specifically, citizen collected evidence documented strong to very strong, highly offensive odors from the Plant's wastewater treatment ponds on August 4, 7, 8, 13, 14, 18, 24, and 26, 2014 and TCEQ staff detected a light rancid grease odor downwind of the Plant's wastewater treatment ponds on August 4, 2014, resulting in nuisance odor conditions.

III. DENIALS

The Respondent generally denies each allegation in Section II ("Allegations").

IV. ORDERING PROVISIONS

1. It is, therefore, ordered by the TCEQ that the Respondent pay an administrative penalty as set forth in Section I, Paragraph 6 above. The payment of this administrative penalty

and the Respondent's compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order resolve only the allegations in Section II. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective action or penalties for violations which are not raised here. Administrative penalty payments shall be made payable to "TCEQ" and shall be sent with the notation "Re: SBBQ Operations LLC dba Sadler's Bar B Que Sales, Docket No. 2014-1656-AIR-E" to:

Financial Administration Division, Revenue Operations Section
Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 13088
Austin, Texas 78711-3088

2. It is further ordered that the Respondent shall undertake the following technical requirements:
 - a. Within 30 days after the effective date of this Agreed Order, implement measures designed to prevent nuisance odor conditions; and
 - b. Within 45 days after the effective date of this Agreed Order, submit written certification as described below, and include detailed supporting documentation including photographs, receipts, and/or other records to demonstrate compliance with Ordering Provision No. 2.a. The certification shall be notarized by a State of Texas Notary Public and include the following certification language:

"I certify under penalty of law that I have personally examined and am familiar with the information submitted and all attached documents, and that based on my inquiry of those individuals immediately responsible for obtaining the information, I believe that the submitted information is true, accurate and complete. I am aware that there are significant penalties for submitting false information, including the possibility of fines and imprisonment for knowing violations."

The certification shall be submitted to:

Order Compliance Team
Enforcement Division, MC 149A
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 13087
Austin, Texas 78711-3087

with a copy to:

Air Section Manager
Tyler Regional Office
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
2916 Teague Drive
Tyler, Texas 75701-3734

3. The provisions of this Agreed Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Respondent. The Respondent is ordered to give notice of the Agreed Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Plant operations referenced in this Agreed Order.
4. If the Respondent fails to comply with any of the Ordering Provisions in this Agreed Order within the prescribed schedules, and that failure is caused solely by an act of God, war, strike, riot, or other catastrophe, the Respondent's failure to comply is not a violation of this Agreed Order. The Respondent shall have the burden of establishing to the Executive Director's satisfaction that such an event has occurred. The Respondent shall notify the Executive Director within seven days after the Respondent becomes aware of a delaying event and shall take all reasonable measures to mitigate and minimize any delay.
5. The Executive Director may grant an extension of any deadline in this Agreed Order or in any plan, report, or other document submitted pursuant to this Agreed Order, upon a written and substantiated showing of good cause. All requests for extensions by the Respondent shall be made in writing to the Executive Director. Extensions are not effective until the Respondent receives written approval from the Executive Director. The determination of what constitutes good cause rests solely with the Executive Director.
6. This Agreed Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against the Respondent in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the OAG to: (1) enforce the terms of this Agreed Order; or (2) pursue violations of a statute within the Commission's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by the Commission under such a statute.
7. This Agreed Order may be executed in separate and multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single instrument. Any page of this Agreed Order may be copied, scanned, digitized, converted to electronic portable document format ("pdf"), or otherwise reproduced and may be transmitted by digital or electronic transmission, including but not limited to facsimile transmission and electronic mail. Any signature affixed to this Agreed Order shall constitute an original signature for all purposes and may be used, filed, substituted, or issued for any purpose for which an original signature could be used. The term "signature" shall include manual signatures and true and accurate reproductions of manual signatures created, executed, endorsed, adopted, or authorized by the person or persons to whom the signatures are attributable. Signatures may be copied or reproduced digitally, electronically, by photocopying, engraving, imprinting, lithographing, electronic mail, facsimile transmission, stamping, or any other means or process which the Executive Director deems acceptable. In this paragraph exclusively, the terms "electronic transmission", "owner", "person", "writing", and "written" shall have the meanings assigned to them under TEX. BUS. ORG. CODE § 1.002.
8. Under 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 70.10(b), the effective date is the date of hand-delivery of the Order to the Respondent, or three days after the date on which the Commission mails notice of the Order to the Respondent, whichever is earlier.

SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

For the Commission

Romo/Garcia J
For the Executive Director

5/8/15
Date

I, the undersigned, have read and understand the attached Agreed Order. I am authorized to agree to the attached Agreed Order on behalf of the entity indicated below my signature, and I do agree to the terms and conditions specified therein. I further acknowledge that the TCEQ, in accepting payment for the penalty amount, is materially relying on such representation.

I also understand that failure to comply with the Ordering Provisions, if any, in this order and/or failure to timely pay the penalty amount, may result in:

- A negative impact on compliance history;
- Greater scrutiny of any permit applications submitted;
- Referral of this case to the Attorney General's Office for contempt, injunctive relief, additional penalties, and/or attorney fees, or to a collection agency;
- Increased penalties in any future enforcement actions;
- Automatic referral to the Attorney General's Office of any future enforcement actions; and
- TCEQ seeking other relief as authorized by law.

In addition, any falsification of any compliance documents may result in criminal prosecution.

R. Munday
Signature

3/4/15
Date

Russell Munday
Name (Printed or typed)
Authorized Representative of
SBBQ Operations LLC
dba Sadler's Bar B Que Sales

12 VP operations
Title

Instructions: Send the original, signed Agreed Order with penalty payment to the Financial Administration Division, Revenue Operations Section at the address in Section IV, Paragraph 1 of this Agreed Order.