EXECUTIVE SUMMARY – ENFORCEMENT MATTER – CASE No. 58415 Charles Patrick Patterson RN110852795

Docket No. 2019-1447-MSW-E

Order Type:

Default Order

Media:

MSW

Small Business:

N/A

Location(s) Where Violation(s) Occurred:

10510 County Road 6910, Lubbock, Lubbock County (the "Site")

Type of Operation:

residential property

Other Significant Matters:

Additional Pending Enforcement Actions: None Past-Due Penalties: None Past-Due Fees: None Other: None Interested Third Parties: None

Texas Register Publication Date: December 1, 2023

Comments Received: None

Penalty Information

Total Penalty Assessed: \$1,250

Total Paid to General Revenue: \$1,250

Total Due to General Revenue: \$0

Compliance History Classifications:

Person/CN - N/A Site/RN - N/A

Major Source: No Statutory Limit Adjustment: None

Applicable Penalty Policy: April 2014

Investigation Information

Complaint Date(s): July 15, 2019

Complaint Information: Complainant alleged that material is being improperly disposed

in Lubbock County.

Date(s) of Investigation: July 31, 2019 through August 14, 2019

Date(s) of NOV(s): N/A

Date(s) of NOE(s): September 27, 2019

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY – ENFORCEMENT MATTER – CASE NO. 58415 Charles Patrick Patterson RN110852795 Docket No. 2019-1447-MSW-E

Violation Information

Caused, suffered, allowed, or permitted the unauthorized disposal of municipal solid waste ("MSW") [30 Tex. Admin. Code § 330.15(c)].

Corrective Actions/Technical Requirements

Corrective Action(s) Completed:

None

Technical Requirements:

- 1. Immediately, cease transporting and disposing of any additional MSW, including grit trap waste, at the Site.
- 2. Within 30 days remove all MSW from the Site and dispose of it at an authorized facility.
- 3. Within 45 days submit written certification to demonstrate compliance with Technical Requirement Nos. 1 and 2.

Litigation Information

Date Petition(s) Filed:March 25, 2021Date(s) of Service:March 29, 2021

Date Answer(s) Filed: N/A

Contact Information

TCEQ Attorneys: Barrett Hollingsworth, Litigation Division, (512) 239-3400 Garrett Arthur, Public Interest Counsel, (512) 239-6363

TCEQ Litigation Agenda Coordinator: Katherine McKenzie, Litigation Division, (512) 239-2575

TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Stephanie McCurley, Enforcement Division, (512) 239-2607

TCEQ Regional Contact: Jay Keith, Lubbock Regional Office, (806) 796-7092

Respondent Contact: Charles Patrick Patterson, 10510 County Road 6910, Lubbock, Texas 79407

Respondent's Attorney: N/A

Penalty Calculation Worksheet (PCW)

Policy Revision 4 (April 2014)

PAYABLE PENALTY

PCW Revision March 26, 2014

\$1,250

TCEQ								
DATES	Assigned						-	
	PCW	4-Aug-2021	Screening	4-Oct-2019	EPA Due			
RESPO		TY INFORMATI						
D.	Kespondent	Charles Patrick I	Patterson					
	g. Ent. Ref. No. ty/Site Region				Maior /	dinar Cauraa	Minor	
raciii	ty/Site Region	Z-LUDDOCK			мајог/ г	Minor Source	MILLOL	
CASE I	NFORMATION							
	f./Case ID No.	58415		1	No.	of Violations	1	
	•	2019-1447-MSW	V-F			Order Type		
Med		Municipal Solid \			Governmen	t/Non-Profit		
	Multi-Media				Enf.	Coordinator	Stephanie McCurley	
	'						Enforcement Team 7	7
Adr	min. Penalty \$ I	_imit Minimum	\$0	Maximum	\$25,000			
			Penalt	y Calcula	tion Secti	on		
TOTA	L BASE PENA	LTY (Sum of	violation	base penalt	ties)		Subtotal 1	\$1,250
ADJU:	STMENTS (+	/-) TO SUBT	OTAL 1		N has the classification of a			
	Compliance Hi	otained by multiplying	g the Total Base F	enaity (Subtotal 1	Adjustment		tals 2, 3, & 7	\$0
	Compliance in	Story		0.0%	Aujustinent	Subto	tais 2, 3, & 7	40
	Notes	No ac	diustment for	compliance his	tory classification	on.		
	110103		-,		,			
	Culpability	No		0.0%	Enhancement		Subtotal 4	\$0
	Notes	The Pr	schondont doo	s not most the	culpability crit	oria		
	Notes	THE IXE	espondent doe	s not meet the	culpability crit	eria.		
	ļ						4	
	Good Faith Effe	ort to Comply T	otal Adjustn	nents			Subtotal 5	\$0
	Economic Bene	ETIT Total EB Amounts	47		Enhancement* d at the Total EB \$	Amount	Subtotal 6	\$0
	Estimated	Cost of Compliance		Сарре	u at the Total LD \$	Amount		
SUM (OF SUBTOTAL	LS 1-7				F	inal Subtotal	\$1,250
OTHE	R FACTORS A	AS JUSTICE N	1AY REQUI	RE	0.0%		Adjustment	\$0
Reduces of	or enhances the Final	Subtotal by the indi	cated percentage				- <u> </u>	
	Notes							
						Fire I Dec		44 250
						Finai Per	nalty Amount	\$1,250
CTATI	ITODY I TMT	CADILICTME	VIT.					¢1 250
SIAIL	DIOKY LIMI	T ADJUSTME	N I			Final Asse	ssed Penalty	\$1,250
DEEE	DDAI					Dadwakias	A discolunce and	<i>Φ</i> Λ
DEFEI Reduces t		enalty by the indicate	d nercentage			Reduction	Adjustment	\$0
neuuces t	.ne i iliai Assesseu Pe	marcy by the mulcate	a percentage.				1	
	Notes	Defe	erral not offere	ed for non-expe	dited settleme	nt.		
	110103	Dere		слрс				

Policy Revision 4 (April 2014)

PCW Revision March 26, 2014

Docket No. 2019-1447-MSW-E

Respondent Charles Patrick Patterson

Case ID No. 58415

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN110852795

Media Municipal Solid Waste

Enf. Coordinator Stephanie McCurley

Component	Number of	Number	Adjust.				
	Written notices of violation ("NOVs") with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (number of NOVs meeting criteria)	0	0%				
NOVS	Other written NOVs	0	0%				
	Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (number of orders meeting criteria)	0	0%				
Orders	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%				
Judgments	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (number of judgments or consent decrees meeting criteria)	0	0%				
Decrees	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%				
Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (<i>number of counts</i>)	0	0%				
Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (number of events)	0	0%				
Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which notices were submitted)	0	0%				
Addits	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which violations were disclosed)	0	0%				
	Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%				
Other	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%				
	Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%				
	Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%				
	Adjustment Perc	entage (Su	btotal 2)				
epeat Violator ((Subtotal 3)						
N/A	Adjustment Perc	entage (Sul	btotal 3)				
mpliance Histo	ory Person Classification (Subtotal 7)						
N/A Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 7)							
ompliance Histo	ory Summary						
Compliance History Notes	No adjustment for compliance history classification.						
			_ 				
	Total Compliance History Adjustment Percentage (S	uptotais 2,	· 3, & / I				

	Scre	ening Date	4-Oct-2019		Docket	No. 2019-1447-MSW-E		PCW
			Charles Patrick	Patterson			Policy	Revision 4 (April 2014)
_		ase ID No.					PCW R	evision March 26, 2014
Reg.	Ent. Ref		RN110852795	M/ t -				
	Enf C		Municipal Solid Stephanie McC					
		tion Number						
		Rule Cite(s)						
		Rule Cite(s)		30 T	Tex. Admin. Code	§ 330.15(c)		
			0 1 5					
	Violatio	n Description				unauthorized disposal of mu ards of grit trap waste were		
			coma maste (:	.o., opec	of at the Si		шоросса	
						Base	Penalty	\$25,000
>> Env	/ironmo	ntal Proper	ty and Hum	an Haalth	Matrix			
// Eliv	ii oiiiie	iitai, Propei	ty and num	Harm	Matrix			
		Release	Major	Moderate	Minor			
OR		Actual			X	B 5.00/		
		Potential				Percent 5.0%		
>>Proc	gramma	tic Matrix						
		Falsification	Major	Moderate	Minor			
						Percent 0.0%		
	Matrix					nificant amounts of pollutant vironmental receptors as a r		
	Notes	not exceed it	eveis triat are pi		ne violation.	ivironinental receptors as a r	esuit oi	
						Adjustment	\$23,750	
							ī	\$1,250
								Ψ1/230
Violatio	on Event	ts						
		Number of \	/iolation Events	1		51 Number of violation of	lavs	
						. Tambér et Heidelen e	,.	
			daily					
			weekly					
			monthly		Violation Base Penalt			\$1,250
			quarterly semiannual	X		Violation base	Penalty	\$1,230
			annual					
			single event					
		One quarte	rly event is reco			2019 investigation end date	to the	
				October 4,	2019 screening of	late.		
Good F	aith Effo	orts to Com		0.0%	NOT/NOV +- EDDDD		Reduction	\$0
			Extraordinary	efore NOE/NOV	NOE/NOV to EDPRP/	Settlement Offer		
			Ordinary					
			N/A	х				
			ŕ	The Despends	ont door not man	t the good faith critoria for		
Notes The Respondent does not meet the good faith criteria for this violation.								
						Violation	Subtotal	\$1,250
Econon	nic Porc	fit (EB) for	this violation	n .		Statutory Limit	_	
LCOHOII	inc belle	int (LB) IOI	tilis violatio	J11		Statutory Liffilt	. CSt	
		Estimate	ed EB Amount		\$7	Violation Final Pena	Ity Total	\$1,250
				This viola	ation Final Asse	ssed Penalty (adjusted fo	r limits)	\$1,250

	E	conomic	Benefit	Wo	rksheet		
Respondent	Charles Patric	k Patterson					
Case ID No.	58415						
Reg. Ent. Reference No.	RN110852795						
	Municipal Solid						Years of
Violation No.	•					Percent Interest	Depreciation
						5.0	15
	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Vrc	Interest Saved	Costs Saved	EB Amount
Item Description		Dute Required	i iliai bacc	5	Interest Savea	COStS Savea	LD Amount
Item Description							
D.I I Ct.							
Delayed Costs	1	11	T	0.00	+0	40	+0
Equipment Buildings				0.00	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0
Engineering/Construction				0.00	\$0	\$0 \$0	\$0
Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0 \$0
Training/Sampling		Ì		0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal	\$150	14-Aug-2019	26-Jul-2020	0.95	\$7	n/a	\$7
Permit Costs	7-55			0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Notes for DELAYED costs Rotes for DELAYED costs Estimated cost to remove all grit trap waste and contaminated soil from the Site and dispose of it at an authorized facility. The Date Required is the investigation end date and the Final Date is the estimated date of compliance.							
Avoided Costs	ANNU	ALIZE avoided o	osts before e	tering		one-time avoide	d costs)
Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Supplies/Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Financial Assurance				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs				0.00	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Notes for AVOIDED costs							

To request a more accessible version of this report, please contact the TCEQ Help Desk at (512) 239-4357.



Compliance History Report

Compliance History Report for CN605700129, RN110852795, Rating Year 2019 which includes Compliance History (CH) components from September 1, 2014, through August 31, 2019.

Classification: NOT APPLICABLE

Classification: NOT APPLICABLE

Rating: N/A

Rating: N/A

Customer, Respondent, CN605700129, Charles

or Owner/Operator: Patrick Patterson

Regulated Entity: RN110852795, Mighty Wash

Patterson UNA

Complexity Points: N/A Repeat Violator: N/A

CH Group: 14 - Other

Location: 10510 County Road 6910 in Lubbock, Lubbock County, Texas

TCEQ Region: REGION 02 - LUBBOCK

ID Number(s):

MUNICIPAL SOLID WASTE NON PERMITTED ID NUMBER

455020068

Compliance History Period: September 01, 2014 to August 31, 2019 Rating Year: 2019 Rating Date: 09/01/2019

Date Compliance History Report Prepared: April 09, 2020

Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History: Enforcement

Component Period Selected: April 09, 2015 to April 09, 2020

TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding This Compliance History.

Name: Stephanie McCurley Phone: (512) 239-2607

Site and Owner/Operator History:

1) Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five year compliance period? NO

2) Has there been a (known) change in ownership/operator of the site during the compliance period? NO

Components (Multimedia) for the Site Are Listed in Sections A - J

A. Final Orders, court judgments, and consent decrees:

N/A

B. Criminal convictions:

N/A

C. Chronic excessive emissions events:

N/A

D. The approval dates of investigations (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

N/Δ

E. Written notices of violations (NOV) (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

A notice of violation represents a written allegation of a violation of a specific regulatory requirement from the commission to a regulated entity. A notice of violation is not a final enforcement action, nor proof that a violation has actually occurred.

N/A

F. Environmental audits:

N/A

G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs):

N/A

H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates:

N/A

I. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program:

N/A

J. Early compliance:

N/A

Sites Outside of Texas:

N/A

Component Appendices

Appendix A

All NOVs Issued During Component Period 4/9/2015 and 4/9/2020

N/A

For Informational Purposes Only

Appendix B

All Investigations Conducted During Component Period April 09, 2015 and April 09, 2020

(1596993)

Item 1

September 25, 2019 For Informational Purposes Only

^{*} No violations documented during this investigation

^{**}Investigation applicable for the Compliance History Rating period between 09/01/2014 and 08/31/2019.

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



IN THE MATTER OF AN	§	BEFORE THE
ENFORCEMENT ACTION	§	
CONCERNING	§	TEXAS COMMISSION ON
CHARLES PATRICK PATTERSON;	§	
RN110852795	§	ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

DEFAULT ORDER DOCKET NO. 2019-1447-MSW-E

On	, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
("Commission	" or "TCEQ") considered the Executive Director's Preliminary Report and Petition,
filed pursuan	t to Tex. Water Code ch. 7, Tex. Health & Safety Code ch. 361 and the rules of the
TCEQ, which	requests appropriate relief, including the imposition of an administrative penalty
and corrective	e action of the respondent. The respondent made the subject of this Order is
Charles Patrio	k Patterson ("Respondent").

The Commission makes the following Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law:

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. Respondent owns an unauthorized municipal solid waste ("MSW") disposal site located at 10510 County Road 6910 in Lubbock, Lubbock County, Texas (the "Site"). The Site contains and involves the management of MSW, as defined in Tex. Health & Safety Code ch. 361.
- 2. During an investigation conducted from July 31 through August 14, 2019, an investigator documented that Respondent caused, suffered, allowed, or permitted the unauthorized disposal of MSW. Specifically, 11 cubic yards of grit trap waste were disposed of at the Site.
- 3. The Executive Director filed the "Executive Director's Preliminary Report and Petition Recommending that the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality Enter an Enforcement Order Assessing an Administrative Penalty Against and Requiring Certain Actions of Charles Patrick Patterson" (the "EDPRP") in the TCEQ Chief Clerk's office on March 25, 2021.
- 4. By letter dated March 25, 2021, sent to Respondent's last known address via certified mail, return receipt requested, postage prepaid, the Executive Director served Respondent with notice of the EDPRP. According to the return receipt "green card," Respondent received notice of the EDPRP on March 29, 2021, as evidenced by the signature on the card.
- 5. More than 20 days have elapsed since Respondent received notice of the EDPRP. Respondent failed to file an answer and failed to request a hearing.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 1, Respondent is subject to the jurisdiction of the TCEQ because it alleges violations of Tex. Health & Safety Code ch. 361 and the rules of the TCEO.
- 2. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 2, Respondent caused, suffered, allowed, or permitted the unauthorized disposal of MSW, in violation of 30 Tex. ADMIN. CODE § 330.15(c).
- 3. As evidenced by Findings of Fact Nos. 3 and 4, the Executive Director timely served Respondent with proper notice of the EDPRP, as required by Tex. Water Code § 7.055 and 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 70.104(b)(1).

- 4. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 5, Respondent failed to file a timely answer as required by Tex. Water Code § 7.056 and 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 70.105. Pursuant to Tex. Water Code § 7.057 and 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 70.106, the Commission may enter a Default Order against Respondent and assess the penalty recommended by the Executive Director.
- 5. Pursuant to Tex. Water Code § 7.051, the Commission has the authority to assess an administrative penalty against Respondent for violations of state statutes within TCEQ's jurisdiction, for violations of rules adopted under such statutes, or for violations of orders or permits issued under such statutes.
- 6. An administrative penalty in the amount of one thousand two hundred fifty dollars (\$1,250.00) is justified by the facts recited in this Order, and considered in light of the factors set forth in Tex. WATER CODE § 7.053. Respondent paid one thousand two hundred fifty dollars (\$1,250.00) of the penalty.
- 7. Tex. Water Code §§ 5.102 and 7.002 authorize the Commission to issue orders and make determinations necessary to effectuate the purposes of the statutes within its jurisdiction.

ORDERING PROVISIONS

NOW, THEREFORE, THE TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ORDERS that:

- 1. Respondent is assessed an administrative penalty as set forth in Conclusion of Law No. 6 for violations of state statutes and rules of the TCEQ. The payment of this penalty and Respondent's compliance with all the requirements set forth in this Order resolve only the matters set forth by this Order in this action. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective actions or penalties for violations which are not raised here.
- 2. Respondent shall undertake the following technical requirements:
 - a. Immediately upon the effective date of this Order, cease transporting and disposing of any additional MSW, including grit trap waste, at the Site.
 - b. Within 30 days after the effective date of this order, remove all MSW from the Site, including grit trap waste and using appropriate corrective measures, and dispose of it at an authorized facility.
 - c. Within 45 days after the effective date of this Order, submit written certification to demonstrate compliance with Ordering Provision Nos. 2.a. and 2.b. The certification shall be accompanied by detailed supporting documentation, including photographs, receipts, and/or other records, shall be signed by Respondent, and shall include the following certification language:

"I certify under penalty of law that I have personally examined and am familiar with the information submitted and all attached documents, and that based on my inquiry of those individuals immediately responsible for obtaining the information, I believe that the submitted information is true, accurate and complete. I am aware that there are significant penalties for submitting false information, including the possibility of fine and imprisonment for knowing violations."

The written certification and supporting documentation necessary to demonstrate compliance with these Ordering Provisions shall be sent to:

Texas Commission on Environmental Quality Enforcement Division, MC 149A P.O. Box 13087 Austin, Texas 78711-3087 with a copy to:

Waste Section Manager Lubbock Regional Office Texas Commission on Environmental Quality 5012 50th Street, Suite 100 Lubbock, Texas 79414-3426

- 3. All relief not expressly granted in this Order is denied.
- 4. The provisions of this Order shall apply to and be binding upon Respondent.
- 5. The Executive Director may grant an extension of any deadline in this Order or in any plan, report, or other document submitted pursuant to this Order, upon a written and substantiated showing of good cause. All requests for extensions by Respondent shall be made in writing to the Executive Director. Extensions are not effective until Respondent receives written approval from the Executive Director. The determination of what constitutes good cause rests solely with the Executive Director. Extension requests shall be sent to the Enforcement Division at the address listed above.
- 6. If Respondent fails to comply with any of the Ordering Provisions in this Order within the prescribed schedules, and that failure is caused solely by an act of God, war, strike, riot, or other catastrophe, Respondent's failure to comply is not a violation of this Order. Respondent shall have the burden of establishing to the Executive Director's satisfaction that such an event has occurred. Respondent shall notify the Executive Director within seven days after Respondent becomes aware of a delaying event and shall take all reasonable measures to mitigate and minimize any delay.
- 7. The Executive Director may refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings without notice to Respondent if the Executive Director determines that Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Order.
- 8. The provisions of this Order are deemed severable, and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.
- 9. This Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Order, whichever is later.
- 10. The Chief Clerk shall provide a copy of this fully executed Order to each of the parties. By law, the effective date of this Order shall be the date the Order is final, as provided by 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 70.106(d) and Tex. Gov't Code § 2001.144.

SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL	QUALITY	
For the Commission	Date	

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



UNSWORN DECLARATION OF BARRETT J. HOLLINGSWORTH

"On behalf of the Executive Director of the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality, the 'Executive Director's Preliminary Report and Petition Recommending that the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality Enter an Enforcement Order Assessing an Administrative Penalty Against and Requiring Certain Actions of Charles Patrick Patterson' (the "EDPRP") was filed in the TCEQ Chief Clerk's office on March 25, 2021.

The EDPRP was mailed to Respondent's last known address on March 25, 2021, via certified mail, return receipt requested, postage prepaid. According to the return receipt "green card," Respondent received notice of the EDPRP on March 29, 2021, as evidenced by the signature on the card.

More than 20 days have elapsed since Respondent received notice of the EDPRP. Respondent failed to file an answer and failed to request a hearing."

"My name is Barrett J. Hollingsworth and I am an employee of the following governmental agency: Texas Commission on Environmental Quality. I am executing this declaration as part of my assigned duties and responsibilities. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct."

Executed in Travis County, State of Texas, on the 16th day of August, 2023

Barret Hollingswate

Declarant