EXECUTIVE SUMMARY – ENFORCEMENT MATTER – CASE NO. 59364 Kelly Chittum RN103719712

Docket No. 2020-0715-MSW-E

Order Type:

Default Order

Media:

MSW

Small Business:

Yes

Location(s) Where Violation(s) Occurred:

17066 County Road 406 near Abilene, Jones County (the "Site")

Type of Operation:

unauthorized disposal site

Other Significant Matters:

Additional Pending Enforcement Actions: None Past-Due Penalties: None Past-Due Fees: None Other: None Interested Third-Parties: None

Texas Register Publication Date: March 17, 2023

Comments Received: None

Penalty Information

Total Penalty Assessed: \$3,937 **Total Paid to General Revenue:** \$0

Total Due to General Revenue: \$3,937

Compliance History Classifications:

Person/CN - Unclassified Site/RN - Unclassified

Major Source: Yes
Statutory Limit Adjustment: None

Applicable Penalty Policy: April 2014

Investigation Information

Complaint Date(s): August 20, 2019

Complaint Information: Complainant concerned about accumulation of tires on property.

Date(s) of Investigation: September 12, 2019; April 27, 2020

Date(s) of NOV(s): November 8, 2019

Date(s) of NOE(s): May 6, 2020

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY – ENFORCEMENT MATTER – CASE NO. 59364 Kelly Chittum RN103719712 Docket No. 2020-0715-MSW-E

Violation Information

Caused, suffered, allowed, or permitted the unauthorized disposal of municipal solid waste ("MSW") [30 Tex. Admin. Code § 330.15(a) and (c)].

Corrective Actions/Technical Requirements

Corrective Action(s) Completed:

None

Technical Requirements:

- 1. Immediately cease disposing of any additional MSW, including scrap tires, at the Site.
- 2. Within 30 days remove all MSW, including scrap tires, from the Site and dispose of it at an authorized facility.
- 3. Within 45 days submit written certification to demonstrate compliance with Technical Requirement Nos. 1 and 2.

Litigation Information

Date Petition(s) Filed: May 24, 2022
Date(s) of Service: May 31, 2022

Date Answer(s) Filed: N/A

Contact Information

TCEQ Attorneys: Clayton Smith, Litigation Division, (512) 239-3400

Sheldon Wayne, Public Interest Counsel, (512) 239-6363

TCEQ Litigation Agenda Coordinator: Katherine McKenzie, Litigation Division, (512) 239-2575

TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Ken Moller, Enforcement Division, (512) 239-6111
TCEQ Regional Contact: Michael Taylor, P.G., Abilene Regional Office, (325) 698-6125
Respondent Contact: Kelly Chittum, 17066 County Road 406, Abilene, Texas 79601

Respondent's Attorney: N/A



DEFERRAL

Notes

PAYABLE PENALTY

Reduces the Final Assessed Penalty by the indicated percentage.

Penalty Calculation Worksheet (PCW)

PCW Revision March 26 2014

Policy Revision 4 (April 2014) **DATES** Assigned 11-May-2020 Screening 15-May-2020 PCW 27-Jan-2021 **EPA Due** RESPONDENT/FACILITY INFORMATION Respondent Kelly Chittum Reg. Ent. Ref. No. RN103719712 Facility/Site Region 3-Abilene Major/Minor Source Major **CASE INFORMATION** No. of Violations 1 Enf./Case ID No. 59364 **Docket No. 2020-0715-MSW-E** Order Type 1660 Media Program(s) Waste Tires Government/Non-Profit No Multi-Media **Enf. Coordinator** Tyler Richardson EC's Team Enforcement Team 7 **Admin. Penalty \$ Limit Minimum** \$0 Maximum \$25,000 Penalty Calculation Section **TOTAL BASE PENALTY (Sum of violation base penalties)** \$3,750 Subtotal 1 ADJUSTMENTS (+/-) TO SUBTOTAL 1 Subtotals 2-7 are obtained by multiplying the Total Base Penalty (Subtotal 1) by the indicated percentage. **Compliance History 5.0%** Adjustment Subtotals 2, 3, & 7 \$187 Notes Enhancement for one NOV with same/similar violations. Culpability Subtotal 4 \$0 No **0.0%** Enhancement Notes The Respondent does not meet the culpability criteria. **Good Faith Effort to Comply Total Adjustments** Subtotal 5 \$0 Subtotal 6 \$0 **Economic Benefit** 0.0% Enhancement* Total EB Amounts *Capped at the Total EB \$ Amount \$200 Estimated Cost of Compliance **SUM OF SUBTOTALS 1-7** Final Subtotal \$3,937 OTHER FACTORS AS JUSTICE MAY REQUIRE 0.0% \$0 Adjustment Reduces or enhances the Final Subtotal by the indicated percentage. Notes Final Penalty Amount \$3,937 STATUTORY LIMIT ADJUSTMENT Final Assessed Penalty \$3,937

Deferral not offered for non-expedited settlement.

0.0%

Reduction

Adjustment

\$0

\$3,937

Screening Date 15-May-2020
Respondent Kelly Chittum

Case ID No. 59364
Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN103719712

Media Waste Tires

Enf. Coordinator Tyler Richardson

Compliance History Worksheet									
>> C	ompliance Hist Component	ory <i>Site</i> Enhancement (Subtotal 2) Number of	Number	Adjust.					
	NOVs	Written notices of violation ("NOVs") with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (number of NOVs meeting criteria)	1	5%					
		Other written NOVs	0	0%					
		Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (number of orders meeting criteria)	0	0%					
	Orders	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%					
	Judgments and Consent	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (number of judgments or consent decrees meeting criteria)	0	0%					
	Decrees	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%					
	Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (number of counts)	0	0%					
	Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (number of events)	0	0%					
	Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which notices were submitted)	0	0%					
	Audits	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which violations were disclosed)	0	0%					
		Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%					
	Other	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%					
	5 5 7 5	Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%					
		Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%					
		Adjustment Per	centage (Sub	total 2) [5%				
>> R	epeat Violator	(Subtotal 3)							
	No	Adjustment Per	centage (Sub	total 3)	0%				
>> C	ompliance Hist	ory Person Classification (Subtotal 7)							
	Unclassified Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 7)								
>> Compliance History Summary									
	Compliance History Notes	Enhancement for one NOV with same/similar violations.							
		Total Compliance History Adjustment Percentage (S	Subtotals 2,	3, & 7) [5%				
>> Fin	al Compliance	History Adjustment Final Adjustment Percent	age *capped a	at 100%	5%				

	Screening Date			Docke	t No. 2020-0715-MSW-E		PCW
	Respondent	Kelly Chittum				Policy	Revision 4 (April 2014)
	Case ID No.	59364				PCW R	evision March 26, 2014
Reg.	Ent. Reference No.						
		Waste Tires					
	Enf. Coordinator						
	Violation Number	1					
	Rule Cite(s)		30 Tex.	Admin. Code § 3	330.15(a) and (c)		
	Violation Description				e unauthorized disposal of m ately 608 scrap tires were di e.		
					Base	e Penalty	\$25,000
>> Env	rironmental, Prope	rtv and Huma	n Health	Matrix			
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	,	Harm				
	Release	Major	Moderate	Minor			
OR	Actual			Х			
	Potential				Percent 15.0%		
D	uun mamantin Matuin						
>>Prog	grammatic Matrix Falsification	Major	Moderate	Minor			
	Faisincation	Major	Moderate	MILLOL	Percent 0.0%		
					Percent 0.0%		
	Human haalth	or the environme	nt bas basn	avnagad to inci-	mificant amounts of pollutan	ta that da	
					gnificant amounts of pollutan nvironmental receptors as a		
	Notes	evels that are pro-		ne violation.	Wildimental receptors as a	result of	
				10 11010111			
					Adjustment	\$21,250	
					, and a second second	+/	
							\$3,750
Violatio	on Events						
	Number of	Violation Events	1		18 Number of violation	dave	
	Number of	Violation Events	1		18 Number of violation	uays	
		daily		•			
		weekly					
		monthly					
		quarterly	Х		Violation Base Penalty		\$3,750
		semiannual					1-7
		annual					
		single event					
	One quarter	y avant is recomm	anded from	the April 27 20	20 record review date to the	May 15	
	One quarteri	y event is recomm		screening date.	20 record review date to the	May 13,	
				J			
Good F	aith Efforts to Com	nly	0.0%			Doductica	\$0
good Fa	aith Efforts to Com		ore NOE/NOV	NOE/NOV to EDPRE		Reduction	φU
		Extraordinary			,		
		Ordinary					
		N/A	Х				
Notes The Respondent does not meet the good faith criteria for this violation.							
					Violation		\$3,750
Econon	nic Benefit (EB) for	this violation			Statutory Limit	Test	
	Estimat	ed EB Amount		\$200	Violation Final Pena	ilty Total	\$3,938
			This viola	ation Final Acc	essed Penalty (adjusted fo	or limite\	\$3,938
			s viole	v i iliai A350	r charry (aujusteu 10	to)	ال در رد ب

Economic Benefit Worksheet							
Respondent Case ID No. Reg. Ent. Reference No.	59364	2					
	Waste Tires					Percent Interest	Years of Depreciation
						5.0	15
	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Costs Saved	EB Amount
Item Description							
Delayed Costs				-1			
Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.00	\$0	\$0 \$0	\$0
Other (as needed) Engineering/Construction				0.00	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0
Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Other (as needed)	\$3,040	12-Nov-2019	7-Mar-2021	1.32	\$200	n/a	\$200
Notes for DELAYED costs	Estimated delayed cost to remove all scrap tires from the Site and dispose of them at an authorized facility (\$5 per tire). The Date Required is the initial investigation date and the Final Date is the estimated date of compliance.						
Avoided Costs	ANNU	ALIZE avoided c	osts before ei		•	one-time avoide	
Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling Supplies/Equipment				0.00	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0
Financial Assurance				0.00	\$0	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Notes for AVOIDED costs		,		,,	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	-	
Approx. Cost of Compliance		\$3,040			TOTAL		\$200



Compliance History Report for CN602236028, RN103719712, Rating Year 2019 which includes Compliance History (CH) components from September 1, 2014, through August 31, 2019.

Customer, Respondent, or CN602236028, Kelly Chittum

Classification: UNCLASSIFIED

Rating: -----

Owner/Operator: Regulated Entity:

RN103719712, Kelly Chittum Tire

Classification: UNCLASSIFIED

NO

Rating: -----

Complexity Points:

2

Repeat Violator:

Raung:

CH Group:

14 - Other

Location:

17066 County Road 406 in Abilene, Jones County, Texas

TCEQ Region:

REGION 03 - ABILENE

ID Number(s):

TIRES REGISTRATION ABT00005

TIRES REGISTRATION ABT00004

MUNICIPAL SOLID WASTE NON PERMITTED ID NUMBER

R03103719712

Compliance History Period:

September 01, 2014 to August 31, 2019

Rating Year: 2019

Rating Date: 09/01/2019

Date Compliance History Report Prepared:

May 12, 2020

Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History:

Enforcement

Component Period Selected:

May 12, 2015 to May 12, 2020

TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding This Compliance History.

Name: Tyler Richardson

Phone: (512) 239-4872

Site and Owner/Operator History:

1) Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five year compliance period?

YES

2) Has there been a (known) change in ownership/operator of the site during the compliance period?

NO

Components (Multimedia) for the Site Are Listed in Sections A - J

A. Final Orders, court judgments, and consent decrees:

N/A

B. Criminal convictions:

N/A

C. Chronic excessive emissions events:

N/A

D. The approval dates of investigations (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

N/A

E. Written notices of violations (NOV) (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

A notice of violation represents a written allegation of a violation of a specific regulatory requirement from the commission to a regulated entity. A notice of violation is not a final enforcement action, nor proof that a violation has actually occurred.

1 Date: 11/08/2019 (1598749)

Self Report? NO Classification: Moderate

Citation: 30 TAC Chapter 330, SubChapter A 330.15(a)

30 TAC Chapter 330, SubChapter A 330.15(c)

Description: Failure to comply with the General Prohibition requirements which states a person may

not cause, suffer, allow, or permit the collection, storage, transportation, processing, or disposal of municipal solid waste (MSW) without the authorization of the commission.

	N/A
G.	Type of environmental management systems (EMSs): $\ensuremath{N/A}$
н.	Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates: $\ensuremath{N}\xspace/\ensuremath{A}$
I.	Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program: $\ensuremath{\text{N/A}}$
J.	Early compliance: N/A
Sit	es Outside of Texas:

F. Environmental audits:

N/A

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



IN THE MATTER OF AN	§	BEFORE THE
ENFORCEMENT ACTION	§	
CONCERNING	§	TEXAS COMMISSION ON
KELLY CHITTUM:	§	
RN103719712	§	ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

DEFAULT ORDER

DOCKET NO. 2020-0715-MSW-E

On ______, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("Commission" or "TCEQ") considered the Executive Director's Preliminary Report and Petition, filed pursuant to Tex. Water Code ch. 7, Tex. Health & Safety Code ch. 361, and the rules of the TCEQ, which requests appropriate relief, including the imposition of an administrative penalty and corrective action of the respondent. The respondent made the subject of this Order is Kelly Chittum ("Respondent").

The Commission makes the following Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law:

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. Respondent owns and operates an unauthorized disposal site located at 17066 County Road 406 near Abilene, Jones County, Texas (the "Site"). The Site contains and/or involves the management of municipal solid waste ("MSW"), including scrap tires, as defined in Tex. Health & Safety Code ch. 361.
- 2. During an investigation conducted on September 12, 2019, and a record review conducted on April 27, 2020, an investigator documented that Respondent caused, suffered, allowed, or permitted the unauthorized disposal of MSW. Specifically, approximately 608 scrap tires were disposed of at the Site.
- 3. The Executive Director filed the "Executive Director's Preliminary Report and Petition Recommending that the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality Enter an Enforcement Order Assessing an Administrative Penalty Against and Requiring Certain Actions of Kelly Chittum" (the "EDPRP") in the TCEQ Chief Clerk's office on May 24, 2022.
- 4. By letter dated May 24, 2022, sent to Respondent's last known address via certified mail, return receipt requested, postage prepaid, the Executive Director served Respondent with notice of the EDPRP. According to USPS.com "Track & Confirm" delivery confirmation records, Respondent received notice of the EDPRP on May 31, 2022.
- 5. More than 20 days have elapsed since Respondent received notice of the EDPRP. Respondent failed to file an answer and failed to request a hearing.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 1, Respondent is subject to the jurisdiction of the TCEQ pursuant to Tex. Health & Safety Code ch. 361 and the rules of the TCEQ.
- 2. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 2, Respondent caused, suffered, allowed, or permitted the unauthorized disposal of MSW, in violation of 30 Tex. ADMIN. CODE § 330.15(a) and (c).
- 3. As evidenced by Findings of Fact Nos. 3 and 4, the Executive Director timely served Respondent with proper notice of the EDPRP, as required by Tex. Water Code § 7.055 and 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 70.104(b)(1).
- 4. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 5, Respondent failed to file a timely answer as required by Tex. Water Code § 7.056 and 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 70.105. Pursuant to Tex. Water Code § 7.057

- and 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 70.106, the Commission may enter a Default Order against Respondent and assess the penalty recommended by the Executive Director.
- 5. Pursuant to Tex. Water Code § 7.051, the Commission has the authority to assess an administrative penalty against Respondent for violations of state statutes within TCEQ's jurisdiction, for violations of rules adopted under such statutes, or for violations of orders or permits issued under such statutes.
- 6. An administrative penalty in the amount of three thousand nine hundred thirty-seven dollars (\$3,937.00) is justified by the facts recited in this Order and considered in light of the factors set forth in Tex. Water Code § 7.053.
- 7. Tex. Water Code §§ 5.102 and 7.002 authorize the Commission to issue orders and make determinations necessary to effectuate the purposes of the statutes within its jurisdiction.

ORDERING PROVISIONS

NOW, THEREFORE, THE TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ORDERS that:

- 1. Respondent is assessed an administrative penalty in the amount of three thousand nine hundred thirty-seven dollars (\$3,937.00) for violations of state statutes and rules of the TCEQ. The payment of this penalty and Respondent's compliance with all the requirements set forth in this Order resolve only the matters set forth by this Order in this action. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective actions or penalties for violations which are not raised here.
- 2. The penalty assessed by this Order shall be paid within 30 days after the effective date of this Order. All checks submitted to pay the penalty imposed by this Order shall be made out to TCEQ and shall be sent with the notation "Re: Kelly Chittum; Docket No. 2020-0715-MSW-E" to:

Financial Administration Division Revenue Operations Section Texas Commission on Environmental Quality Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214 P.O. Box 13088 Austin, Texas 78711-3088

- 3. Respondent shall undertake the following technical requirements:
 - a. Immediately upon the effective date of this Order, cease disposing of any additional MSW, including scrap tires, at the Site.
 - b. Within 30 days after the effective date of this Order, remove all MSW, including scrap tires, from the Site and dispose of it at an authorized facility.
 - c. Within 45 days after the effective date of this Order, submit written certification to demonstrate compliance with Ordering Provision Nos. 3.a. and 3.b.

 The certification shall be accompanied by detailed supporting documentation, including photographs, receipts, and/or other records, shall be signed by Respondent, and shall include the following certification language:

"I certify under penalty of law that I have personally examined and am familiar with the information submitted and all attached documents, and that based on my inquiry of those individuals immediately responsible for obtaining the information, I believe that the submitted information is true, accurate and complete. I am aware that there are significant penalties for submitting false information, including the possibility of fine and imprisonment for knowing violations."

The written certification and supporting documentation necessary to demonstrate compliance with these Ordering Provisions shall be sent to:

Enforcement Division, MC 149A Texas Commission on Environmental Quality P.O. Box 13087 Austin, Texas 78711-3087

and:

Waste Section Manager Abilene Regional Office Texas Commission on Environmental Quality 1977 Industrial Boulevard Abilene, Texas 79602-7833

- 4. All relief not expressly granted in this Order is denied.
- 5. The provisions of this Order shall apply to and be binding upon Respondent.
- 6. The Executive Director may grant an extension of any deadline in this Order or in any plan, report, or other document submitted pursuant to this Order, upon a written and substantiated showing of good cause. All requests for extensions by Respondent shall be made in writing to the Executive Director. Extensions are not effective until Respondent receives written approval from the Executive Director. The determination of what constitutes good cause rests solely with the Executive Director. Extension requests shall be sent to the Enforcement Division at the address listed above.
- 7. If Respondent fails to comply with any of the Ordering Provisions in this Order within the prescribed schedules, and that failure is caused solely by an act of God, war, strike, riot, or other catastrophe, Respondent's failure to comply is not a violation of this Order. Respondent shall have the burden of establishing to the Executive Director's satisfaction that such an event has occurred. Respondent shall notify the Executive Director within seven days after Respondent becomes aware of a delaying event and shall take all reasonable measures to mitigate and minimize any delay.
- 8. The Executive Director may refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings without notice to Respondent if the Executive Director determines that Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Order.
- 9. The provisions of this Order are deemed severable, and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.
- 10. This Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Order, whichever is later.
- 11. The Chief Clerk shall provide a copy of this fully executed Order to each of the parties. By law, the effective date of this Order shall be the date the Order is final, as provided by 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 70.106(d) and Tex. Gov't Code § 2001.144.

SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTA	AL QUALITY	
For the Commission	Date	

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



UNSWORN DECLARATION OF JESSE CLAYTON SMITH

"On behalf of the Executive Director of the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality, the 'Executive Director's Preliminary Report and Petition Recommending that the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality Enter an Enforcement Order Assessing an Administrative Penalty Against and Requiring Certain Actions of Kelly Chittum' (the 'EDPRP') was filed in the TCEQ Chief Clerk's office on May 24, 2022.

The EDPRP was mailed to Respondent's last known address on May 24, 2022, via certified mail, return receipt requested, postage prepaid. According to USPS.com 'Track & Confirm' delivery confirmation records, Respondent received notice of the EDPRP on May 31, 2022.

More than 20 days have elapsed since Respondent received notice of the EDPRP. Respondent failed to file an answer and failed to request a hearing."

"My name is Jesse Clayton Smith and I am an employee of the following governmental agency: Texas Commission on Environmental Quality. I am executing this declaration as part of my assigned duties and responsibilities. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct."

Executed in Williamson County, State of Texas, on the 6th day of February 2023

Declarant