

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY – ENFORCEMENT MATTER – CASE NO. 59470
Ruiz and Forsh JV LLC
RN110491362
Docket No. 2020-0851-AIR-E

Order Type:
Default Order

Media:
AIR

Small Business:
Yes

Location(s) Where Violation(s) Occurred:
6210 Northwest Loop 410, San Antonio, Bexar County

Type of Operation:
autobody repair and refinishing shop

Other Significant Matters:
Additional Pending Enforcement Actions: None
Past-Due Penalties: None
Past-Due Fees: None
Other: None
Interested Third-Parties: None

Texas Register Publication Date: September 16, 2022

Comments Received: None

Penalty Information

Total Penalty Assessed: \$1,250

Total Paid to General Revenue: \$0

Total Due to General Revenue: \$1,250

Compliance History Classifications:
Person/CN - Satisfactory
Site/RN - Satisfactory

Major Source: No

Statutory Limit Adjustment: None

Applicable Penalty Policy: April 2014

Investigation Information

Complaint Date(s): N/A

Date(s) of Investigation: April 2, 2020; April 16, 2020

Date(s) of NOV(s): N/A

Date(s) of NOE(s): June 9, 2020

Ruiz and Forsh JV LLC
RN110491362
Docket No. 2020-0851-AIR-E

Violation Information

Failed to obtain authorization prior to constructing or modifying a source of air contaminants [TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §§ 382.0518(a) and 382.085(b) and 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 116.110(a)].

Corrective Actions/Technical Requirements

Corrective Action(s) Completed:

None

Technical Requirements:

1. Within 30 days, submit an administratively complete registration or permit application to authorize the auto body repair and refinishing activities at the Facility.
2. Respond completely and adequately, as determined by the TCEQ, to all requests for information concerning the registration or permit application by any deadline specified in writing.
3. Within 45 days, submit written certification to demonstrate compliance with Technical Requirement No. 1.
4. Within 180 days, submit written certification that either authorization for the auto body repair and refinishing activities at the Facility has been obtained or that operations have ceased until such time that the appropriate authorization has been obtained.

Litigation Information

Date Petition(s) Filed: February 16, 2022

Date Green Card(s) Signed: February 18, 2022

Date Answer(s) Filed: N/A

Contact Information

TCEQ Attorneys: Cynthia Sirois, Litigation Division, (512) 239-3400

Sheldon Wayne, Public Interest Counsel, (512) 239-6363

TCEQ Litigation Agenda Coordinator: Katherine McKenzie, Litigation Division, (512) 239-2575

TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Amanda Diaz, Enforcement Division, (512) 239-2601

TCEQ Regional Contact: George Ortiz, San Antonio Regional Office, (210) 490-3096

Respondent Contact: Mario Ruiz, Ruiz and Forsh JV LLC, 6210 Northwest Loop 410, San Antonio,
Texas 78247

Respondent's Attorney: N/A



Penalty Calculation Worksheet (PCW)

Policy Revision 4 (April 2014)

PCW Revision March 26, 2014

DATES	Assigned	8-Jun-2020	Screening	18-Jun-2020	EPA Due	
	PCW	29-Mar-2021				

RESPONDENT/FACILITY INFORMATION	
Respondent	Ruiz and Forsh JV LLC
Reg. Ent. Ref. No.	RN110491362
Facility/Site Region	13-San Antonio
Major/Minor Source	Minor

CASE INFORMATION			
Enf./Case ID No.	59470	No. of Violations	1
Docket No.	2020-0851-AIR-E	Order Type	1660
Media Program(s)	Air	Government/Non-Profit	No
Multi-Media		Enf. Coordinator	Amanda Diaz
		EC's Team	Enforcement Team 4
Admin. Penalty \$ Limit Minimum	\$0	Maximum	\$25,000

Penalty Calculation Section

TOTAL BASE PENALTY (Sum of violation base penalties)	Subtotal 1	\$1,250
---	-------------------	----------------

ADJUSTMENTS (+/-) TO SUBTOTAL 1

Subtotals 2-7 are obtained by multiplying the Total Base Penalty (Subtotal 1) by the indicated percentage.

Compliance History	0.0% Adjustment	Subtotals 2, 3, & 7	\$0
---------------------------	------------------------	--------------------------------	------------

Notes: No adjustment for compliance history.

Culpability	No	0.0% Enhancement	Subtotal 4	\$0
--------------------	----	-------------------------	-------------------	------------

Notes: The Respondent does not meet the culpability criteria.

Good Faith Effort to Comply Total Adjustments	Subtotal 5	\$0
--	-------------------	------------

Economic Benefit	0.0% Enhancement*	Subtotal 6	\$0
-------------------------	--------------------------	-------------------	------------

Total EB Amounts: \$654
 Estimated Cost of Compliance: \$5,000
 *Capped at the Total EB \$ Amount

SUM OF SUBTOTALS 1-7	Final Subtotal	\$1,250
-----------------------------	-----------------------	----------------

OTHER FACTORS AS JUSTICE MAY REQUIRE	0.0% Adjustment	\$0
---	------------------------	------------

Reduces or enhances the Final Subtotal by the indicated percentage.

Notes:

Final Penalty Amount	\$1,250
-----------------------------	----------------

STATUTORY LIMIT ADJUSTMENT	Final Assessed Penalty	\$1,250
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	----------------

DEFERRAL	0.0% Reduction Adjustment	\$0
-----------------	----------------------------------	------------

Reduces the Final Assessed Penalty by the indicated percentage.

Notes: Deferral not offered for non-expedited settlement.

PAYABLE PENALTY	\$1,250
------------------------	----------------

Screening Date 18-Jun-2020

Docket No. 2020-0851-AIR-E

PCW

Respondent Ruiz and Forsh JV LLC

Case ID No. 59470

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN110491362

Media Air

Enf. Coordinator Amanda Diaz

Policy Revision 4 (April 2014)

PCW Revision March 26, 2014

Compliance History Worksheet

>> Compliance History Site Enhancement (Subtotal 2)

Component	Number of...	Number	Adjust.
NOVs	Written notices of violation ("NOVs") with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (<i>number of NOVs meeting criteria</i>)	0	0%
	Other written NOVs	0	0%
Orders	Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (<i>number of orders meeting criteria</i>)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%
Judgments and Consent Decrees	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (<i>number of judgments or consent decrees meeting criteria</i>)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%
Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (<i>number of counts</i>)	0	0%
Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (<i>number of events</i>)	0	0%
Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (<i>number of audits for which notices were submitted</i>)	0	0%
	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (<i>number of audits for which violations were disclosed</i>)	0	0%
Other	Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%
	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%
	Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%
	Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 2) 0%

>> Repeat Violator (Subtotal 3)

No

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 3) 0%

>> Compliance History Person Classification (Subtotal 7)

Satisfactory Performer

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 7) 0%

>> Compliance History Summary

Compliance History Notes

No adjustment for compliance history.

Total Compliance History Adjustment Percentage (Subtotals 2, 3, & 7) 0%

>> Final Compliance History Adjustment

Final Adjustment Percentage *capped at 100% 0%

Screening Date 18-Jun-2020
Respondent Ruiz and Forsh JV LLC
Case ID No. 59470
Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN110491362
Media Air
Enf. Coordinator Amanda Diaz

Docket No. 2020-0851-AIR-E

PCW

Policy Revision 4 (April 2014)
PCW Revision March 26, 2014

Violation Number

Rule Cite(s) 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 116.110(a) and Tex. Health & Safety Code §§ 382.0518(a) and 382.085(b)

Violation Description Failed to obtain authorization prior to constructing or modifying a source of air contaminants. Specifically, the Respondent conducted auto body repair and refinishing activities prior to obtaining the proper authorization.

Base Penalty

>> Environmental, Property and Human Health Matrix

OR	Release	Harm			Percent
		Major	Moderate	Minor	
Actual	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text" value="0.0%"/>
Potential	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	

>> Programmatic Matrix

Matrix Notes	Falsification	Major	Moderate	Minor	Percent
		<input type="text"/>	<input checked="" type="text" value="x"/>	<input type="text"/>	
	<input type="text" value="100% of the rule requirement was not met."/>				

Adjustment

Violation Events

Number of Violation Events Number of violation days

daily	<input type="text"/>
weekly	<input type="text"/>
monthly	<input type="text"/>
quarterly	<input checked="" type="text" value="x"/>
semiannual	<input type="text"/>
annual	<input type="text"/>
single event	<input type="text"/>

Violation Base Penalty

Good Faith Efforts to Comply

Reduction

	Before NOE/NOV	NOE/NOV to EDPRP/Settlement Offer
Extraordinary	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Ordinary	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
N/A	<input checked="" type="text" value="x"/>	<input type="text"/>

Notes

Violation Subtotal

Economic Benefit (EB) for this violation

Statutory Limit Test

Estimated EB Amount

Violation Final Penalty Total

This violation Final Assessed Penalty (adjusted for limits)

Economic Benefit Worksheet

Respondent Ruiz and Forsh JV LLC
Case ID No. 59470
Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN110491362
Media Air
Violation No. 1

Percent Interest	Years of Depreciation
5.0	15

Item Description	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Costs Saved	EB Amount
------------------	-----------	---------------	------------	-----	----------------	-------------	-----------

Delayed Costs

Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Engineering/Construction				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs	\$5,000	19-Jun-2018	29-Jan-2021	2.62	\$654	n/a	\$654
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0

Notes for DELAYED costs

Estimated cost to obtain authorization for the auto body repair and refinishing activities at the Site. The Date Required is the initial investigation date and the Final Date is the estimated date of compliance.

Avoided Costs

ANNUALIZE avoided costs before entering item (except for one-time avoided costs)

Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Supplies/Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Financial Assurance				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0

Notes for AVOIDED costs

Approx. Cost of Compliance

\$5,000

TOTAL

\$654



Compliance History Report

Compliance History Report for CN605569193, RN110491362, Rating Year 2019 which includes Compliance History (CH) components from September 1, 2014, through August 31, 2019.

Customer, Respondent, or Owner/Operator:	CN605569193, Ruiz And Forsh JV LLC	Classification:	SATISFACTORY	Rating:	8.00
Regulated Entity:	RN110491362, MY COLLISION CENTER	Classification:	SATISFACTORY	Rating:	8.00
Complexity Points:	0	Repeat Violator:	NO		
CH Group:	14 - Other				
Location:	6210 NORTHWEST LOOP 410 SAN ANTONIO, BEXAR COUNTY, TX 78238-3306				
TCEQ Region:	REGION 13 - SAN ANTONIO				
ID Number(s):	AIR QUALITY NON PERMITTED ID NUMBER R13110491362				
Compliance History Period:	September 01, 2014 to August 31, 2019	Rating Year:	2019	Rating Date:	09/01/2019
Date Compliance History Report Prepared:	June 18, 2020				
Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History:	Enforcement				
Component Period Selected:	June 18, 2015 to June 18, 2020				
TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding This Compliance History.					
Name:	Amanda Diaz			Phone:	(512) 239-2601

Site and Owner/Operator History:

- 1) Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five year compliance period? NO
- 2) Has there been a (known) change in ownership/operator of the site during the compliance period? NO

Components (Multimedia) for the Site Are Listed in Sections A - J

A. Final Orders, court judgments, and consent decrees:
N/A

B. Criminal convictions:
N/A

C. Chronic excessive emissions events:
N/A

D. The approval dates of investigations (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):
N/A

E. Written notices of violations (NOV) (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):
A notice of violation represents a written allegation of a violation of a specific regulatory requirement from the commission to a regulated entity. A notice of violation is not a final enforcement action, nor proof that a violation has actually occurred.
N/A

F. Environmental audits:
N/A

G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs):
N/A

H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates:

N/A

I. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program:

N/A

J. Early compliance:

N/A

Sites Outside of Texas:

N/A

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



**IN THE MATTER OF AN
ENFORCEMENT ACTION
CONCERNING
RUIZ AND FORSH JV LLC;
RN110491362**

**§
§
§
§
§**

**BEFORE THE
TEXAS COMMISSION ON
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY**

DEFAULT ORDER

DOCKET NO. 2020-0851-AIR-E

On _____, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("Commission" or "TCEQ") considered the Executive Director's Preliminary Report and Petition, filed pursuant to TEX. WATER CODE ch. 7, TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE ch. 382, and the rules of the TCEQ, which requests appropriate relief, including the imposition of an administrative penalty and corrective action of the respondent. The respondent made the subject of this Order is Ruiz and Forsh JV LLC ("Respondent").

The Commission makes the following Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law:

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Respondent owns and operates an autobody repair and refinishing shop located at 6210 Northwest Loop 410 in San Antonio, Bexar County, Texas (the "Facility"). The Facility consists of one or more sources as defined in TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 382.003(12).
2. During a record review conducted between April 2, 2020, and April 16, 2020, an investigator documented that Respondent failed to obtain authorization prior to constructing or modifying a source of air contaminants. Specifically, Respondent conducted auto body repair and refinishing activities prior to obtaining the proper authorization.
3. The Executive Director filed the "Executive Director's Preliminary Report and Petition Recommending that the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality Enter an Enforcement Order Assessing an Administrative Penalty Against and Requiring Certain Actions of Ruiz and Forsh JV LLC" (the "EDPRP") in the TCEQ Chief Clerk's office on February 16, 2022.
4. By letter dated February 16, 2022, sent to Respondent's last known address via certified mail, return receipt requested, postage prepaid, the Executive Director served Respondent with notice of the EDPRP. According to the return receipt "green card," Respondent received notice of the EDPRP on February 18, 2022, as evidenced by the signature on the card.
5. More than 20 days have elapsed since Respondent received notice of the EDPRP. Respondent failed to file an answer and failed to request a hearing.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 1, Respondent is subject to the jurisdiction of the TCEQ, pursuant to TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE ch. 382 and the rules of the TCEQ.
2. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 2, Respondent failed to obtain authorization prior to constructing or modifying a source of air contaminants, in violation of TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §§ 382.0518(a) and 382.085(b) and 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 116.110(a).
3. As evidenced by Findings of Fact Nos. 3 and 4, the Executive Director timely served Respondent with proper notice of the EDPRP, as required by TEX. WATER CODE § 7.055 and 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 70.104(b)(1).

4. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 5, Respondent failed to file a timely answer as required by TEX. WATER CODE § 7.056 and 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 70.105. Pursuant to TEX. WATER CODE § 7.057 and 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 70.106, the Commission may enter a Default Order against Respondent and assess the penalty recommended by the Executive Director.
5. Pursuant to TEX. WATER CODE § 7.051, the Commission has the authority to assess an administrative penalty against Respondent for violations of state statutes within TCEQ's jurisdiction, for violations of rules adopted under such statutes, or for violations of orders or permits issued under such statutes.
6. An administrative penalty in the amount of one thousand two hundred fifty dollars (\$1,250.00) is justified by the facts recited in this Order, and considered in light of the factors set forth in TEX. WATER CODE § 7.053.
7. TEX. WATER CODE §§ 5.102 and 7.002 authorize the Commission to issue orders and make determinations necessary to effectuate the purposes of the statutes within its jurisdiction.

ORDERING PROVISIONS

NOW, THEREFORE, THE TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ORDERS that:

1. Respondent is assessed an administrative penalty in the amount of one thousand two hundred fifty dollars (\$1,250.00) for violations of state statutes and rules of the TCEQ. The payment of this penalty and Respondent's compliance with all the requirements set forth in this Order resolve only the matters set forth by this Order in this action. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective actions or penalties for violations which are not raised here.
2. The penalty assessed by this Order shall be paid within 30 days after the effective date of this Order. All checks submitted to pay the penalty imposed by this Order shall be made out to TCEQ and shall be sent with the notation "Re: Ruiz and Forsh JV LLC; Docket No. 2020-0851-AIR-E" to:

Financial Administration Division
Revenue Operations Section
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214
P.O. Box 13088
Austin, Texas 78711-3088
3. Respondent shall undertake the following technical requirements:
 - a. Within 30 days after the effective date of this Order, submit an administratively complete registration, in accordance with 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE ch. 106, or permit application, in accordance with 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 116.111, to authorize the auto body repair and refinishing activities at the Facility to:

Air Permits Division, MC 163
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 13087
Austin, Texas 78711-3087
 - b. Respond completely and adequately, as determined by the TCEQ, to all requests for information concerning the registration or permit application by any deadline specified in writing.
 - c. Within 45 days after the effective date of this Order, submit written certification in accordance with Ordering Provision No. 3.e., to demonstrate compliance with Ordering Provision No. 3.a.

- d. Within 180 days after the effective date of this Order, submit written certification in accordance with Ordering Provision No. 3.e., that either authorization for the auto body repair and refinishing activities at the Facility has been obtained or that operations have ceased until such time that the appropriate authorization has been obtained.
- e. The certifications required by these Ordering Provisions shall be accompanied by detailed supporting documentation, including photographs, receipts, and/or other records, shall be signed by Respondent, and shall include the following certification language:

“I certify under penalty of law that I have personally examined and am familiar with the information submitted and all attached documents, and based on my inquiry of those individuals immediately responsible for obtaining the information, I believe the submitted information is true, accurate, and complete. I am aware there are significant penalties for submitting false information, including the possibility of fine and imprisonment for knowing violations.”

The written certifications and supporting documentation necessary to demonstrate compliance with these Ordering Provisions shall be sent to:

Enforcement Division, MC 149A
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 13087
Austin, Texas 78711-3087

and:

Air Section Manager
San Antonio Regional Office
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
14250 Judson Road
San Antonio, Texas 78233-4480

4. All relief not expressly granted in this Order is denied.
5. The provisions of this Order shall apply to and be binding upon Respondent. Respondent is ordered to give notice of this Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Site operations referenced in this Order.
6. The Executive Director may grant an extension of any deadline in this Order or in any plan, report, or other document submitted pursuant to this Order, upon a written and substantiated showing of good cause. All requests for extensions by Respondent shall be made in writing to the Executive Director. Extensions are not effective until Respondent receives written approval from the Executive Director. The determination of what constitutes good cause rests solely with the Executive Director. Extension requests shall be sent to the Enforcement Division at the address listed above.
7. If Respondent fails to comply with any of the Ordering Provisions in this Order within the prescribed schedules, and that failure is caused solely by an act of God, war, strike, riot, or other catastrophe, Respondent's failure to comply is not a violation of this Order. Respondent shall have the burden of establishing to the Executive Director's satisfaction that such an event has occurred. Respondent shall notify the Executive Director within seven days after Respondent becomes aware of a delaying event and shall take all reasonable measures to mitigate and minimize any delay.
8. The Executive Director may refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings without notice to Respondent if the Executive Director determines that Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Order.

9. The provisions of this Order are deemed severable, and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.
10. This Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Order, whichever is later.
11. The Chief Clerk shall provide a copy of this fully executed Order to each of the parties. By law, the effective date of this Order shall be the date the Order is final, as provided by 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 70.106(d) and TEX. GOV'T CODE § 2001.144.

SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

For the Commission

Date

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



UNSWORN DECLARATION OF CYNTHIA K. SIROIS

"On behalf of the Executive Director of the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality, the 'Executive Director's Preliminary Report and Petition Recommending that the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality Enter an Enforcement Order Assessing an Administrative Penalty Against and Requiring Certain Actions of Ruiz and Forsh JV LLC' (the "EDPRP") was filed in the TCEQ Chief Clerk's office on February 16, 2022.

The EDPRP was mailed to Respondent's last known address on February 16, 2022, via certified mail, return receipt requested, postage prepaid. According to the return receipt "green card," Respondent received notice of the EDPRP on February 18, 2022, as evidenced by the signature on the card.

More than 20 days have elapsed since Respondent received notice of the EDPRP. Respondent failed to file an answer and failed to request a hearing."

"My name is Cynthia K. Sirois, and I am an employee of the following governmental agency: Texas Commission on Environmental Quality. I am executing this declaration as part of my assigned duties and responsibilities. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct."

Executed in Travis County,
State of Texas,
on the 19th day of August, 2022

Cynthia K Sirois

Declarant