Findings Order Justification: Indifference to legal duty based on violation of a previous order							
Rock, Concho County (the "Site")							
None None None None None							
December 29, 2023							
None							
Penalty Information							
\$8,800							
\$260							
\$8,540							
No							
N/A							
January 28, 2021							
Investigation Information							
N/A							
April 20, 2021							
11p111 20, 2021							
N/A							

Violation Information

Failed to obtain authorization prior to constructing, altering, repairing, extending, or operating an On-Site Sewage Facility ("OSSF") [TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §§ 366.004 and 366.051(a), 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 285.3(a) and (b)(1), and Texas Commission on Environmental Quality Agreed Order Docket No. 2019-1702-OSS-E, Ordering Provision No. 2.a.i.].

Corrective Actions/Technical Requirements

Corrective Action(s) Completed:

Respondent properly abandoned the OSSF at the Site as of March 4, 2022.

Technical Requirements: None

Litigation Information

Settlement Date:

November 20, 2023

Contact Information

TCEQ Attorneys: Taylor Pack Ellis, Litigation Division, (512) 239-3400 Sheldon Wayne, Public Interest Counsel, (512) 239-6363

TCEQ Litigation Agenda Coordinator: Katherine McKenzie, Litigation Division, (512) 239-2575

TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Cheryl Thompson, Enforcement Division, (817) 588-5865

TCEQ Regional Contact: Ronnie Cline, San Angelo Regional Office, 325-659-6705

Respondent Contact: Leah Brosig, Director, Chaparral Property Services, LLC fka MB Chaparral, LLC, 11490 FM 380 Paint Rock, Texas 76866-3662

Respondent's Attorney: N/A

REAL OF THE OWNER OWNER OF THE OWNER	Policy Re	Pe vision 5 (January 28,		alculatio	n Worksh	ieet (PC		vision February	/ 11, 2021
DATES	Assigned	12-Jul-2021	-		_				
	PCW	7-Aug-2023	Screening	27-Sep-2021	EPA Due				
RESPO		TY INFORMATI							
_	Respondent	Chaparral Proper	ty Services, L	LC fka MB Cha	parral, LLC				
-	g. Ent. Ref. No. ty/Site Region				Major/Mi	inor Source	Minor		
		o Sun Angelo			riajor/ri				
	NFORMATION	50522				6 \ /! = = +! = = =	[4		1
En	f./Case ID No. Docket No.	2022-0090-0SS	-F			f Violations Order Type			
Med		On-Site Sewage			Government				
	Multi-Media		÷		Enf. (Cheryl Thomp		
Adr	nin. Penalty \$ L	.imit Minimum	\$0	Maximum	\$5,000	EC's Team	Enforcement	Team 1	
			Penalt	y Calculat	tion Sectio	n			
ΤΟΤΑΙ	L BASE PENA	LTY (Sum of	violation b	oase penalt	ies)		Subtotal 1		\$8,000
ADJUS	STMENTS (+	/-) TO SUBTO	DTAL 1						
	Subtotals 2-7 are of	tained by multiplying	the Total Base P	, ,				r	\$1,600
	Compliance Hi	story		20.0%	Adjustment	Sublo	tals 2, 3, & 7		\$1,000
	Notes	Enhancemen	t for one agree	ed order conta	ining a denial of	liablility.			
	Culpability	No		0.0%	Enhancement		Subtotal 4		\$0
	Notes	The Re	spondent does	s not meet the	culpability crite	ria.			
	Good Faith Eff	ort to Comply T	otal Adjustm	ients			Subtotal 5		-\$800
	Economic Ben				Enhancement*		Subtotal 6		\$0
	Estimated	Total EB Amounts Cost of Compliance	\$44 \$500	*Capped	l at the Total EB \$ A	mount			
SUM (OF SUBTOTA	LS 1-7				F	inal Subtotal		\$8,800
OTHE	R FACTORS A	S JUSTICE M	IAY REQUI	RE [0.0%		Adjustment		\$0
Reduces of	or ennances the Final	Subtotal by the indic	cated percentage.				ו		
	Notes								
						Final Pen	alty Amount		\$8,800
STATU	JTORY LIMIT		IT			Final Asse	ssed Penalty		\$8,800
DEFEF	RRAL				0.0%	Reduction	Adjustment		\$0
Reduces t	he Final Assessed Pe	nalty by the indicated	d percentage.				1		
	Notes	No d	leferral is reco	mmended for	Findings Orders.				
PAYA	BLE PENALTY	1							\$8,800

Reg	. Ent. Refer	ence No. RN104385695			
	Enf. Coo	Media On-Site Sewage Disposal rdinator Cheryl Thompson			
		Compliance History Worksheet			
> Co	mpliance Histo	ory Site Enhancement (Subtotal 2)			
	Component	Number of	Number	Adjust.	
	NOVs	Written notices of violation ("NOVs") with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (<i>number of NOVs meeting criteria</i>)	0	0%	
		Other written NOVs	0	0%	
		Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (<i>number of</i> orders meeting criteria)	1	20%	
	Orders	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%	
	Judgments and Consent	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (<i>number of judgments or consent decrees meeting criteria</i>)	0	0%	
	Decrees	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%	
	Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (<i>number of counts</i>)	0	0%	
	Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (number of events)	0	0%	
		Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (<i>number of audits for which notices were submitted</i>)	0	0%	
	Audits	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (<i>number of audits for which violations were disclosed</i>)	0	0%	
		Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%	
	Other	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%	
		Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%	
		Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%	
		Adjustment Per	centage (Sub	ototal 2)	20%
> Re	peat Violator			_	
	N/A	Adjustment Per	centage (Sub	ototal 3)	0%
> Co	mpliance Histo	ory Person Classification (Subtotal 7)			
	N/A	N/A Adjustment Per		ototal 7)	0%
> Co	mpliance Histo	ory Summary			
	Compliance History Notes	Enhancement for one agreed order containing a denial of liablility.			
		Total Compliance History Adjustment Percentage (S	Subtotals 2,	3, & 7)	20%
> Fina	al Compliance	History Adjustment			
		Final Adjustment Percenta	age *capped	at 100%	20%

Docket No. 2022-0090-OSS-E

Respondent Chaparral Property Services, LLC fka MB Chaparral, LLC

Screening Date 27-Sep-2021

Case ID No. 58522

PCW

Policy Revision 5 (January 28, 2021) PCW Revision February 11, 2021

		ening Date				et No. 2022-0090-0SS-E		PCW
			Chaparral Prope	erty Services	, LLC fka MB Ch	naparral, LLC	Policy R	Revision 5 (January 28, 2021)
_		Case ID No.					PCV	V Revision February 11, 2021
Reg.	Ent. Ref		RN104385695					
	Faf (On-Site Sewage					
		tion Number	Cheryl Thompso	on				
	VIOIa	ation Number	I					
		Rule Cite(s)	366.004 and	d 366.051(a)	, and Texas Co	b)(1), Tex. Health & Safety C mmission on Environmental DSS-E, Ordering Provision No	Quality	
	Violatio	n Description	or operating a	in On-Site Se	wage Facility (tructing, altering, repairing, "OSSF"). Specifically, the Re- re a ten-space recreational ve orization.	spondent	
						Bas	e Penalty	\$5,000
>> Env	vironme	ntal, Prope	rty and Hum		Matrix			
		Release	Major	Harm Moderate	Minor			
OR		Actual		Tioucrute				
		Potential				Percent 0.0%		
_								
>>Prog	gramma	tic Matrix Falsification	Major	Moderate	Minor			
		Faisincation	Major X	Moderate	MINOF	Percent 10.0%		
					JLJ			
	Matrix Notes		1009	% of the rule	requirements	were not met.		
						Adjustment	\$4,500	
								\$500
Violatio	on Even	ts						
		Number of V	iolation Events	16	1 (=	482 Number of violation	davs	
				10	<u>اللہ الے</u>		uuys	
			daily]			
			weekly					
			monthly quarterly	Х		Violation Bas	e Penalty	\$8,000
			semiannual			Violation Bus	e i churcy	40,000
			annual		j			
			single event					
		Civita an maan				om the effective date of TCE	Agreed	
						the screening date (Septem		
Good F	aith Eff	orts to Com	ply	10.0%			Reduction	\$800
			Be	efore NOE/NOV	NOE/NOV to EDP	RP/Settlement Offer		
			Extraordinary					
			Ordinary		X			
			N/A		<u> </u>			
			Notes	The Respo		d compliance by March 4, 22.		
						Violatior	Subtotal	\$7,200
Econon	nic Bene	efit (EB) for	this violatio	on		Statutory Limit	t Test	
		Estimate	ed EB Amount		\$44	Violation Final Pen	alty Total	\$8,800
				This viola	ation Final As	sessed Penalty (adjusted 1	or limits)	\$8,800

Economic Benefit Worksheet								
	Chaparral Property Services, LLC fka MB Chaparral, LLC							
Case ID No.								
Reg. Ent. Reference No.								
-	On-Site Sewad						Years of	
Violation No.	Percent Interest							
	-					5.0	15	
	Thom Cost	Data Deguired	Final Date	Vera	Interest Saved	Costs Saved	EB Amount	
	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Costs Saved	EB Amount	
Item Description								
Delayed Costs		1		0	1			
Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Buildings				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Engineering/Construction				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Land				0.00	\$0 \$0	n/a	\$0 \$0	
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a n/a	\$0	
Training/Sampling Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0	
Permit Costs	\$500	2-Jun-2020	4-Mar-2022	1.75	\$44	n/a	\$44	
Other (as needed)	\$300	2-Jun-2020	4-11101-2022	0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0	
		111						
						e with 30 TEX. ADM		
Notes for DELAYED costs	285. Date req	uired is the effect	ive date of TCE	Q Agree	ed Order Docket No	. 2019-1702-OSS-	E, and the final	
			date is th	ne date	of compliance.			
Avoided Costs		AI IZE avoided c	osts before en	terina	item (except for	one-time avoide	d costs)	
Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Supplies/Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Financial Assurance				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0	
ONE-TIME avoided costs				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Notes for AVOIDED costs								
	<u></u>							
Approx. Cost of Compliance		\$500			TOTAL		\$44	
	L	4000					די ש	

The TCEQ is committed to accessibility. To request a more accessible version of this report, please contact the TCEQ Help Desk at (512) 239-4357.



Compliance History Report

Compliance History Report for CN605702885, RN104385695, Rating Year 2022 which includes Compliance History (CH) components from September 1, 2017, through August 31, 2022.

Customer, Respondent, or Owner/Operator:	CN605702885, MB Chaparral, LLC	Classification: NOT APPLICABL	E Rating: N/A					
Regulated Entity:	RN104385695, OSSF 19801 US HIGHWAY 83 NORTH	Classification: NOT APPLICABL	E Rating: N/A					
Complexity Points:	N/A	Repeat Violator: N/A						
CH Group:	14 - Other							
Location:	ion: 19801 United States Highway 83 North, Paint Rock, Concho County, Texas							
TCEQ Region:	REGION 08 - SAN ANGELO							
ID Number(s): ON SITE SEWAGE FACILITY PERMIT R08104385695								
Compliance History Per	iod: September 01, 2017 to August 31, 2	022 Rating Year: 2022 R	ating Date: 09/01/2022					
Date Compliance Histor	y Report Prepared: January 10, 202	3						
Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History: Enforcement								
Component Period Selected: January 10, 2018 to January 10, 2023								
TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding This Compliance History.								
Name: Alejandro LajePhone: (512) 239-2547								

Site and Owner/Operator History:

1) Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five-year compliance period?	YES
2) Has there been a (known) change in ownership/operator of the site during the compliance period?	NO

Components (Multimedia) for the Site Are Listed in Sections A - J

A. Final Orders, court judgments, and consent decrees:

 1
 Effective Date: 06/02/2020
 ADMINORDER 2019-1702-OSS-E (1660 Order-Agreed Order With Denial)

 Classification:
 Major

Citation: 30 TAC Chapter 285, SubChapter A 285.3(a)

30 TAC Chapter 285, SubChapter A 285.3(b)(1)

- 5B THSC Chapter 366, SubChapter A 366.004
- 5B THSC Chapter 366, SubChapter A 366.051(a)

Description: Failed to obtain authorization prior to constructing, altering, repairing, extending, or operating an OSSF

B. Criminal convictions:

N/A

C. Chronic excessive emissions events:

N/A

D. The approval dates of investigations (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

E. Written notices of violations (NOV) (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

A notice of violation represents a written allegation of a violation of a specific regulatory requirement from the commission to a regulated entity. A notice of violation is not a final enforcement action, nor proof that a violation has actually occurred. N/A

F. Environmental audits:

N/A

- G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs): N/A
- H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates: \$N/A\$
- I. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program: \$N/A\$
- J. Early compliance: N/A

Sites Outside of Texas:

N/A

Component Appendices

Appendix A All NOVs Issued During Component Period 1/10/2018 and 1/10/2023

N/A

Appendix B All Investigations Conducted During Component Period January 10, 2018 and January 10, 2023

Item 1 July 08, 2021** (1724745)

* No violations documented during this investigation

**Investigation applicable for the Compliance History Rating period between 09/01/2017 and 08/31/2022.

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



§

555555

IN THE MATTER OF AN ENFORCEMENT ACTION CONCERNING CHAPARRAL PROPERTY SERVICES, LLC FKA MB CHAPARRAL, LLC; RN104385695

BEFORE THE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON

ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

AGREED ORDER

DOCKET NO. 2022-0090-OSS-E

On _______, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("Commission" or "TCEQ") considered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement action regarding Chaparral Property Services, LLC fka MB Chaparral, LLC ("Respondent") under the authority of Tex. WATER CODE chs. 7 and 26 and Tex. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE ch. 366. The Executive Director of the TCEQ, represented by the Litigation Division, and Respondent presented this Order to the Commission.

Respondent understands that it has certain procedural rights at certain points in the enforcement process, including the right to formal notice of violations, to request an evidentiary hearing, receive notice of an evidentiary hearing, and a right to appeal. By entering into this Order, Respondent agrees to waive all notice and procedural rights which might otherwise be authorized or required in this action.

It is further understood and agreed that this Order represents the complete and fully-integrated agreement of the parties. The provisions of this Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable. The duties and responsibilities imposed by this Order are binding upon Respondent.

The Commission makes the following Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law:

FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. Respondent constructed, installed, altered, and/or repaired an On-Site Sewage Facility ("OSSF"), as defined in 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 285.2(45), at 19801 United States Highway 83 North in Paint Rock, Concho County, Texas (the "Site"). Therefore, Respondent is subject to TCEQ jurisdiction pursuant to TEX. WATER CODE ch. 26 and TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 366.011.
- 2. During an investigation conducted on April 20, 2021, an investigator documented that Respondent failed to obtain authorization prior to constructing, altering, repairing, extending, or operating an OSSF. Specifically, Respondent altered an existing OSSF at the Site to serve a ten-space recreational vehicle park without authorization.
- 3. The Executive Director recognizes that Respondent properly abandoned the OSSF at the Site, in accordance with 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE ch. 285, as of March 4, 2022.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 1, Respondent is subject to the jurisdiction of the TCEQ pursuant to TEX. WATER CODE ch. 26, TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE ch. 366, and the rules of the TCEQ.

Chaparral Property Services, LLC fka MB Chaparral, LLC Docket No. 2022-0090-OSS-E Page 2

- 2. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 2, Respondent failed to obtain authorization prior to constructing, altering, repairing, extending, or operating an OSSF, in violation of Tex. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §§ 366.004 and 366.051(a), 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 285.3(a) and (b)(1), and Texas Commission on Environmental Quality Agreed Order Docket No. 2019-1702-OSS-E, Ordering Provision No. 2.a.i.
- 3. Pursuant to TEX. WATER CODE § 7.051, TCEQ has the authority to assess an administrative penalty against Respondent for violations of state statutes within TCEQ's jurisdiction, for violations of rules adopted under such statutes, or for violations of orders or permits issued under such statutes.
- 4. An administrative penalty in the amount of \$8,800 is justified by the facts recited in this Order, and considered in light of the factors set forth in TEX. WATER CODE § 7.053. Respondent paid \$260 of the penalty. The remaining amount of \$8,540 shall be paid in 35 monthly payments of \$244 each. The first monthly payment shall be paid within 30 days after the effective date of this Order. The subsequent payments shall each be paid not later than 30 days following the due date of the previous payment until the penalty is paid in full. If Respondent fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with the payment requirements of this Order, including the payment schedule, the Executive Director may, at his option, accelerate the maturity of the remaining installments, in which event the unpaid balance shall become immediately due and payable without demand or notice. In addition, Respondent's failure to meet the payment schedule of this Order and/or the acceleration of any remaining balance constitutes the failure by Respondent to timely and satisfactorily comply with all the terms of this Order.

ORDERING PROVISIONS

NOW, THEREFORE, THE TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ORDERS that:

1. Respondent is assessed an administrative penalty as set forth in Conclusion of Law No. 4 for violations of state statutes and rules of the TCEQ. The payment of this penalty and Respondent's compliance with all requirements set forth in this Order resolve only the matters set forth by this Order in this action. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective actions or penalties for violations which are not raised here. Penalty payments shall be made payable to TCEQ and shall be sent with the notation "Re: Chaparral Property Services, LLC fka MB Chaparral, LLC, Docket No. 2022-0090-OSS-E" to:

Financial Administration Division Revenue Operations Section Texas Commission on Environmental Quality Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214 P.O. Box 13088 Austin, Texas 78711-3088

- 2. All relief not expressly granted in this Order is denied.
- 3. The duties and provisions imposed by this Order shall apply to and be binding upon Respondent.
- 4. The Executive Director may grant an extension of any deadline in this Order or in any plan, report, or other document submitted pursuant to this Order, upon a written and substantiated showing of good cause. All requests for extensions by Respondent shall be made in writing to the Executive Director. Extensions are not effective until Respondent receives written approval from the Executive Director. The determination of what constitutes good cause rests solely with the Executive Director.

- 5. If Respondent fails to comply with any of the Ordering Provisions in this Order within the prescribed schedules, and that failure is caused solely by an act of God, war, strike, riot, or other catastrophe, Respondent's failure to comply is not a violation of this Order. Respondent shall have the burden of establishing to the Executive Director's satisfaction that such an event has occurred. Respondent shall notify the Executive Director within seven days after Respondent becomes aware of a delaying event and shall take all reasonable measures to mitigate and minimize any delay.
- 6. This Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against Respondent in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") to: (1) enforce the terms of this Order, or (2) pursue violations of a statute within TCEQ's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by TCEQ under such a statute. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the OAG for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Order.
- 7. The provisions of this Order are deemed severable, and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.
- 8. This Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Order, whichever is later.
- 9. This Order may be executed in separate and multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single instrument. Any page of this Order may be copied, scanned, digitized, converted to electronic portable document format ("pdf"), or otherwise reproduced and may be transmitted by digital or electronic transmission, including but not limited to facsimile transmission and electronic mail. Any signature affixed to this Order shall constitute an original signature for all purposes and may be used, filed, substituted, or issued for any purpose for which an original signature could be used. The term "signature" shall include manual signatures and true and accurate reproductions of manual signatures created, executed, endorsed, adopted, or authorized by the person or persons to whom the signatures are attributable. Signatures may be copied or reproduced digitally, electronically, by photocopying, engraving, imprinting, lithographing, electronic mail, facsimile transmission, stamping, or any other means or process which the Executive Director deems acceptable. In this paragraph exclusively, the terms: electronic transmission, owner, person, writing, and written, shall have the meanings assigned to them under TEX. BUS. ORG. CODE § 1.002.
- 10. The effective date of this Order is the date it is signed by the Commission. A copy of this fully executed Order shall be provided to each of the parties.

Chaparral Property Services, LLC fka MB Chaparral, LLC Docket No. 2022-0090-OSS-E Page 4

SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

For the Commission

Date

For the Executive Director

1/22/24 Date

I, the undersigned, have read and understand the attached Order. I am authorized to agree to the attached Order, and I do agree to the terms and conditions specified therein. I further acknowledge that the TCEQ, in accepting payment for the penalty amount, is materially relying on such representation.

I also understand that failure to comply with the Ordering Provisions in this Order and/or failure to timely pay the penalty amount may result in:

- A negative impact on compliance history;
- Greater scrutiny of any permit applications;
- Referral of this case to the Attorney General's office for contempt, injunctive relief, additional penalties, and/or attorney fees, or to a collection agency;
- Increased penalties in any future enforcement actions;
- Automatic referral to the Attorney General's office of any future enforcement actions; and
- TCEQ seeking other relief as authorized by law.

In addition, I understand that any falsification of any compliance documents may result in criminal prosecution.

Signature - Leah Brosig, Director Chaparral Property Services, LLC fka MB Chaparral, LLC 18360 Private Road 1773 Paint Rock, Texas 76866

If mailing address has changed, please check this box and provide the new address below:

The Chaparral Ranch Leah Brosig 11490 FM 380 Paint Rock, TX 76866