

Executive Summary – Enforcement Matter – Case No. 63627

City of Comanche

RN101917680

Docket No. 2023-0236-MWD-E

Order Type:

1660 Agreed Order

Findings Order Justification:

N/A

Media:

MWD

Small Business:

No

Location(s) Where Violation(s) Occurred:

City of Comanche WWTF, 900 East Fleming Avenue, Comanche, Comanche County

Type of Operation:

Wastewater treatment facility

Other Significant Matters:

Additional Pending Enforcement Actions: No

Past-Due Penalties: No

Other: N/A

Interested Third-Parties: None

Texas Register Publication Date: May 2, 2025

Comments Received: No

Penalty Information

Total Penalty Assessed: \$14,500

Amount Deferred for Expedited Settlement: \$2,900

Total Paid to General Revenue: \$11,600

Total Due to General Revenue: \$0

Payment Plan: N/A

Compliance History Classifications:

Person/CN - Satisfactory

Site/RN - Satisfactory

Major Source: No

Statutory Limit Adjustment: N/A

Applicable Penalty Policy: January 2021

Investigation Information

Complaint Date(s): N/A

Complaint Information: N/A

Date(s) of Investigation: October 28, 2022

Date(s) of NOE(s): January 5, 2023

Executive Summary – Enforcement Matter – Case No. 63627

City of Comanche

RN101917680

Docket No. 2023-0236-MWD-E

Violation Information

Failed to comply with permitted effluent limitations for *Escherichia coli*, ammonia nitrogen, and carbonaceous biochemical oxygen demand (5-day) [30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 305.125(1), TEX. WATER CODE § 26.121(a)(1), and Texas Pollutant Discharge Elimination System ("TPDES") Permit No. WQ0014445001, Effluent Limitations and Monitoring Requirements No. 1].

Corrective Actions/Technical Requirements

Corrective Action(s) Completed:

N/A

Technical Requirements:

The Order will require the Respondent to, within 130 days, submit written certification of compliance with the permitted effluent limitations of TPDES Permit No. WQ0014445001 demonstrating at least three consecutive months of compliance with all permitted effluent limitations to demonstrate compliance.

Contact Information

TCEQ Attorney: N/A

TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Samantha Smith, Enforcement Division, Enforcement Team 7, MC R-12, (512) 239-2099; Michael Parrish, Enforcement Division, MC 219, (512) 239-2548

Respondent: The Honorable Mary Boyd, Mayor, City of Comanche, 101 East Grand Avenue, Comanche, Texas 76442

Respondent's Attorney: N/A



Penalty Calculation Worksheet (PCW)

Policy Revision 5 (January 28, 2021)

PCW Revision February 11, 2021

DATES	Assigned	17-Jan-2023	Screening	3-Feb-2023	EPA Due	
	PCW	5-Feb-2025				

RESPONDENT/FACILITY INFORMATION

Respondent	City of Comanche
Reg. Ent. Ref. No.	RN101917680
Facility/Site Region	3-Abilene
Major/Minor Source	Minor

CASE INFORMATION

Enf./Case ID No.	63627	No. of Violations	2
Docket No.	2023-0236-MWD-E	Order Type	1660
Media Program(s)	Water Quality	Government/Non-Profit	Yes
Multi-Media		Enf. Coordinator	Samantha Smith
		EC's Team	Enforcement Team 1
Admin. Penalty \$ Limit Minimum	\$0	Maximum	\$25,000

Penalty Calculation Section

TOTAL BASE PENALTY (Sum of violation base penalties)	Subtotal 1	\$10,000
---	-------------------	----------

ADJUSTMENTS (+/-) TO SUBTOTAL 1

Subtotals 2-7 are obtained by multiplying the Total Base Penalty (Subtotal 1) by the indicated percentage.

Compliance History	45.0%	Adjustment	Subtotals 2, 3, & 7	\$4,500
---------------------------	-------	-------------------	--------------------------------	---------

Notes	Enhancement for nine months of self-reported effluent violations.
--------------	---

Culpability	No	0.0%	Enhancement	Subtotal 4	\$0
--------------------	----	------	--------------------	-------------------	-----

Notes	The Respondent does not meet the culpability criteria.
--------------	--

Good Faith Effort to Comply Total Adjustments	Subtotal 5	\$0
--	-------------------	-----

Economic Benefit	0.0%	Enhancement*	Subtotal 6	\$0
-------------------------	------	---------------------	-------------------	-----

Total EB Amounts	\$2,316	*Capped at the Total EB \$ Amount
Estimated Cost of Compliance	\$15,000	

SUM OF SUBTOTALS 1-7	Final Subtotal	\$14,500
-----------------------------	-----------------------	----------

OTHER FACTORS AS JUSTICE MAY REQUIRE	0.0%	Adjustment	\$0
---	------	-------------------	-----

Reduces or enhances the Final Subtotal by the indicated percentage.

Notes	N/A
--------------	-----

Final Penalty Amount	\$14,500
-----------------------------	----------

STATUTORY LIMIT ADJUSTMENT	Final Assessed Penalty	\$14,500
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	----------

DEFERRAL	20.0%	Reduction	Adjustment	-\$2,900
-----------------	-------	------------------	-------------------	----------

Reduces the Final Assessed Penalty by the indicated percentage.

Notes	Deferral offered for expedited settlement.
--------------	--

PAYABLE PENALTY	\$11,600
------------------------	----------

Screening Date	3-Feb-2023	Docket No.	2023-0236-MWD-E	PCW
Respondent	City of Comanche			
Case ID No.	63627			
Reg. Ent. Reference No.	RN101917680			
Media	Water Quality			
Enf. Coordinator	Samantha Smith			

Policy Revision 5 (January 28, 2021)

PCW Revision February 11, 2021

Compliance History Worksheet

>> Compliance History Site Enhancement (Subtotal 2)

Component	Number of...	Number	Adjust.
NOVs	Written notices of violation ("NOVs") with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (<i>number of NOVs meeting criteria</i>)	9	45%
	Other written NOVs	0	0%
Orders	Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (<i>number of orders meeting criteria</i>)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%
Judgments and Consent Decrees	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (<i>number of judgments or consent decrees meeting criteria</i>)	0	0%
	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%
Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (<i>number of counts</i>)	0	0%
Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (<i>number of events</i>)	0	0%
Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (<i>number of audits for which notices were submitted</i>)	0	0%
	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (<i>number of audits for which violations were disclosed</i>)	0	0%
Other	Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%
	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%
	Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%
	Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 2) 45%

>> Repeat Violator (Subtotal 3)

No

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 3) 0%

>> Compliance History Person Classification (Subtotal 7)

Satisfactory Performer

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 7) 0%

>> Compliance History Summary

Compliance History Notes

Enhancement for nine months of self-reported effluent violations.

Total Compliance History Adjustment Percentage (Subtotals 2, 3, & 7) 45%

>> Final Compliance History Adjustment

Final Adjustment Percentage *capped at 100% 45%

Screening Date 3-Feb-2023 Respondent City of Comanche Case ID No. 63627 Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101917680 Media Water Quality Enf. Coordinator Samantha Smith	Docket No. 2023-0236-MWD-E	PCW <i>Policy Revision 5 (January 28, 2021)</i> <i>PCW Revision February 11, 2021</i>
--	-----------------------------------	--

Violation Number	1	
Rule Cite(s)		30 Tex. Admin. Code § 305.125(1), Tex. Water Code § 26.121(a)(1), and Texas Pollutant Discharge Elimination System ("TPDES") Permit No. WQ0014445001, Effluent Limitations and Monitoring Requirements No. 1.
Violation Description		Failed to comply with permitted effluent limitations, as shown in the attached effluent violation table.

Base Penalty \$25,000

>> Environmental, Property and Human Health Matrix

OR		Harm			
	Release	Major	Moderate	Minor	
	Actual			X	Percent 15.0%
	Potential				

>> Programmatic Matrix

Matrix Notes		Falsification	Major	Moderate	Minor	
						Percent 0.0%
		A simplified model was used to evaluate ammonia nitrogen to determine whether the discharged amount of pollutants exceeded levels protective of human health or the environment. Human health or the environment has been exposed to insignificant amounts of pollutants that do not exceed levels that are protective of human health or environmental receptors as a result of the violation.				

Adjustment \$21,250

\$3,750

Violation Events

Number of Violation Events	1	61	Number of violation days
----------------------------	--	---	--------------------------

	daily		Violation Base Penalty \$3,750
	weekly		
	monthly		
	quarterly	X	
	semiannual		
	annual		
	single event		

One quarterly event is recommended for the quarter containing the months of May and June 2022.

Good Faith Efforts to Comply

	0.0%	
	Before NOE/NOV	NOE/NOV to EDPRP/Settlement Offer
Extraordinary		
Ordinary		
N/A	X	
Notes	The Respondent does not meet the good faith criteria for this violation.	

Reduction \$0

Violation Subtotal \$3,750

Economic Benefit (EB) for this violation

	Statutory Limit Test
Estimated EB Amount \$2,316	Violation Final Penalty Total \$5,438

This violation Final Assessed Penalty (adjusted for limits) \$5,438

Economic Benefit Worksheet

Respondent City of Comanche
Case ID No. 63627
Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101917680
Media Water Quality
Violation No. 1

Percent Interest	Years of Depreciation
5.0	15

Item Description	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Costs Saved	EB Amount
------------------	-----------	---------------	------------	-----	----------------	-------------	-----------

Delayed Costs

Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Engineering/Construction				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Other (as needed)	\$15,000	31-May-2022	1-Jul-2025	3.09	\$2,316	n/a	\$2,316

Notes for DELAYED costs

Estimated cost to determine the cause of noncompliance and to make any necessary repairs/adjustments to the Facility to achieve compliance with the permitted effluent limitations. Date Required is the end date of the first month of noncompliance, and the Final Date is the estimated date of compliance.

Avoided Costs

ANNUALIZE avoided costs before entering item (except for one-time avoided costs)

Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Supplies/Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Financial Assurance				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0

Notes for AVOIDED costs

Approx. Cost of Compliance

\$15,000

TOTAL

\$2,316

Screening Date 3-Feb-2023 Respondent City of Comanche Case ID No. 63627 Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101917680 Media Water Quality Enf. Coordinator Samantha Smith	Docket No. 2023-0236-MWD-E	PCW <small>Policy Revision 5 (January 28, 2021)</small> <small>PCW Revision February 11, 2021</small>
--	-----------------------------------	--

Violation Number	2	
Rule Cite(s)		30 Tex. Admin. Code § 305.125(1), Tex. Water Code § 26.121(a)(1), and TPDES Permit No. WQ0014445001, Effluent Limitations and Monitoring Requirements No. 1.
Violation Description		Failed to comply with permitted effluent limitations, as shown in the attached effluent violation table.

Base Penalty \$25,000

>> Environmental, Property and Human Health Matrix

OR	Release	Major	Moderate	Minor		
	Actual		x			
	Potential					
	Percent 25.0%					

>> Programmatic Matrix

Matrix Notes	Falsification	Major	Moderate	Minor		
	Percent 0.0%					
	A simplified model was used to evaluate ammonia nitrogen and carbonaceous biochemical oxygen demand (5-day) to determine whether the discharged amounts of pollutants exceeded protective levels. <i>Escherichia coli</i> was also evaluated. Human health or the environment has been exposed to significant amounts of pollutants that do not exceed levels that are protective of human health or environmental receptors as a result of the violation.					

Adjustment \$18,750
\$6,250

Violation Events

Number of Violation Events	1	31	Number of violation days
----------------------------	---	----	--------------------------

	daily		weekly		monthly	x	quarterly		semiannual		annual		single event	
--	-------	--	--------	--	---------	---	-----------	--	------------	--	--------	--	--------------	--

Violation Base Penalty \$6,250

One monthly event is recommended for the month of July 2022.

Good Faith Efforts to Comply

	0.0%	
	Before NOE/NOV	NOE/NOV to EDPRP/Settlement Offer
Extraordinary		
Ordinary		
N/A	X	
Notes	The Respondent does not meet the good faith criteria for this violation.	

Violation Subtotal \$6,250

Economic Benefit (EB) for this violation

Estimated EB Amount	Statutory Limit Test
\$0	Violation Final Penalty Total \$9,063
This violation Final Assessed Penalty (adjusted for limits) \$9,063	

Economic Benefit Worksheet

Respondent City of Comanche
Case ID No. 63627
Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101917680
Media Water Quality
Violation No. 2

Percent Interest	Years of Depreciation
5.0	15

Item Description	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Costs Saved	EB Amount
------------------	-----------	---------------	------------	-----	----------------	-------------	-----------

Delayed Costs

Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Engineering/Construction				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0

Notes for DELAYED costs

See Economic Benefit Worksheet for Violation No. 1.

Avoided Costs

ANNUALIZE avoided costs before entering item (except for one-time avoided costs)

Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Supplies/Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Financial Assurance				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0

Notes for AVOIDED costs

Approx. Cost of Compliance

\$0

TOTAL

\$0

City of Comanche TPDES Permit No. WQ0014445001 Docket No. 2023-0236-MWD-E Case No. 63627						
Effluent Violation Table						
	Carbonaceous Biochemical Oxygen Demand (5- day) Daily Avg. Conc.	<i>Escherichia coli</i> Daily Avg. Conc.	<i>Escherichia coli</i> Daily Max Conc.	Ammonia Nitrogen Daily Avg Conc.	Ammonia Nitrogen Daily Max. Conc.	Ammonia Nitrogen Daily Avg. Loading
Monitoring Period	Limit = 10 mg/L	Limit = 126 CFU/ 100 ml	Limit = 399 CFU/100 ml	Limit = 3 mg/L	Limit = 10 mg/L	Limit = 15 lbs/day
May 2022	c	c	c	3.5	11.9	c
June 2022	c	c	c	7.17	15.9	20
July 2022	12.04	1210	2420	18.89	39.2	18.89

Avg. = average Conc. = concentration mg/L = milligram per liter c = compliant
CFU/100 ml = colony forming units per 100 milliliters Max. = maximum
lbs/day = pounds per day



Compliance History Report

Compliance History Report for CN600645758, RN101917680, Rating Year 2024 which includes Compliance History (CH) components from September 1, 2019, through August 31, 2024.

Customer, Respondent, or Owner/Operator: CN600645758, City of Comanche **Classification:** SATISFACTORY **Rating:** 4.00

Regulated Entity: RN101917680, CITY OF COMANCHE **Classification:** SATISFACTORY **Rating:** 4.00

Complexity Points: 4 **Repeat Violator:** NO

CH Group: 08 - Sewage Treatment Facilities

Location: 900 East Fleming Avenue, Comanche, Comanche County, Texas

TCEQ Region: REGION 03 - ABILENE

ID Number(s):
WASTEWATER PERMIT WQ0014445001 **WASTEWATER EPA ID** TX0022730

Compliance History Period: September 01, 2019 to August 31, 2024 **Rating Year:** 2024 **Rating Date:** 09/01/2024

Date Compliance History Report Prepared: February 05, 2025

Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History: Enforcement

Component Period Selected: February 05, 2020 to February 05, 2025

TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding This Compliance History.
Name: Samantha Smith **Phone:** (512) 239-2099

Site and Owner/Operator History:

- 1) Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five-year compliance period? YES
- 2) Has there been a (known) change in ownership/operator of the site during the compliance period? NO

Components (Multimedia) for the Site Are Listed in Sections A - J

A. Final Orders, court judgments, and consent decrees:

N/A

B. Criminal convictions:

N/A

C. Chronic excessive emissions events:

D. The approval dates of investigations (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

Item 1	February 20, 2020	(1640823)	Item 15	April 16, 2021	(1726004)
Item 2	March 20, 2020	(1647343)	Item 16	May 20, 2021	(1740306)
Item 3	April 13, 2020	(1653681)	Item 17	June 16, 2021	(1740307)
Item 4	May 14, 2020	(1660264)	Item 18	July 09, 2021	(1751865)
Item 5	June 09, 2020	(1666774)	Item 19	August 19, 2021	(1757328)
Item 6	July 17, 2020	(1673727)	Item 20	September 17, 2021	(1766419)
Item 7	August 14, 2020	(1680505)	Item 21	October 19, 2021	(1776994)
Item 8	September 09, 2020	(1687072)	Item 23	November 16, 2021	(1783785)
Item 9	October 15, 2020	(1693416)	Item 24	December 15, 2021	(1790814)
Item 10	November 13, 2020	(1712943)	Item 25	January 11, 2022	(1798605)
Item 11	December 16, 2020	(1712944)	Item 26	February 15, 2022	(1806479)
Item 12	January 14, 2021	(1712945)	Item 27	March 17, 2022	(1813547)
Item 13	February 17, 2021	(1726002)	Item 28	April 19, 2022	(1820116)
Item 14	March 16, 2021	(1726003)	Item 29	May 12, 2022	(1828956)

E. Written notices of violations (NOV) (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

A notice of violation represents a written allegation of a violation of a specific regulatory requirement from the commission to a regulated entity. A notice of violation is not a final enforcement action, nor proof that a violation has actually occurred.

1	Date: 02/29/2024 (1983866)		
	Self Report? YES	Classification: Moderate	
	Citation: 2D TWC Chapter 26, SubChapter A 26.121(a) 30 TAC Chapter 305, SubChapter F 305.125(1)		
	Description: Failure to meet the limit for one or more permit parameter		
2	Date: 03/31/2024 (1990395)		
	Self Report? YES	Classification: Moderate	
	Citation: 2D TWC Chapter 26, SubChapter A 26.121(a) 30 TAC Chapter 305, SubChapter F 305.125(1)		
	Description: Failure to meet the limit for one or more permit parameter		
3	Date: 04/30/2024 (1996852)		
	Self Report? YES	Classification: Moderate	
	Citation: 2D TWC Chapter 26, SubChapter A 26.121(a) 30 TAC Chapter 305, SubChapter F 305.125(1)		
	Description: Failure to meet the limit for one or more permit parameter		
4	Date: 05/31/2024 (2003804)		
	Self Report? YES	Classification: Moderate	
	Citation: 2D TWC Chapter 26, SubChapter A 26.121(a) 30 TAC Chapter 305, SubChapter F 305.125(1)		
	Description: Failure to meet the limit for one or more permit parameter		
5	Date: 06/30/2024 (2011362)		
	Self Report? YES	Classification: Moderate	
	Citation: 2D TWC Chapter 26, SubChapter A 26.121(a) 30 TAC Chapter 305, SubChapter F 305.125(1)		
	Description: Failure to meet the limit for one or more permit parameter		
6	Date: 07/31/2024 (2016959)		
	Self Report? YES	Classification: Moderate	
	Citation: 2D TWC Chapter 26, SubChapter A 26.121(a) 30 TAC Chapter 305, SubChapter F 305.125(1)		
	Description: Failure to meet the limit for one or more permit parameter		
7	Date: 08/31/2024 (2023980)		
	Self Report? YES	Classification: Moderate	
	Citation: 2D TWC Chapter 26, SubChapter A 26.121(a) 30 TAC Chapter 305, SubChapter F 305.125(1)		
	Description: Failure to meet the limit for one or more permit parameter		
8	Date: 09/30/2024 (2030102)		
	Self Report? YES	Classification: Moderate	
	Citation: 2D TWC Chapter 26, SubChapter A 26.121(a) 30 TAC Chapter 305, SubChapter F 305.125(1)		
	Description: Failure to meet the limit for one or more permit parameter		
9	Date: 10/31/2024 (2036421)		
	Self Report? YES	Classification: Moderate	
	Citation: 2D TWC Chapter 26, SubChapter A 26.121(a) 30 TAC Chapter 305, SubChapter F 305.125(1)		
	Description: Failure to meet the limit for one or more permit parameter		

F. Environmental audits:

N/A

G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs):

N/A

H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates:

N/A

I. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program:

N/A

J. Early compliance:

N/A

Sites Outside of Texas:

N/A

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



IN THE MATTER OF AN
ENFORCEMENT ACTION
CONCERNING
CITY OF COMANCHE
RN101917680

§ BEFORE THE
§
§ TEXAS COMMISSION ON
§
§ ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

AGREED ORDER DOCKET NO. 2023-0236-MWD-E

I. JURISDICTION AND STIPULATIONS

On _____, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("the Commission" or "TCEQ") considered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement action regarding the City of Comanche (the "Respondent") under the authority of TEX. WATER CODE chs. 7 and 26. The Executive Director of the TCEQ, through the Enforcement Division, and the Respondent together stipulate that:

1. The Respondent owns and operates a wastewater treatment facility located at 900 East Fleming Avenue in Comanche, Comanche County, Texas (the "Facility"). The Facility is near or adjacent to water in the state as defined in TEX. WATER CODE § 26.001(5).
2. The Executive Director and the Respondent agree that the TCEQ has jurisdiction to enter this Order pursuant to TEX. WATER CODE §§ 7.002, 7.051, and 7.073, and that the Respondent is subject to TCEQ's jurisdiction. The TCEQ has jurisdiction in this matter pursuant to TEX. WATER CODE § 5.013 because it alleges violations of TEX. WATER CODE ch. 26 and the rules of the TCEQ.
3. The occurrence of any violation is in dispute and the entry of this Order shall not constitute an admission by the Respondent of any violation alleged in Section II ("Allegations"), nor of any statute or rule.
4. An administrative penalty in the amount of \$14,500 is assessed by the Commission in settlement of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations"). The Respondent paid \$11,600 of the penalty and \$2,900 is deferred contingent upon the Respondent's timely and satisfactory compliance with all the terms of this Order. The deferred amount shall be waived only upon full compliance with all the terms and conditions contained in this Order. If the Respondent fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with any of the terms or requirements contained in this Order, the Executive Director may demand payment of all or part of the deferred penalty amount.
5. The Executive Director and the Respondent agree on a settlement of the matters alleged in this enforcement action, subject to final approval in accordance with 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 70.10(a). Any notice and procedures, which might otherwise be authorized or required in this action, are waived in the interest of a more timely resolution of the matter.

6. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that the Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Order.
7. This Order represents the complete and fully integrated agreement of the parties. The provisions of this Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.
8. This Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Order, whichever is later.

II. ALLEGATIONS

During a record review for the Facility conducted on October 28, 2022, an investigator documented that the Respondent failed to comply with permitted effluent limitations, in violation of 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 305.125(1), TEX. WATER CODE § 26.121(a)(1), and Texas Pollutant Discharge Elimination System ("TPDES") Permit No. WQ0014445001, Effluent Limitations and Monitoring Requirements No. 1, as shown in the effluent violation table below:

Effluent Violation Table						
	Carbonaceous Biochemical Oxygen Demand (5-day) Daily Avg. Conc.	<i>Escherichia coli</i> Daily Avg. Conc.	<i>Escherichia coli</i> Daily Max Conc	Ammonia Nitrogen Daily Avg Conc.	Ammonia Nitrogen Daily Max. Conc.	Ammonia Nitrogen Daily Avg. Loading
Monitoring Period	Limit = 10 mg/L	Limit = 126 CFU/ 100 ml	Limit = 399 CFU/ 100 ml	Limit = 3 mg/L	Limit = 10 mg/L	Limit = 15 lbs/day
May 2022	c	c	c	3.5	11.9	c
June 2022	c	c	c	7.17	15.9	20
July 2022	12.04	1210	2420	18.89	39.2	18.89

Avg. = average Conc. = concentration mg/L = milligram per liter c = compliant CFU/100 ml = colony forming units per 100 milliliters Max. = maximum lbs/day = pounds per day

III. DENIALS

The Respondent generally denies each allegation in Section II ("Allegations").

IV. ORDERING PROVISIONS

NOW, THEREFORE, THE TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ORDERS that:

1. The Respondent is assessed a penalty as set forth in Section I, Paragraph No. 4. The payment of this penalty and the Respondent's compliance with all of the requirements

set forth in this Order resolve only the allegations in Section II. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective action or penalties for violations which are not raised here. Penalty payments shall be made payable to "TCEQ" and shall be sent with the notation "Re: City of Comanche, Docket No. 2023-0236-MWD-E" to:

Financial Administration Division, Revenue Operations Section
Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 13088
Austin, Texas 78711-3088

2. The Respondent shall within 130 days after the effective date of this Order, submit written certification of compliance with the permitted effluent limitations of TPDES Permit No. WQ0014445001, including specific corrective actions that were implemented at the Facility to achieve compliance and copies of the most current self-reported discharge monitoring reports, demonstrating at least three consecutive months of compliance with all permitted effluent limitations, and include detailed supporting documentation including photographs, receipts, and/or other records to demonstrate compliance. The certification shall be signed by the Respondent and shall include the following certification language:

"I certify under penalty of law that I have personally examined and am familiar with the information submitted and all attached documents, and that based on my inquiry of those individuals immediately responsible for obtaining the information, I believe that the submitted information is true, accurate and complete. I am aware that there are significant penalties for submitting false information, including the possibility of fines and imprisonment for knowing violations."

The certification shall be submitted to:

Enforcement Division, MC 149A
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 13087
Austin, Texas 78711-3087

with a copy to:

Water Section Manager
Abilene Regional Office
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
1977 Industrial Boulevard
Abilene, Texas 79602-7833

3. All relief not expressly granted in this Order is denied.
4. The duties and provisions imposed by this Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Respondent. The Respondent is ordered to give notice of this Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Facility operations referenced in this Order.

5. The Executive Director may grant an extension of any deadline in this Order or in any plan, report, or other document submitted pursuant to this Order, upon a written and substantiated showing of good cause. All requests for extensions by the Respondent shall be made in writing to the Executive Director. Extensions are not effective until the Respondent receives written approval from the Executive Director. The determination of what constitutes good cause rests solely with the Executive Director. Extension requests shall be sent to the Enforcement Division at the address listed above.
6. This Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against the Respondent in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the OAG to: (1) enforce the terms of this Order; or (2) pursue violations of a statute within the Commission's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by the Commission under such a statute.
7. This Order may be executed in separate and multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single instrument. Any page of this Order may be copied, scanned, digitized, converted to electronic portable document format ("pdf"), or otherwise reproduced and may be transmitted by digital or electronic transmission, including but not limited to facsimile transmission and electronic mail. Any signature affixed to this Order shall constitute an original signature for all purposes and may be used, filed, substituted, or issued for any purpose for which an original signature could be used. The term "signature" shall include manual signatures and true and accurate reproductions of manual signatures created, executed, endorsed, adopted, or authorized by the person or persons to whom the signatures are attributable. Signatures may be copied or reproduced digitally, electronically, by photocopying, engraving, imprinting, lithographing, electronic mail, facsimile transmission, stamping, or any other means or process which the Executive Director deems acceptable. In this paragraph exclusively, the terms: electronic transmission, owner, person, writing, and written, shall have the meanings assigned to them under TEX. BUS. ORG. CODE § 1.002.
8. The effective date of this Order is the date it is signed by the Commission. A copy of this fully executed Order shall be provided to each of the parties.

SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

For the Commission

Date



For the Executive Director

6/3/2025


Date

I, the undersigned, have read and understand the attached Order. I am authorized to agree to the attached Order, and I do agree to the terms and conditions specified therein. I further acknowledge that the TCEQ, in accepting payment for the penalty amount, is materially relying on such representation.

I also understand that failure to comply with the Ordering Provisions, if any, in this Order and/or failure to timely pay the penalty amount, may result in:

- A negative impact on compliance history;
- Greater scrutiny of any permit applications submitted;
- Referral of this case to the OAG for contempt, injunctive relief, additional penalties, and/or attorney fees, or to a collection agency;
- Increased penalties in any future enforcement actions;
- Automatic referral to the OAG of any future enforcement actions; and
- TCEQ seeking other relief as authorized by law.

In addition, any falsification of any compliance documents may result in criminal prosecution.



Signature

3-19-25

Date

MARY A BOYD

Name (Printed or typed)
Authorized Representative of
City of Comanche

MAYOR

Title

☐ *If mailing address has changed, please check this box and provide the new address below:*

Instructions: Send the original, signed Order with penalty payment to the Financial Administration Division, Revenue Operations Section at the address in Ordering Provision 1 of this Order.