# Executive Summary - Enforcement Matter - Case No. 63553 City of Andrews RN101190718 Docket No. 2023-0397-PWS-E

# Order Type:

Findings Agreed Order

#### **Findings Order Justification:**

Three repeated enforcement actions (or two orders with nuisance violations) over the prior five year period for the same violation(s).

Media:

**PWS** 

**Small Business:** 

No

### Location(s) Where Violation(s) Occurred:

City of Andrews PWS, 111 Logsdon Street, Andrews, Andrews County

**Type of Operation:** Public water supply

# Other Significant Matters:

Additional Pending Enforcement Actions: No

Past-Due Penalties: No

Other: N/A

Interested Third-Parties: None

**Texas Register Publication Date:** February 14, 2025

Comments Received: No

#### **Penalty Information**

**Total Penalty Assessed:** \$2,625

**Amount Deferred for Naturally Occurring Inorganic Contaminants:** \$2,625

Total Paid to General Revenue: \$0 Total Due to General Revenue: \$0

Payment Plan: N/A

#### **Compliance History Classifications:**

Person/CN - High Site/RN - N/A

**Major Source**: Yes

Statutory Limit Adjustment: N/A

**Applicable Penalty Policy:** January 2021

#### **Investigation Information**

Complaint Date(s): N/A Complaint Information: N/A

Date(s) of Investigation: January 9, 2023 through January 20, 2023

Date(s) of NOE(s): January 20, 2023

# Executive Summary - Enforcement Matter - Case No. 63553 City of Andrews RN101190718 Docket No. 2023-0397-PWS-E

### Violation Information

Failed to comply with the maximum contaminant level of 0.010 milligrams per liter for arsenic based on a running annual average [30 Tex. Admin. Code § 290.106(f)(3)(C) and Tex. Health & Safety Code § 341.0315(c)].

### Corrective Actions/Technical Requirements

# **Corrective Action(s) Completed:**

By September 13, 2024, the Respondent returned to compliance with the maximum contaminant level for arsenic at the Facility.

# **Technical Requirements:**

N/A

## **Contact Information**

TCEQ Attorney: N/A

TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Ilia Perez-Ramirez, Enforcement Division,

Enforcement Team 5, MC R-12, (713) 767-3743; Michael Parrish, Enforcement Division,

MC 219, (512) 239-2548

**Respondent:** The Honorable Jason Harper, Mayor, City of Andrews, 111 Logsdon

Street, Andrews, Texas 79714 **Respondent's Attorney:** N/A



# Penalty Calculation Worksheet (PCW)

Policy Revision 5 (January 28, 2021)

PCW Revision February 11, 2021

 DATES
 Assigned
 23-Jan-2023

 PCW
 7-Mar-2023

PCW 7-Mar-2023 Screening 27-Jan-2023 EPA Due 31-Mar-2023

RESPONDENT/FACILI	TY INFORMATION		
Respondent	City of Andrews		
Reg. Ent. Ref. No.	RN101190718		
Facility/Site Region	7-Midland	Major/Minor Source Major	

CASE INFORMATION						
Enf./Case ID No. 63553				No.	of Violations	1
Docket No. 2023-0	2023-0397-PWS-E				Order Type	Findings
Media Program(s) Public Water Supply			Governmen	nt/Non-Profit	Yes	
Multi-Media			Enf	. Coordinator	Ilia Perez-Ramirez	
				<b>-</b>	EC's Team	Enforcement Team 5
Admin. Penalty \$ Limit N	1inimum	\$50	Maximum	\$5,000		

	•		1 - 7				
		Penalty Calcula	tion Section				
TOTA	L BASE PENA	.TY (Sum of violation base penal		Subtotal 1	\$2,500		
ADIII	CTMENTS ( )	\ TO CURTOTAL 1	•	·			
ADJU	SIMENIS (+ Subtotals 2-7 are of	<ul> <li>TO SUBTOTAL 1</li> <li>ained by multiplying the Total Base Penalty (Subtotal 1</li> </ul>	) by the indicated percentag	e.			
	Compliance Hi			Subtotals 2, 3, & 7	\$375		
		Enhancement for one agreed order without a denial of liability.					
	Notes	Reduction for High Performer		,			
	Culpability	0.0%	Enhancement	Subtotal 4	\$0		
	Notes	The Respondent does not meet the	culpability criteria.				
		·	, ,				
	Good Faith Eff	rt to Comply Total Adjustments		Subtotal 5	-\$250		
	Good Faith En	to comply rotal Adjustments		Subtotal 5	<del>\$250</del>		
	Economic Ben	iit 0.00%	Enhancement*	Subtotal 6	\$0		
		Total EB Amounts \$15,457 *Capped	d at the Total EB \$ Amount	Subtotal o	<b>40</b>		
	Estimated	Cost of Compliance \$100,000					
SUM (	OF SUBTOTA	S 1-7		Final Subtotal	\$2,625		
OTHE	R FACTORS A	S JUSTICE MAY REQUIRE Subtotal by the indicated percentage.	0.0%	Adjustment	\$0		
Reduces	or enhances the rina	dubtotal by the indicated percentage.					
	Notes						
			Ein	al Bonalty Amount	¢2.625		
			riii	al Penalty Amount	\$2,625		
STAT	UTORY LIMIT	ADJUSTMENT	Fina	Assessed Penalty	\$2,625		
<b>DEFE</b> I		alty by the indicated percentage.	<b>100.0%</b> Reduc	tion <b>Adjustment</b>	-\$2,625		
Reduces	110 1 1101 7 13303300 1 0	The Executive Director recommends a cond	itional deferral for nati	rally			
	Notes	occurring constitue		alally			
PAYA	BLE PENALT				\$0		
					T-		

Policy Revision 5 (January 28, 2021) PCW Revision February 11, 2021

Screening Date 27-Jan-2023 **Respondent** City of Andrews

**Case ID No.** 63553

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101190718

Media Public Water Supply

Enf. Coordinator Ilia Perez-Ramirez

Compliance History Worksheet							
>> Co	Component	ory <i>Sit</i> e Enhancement (Subtotal 2)  Number of	Number	Adjust.			
	NOVs	Written notices of violation ("NOVs") with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (number of NOVs meeting criteria)	0	0%			
		Other written NOVs	0	0%			
		Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (number of orders meeting criteria)	0	0%			
	Orders	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	1	25%			
	Judgments and Consent	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (number of judgments or consent decrees meeting criteria)	0	0%			
	Decrees	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%			
	Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (number of counts)	0	0%			
	Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (number of events)	0	0%			
	Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which notices were submitted)	0	0%			
	Addits	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 ( <i>number of audits for which violations were disclosed</i> )	0	0%			
		Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%			
	Other	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%			
		Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%			
		Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%			
		Adjustment Per	centage (Sub	total 2)	25%		
>> Re	peat Violator	(Subtotal 3)					
N/A Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 3) 0%							
>> Co	mpliance Hist	ory Person Classification (Subtotal 7)					
High Performer  Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 7) -10%							
>> Compliance History Summary							
Compliance History Notes  Enhancement for one agreed order without a denial of liability. Reduction for High Performer classification.							
Total Compliance History Adjustment Percentage (Subtotals 2, 3, & 7) 15%							
>> Final Compliance History Adjustment							
Final Adjustment Percentage *capped at 100% 15%							

Economic Benefit Worksheet							
Respondent	City of Andrev	vs					
Case ID No.	63553						
Reg. Ent. Reference No.	RN101190718	}					
	Public Water S						Years of
Violation No.		,				Percent Interest	Depreciation
						5.0	15
	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Costs Saved	EB Amount
Item Description							
20011 2 00011 7 11011							
Delayed Costs							
Équipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)	\$100,000	30-Jun-2022	13-Sep-2024	2.21	\$736	\$14,721	\$15,457
Engineering/Construction				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0 \$0	n/a n/a	\$0 \$0
Notes for DELAYED costs	The delayed cost includes the estimated amount to investigate, identify, and implement the necessary corrective actions to return compliance with the MCL for arsenic, calculated from the last day of the first quarter of noncompliance to the date of compliance.						
Avoided Costs	ANNU	ALIZE avoided c	osts before en			one-time avoided	l costs)
Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Supplies/Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Financial Assurance				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs				0.00	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0	\$0
Other (as needed)  Notes for AVOIDED costs				0.00	1 \$0	<u>\$</u> ∪	\$0
Approx. Cost of Compliance		\$100,000			TOTAL		\$15,457

The TCEQ is committed to accessibility.

To request a more accessible version of this report, please contact the TCEQ Help Desk at (512) 239-4357.



# Compliance History Report

Compliance History Report for CN600636955, RN101190718, Rating Year 2024 which includes Compliance History (CH) components from September 1, 2019, through August 31, 2024.

Customer, Respondent, CN600636955, City of Andrews Classification: HIGH Rating: 0.00

or Owner/Operator:

Regulated Entity: RN101190718, CITY OF ANDREWS Classification: NOT APPLICABLE Rating: N/A

Complexity Points: N/A Repeat Violator: N/A

CH Group: 14 - Other

**Location:** 111 LOGSDON STREET IN ANDREWS, ANDREWS COUNTY, TEXAS

TCEQ Region: REGION 07 - MIDLAND

ID Number(s):

PUBLIC WATER SYSTEM/SUPPLY REGISTRATION

0020001

Compliance History Period: September 01, 2019 to August 31, 2024 Rating Year: 2024 Rating Date: 09/01/2024

**Date Compliance History Report Prepared:** December 16, 2024

Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History: Enforcement

Component Period Selected: December 16, 2019 to December 16, 2024

TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding This Compliance History.

Name: Ilia Perez-Ramirez Phone: (512) 239-2556

#### Site and Owner/Operator History:

1) Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five year compliance period?

2) Has there been a (known) change in ownership/operator of the site during the compliance period? NO

#### Components (Multimedia) for the Site Are Listed in Sections A - J

#### A. Final Orders, court judgments, and consent decrees:

1 Effective Date: 03/06/2020 ADMINORDER 2019-0304-PWS-E (Findings Order-Agreed Order Without

Denial)

Classification: Moderate

Citation: 30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.106(f)(3)(C)

5A THSC Chapter 341, SubChapter A 341.0315(c)

 ${\hbox{Description:}} \quad {\hbox{ARS MCL 1Q2019 - During the 1st quarter of 2019 the system violated the maximum contaminant level} \\$ 

for Arsenic with a RAA of 0.020 mg/L.

Classification: Moderate

Citation: 30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.106(f)(3)(C)

5A THSC Chapter 341, SubChapter A 341.0315(c)

Description: FLU MCL 1Q2019 - During the 1st quarter of 2019 the system violated the maximum contaminant level

for fluoride with a RAA of 4.2 mg/L.

Classification: Moderate

Citation: 30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.106(f)(3)(C)

5A THSC Chapter 341, SubChapter A 341.0315(c)

Description: ARS MCL 4Q2018 - During the 4th quarter of 2018 the system violated the maximum contaminant level

for Arsenic with a RAA of 0.016 mg/L.

Classification: Moderate

Citation: 30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.106(f)(3)(C)

5A THSC Chapter 341, SubChapter A 341.0315(c)

Description: ARS MCL 3Q2018 - During the 3rd quarter of 2018 the system violated the maximum contaminant

level for Arsenic with a RAA of 0.011 mg/L.

#### **B.** Criminal convictions:

N/A

#### C. Chronic excessive emissions events:

N/A

#### D. The approval dates of investigations (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

Item 1	August 10, 2020	(1663875)
Item 2	August 28, 2020	(1666213)
Item 3	May 31, 2022	(1818513)
Item 4	February 28, 2023	(1880616)
Item 5	June 20, 2023	(1904685)
Item 6	February 22, 2024	(1945330)

#### E. Written notices of violations (NOV) (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

A notice of violation represents a written allegation of a violation of a specific regulatory requirement from the commission to a regulated entity. A notice of violation is not a final enforcement action, nor proof that a violation has actually occurred.

14//

#### F. Environmental audits:

N/A

#### G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs):

N/A

#### H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates:

N/A

#### I. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program:

N/A

#### J. Early compliance:

N/A

#### Sites Outside of Texas:

N/A

#### **Component Appendices**

# Appendix A

#### All NOVs Issued During Component Period 12/16/2019 and 12/16/2024

1 Date: 07/20/2022 (1868890)

Self Report? NO Classification: Moderate

Citation:

30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.106(f)(3)(C)

Description: ARS MCL 2Q2022 - During the 2nd quarter of 2022 the system violated the

maximum contaminant level for arsenic with a RAA of 0.011 mg/L. ETT Point

Value = 5

2 Date: 10/20/2022 (1868890)

Self Report? NO Classification: Moderate

Citation:

30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.106(f)(3)(C)

Description: ARS MCL 3Q2022 - During the 3rd quarter of 2022 the system violated the

maximum contaminant level for arsenic with a RAA of 0.012 mg/L. ETT Point

Value = 5

3 Date: 12/22/2022 (1868890)

Self Report? NO Classification: Moderate

Citation:

30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.106(f)(3)(C)

Description: ARS MCL 4Q2022 - During the 4th quarter of 2022 the system violated the

maximum contaminant level for arsenic with a RAA of 0.013 mg/L. ETT Point

Value = 5

#### Appendix B

#### All Investigations Conducted During Component Period December 16, 2019 and December 16, 2024

Item 1*	August 10, 2020**	(1663875)
Item 2*	August 28, 2020**	(1666213)
Item 3*	May 31, 2022**	(1818513)
Item 4	January 18, 2023**	(1868890)
Item 5	January 20, 2023**	(1872847)
Item 6*	February 28, 2023**	(1880616)
Item 7*	June 20, 2023**	(1904685)
Item 8*	February 22, 2024**	(1945330)

<sup>\*</sup> No violations documented during this investigation

<sup>\*</sup> NOVs applicable for the Compliance History rating period 9/1/2019 to 8/31/2024

<sup>\*\*</sup>Investigation applicable for the Compliance History Rating period between 09/01/2019 and 08/31/2024.

# TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



IN THE MATTER OF AN § BEFORE THE
ENFORCEMENT ACTION §
CONCERNING § TEXAS COMMISSION ON
CITY OF ANDREWS §
RN101190718 § ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

#### AGREED ORDER DOCKET NO. 2023-0397-PWS-E

On	_, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("the
Commission" or "TCEQ") consi	dered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement
action regarding the City of Ar	ndrews (the "Respondent") under the authority of Tex. HEALTH &
SAFETY CODE ch. 341. The Exec	utive Director of the TCEQ, through the Enforcement Division,
and the Respondent, presented	d this Order to the Commission.

The Respondent understands that it has certain procedural rights at certain points in the enforcement process, including the right to formal notice of violations, notice of an evidentiary hearing, the right to an evidentiary hearing, and a right to appeal. By entering into this Order, the Respondent agrees to waive all notice and procedural rights.

It is further understood and agreed that this Order represents the complete and fully-integrated agreement of the parties. The provisions of this Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable. The duties and responsibilities imposed by this Order are binding upon the Respondent.

The Commission makes the following Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law:

#### I. FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. The Respondent owns and operates a public water supply located at 111 Logsdon Street in Andrews, Andrews County, Texas (the "Facility"). The Facility provides water for human consumption, has approximately 5,333 service connections, and serves at least 25 people per day for at least 60 days per year. As such, the Facility is a public water system as defined in 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 290.38(73).
- 2. During a record review for the Facility conducted on January 9, 2023 through January 20, 2023, an investigator documented that the running annual average concentrations of arsenic were 0.011 milligrams per liter ("mg/L") for the second quarter of 2022, 0.012 mg/L for the third quarter 2022, and 0.013 mg/L for the fourth quarter of 2022.
- 3. The Executive Director recognizes that by September 13, 2024, the Respondent returned to compliance with the maximum contaminant level ("MCL") for arsenic at the Facility.

#### II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 1, the Respondent is subject to the jurisdiction of the TCEQ pursuant to Tex. Health & Safety Code ch. 341 and the rules of the TCEQ.
- 2. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 2, the Respondent failed to comply with the MCL of 0.010 mg/L for arsenic based on a running annual average, in violation of 30 Tex. ADMIN. CODE§ 290.106(f)(3)(C) and Tex. Health & Safety Code § 341.0315(c).
- 3. Pursuant to Tex. Health & Safety Code § 341.049(a), the TCEQ has the authority to assess an administrative penalty against the Respondent for violations of state statutes within the TCEQ's jurisdiction, for violations of rules adopted under such statutes, or for violations of orders or permits issued under such statutes.
- 4. An administrative penalty in the amount of \$2,625 is justified by the facts recited in this Order, and considered in light of the factors set forth in Tex. Health & Safety Code § 341.049(b). The amount of \$2,625 is deferred contingent upon the Respondent's timely and satisfactory compliance with all the terms of this Order and shall be waived only upon full compliance with all the terms and conditions contained in this Order. If the Respondent fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with any requirement contained in this Order, the Executive Director may demand payment of all or part of the conditionally deferred penalty.

#### III. ORDERING PROVISIONS

NOW, THEREFORE, THE TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ORDERS that:

1. The Respondent is assessed a penalty as set forth in Conclusion of Law No. 4 for violations of state statutes and rules of the TCEQ. The payment of this penalty and the Respondent's compliance with all the requirements set forth in this Order resolve only the matters set forth by this Order in this action. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective actions or penalties for violations that are not raised here. Penalty payments shall be made payable to "TCEQ" and shall be sent with the notation "Re: City of Andrews, Docket No. 2023-0397-PWS-E" to:

Financial Administration Division, Revenue Operations Section Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214 Texas Commission on Environmental Quality P.O. Box 13088 Austin, Texas 78711-3088

- 2. All relief not expressly granted in this Order is denied.
- 3. The duties and provisions imposed by this Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Respondent. The Respondent is ordered to give notice of this Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Facility operations referenced in this Order.
- 4. The Executive Director may grant an extension of any deadline in this Order or in any plan, report, or other document submitted pursuant to this Order, upon a written and

- substantiated showing of good cause. All requests for extensions by the Respondent shall be made in writing to the Executive Director. Extensions are not effective until the Respondent receives written approval from the Executive Director. The determination of what constitutes good cause rests solely with the Executive Director.
- 5. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that the Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms in this Order.
- 6. This Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Order, whichever is later.
- 7. This Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against the Respondent in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the OAG to: (1) enforce the terms of this Order; or (2) pursue violations of a statute within the Commission's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by the Commission under such a statute.
- 8. This Order may be executed in separate and multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single instrument. Any page of this Order may be copied, scanned, digitized, converted to electronic portable document format ("pdf"), or otherwise reproduced and may be transmitted by digital or electronic transmission, including but not limited to facsimile transmission and electronic mail. Any signature affixed to this Order shall constitute an original signature for all purposes and may be used, filed, substituted, or issued for any purpose for which an original signature could be used. The term "signature" shall include manual signatures and true and accurate reproductions of manual signatures created, executed, endorsed, adopted, or authorized by the person or persons to whom the signatures are attributable. Signatures may be copied or reproduced digitally, electronically, by photocopying, engraving, imprinting, lithographing, electronic mail, facsimile transmission, stamping, or any other means or process which the Executive Director deems acceptable. In this paragraph exclusively, the terms: electronic transmission, owner, person, writing, and written, shall have the meanings assigned to them under Tex. Bus. Org. Code § 1.002.
- 9. The effective date of this Order is the date it is signed by the Commission. A copy of this fully executed Order shall be provided to each of the parties.

City of Andrews DOCKET NO. 2023-0397-PWS-E Page 4

City of Andrews

#### SIGNATURE PAGE

### TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

For the Commission	Date
	3/20/2025
For the Executive Director	Date
the attached Order, and I do agree to the term	l the attached Order. I am authorized to agree to ns and conditions specified therein. I further ment for the penalty amount, is materially relying
I also understand that failure to comply with and/or failure to timely pay the penalty amou	the Ordering Provisions, if any, in this Order ant, may result in:
<ul> <li>A negative impact on compliance histor</li> <li>Greater scrutiny of any permit applicati</li> <li>Referral of this case to the OAG for con and/or attorney fees, or to a collection</li> <li>Increased penalties in any future enforce</li> <li>Automatic referral to the OAG of any future</li> <li>TCEQ seeking other relief as authorized</li> </ul>	ions submitted; itempt, injunctive relief, additional penalties, agency; cement actions; iture enforcement actions; and
In addition, any falsifigation of any complian	ce documents may result in criminal prosecution.
Signature Tason Harper	1/13/25 Date Mayor
Name (Printed or typed) Authorized Representative of	Title

 $\Box$  If mailing address has changed, please check this box and provide the new address below: