Executive Summary - Enforcement Matter - Case No. 64368 City of Paducah RN101385029 Docket No. 2023-0971-PWS-E

Order Type: Findings Agreed Order Findings Order Justification: Three repeated enforcement actions (or two orders with nuisance violations) over the prior five year period for the same violation(s). Media: **PWS Small Business:** No Location(s) Where Violation(s) Occurred: City of Paducah PWS, 1015 Backus Street, Paducah, Cottle County **Type of Operation:** Public water supply **Other Significant Matters:** Additional Pending Enforcement Actions: No Past-Due Penalties: No Other: N/A Interested Third-Parties: None **Texas Register Publication Date:** March 15, 2024 Comments Received: No

Penalty Information

Total Penalty Assessed: \$243 Total Paid to General Revenue: \$243 Total Due to General Revenue: \$0 Payment Plan: N/A Compliance History Classifications: Person/CN - High Site/RN - N/A Major Source: No Statutory Limit Adjustment: N/A Applicable Penalty Policy: January 2021

Investigation Information

Complaint Date(s): May 30, 2023 Complaint Information: Alleged the water system in Cottle County is not maintaining a chlorine residual in the distribution system. Date(s) of Investigation: May 31, 2023 Date(s) of NOE(s): July 17, 2023

Executive Summary - Enforcement Matter - Case No. 64368 City of Paducah RN101385029 Docket No. 2023-0971-PWS-E

Violation Information

Failed to maintain a disinfectant residual of at least 0.2 milligrams per liter of free chlorine throughout the distribution system [30 Tex. ADMIN. CODE §§ 290.46(d)(2)(A) and 290.110(b)(4) and Tex. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 341.0315(c)].

Corrective Actions/Technical Requirements

Corrective Action(s) Completed:

On June 1, 2023, the Respondent maintained a disinfectant residual of 0.2 milligrams per liter of free chlorine throughout the distribution system.

Technical Requirements:

N/A

Contact Information

TCEQ Attorney: N/A TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Mason DeMasi, Enforcement Division, Enforcement Team 5, MC R-13, (512) 239-2093; Michael Parrish, Enforcement Division, MC 219, (512) 239-2548 Respondent: The Honorable Chris Pray, Mayor, City of Paducah, P.O. Box 759, Paducah, Texas 79248-0759 Respondent's Attorney: N/A

S COMMISER S COMMISER S COMMISER	Policy Revi	Pe ision 5 (January 28, 2	,	alculatio	n Worksh	neet (PC		vision February	y 11, 2021
DATES	Assigned		Concerting	26 1.4 2022			1		
	PCW	26-Jul-2023		26-Jul-2023	EPA Due				
RESPO		TY INFORMATI City of Paducah	ON						1
Re	g. Ent. Ref. No.								
Facili	ty/Site Region	3-Abilene			Major/M	inor Source	Minor		1
CASE I	NFORMATION								
En	f./Case ID No.		_		No. c	of Violations]
Mer		2023-0971-PWS Public Water Sup			Government	Order Type /Non-Profit			-
	Multi-Media					•	Mason DeMasi		
Ad	min Bonalty ¢ l	limit Minimum	\$50	Maximum [¢E 000	EC's Team	Enforcement T	eam 5	J
Adi	iiiii. Penaity și	Limit Minimum	\$JU	Maximum	\$5,000				
			Penalty	y Calcula	tion Section	on			
ΤΟΤΑ	L BASE PENA	LTY (Sum of	violation b	, base penalt	ties)		Subtotal 1		\$250
	STMENTS (+	/-) TO SUBTO	ΤΔΙ 1						
ADJU.	Subtotals 2-7 are of	ptained by multiplying) by the indicated p				
	Compliance Hi			22.0%	Adjustment		tals 2, 3, & 7		\$55
	Notes			•	similar violation order containin	•			
				-	mer classificatio	•			
	Culpability	No		0.0%	Enhancement		Subtotal 4		\$0
						_			
	Notes	The Re	spondent does	s not meet the	culpability crite	ria.			
							1		
	Good Faith Eff	ort to Comply T	otal Adjustm	ents			Subtotal 5		-\$62
	Economic Bene	efit Total EB Amounts	\$0		Enhancement* d at the Total EB \$ A	Amount	Subtotal 6		\$0
	Estimated	l Cost of Compliance	\$100						
SUM (LS 1-7				F	inal Subtotal		\$243
		-				-			7
		AS JUSTICE M Subtotal by the indic		RE	0.0%		Adjustment		\$0
Reduces	or enhances the rina		ated percentage.						
	Notes								
						Final Per	alty Amount		\$243
									<i>~</i> =
STAT	JTORY LIMIT	r adjustmen	IT			Final Asse	ssed Penalty		\$243
DEFE	RRAI				0.0%	Reduction	Adjustment		\$0
		nalty by the indicated	l percentage.		0.0 /0			L	- - •
	Notes	No	leferral is reco	mmandad for	Findings Orders				
	NULES				indings orders	•			
_		-						r	
ΡΑΥΑ	BLE PENALT	Y							\$243

Compliance His	Compliance History Worksheet ory Site Enhancement (Subtotal 2)		
Component	Number of	Number	Adjust.
NOVs	Written notices of violation ("NOVs") with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (<i>number of NOVs meeting criteria</i>)	2	10%
	Other written NOVs	1	2%
	Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (<i>number of orders meeting criteria</i>)	1	20%
Orders	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%
Judgments			0%
and Consent Decrees	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%
Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (<i>number of counts</i>)	0	0%
Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (<i>number of events</i>)	0	0%
Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which notices were submitted)		0%
Audits	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (<i>number of audits for which violations were disclosed</i>)	0	0%
	Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%
Other	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%
other	Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%
	Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%
	Adjustment Pere	centage (Su	btotal 2) [
Repeat Violator	(Subtotal 3)		
N/	A Adjustment Pere	centage (Su	btotal 3)
Compliance His	ory Person Classification (Subtotal 7)		
High Per	former Adjustment Pere	centage (Su	btotal 7) [
Compliance His	ory Summary		
Compliance History Notes	Enhancement for two NOVs with the same/similar violations, one NOV with a dissimand one agreed order containing denial of liability. Reduction for High Performer c		
	Total Compliance History Adjustment Percentage (S	Subtotals 2.	_ , <u>3, & 7)</u> [
Final Compliance	History Adjustment		-, /
	Final Adjustment Percenta	an *connod	at 100%

Docket No. 2023-0971-PWS-E

Screening Date 26-Jul-2023

Case ID No. 64368

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101385029

Respondent City of Paducah

Media Public Water Supply

Policy Revision 5 (January 28, 2021) PCW Revision February 11, 2021

PCW

		ening Date			Docl	(et No. 2023-0971-		PCW
		lespondent Case ID No.	City of Paducah					Revision 5 (January 28, 2021) W Revision February 11, 2021
Reg.		erence No.						
			Public Water Supply	/				
		oordinator	Mason DeMasi					
	VIOIE	Rule Cite(s)	I	ada 88.20		and 290.110(b)(4) a	nd Toy, Hoalth &	1
		Rule Cite(S)	50 TEX. Admin. Co		Safety Code §		ind rex. nearth &	
								1
						al of at least 0.2 milli istribution system. S		
	Violatio	n Description	31, 2023, a free c	hlorine re	esidual concen	tration of 0.07 mg/L	was measured at	
			the de	ad-end fl	ush valve on F	arm-to-Market Road	1037.	
								<u>1</u>
							Base Penalty	\$5,000
>> Env	vironme	ntal, Prope	rty and Human	Health _{Harm}	Matrix			
		Release		oderate	Minor			
OR		Actual				Dercent	F 00/	
		Potential		X		Percent	5.0%	
>>Prog	gramma	tic Matrix Falsification	Major Ma	oderate	Minor			
		Faisincation	Major Mo	Juerale	MINO	Percent	0.0%	
								ח
	Matrix					oose persons served l		
	Notes	significant ar	nount of contaminar	nts which	would not exc	eed levels protective	of human health.	
						Adjustment	\$4,750	- 1
							φ (γ) δC	
								\$250
Violatio	on Even	ts						
		Number of V	iolation Events	1		1 Number of	violation days	
			daily]			
			weekly					
			monthly					+250
			quarterly semiannual	X		Violat	ion Base Penalty	\$250
			annual					
			single event					
		One quarter	v event is recomme	nded, cal	culated from t	he May 31, 2023 inve	estigation date to	1
			-		2023 compliar			
Cood F	aith Eff	orte te Care	ply	25.00/			Deduct	
GUUU F		orts to Com		25.0% NOE/NOV		RP/Settlement Offer	Reduction	\$62
			Extraordinary					
			Ordinary N/A	X				
					<u>п</u>			
			Notes The	Respond	lent achieved	compliance by June 1	<mark>, 2023.</mark>	
						v	iolation Subtota	\$188
Econon	nic Bene	efit (EB) for	this violation			Statutor	y Limit Test	
		Estimate	ed EB Amount		\$0	Violation Fi	nal Penalty Tota	\$243
			т	his viola	ation Final As	sessed Penalty (ad	justed for limits	\$243
			-					T =

	E	conomic	Benefit	Wor	ksheet		
Respondent Case ID No. Reg. Ent. Reference No.	64368						
-	Public Water S					Percent Interest	Years of Depreciation
						5.0	15
	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Costs Saved	EB Amount
Item Description							
Delayed Costs		1		7			
Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.00	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0	\$0 #0
Other (as needed)				0.00	<u>\$0</u> \$0	\$0 \$0	<u>\$0</u> \$0
Engineering/Construction Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0 \$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Other (as needed)	\$100	31-May-2023	1-Jun-2023	0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Notes for DELAYED costs	noncomplia residual of a	nce, make any ne t least 0.2 mg/L f storage tank, cal	cessary repairs ree chlorine thr culated from the	or adjus oughout e investi	tments to the Fac the distribution sy gation date to the	t to determine the ility, and maintain a ystem and in each f date of compliance	disinfectant inished water
Avoided Costs	ANNU	ALIZE avoided c	osts before er	_		one-time avoided	-
Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.00	\$0 \$0	<u>\$0</u> \$0	<u>\$0</u> \$0
Supplies/Equipment Financial Assurance				0.00	<u>\$0</u> \$0	\$0 \$0	<u>\$0</u> \$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs				0.00	\$0	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	<u>\$0</u> \$0	\$0
Notes for AVOIDED costs					μ φυ	¥9	¥ 3
Approx. Cost of Compliance		\$100			TOTAL		\$0

The TCEQ is committed to accessibility. To request a more accessible version of this report, please contact the TCEQ Help Desk at (512) 239-4357.



Compliance History Report

Compliance History Report for CN600629836, RN101385029, Rating Year 2023 which includes Compliance History (CH) components from September 1, 2018, through August 31, 2023.

Customer, Respondent, or Owner/Operator:	CN600629836, City of Paducah	Classification: HIGH	Rating: 0.00					
Regulated Entity:	RN101385029, CITY OF PADUCAH	Classification: NOT APPLICA	BLE Rating: N/A					
Complexity Points:	N/A	Repeat Violator: N/A						
CH Group: Location:	14 - Other 1015 BACKUS STREET IN PADUCAH, COT	TLE COUNTY, TEXAS						
TCEQ Region:	REGION 03 - ABILENE							
•	ID Number(s): PUBLIC WATER SYSTEM/SUPPLY REGISTRATION 0510001 Compliance History Period: September 01, 2018 to August 31, 2023 Rating Year: 2023 Rating Date: 09/01/2023							
Date Compliance History	y Report Prepared: January 17, 2024	4						
Agency Decision Requir	ing Compliance History: Enforceme	nt						
Component Period Selec	cted: January 17, 2019 to January 17, 2	2024						
TCEQ Staff Member to C	ontact for Additional Information I	Regarding This Compliance H	istory.					
Name: Mason DeMasi		Phone: (210) 657-842	5					
Site and Owner/Operator History:								
 Has the site been in exister Has there been a (known) 		YES NO						

Components (Multimedia) for the Site Are Listed in Sections A - J

A. Final Orders, court judgments, and consent decrees:

- 1
 Effective Date:
 06/02/2020
 ADMINORDER
 2019-1739-PWS-E
 (1660 Order-Agreed Order With Denial)

 Classification:
 Major
 - Citation: 30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter D 290.46(e)
 - 5A THSC Chapter 341, SubChapter A 341.033(a)

Description: Failure to use a water works operator who holds an applicable, valid license issued by the Executive Director. Specifically, an unlicensed individual had been collecting daily residual samples for compliance purposes.

B. Criminal convictions:

N/A

C. Chronic excessive emissions events:

N/A

D. The approval dates of investigations (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

Item 1	June 24, 2019	(1576176)
Item 2	May 04, 2020	(1645006)

E. Written notices of violations (NOV) (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

A notice of violation represents a written allegation of a violation of a specific regulatory requirement from the commission to a regulated entity. A notice of violation is not a final enforcement action, nor proof that a violation has actually occurred.

1	Date:	06/14/202	23 (1903189)
	Self Repo	ort? NO		

Classification: Moderate

Citation:30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.110(b)(4)Description:Failure to maintain a free-chlorine residual of 0.20 mg/L or greater
throughout the distribution system at all times.

 2
 Date: 09/14/2023 (1925632)

 Self Report?
 NO
 Classification: Moderate

 Citation:
 30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.110(b)(4)

 Description:
 Failure to maintain a free-chlorine residual of 0.20 mg/L or greater

 throughout the distribution system at all times.

3 Date: 01/16/2024 (1950282) Self Report? NO Classification: Moderate Citation: 30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter D 290.46(r) Description: Failure to provide a minimum pressure of 35 pounds per square inch ("psi") throughout the distribution system under normal operating conditions.

F. Environmental audits:

N/A

- G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs): \$N/A\$
- H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates: $$\rm N/A$$
- I. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program: \$N/A\$
- J. Early compliance:

N/A

Sites Outside of Texas:

N/A

Component Appendices

Appendix A All NOVs Issued During Component Period 1/17/2019 and 1/17/2024

1	Date: 06/20/2019 (1575465)							
	Self Report? Citation: Description:		NO		Classification:	Minor		
			30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter D 290.46 Failure to have maximum lead levels in pip agreement.			s in service		
	Self Repor Citation:	t?	NO		Classification:	Minor		
	Descriptio	n:		Chapter 290, SubChapter D 29 o have 16-mesh or finer corros		a on Well #7.		
	Self Repor Citation:		NO		Classification:	Minor		
	Descriptio	n:	Failure t mainten a watert	Chapter 290, SubChapter D 29 o maintain all water treatment ance facilities, distribution syst ight condition and free of exce nd 2 had leaks.	t units, storage and pre tem lines, and related a	appurtenances in		
2	Date:	08/2	7/2021	(1755062)				
	Self Repor Citation:	t?	NO		Classification:	Minor		
				Chapter 290, SubChapter D 29				
	Description:		Failure to flush all dead-end mains at monthly intervals. Specifically, the dead-end mains at 8th Street and Boehner Street, 10th Street and Easly Street, and 10th Street and Birdy Street were not being flushed monthly.					
	Self Repor Citation:	t?	NO		Classification:	Minor		
	Description:		30 TAC (Chapter 290, SubChapter D 29 Chapter 290, SubChapter D 29	90.46(r)			
			Failure to provide a minimum pressure of 35 pounds per square inch ("psi") throughout the distribution system under normal operating conditions and 20 psi during emergencies such as firefighting. Specifically, a pressure reading obtained on January 28, 2022 on Farm-to-Market Road 1037 displayed a reading of 25 psi.					
	Self Repor Citation:	t?	NO		Classification:	Minor		
				Chapter 290, SubChapter D 29				
	Descriptio			o have flush valves on the dea				
	Self Report? Citation: Description:				Classification:	Minor		
			30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter D 290.46(n)(2) Failure to make available an accurate and up-to-date map of the distribution system so that valves and mains can be easily located during emergencies. Specifically, the distribution system map did not include the waterline on Farm-to-Market Road 1037.					
	Self Repor Citation:	t?	NO		Classification:	Moderate		
			30 TAC (Chapter 290, SubChapter F 29	0.110(b)(4)			
	Descriptio	n:	Failure t at all tim	o maintain a 0.2 mg/L free chl ies.	lorine residual in the di	stribution system		
3	Date:	08/0	8/2022	(1825819)				
	Self Repor Citation:	t?	NO		Classification:	Minor		
				Chapter 290, SubChapter F 29 Chapter 290, SubChapter F 29				

Description: Failure to meet the commissions secondary constituent level for sulfate at the

3

		entry point.				
	Self Report? Citation:	NO	Classification:	Moderate		
		30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.11	()()			
	Description:	Failure to maintain a 0.20 mg/L free chlori valve on FM 1037.	ne residual at the o	dead-end flush		
4*	Date: 06	/14/2023 (1903189)				
	Self Report? Citation:	NO	Classification:	Moderate		
	ontation	30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.11	.0(b)(4)			
	Description:	Failure to maintain a free-chlorine residual throughout the distribution system at all the time of the system at all the system at a system at all the system at a system at all the system at a system at all the system at a system at all the system at all the system at a		reater		
5	Date: 09	/14/2023 (1925632)				
	Self Report? Citation:	NO	Classification:	Moderate		
		30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.11				
	Description:	Failure to maintain a free-chlorine residual throughout the distribution system at all the di	5, 5	reater		
6	Date: 01	/16/2024 (1950282)				
	Self Report? Citation:	NO	Classification:	Moderate		
		30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter D 290.46(r)				
	Description:	Failure to provide a minimum pressure of 3 throughout the distribution system under r				

 \ast NOVs applicable for the Compliance History rating period 9/1/2018 to 8/31/2023

Appendix B All Investigations Conducted During Component Period January 17, 2019 and January 17, 2024

Item 1	June 20, 2019**	(1575465)
Item 2*	June 24, 2019**	(1576176)
Item 3	August 12, 2019**	(1582796)
Item 4*	May 04, 2020**	(1645006)

* No violations documented during this investigation

**Investigation applicable for the Compliance History Rating period between 09/01/2018 and 08/31/2023.

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



§

§ §

Ş

IN THE MATTER OF AN ENFORCEMENT ACTION CONCERNING CITY OF PADUCAH RN101385029 BEFORE THE TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

AGREED ORDER DOCKET NO. 2023-0971-PWS-E

On _______, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("the Commission" or "TCEQ") considered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement action regarding the City of Paducah (the "Respondent") under the authority of TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE ch. 341. The Executive Director of the TCEQ, through the Enforcement Division, and the Respondent presented this Order to the Commission.

The Respondent understands that it has certain procedural rights at certain points in the enforcement process, including the right to formal notice of violations, notice of an evidentiary hearing, the right to an evidentiary hearing, and a right to appeal. By entering into this Order, the Respondent agrees to waive all notice and procedural rights.

It is further understood and agreed that this Order represents the complete and fully-integrated agreement of the parties. The provisions of this Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable. The duties and responsibilities imposed by this Order are binding upon the Respondent.

The Commission makes the following Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law:

I. FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. The Respondent owns and operates a public water supply located at 1015 Backus Street in Paducah, Cottle County, Texas (the "Facility"). The Facility provides water for human consumption, has approximately 590 service connections, and serves at least 25 people per day for at least 60 days per year. As such, the Facility is a public water system as defined in 30 Tex. ADMIN. CODE § 290.38(73).
- 2. During an investigation at the Facility conducted on May 31, 2023, an investigator documented that a free chlorine residual concentration of 0.07 milligrams per liter ("mg/L") was measured at the dead-end flush valve on Farm-to-Market Road 1037.
- 3. The Executive Director recognizes that on June 1, 2023, the Respondent maintained a disinfectant residual of 0.2 mg/L of free chlorine throughout the distribution system.

City of Paducah DOCKET NO. 2023-0971-PWS-E Page 2

II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 1, the Respondent is subject to the jurisdiction of the TCEQ pursuant to TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE ch. 341 and the rules of the TCEQ.
- 2. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 2, the Respondent failed to maintain a disinfectant residual of at least 0.2 mg/L of free chlorine throughout the distribution system, in violation of 30 Tex. ADMIN. CODE §§ 290.46(d)(2)(A) and 290.110(b)(4) and Tex. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 341.0315(c).
- 3. Pursuant to TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 341.049(a), the TCEQ has the authority to assess an administrative penalty against the Respondent for violations of state statutes within the TCEQ's jurisdiction, for violations of rules adopted under such statutes, or for violations of orders or permits issued under such statutes.
- 4. An administrative penalty in the amount of \$243 is justified by the facts recited in this Order, and considered in light of the factors set forth in TEX. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 341.049(b). The Respondent paid the \$243 penalty.

III. ORDERING PROVISIONS

NOW, THEREFORE, THE TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ORDERS that:

1. The Respondent is assessed a penalty as set forth in Conclusion of Law No. 4 for violations of state statutes and rules of the TCEQ. The payment of this penalty and the Respondent's compliance with all the requirements set forth in this Order resolve only the matters set forth by this Order in this action. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective actions or penalties for violations that are not raised here. Penalty payments shall be made payable to "TCEQ" and shall be sent with the notation "Re: City of Paducah, Docket No. 2023-0971-PWS-E" to:

Financial Administration Division, Revenue Operations Section Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214 Texas Commission on Environmental Quality P.O. Box 13088 Austin, Texas 78711-3088

- 2. All relief not expressly granted in this Order is denied.
- 3. The duties and provisions imposed by this Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Respondent. The Respondent is ordered to give notice of this Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Facility operations referenced in this Order.
- 4. The Executive Director may grant an extension of any deadline in this Order or in any plan, report, or other document submitted pursuant to this Order, upon a written and substantiated showing of good cause. All requests for extensions by the Respondent shall be made in writing to the Executive Director. Extensions are not effective until the Respondent receives written approval from the Executive Director. The determination of what constitutes good cause rests solely with the Executive Director.

City of Paducah DOCKET NO. 2023-0971-PWS-E Page 3

- 5. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that the Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms in this Order.
- 6. This Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Order, whichever is later.
- 7. This Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against the Respondent in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the OAG to: (1) enforce the terms of this Order; or (2) pursue violations of a statute within the Commission's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by the Commission under such a statute.
- 8. This Order may be executed in separate and multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single instrument. Any page of this Order may be copied, scanned, digitized, converted to electronic portable document format ("pdf"), or otherwise reproduced and may be transmitted by digital or electronic transmission, including but not limited to facsimile transmission and electronic mail. Any signature affixed to this Order shall constitute an original signature for all purposes and may be used, filed, substituted, or issued for any purpose for which an original signature could be used. The term "signature" shall include manual signatures and true and accurate reproductions of manual signatures created, executed, endorsed, adopted, or authorized by the person or persons to whom the signatures are attributable. Signatures may be copied or reproduced digitally, electronically, by photocopying, engraving, imprinting, lithographing, electronic mail, facsimile transmission, stamping, or any other means or process which the Executive Director deems acceptable. In this paragraph exclusively, the terms: electronic transmission, owner, person, writing, and written, shall have the meanings assigned to them under TEX. BUS. ORG. CODE § 1.002.
- 9. The effective date of this Order is the date it is signed by the Commission. A copy of this fully executed Order shall be provided to each of the parties.

City of Paducah DOCKET NO. 2023-0971-PWS-E Page 4

SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

For the Commission For the Executive Director Date

4/2/2024 Date

I, the undersigned, have read and understand the attached Order. I am authorized to agree to the attached Order, and I do agree to the terms and conditions specified therein. I further acknowledge that the TCEQ, in accepting payment for the penalty amount, is materially relying on such representation.

I also understand that failure to comply with the Ordering Provisions, if any, in this Order and/or failure to timely pay the penalty amount, may result in:

- A negative impact on compliance history;
- Greater scrutiny of any permit applications submitted;
- Referral of this case to the OAG for contempt, injunctive relief, additional penalties, and/or attorney fees, or to a collection agency;
- Increased penalties in any future enforcement actions;
- Automatic referral to the OAG of any future enforcement actions; and
- TCEQ seeking other relief as authorized by law.

In addition, any falsification of any compliance documents may result in criminal prosecution.

Signature

3 Pray Name (Printed or typed) Authorized Representative of

City of Paducah

2/5/2024 Date

□ If mailing address has changed, please check this box and provide the new address below: