Executive Summary – Enforcement Matter – Case No. 65815 Bethel-Ash Water Supply Corporation RN101216612 Docket No. 2024-0608-PWS-E

Order Type:

Findings Agreed Order

Findings Order Justification:

Three repeated enforcement actions (or two orders with nuisance violations) over the prior five year period for the same violation(s).

Media:

PWS

Small Business:

Yes

Location(s) Where Violation(s) Occurred:

Bethel-Ash WSC Walton Plant, 6947 Farm-to-Market Road 1861 near Athens, Henderson County

Type of Operation:

Public water supply

Other Significant Matters:

Additional Pending Enforcement Actions: No

Past-Due Penalties: No

Other: N/A

Interested Third-Parties: None

Texas Register Publication Date: December 13, 2024

Comments Received: No

Penalty Information

Total Penalty Assessed: \$2,500

Total Paid to General Revenue: \$2,500 Total Due to General Revenue: \$0

Payment Plan: N/A

Compliance History Classifications:

Person/CN - Unclassified

Site/RN - N/A

Major Source: Yes

Statutory Limit Adjustment: N/A

Applicable Penalty Policy: January 2021

Investigation Information

Complaint Date(s): N/A

Complaint Information: N/A

Date(s) of Investigation: March 25, 2024 through April 5, 2024

Date(s) of NOE(s): April 5, 2024

Executive Summary – Enforcement Matter – Case No. 65815 Bethel-Ash Water Supply Corporation RN101216612 Docket No. 2024-0608-PWS-E

Violation Information

Failed to comply with the maximum contaminant level of 0.080 milligrams per liter for total trihalomethanes based on the locational running annual average [30 Tex. ADMIN. CODE § 290.115(f)(1) and Tex. Health & Safety Code § 341.0315(c)].

Corrective Actions/Technical Requirements

Corrective Action(s) Completed:

By September 6, 2024, the Facility returned to compliance with the maximum contaminant level for total trihalomethanes based on the locational running annual average.

Technical Requirements:

N/A

Contact Information

TCEQ Attorney: N/A

TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Emerson Rinewalt, Enforcement Division,

Enforcement Team 5, MC 219, (512) 239-1131; Michael Parrish, Enforcement Division,

MC 219, (512) 239-2548

Respondent: Mark Hannan, Board President, Bethel-Ash Water Supply Corporation,

P.O. Box 1385, Athens, Texas 75751-1385

Respondent's Attorney: N/A



Penalty Calculation Worksheet (PCW)

Policy Revision 5 (January 28, 2021)

PCW Revision February 11, 2021

 DATES
 Assigned
 8-Apr-2024

 PCW
 18-Apr-2024

PCW 18-Apr-2024 | Screening 8-Apr-2024 | EPA Due 30-Jun-2024

RESPONDENT/FACILITY INFORMATION	
Respondent Bethel-Ash Water Supply Corporation	
Reg. Ent. Ref. No. RN101216612	
Facility/Site Region 5-Tyler	Major/Minor Source Major

CASE INFORMATION							
Enf./Case ID No.	65815			No.	of Violations	1	
	2024-0608-PWS				Order Type	Findings	ĺ
Media Program(s)	Public Water Su	pply		Governmen	t/Non-Profit	Yes	Ī
Multi-Media				Enf.	Coordinator	Emerson Rinewalt	ĺ
				•	EC's Team	Enforcement Team 5	Ī
Admin. Penalty \$ I	imit Minimum	\$50	Maximum	\$5,000			

				Penalty	Calcula	tion Section	on		
TOTA	TOTAL BASE PENALTY (Sum of violation base penalties)						Subtotal 1	\$2,500	
ADJU		btained	d by multiplying	PTAL 1 the Total Base Pena					
	Compliance Hi	story	/		10.0%	Adjustment	Subto	otals 2, 3, & 7	\$250
	Notes Enhancement for two NOVs with the same/similar violations.								
	Culpability	No			0.0%	Enhancement		Subtotal 4	\$0
	Notes	Notes The Respondent does not meet the culpability criteria.							
	Good Faith Eff	ort t	o Comply T	otal Adjustmen	its			Subtotal 5	-\$250
	Economic Ben					Enhancement*		Subtotal 6	\$0
	Estimated		al EB Amounts of Compliance	\$328 \$5,000	*Cappe	d at the Total EB \$ A	Amount		
SUM (OF SUBTOTA	LS 1	-7				F	inal Subtotal	\$2,500
	R FACTORS A					0.0%		Adjustment	\$0
	Notes		,	. 3					
							Final Per	nalty Amount	\$2,500
STAT	UTORY LIMI	T AD	JUSTMEN	IT			Final Asse	essed Penalty	\$2,500
DEFE						0.0%	Reduction	Adjustment	\$0
Reduces	the Final Assessed Pe	enalty I	by the indicated	l percentage.				1	
	Notes		No (deferral is recom	mended for	Findings Order.			
ΡΔΥΔ	BLE PENALT	Y						-	\$2,500
									7-,500

Screening Date 8-Apr-2024

Respondent Bethel-Ash Water Supply Corporation

Case ID No. 65815

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN101216612

Media Public Water Supply

Enf. Coordinator Emerson Rinewalt

Policy Revision 5 (January 28, 2021) PCW Revision February 11, 2021

PCW

Compliance History Worksheet							
>> Co	mpliance Hist Component	ory <i>Site</i> Enhancement (Subtotal 2) Number of	Number	Adjust.			
	NOVs	Written notices of violation ("NOVs") with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (number of NOVs meeting criteria)	2	10%			
		Other written NOVs	0	0%			
		Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (<i>number of orders meeting criteria</i>)	0	0%			
	Orders	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denial of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission	0	0%			
	Judgments and Consent	consent decrees incenting criteria j		0%			
	Decrees	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federal government	0	0%			
	Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (number of counts)	0	0%			
	Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (number of events)	0	0%			
	Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which notices were submitted)	0	0%			
	Addits	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which violations were disclosed)	0	0%			
		F		00/			
		Environmental management systems in place for one year or more	No	0%			
	Other	Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a special assistance program	No	0%			
		Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program	No	0%			
		Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government environmental requirements	No	0%			
		Adjustment Per	centage (Sub	total 2) 10°			
>> Re	peat Violator	(Subtotal 3)					
N/A Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 3) 0%							
>> Compliance History Person Classification (Subtotal 7)							
Unclassified Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 7) 0%							
>> Compliance History Summary							
	Compliance History Notes	Enhancement for two NOVs with the same/similar violations.					
Total Compliance History Adjustment Percentage (Subtotals 2, 3, & 7) 10%							
>> Final Compliance History Adjustment							
		Final Adjustment Percenta	age *capped	at 100% 10°			

	E	conomic	Benefit	Woi	ksheet		
Respondent Case ID No. Reg. Ent. Reference No.	65815	ater Supply Corpor	ation				
Media Violation No.	Public Water S 1	Supply				Percent Interest	Years of Depreciation
						5.0	15
	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Costs Saved	EB Amount
Item Description							
Delayed Costs							
Equipment		1		0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)	\$5,000	30-Sep-2023	6-Sep-2024	0.94	\$16	\$312	\$328
Engineering/Construction			•	0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Land				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs				0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Other (as needed)		<u> </u>		0.00	\$0	n/a	\$0
Notes for DELAYED costs	necessary cor	rective actions to the first	return to compl quarter of none	iance w complian	ith the MCL for TTH nce to the date of c		the last day of
Avoided Costs	ANNU	ALIZE avoided Co	osts before er		<u> </u>	one-time avoided	
Disposal				0.00	\$0	\$0 \$0	\$0
Personnel				0.00	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0	\$0 \$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling Supplies/Equipment				0.00	\$0	\$0 \$0	\$0
Financial Assurance				0.00	\$0	\$0 \$0	\$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.00	\$0	\$0	\$0
Notes for AVOIDED costs				,, 0.00	, , , ,	Ţ	¥
Approx. Cost of Compliance		\$5,000			TOTAL		\$328

To request a more accessible version of this report, please contact the TCEQ Help Desk at (512) 239-4357.



Compliance History Report

Compliance History Report for CN600650667, RN101216612, Rating Year 2024 which includes Compliance History (CH) components from September 1, 2019, through August 31, 2024.

Customer, Respondent, CN600650667, Bethel-Ash Water Supply Classification: UNCLASSIFIED Rating: ----- or Owner/Operator: Corporation

Regulated Entity: RN101216612, BETHEL-ASH WSC WALTON Classification: NOT APPLICABLE Rating: N/A

PLANT

Complexity Points: N/A Repeat Violator: N/A

CH Group: 14 - Other

Location: 6947 FARM-TO-MARKET ROAD 1861 NEAR ATHENS, HENDERSON COUNTY, TEXAS

TCEQ Region: REGION 05 - TYLER

ID Number(s):

PUBLIC WATER SYSTEM/SUPPLY REGISTRATION

1070243

Compliance History Period: September 01, 2019 to August 31, 2024 Rating Year: 2024 Rating Date: 09/01/2024

Date Compliance History Report Prepared: October 22, 2024

Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History: Enforcement

Component Period Selected: October 22, 2019 to October 22, 2024

TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding This Compliance History.

Name: Emerson Rinewalt Phone: (512) 239-1131

Site and Owner/Operator History:

1) Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five year compliance period? YES

2) Has there been a (known) change in ownership/operator of the site during the compliance period? NO

Components (Multimedia) for the Site Are Listed in Sections A - J

A. Final Orders, court judgments, and consent decrees:

N/A

B. Criminal convictions:

N/A

C. Chronic excessive emissions events:

N/A

D. The approval dates of investigations (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

Item 1 July 08, 2020 (1646459) Item 2 January 05, 2023 (1867319)

E. Written notices of violations (NOV) (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.):

A notice of violation represents a written allegation of a violation of a specific regulatory requirement from the commission to a regulated entity. A notice of violation is not a final enforcement action, nor proof that a violation has actually occurred.

1 Date: 12/29/2023 (1974249)

Self Report? NO Classification: Moderate

Citation: 30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.115(f)(1)

Description: TTHM LRAA MCL 4Q2023 – During the 4th quarter of 2023 the system

violated the maximum contaminant level for trihalomethanes with a LRAA of 0.090 mg/L at VZCR 4301 and VZCR 4305, Athens (DBP2-01). ETT Point

Value = 5

2 Date: 03/20/2024 (1974249)

Self Report? NO Classification: Moderate

Citation: 30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.115(f)(1)

Description: TTHM LRAA MCL 1Q2024 – During the 1st quarter of 2024 the system violated

the maximum contaminant level for trihalomethanes with a LRAA of 0.090 mg/L at VZCR 4301 and VZCR 4305, Athens (DBP2-01). ETT Point Value = 5

F. Environmental audits:

N/A

G. Type of environmental management systems (EMSs):

N/A

H. Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates:

N/A

I. Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program:

N/A

J. Early compliance:

N/A

Sites Outside of Texas:

N/A

Component Appendices

Appendix A

All NOVs Issued During Component Period 10/22/2019 and 10/22/2024

1 Date: 08/17/2023 (1974249)

Self Report? NO Classification: Moderate

Citation:

30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.115(f)(1)

Description: TTHM LRAA MCL 3Q2023 – During the 3rd quarter of 2023 the system

violated the maximum count level for trihalomethanes with a LRAA of 0.093 mg/L at VZCR 430 and VZCR 4305. Athens (DBP2-01), ETT Point

Value = 5

Date: 12/29/

12/29/2023 (1974249)

4249)

Cla sific ion: M

M lerate

Self epo ?
Citat.on:

30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.115(f)(1)

Description: TTHM LRAA MCL 4Q2023 – During the 4th quarter of 2023 the system

violated the maximum contaminant level for trihalomethanes with a LRAA of 0.090 mg/L at VZCR 4301 and VZCR 4305, Athens (DBP2-01). ETT Point

Value = 5

3* Date: 03/20/2024 (1974249)

Self Report? NO Classification: Moderate

Citation:

30 TAC Chapter 290, SubChapter F 290.115(f)(1)

Description: TTHM LRAA MCL 1Q2024 – During the 1st quarter of 2024 the system violated

the maximum contaminant level for trihalomethanes with a LRAA of 0.090 mg/L at VZCR 4301 and VZCR 4305, Athens (DBP2-01). ETT Point Value = 5

Appendix B

All Investigations Conducted During Component Period October 22, 2019 and October 22, 2024

Item 1*	July 08, 2020**	(1646459)
Item 2*	January 05, 2023**	(1867319)
Item 3	April 04, 2024 *	(1974249)
Item 4	April 05, 2024 *	(1974664)

^{*} No violations documented during this investigation

^{*} NOVs applicable for the Compliance History rating period 9/1/2019 to 8/31/2024

^{**}Investigation applicable for the Compliance History Rating period between 09/01/2019 and 08/31/2024.

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



§	BEFORE THE
§	
§	TEXAS COMMISSION ON
§	TEAAS COMMISSION ON
§	
§	ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY
	\$ \$ \$ \$

AGREED ORDER DOCKET NO. 2024-0608-PWS-E

On _ _ _ _ , the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("the Commission" or "TCEQ") considered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement action regarding Bethel-Ash Water Supply Corporation, (the "Respondent") under the authority of Tex. Health & Safety Code ch. 341. The Executive Director of the TCEQ, through the Enforcement Division, and the Respondent presented this Order to the Commission.

The Respondent understands that they have certain procedural rights at certain points in the enforcement process, including the right to formal notice of violations, notice of an evidentiary hearing, the right to an evidentiary hearing, and a right to appeal. By entering into this Order, the Respondent agrees to waive all notice and procedural rights.

It is further understood and agreed that this Order represents the complete and fully-integrated agreement of the parties. The provisions of this Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable. The duties and responsibilities imposed by this Order are binding upon the Respondent.

The Commission makes the following Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law:

I. FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. The Respondent owns and operates a public water supply located at 6947 Farm-to-Market Road 1861 near Athens, Henderson County, Texas (the "Facility"). The Facility provides water for human consumption, has approximately 513 service connections, and serves at least 25 people per day for at least 60 days per year. As such, the Facility is a public water system as defined in 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 290.38(73).
- 2. During a record review for the Facility conducted on March 25, 2024 through April 5, 2024, an investigator documented that the locational running annual average concentrations of total trihalomethanes ("TTHM") for Stage 2 Disinfection Byproducts at Site 1 were 0.093 milligrams per liter ("mg/L") for the third quarter of 2023, 0.090 mg/L for the fourth quarter of 2023, and 0.090 mg/L for the first quarter of 2024.
- 3. The Executive Director recognizes that by September 6, 2024, the Facility returned to compliance with the maximum contaminant level ("MCL") for TTHM, based on the locational running annual average.

II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 1, the Respondent is subject to the jurisdiction of the TCEQ pursuant to Tex. Health & Safety Code ch. 341 and the rules of the TCEQ.
- 2. As evidenced by Finding of Fact No. 2, the Respondent failed to comply with the MCL of 0.080 mg/L for TTHM, based on the locational running annual average, in violation of 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 290.115(f)(1) and Tex. Health & Safety Code § 341.0315(c).
- 3. Pursuant to Tex. Health & Safety Code § 341.049(a), the TCEQ has the authority to assess an administrative penalty against the Respondent for violations of state statutes within the TCEQ's jurisdiction, for violations of rules adopted under such statutes, or for violations of orders or permits issued under such statutes.
- 4. An administrative penalty in the amount of \$2,500 is justified by the facts recited in this Order and considered in light of the factors set forth in Tex. Health & Safety Code § 341.049(b). The Respondent paid the \$2,500 penalty.

III. ORDERING PROVISIONS

NOW, THEREFORE, THE TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ORDERS that:

1. The Respondent is assessed a penalty as set forth in Conclusion of Law No. 4 for violations of state statutes and rules of the TCEQ. The payment of this penalty and the Respondent's compliance with all the requirements set forth in this Order resolve only the matters set forth by this Order in this action. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective actions or penalties for violations that are not raised here. Penalty payments shall be made payable to "TCEQ" and shall be sent with the notation "Re: Bethel-Ash Water Supply Corporation, Docket No. 2024-0608-PWS-E" to:

Financial Administration Division, Revenue Operations Section Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214 Texas Commission on Environmental Quality P.O. Box 13088 Austin, Texas 78711-3088

- 2. All relief not expressly granted in this Order is denied.
- 3. The duties and provisions imposed by this Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Respondent. The Respondent is ordered to give notice of this Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Facility operations referenced in this Order.
- 4. The Executive Director may grant an extension of any deadline in this Order or in any plan, report, or other document submitted pursuant to this Order, upon a written and substantiated showing of good cause. All requests for extensions by the Respondent shall be made in writing to the Executive Director. Extensions are not effective until the Respondent receives written approval from the Executive Director. The determination of what constitutes good cause rests solely with the Executive Director.

Bethel-Ash Water Supply Corporation DOCKET NO. 2024-0608-PWS-E Page 3

- 5. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that the Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms in this Order.
- 6. This Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Order, whichever is later.
- 7. This Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against the Respondent in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the OAG to: (1) enforce the terms of this Order; or (2) pursue violations of a statute within the Commission's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by the Commission under such a statute.
- 8. This Order may be executed in separate and multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single instrument. Any page of this Order may be copied, scanned, digitized, converted to electronic portable document format ("pdf"), or otherwise reproduced and may be transmitted by digital or electronic transmission, including but not limited to facsimile transmission and electronic mail. Any signature affixed to this Order shall constitute an original signature for all purposes and may be used, filed, substituted, or issued for any purpose for which an original signature could be used. The term "signature" shall include manual signatures and true and accurate reproductions of manual signatures created, executed, endorsed, adopted, or authorized by the person or persons to whom the signatures are attributable. Signatures may be copied or reproduced digitally, electronically, by photocopying, engraving, imprinting, lithographing, electronic mail, facsimile transmission, stamping, or any other means or process which the Executive Director deems acceptable. In this paragraph exclusively, the terms: electronic transmission, owner, person, writing, and written, shall have the meanings assigned to them under Tex. Bus. Org. Code § 1.002.
- 9. The effective date of this Order is the date it is signed by the Commission. A copy of this fully executed Order shall be provided to each of the parties.

Bethel-Ash Water Supply Corporation DOCKET NO. 2024-0608-PWS-E Page 4

SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

For the Commission	Date				
Cun	12/17/2024				
For the Executive Director	Date				
I, the undersigned, have read and understand the attached Order. I am authorized to agree to the attached Order, and I do agree to the terms and conditions specified therein. I further acknowledge that the TCEQ, in accepting payment for the penalty amount, is materially relying on such representation.					
I also understand that failure to comply with the Ore and/or failure to timely pay the penalty amount, ma					
 A negative impact on compliance history; Greater scrutiny of any permit applications sul Referral of this case to the OAG for contempt, and/or attorney fees, or to a collection agency; Increased penalties in any future enforcement Automatic referral to the OAG of any future en TCEQ seeking other relief as authorized by law 	injunctive relief, additional penalties, ; actions; aforcement actions; and				
In addition, any falsification of any compliance docu	ments may result in criminal prosecution.				
Mark C. Hannen	11/12/24				
Signature	Date				
MARK C. HANNAN Name (Printed or typed)					
Authorized Representative of	,				
Bethel-Ash Water Supply Corporation					

☐ If mailing address has changed, please check this box and provide the new address below: