

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

1 **Laurie Gharis:** Good evening. It is now 6:32, so we will go ahead and get started. Today is
2 November 1st. My name is Laurie Gharis. I am with the Texas Commission on Environmental
3 Quality's Office of Chief Clerk. Joining me tonight are our speakers at the table. We have Amy
4 Browning, Holly Landuyt, Doug Boyer, Anita Keese, and Jason Ybarra. Thank you for joining me
5 for tonight's Stakeholder Meeting. This meeting is part of resolution of EPA complaint number
6 02NO20R6. I hope everyone had a chance, ah, to look at our air equipment and talk to our
7 experts and are ready to learn more about our Public Participation Processes. Before we begin,
8 though, I'd like to go over a few logistics. First, I see some of you covered up, and it is a little
9 chilly in here and we have asked for the air conditioner to be turned off. So, hopefully it will be,
10 um, a little warmer very soon. Second, if, um, you just came in here, if you go out these doors
11 and to the right, in the right there are restrooms and water fountains, just in case you need
12 them. As ah, Ms. Dimassi noted this meeting is being interpreted, so please speak clearly and at
13 a good pace so that your information can be interpreted. And, if you need a headset, and just
14 walked in, our back table, back there will, um, be able to help you. The purpose of this
15 Stakeholder Meeting is to provide you with information on how TCEQ works, as well as how you
16 can participate in TCEQ processes. This evening we will discuss public participation in TCEQ
17 permitting processes, how the complaint process works, information related to emergency
18 response activities, and interpreting ambient air quality data. The format for today's meeting is
19 to begin with the TCEQ's staff presentations. After presentations we will have time for
20 questions and answers. During the question-and-answer period, the public is encouraged to ask
21 questions and to engage in open discussions with TCEQ staff. Although we will be listening to
22 and taking notes on your questions and comments and concerns, there will be no formal
23 comment period, as this is a Stakeholder Meeting. So now we are ready for our TCEQ staff
24 presentations. Amy, if you would like to come on up.

25 **Amy Browning:** Sorry, I need to go back, ok. Um, good evening and thank everyone very much
26 for coming out this evening. Ah, we really appreciate you guys coming out to our meeting. Am I
27 on the right slide, ah no, sorry. There you go. I'm going to speak, very briefly today about, ah,
28 the public participation in the TCEQ permitting process, and about the different types of
29 permits that are issued by the TCEQ. Um, as Laurie said, my name's Amy Browning, I am an
30 Attorney with the Office of Legal Services, ah, representing the Executive Director. So, the types
31 of permits issued by TCEQ, are very generally, we have Water Quality and Availability permits,
32 Waste permits, and Air Quality permits. Ah, as you can see, we generally describe these as
33 being, as being, ah, as being the different media, Air, Water and Waste. In Water Quality and
34 Water Availability, these are some of the many different types of permits that you see, um, and
35 they all have their own individual requirements that each and every one of these we could
36 spend an hour talking about just, ah, on their own. Um, same thing for Waste. So, we have these
37 different types of Waste permits, ah, some of these that you might be familiar with, would be
38 the kind of permits that you might see for, ah, things like Municipal Solid Waste, things related
39 to landfills, and, you know, where your trash goes when it leaves your house. Things like that.
40 And then, ah, for Air Quality permits. Air Quality permits are divided into two major groups,
41 minor permits and major permits. Ah, and minor permits are further subdivided as to Permit
42 by Rules, Standard Permits, and Minor New Source Review, while major permits are divided into
43 ah, PSD or Prevention of Significant Deterioration, Nonattainment, and Hazardous Air
44 Pollutants. Ah, just to take one minute because, ah, Houston is located in an Ozone
45 Nonattainment area. Nonattainment permits, generally speaking, have more stringent
46 requirements than, ah, PSD permits. And both PSD permits and Nonattainment permits are
47 generally for larger sources, while minor permits are for smaller sources. Public participation in
48 the permitting process, ah, is governed by several Rules and Statutes. The Statutes were
49 established by the TCEQ Legislature with House Bill 801 in the 76th Legislature in 1999 and
50 then amended in 2015 by the 84th Legislature with Senate Bill 709. The Rules that came out of
51 these Statutes, are codified at 30 Texas Administrative Code, in Chapters 39, 55 and 80. So, what
52 do you talk about when you talk about public participation in permitting? One of the first
53 things that you have to think about is notice, because notice tells you that there is something
54 available for you to participate in. So a notice is something that is put out there that gives the

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

55 public information about a potential permitting activity. Ah, notice is provided by the
56 applicants, but in most cases is also actually mailed out by the TCEQ as well and posted on the
57 TCEQ website. There are different types of notices required for different types of permits.
58 Generally speaking, ah, you often have two different notices, although some types of permits
59 may only have one, but umm, but we'll talk about that more in just a minute. Ah, when are the
60 notices sent out to the public? Well, the notice is sent out when the agency receives an
61 application and determines that that application is in administratively complete and is ready to
62 move forward with being reviewed by the Agency. Generally speaking, the type of information
63 that's in a notice is the location for the proposed facility, what the proposed facility will do, for
64 example, are they proposing to put in a landfill? Is it a refinery? Is it some type of small
65 chemical operation? Is it a Stormwater Permit? There are many different types of applications,
66 and that would be the basic information that would be in a notice. The first notice is called the
67 Notice of Receipt of Application and Intent to Obtain Permit, also known as the NORI. So, you'll
68 often hear us refer to the NORI notice or to the first notice, and it provides an opportunity for
69 the public to know that a permit action is occurring, that someone has applied to the Agency
70 for a permit. Ah, this is an important thing for certain types of applications. For example, for
71 minor NSR Air permits and concrete batch plants, ah, contested case hearing requests, which
72 I'm going to talk about in just a minute, you must have, we must have received at least one
73 contested case hearing request during the NORI for the opportunity to request a hearing
74 through a main, throughout the remainder of the comment period. The second notice is known
75 as the Notice of Application and Preliminary Determination or a NAPD. Ah, again NAPD is the
76 acronym, also second public notice, and this is a notice the Executive Director has reached a
77 preliminary decision on a permit application and that a draft permit is ready for review and
78 comment. Ah, again, you can have the opportunity to request a contested case hearing on
79 applications, ah, during this time period as well, during the notice. Some types of permit
80 applications occasionally, different types, will have something called a consolidated notice,
81 sometimes called a consolidated NORI and NAPD, or sometimes just called a consolidated
82 notice, um, and but that information would be provided in the notice itself, and it would be
83 clear what the comment period would be on the notice. So, that's an important piece of
84 information that you find in the notice itself, is what the, what is the duration of the comment
85 period. You also have public meetings. So, when there is significant public interest in an
86 application, the Agency may hold a public meeting if a public meeting has been requested. Or,
87 also if a public meeting has been requested by a local legislator, the agency will hold a public
88 meeting. And that gives the public the opportunity to ask questions of the applicant and of
89 TCEQ staff. So, TCEQ staff from the permitting program, from the Office of the Chief Clerk, and
90 from the Office of Legal Services would be at the public meeting available to answer questions.
91 If you want to request a public meeting on a permit application, you submit a request to the
92 Office of the Chief Clerk with the permit number and that, that you would like to have a public
93 meeting on the application. At the public meeting there is an informal question and answer
94 comment period, ah, where you get the chance to ask questions and have those questions
95 answered. And then there is a formal comment period where the public is allowed to make
96 formal oral comments on a meeting. So, you can make comments either formally, during the
97 oral portion of a public meeting, or you may make comments in writing on any permit. The
98 Executive Director will respond to all timely comments that are received on any permit
99 application in a formal written response to comment document. Anyone that's on the mailing
100 list for the permit application, or for the county, will receive notification that that formal RTC is
101 available once it has been filed. And, so the way you get to be on the mailing list, either for a
102 permit application or for the county, is you submit a request to the Chiefs Clerk Office that you
103 would like to be on the mailing list. You can submit public comments on the um, Commission's
104 website, by fax, by mail, or orally at a public meeting. The information your comments should
105 contain would be information about how you are potentially impacted by the ah, facility, the
106 proposed facility, and the questions and concerns that you may have about the proposed
107 facility or question you might have about the draft permit. You should submit these timely
108 within the comment period that is listed in the public notice, ah, the dates for when public
109 comment periods end also ah, get listed on the Commission's, ah, Integrated Database as well.

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

110 Ah, you should submit comments if you have concerns about a permit application or if you
111 think that you might want to request a contested case hearing. Ah, to be a party in a contested
112 case hearing, which is the next thing I'm going to talk about, you have to have submitted timely
113 comments on an application. What's a contested case hearing? Contested case hearing is
114 basically like a trial without a jury. Um, it has testimony, it has evidence, and um, experts to, to
115 ask questions about a permit application. A request for a contested case hearing must have
116 submitted timely comments and a timely hearing request, the request must be in writing, and
117 the requester must explain how they are affected in a manner that is different than the general
118 public. One of the ways that you do this is that you tell us where you're located. Are you located
119 right next door to the proposed plant? How far away from it might you be? Do you have
120 potential health concerns, ah, with a proposed plan? So, you need to, if you wanted to be an
121 affected party for a contested case hearing, you need to detail how you would be potentially
122 impacted differently than the general public. Ah, requests for a contested case hearing go
123 before the Commissioners at a public Agenda, and the commissioners make decisions on
124 whether or not to refer matters to a contested case hearing, although occasionally some
125 applicants will also do a direct referral to SOAH. What's SOAH? SOAH is the State Office of
126 Administrative Hearings. Ah, this is the state agency that hears, um, that hears contested case
127 hearings. Ah, they have an administrative law judge. (beeping sounds) Sorry. Sorry. Ah, you
128 have an administrative law judge who will hear the evidence and, ah, the testimony that's
129 presented in the contested case hearing and will then make what's called a Proposal for a
130 Decision, which is a proposal for what the judge believes the evidence, ah, determines for
131 whether or not the permit should be issued or not. And, then that Proposal for Decision goes
132 back before the commissioners, and the commissioners make an actual decision on the permit.
133 Um, Thank you again. My name is Amy Browning. If you have questions you can ah, send them
134 to me ah, at amy.browning@TCEQ.texas.gov, and um, thank you very much.

135 Clapping audible

136 **Holly Landuyt:** Good evening, my name is Holly Landuyt, and I am a Senior Network Specialist
137 and Work Leader in the Ambient Monitoring Section in the Monitoring Division. I appreciate
138 your time this evening. It was really beneficial to get to speak with many of you. Um, I'm going
139 to talk, walk you through the steps to access Ambient Air Monitoring Data. So, ambient air
140 monitoring in Texas began as early as the 1960s, with roughly 30 air monitoring stations, and
141 today Texas has one the largest monitoring networks in the nation consisting of roughly 230 air
142 monitoring stations with over 500 individual pollutant monitors. The TCEQ owns over half of
143 the Texas Air Monitoring Network, and additional air monitoring is conducted by partner
144 organizations such as local governments, universities, nonprofit organizations, and industry to
145 expand our air monitoring coverage in Texas. The Texas Air Monitoring Data are available to
146 our data customers and the general public online at the TCEQ Air Monitoring Database. The
147 Federal Clean Air Act established air monitoring standards for six criteria pollutants. The TCEQ
148 monitors ambient air concentrations of these and other pollutants at stationary air monitoring
149 sites throughout the state. Our federal monitoring requirements are determined by the
150 Environmental Protection Agency, and they're discussed in Title 40 of the Code of Federal
151 Regulations, or the CFR. These regulations include requirements for the how and the where, the
152 quality assessment requirements, the types of equipment, of what we use, and how we site our
153 monitors, and where we locate them. Each pollutant has very specific monitoring requirements
154 that are spelled out in the CFR. We maintain a very robust network of state initiative monitors
155 in addition to our federal network, and these include monitoring for volatile organic
156 compounds and hydrogen sulfide. So, air monitoring information is very easily accessible from
157 the TCEQ homepage with just two clicks, so I am going to show you how to do that today. So,
158 you are going to start with the TCEQ homepage, and that's at www.tceq.texas.gov and it's
159 important Texas is spelled out. So, starting on the homepage - two clicks right - your going to
160 start with Air, click on that, and that's going to open you to the next page, and right here at the
161 top center is Air Quality and Monitoring. So, your next step will be to click that. That's going to
162 take you to our Air Quality and Monitoring homepage. This homepage contains information

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

163 about the monitoring network. It has answers to frequently, frequent questions that have been
164 asked. It provides a variety of links to our air monitoring sites, a geographical interface, and the
165 data. So, up here on the righthand side of the page, or um, quite a few links that I'm going to go
166 over today. Here you have the Texas Air Quality Forecast - I know it is kinda small but you will
167 see it bigger in just a minute - um and there here in the middle is a map, and that's our
168 geographical interface map. It's basically a Google Earth with our air monitoring sites on it that
169 is a wealth of information, and I'll show you how to use that, too. So, today's Texas Air Quality
170 Forecast. This is distributed daily, um, via an email notification, and this is an alert that you can
171 actually sign up from, from the TCEQ homepage. Um, it's also posted on the webpage, and it's
172 updated daily. So, when you click on Texas Today's Air Quality Forecast, you're going to see the
173 regional air quality, and these are all of our main regions. Um, and here is Houston, that's kind
174 of in the middle here. This was a snippet just one day in time, and if you click on your region of
175 interest, and here I clicked on Houston, it's going to actually take you to the Environmental
176 Protection Agency's Air Now webpage, and this will give you more air quality information, um,
177 and you can even put in your zip code and, and really drill down in see what's happening in
178 your neighborhood. So, very, very useful tool. So, as I mentioned earlier on the Air Monitoring
179 webpage, um, we have the Texas Air Monitoring Information System, or TAMIS. So, just another
180 acronym for y'all. Um, this is the database with all of the information about our air monitoring
181 sites. Our data is in near real time, and this is where you can access it, and I'm going to show
182 you in just a few more clicks. So, going back to GeoTAM, that's our interactive graphical
183 display, um, of our Texas air monitoring stations. Um, it allows users to zoom in to a specific
184 area, or sites, and if you select an air monitoring sites, that's the little circles with the colors,
185 um, it's going to provide you with additional information about the sites and the samplers, the
186 air monitoring that's actually happening at the site. Um, and then the near real time data that
187 you can see. Um, there is a legend that you can open that will identify what all the colors mean.
188 So, some sites may have one or two monitors, and some sites may have five or ten or more, and
189 the legend will identify all the different samplers. And so for this example, um, I'm going to,
190 I've zoomed in with GeoTAM, that's right here in this corner, and into the Houston Ship
191 Channel. And in the Houston Ship Channel there is quite a few air monitoring sites, but if you
192 take your mouse or your curser, and you hover over the circle pie chart for Clinton, right in the
193 middle, and sometimes you might need to zoom in just a little bit further, and if you click on
194 that, up is going to pop some site information very specific to that site. And so, right here
195 under the name it says Site Information. If you click on Site Information, it's going to bring you
196 to another screen, and you're going to start off with, you've got a ribbon here and it says 'Basic
197 Information', so that's your site logistics, the address, city, county, lat, long; um, and right next
198 that, if you click on Monitoring Information, that's going to bring you to another page, this one
199 over here, and it's going to show all of active monitors at that site. So, um, and if you want to
200 go back in time and say 'ok, this air monitoring site has been here for 30 years, has the air
201 monitoring changed over years' you can unclick 'show active monitoring' and see the historical
202 monitoring at that site as well. And, over here on the right hand of that page, it says Data
203 Options. So, this is where you can find the Daily Ambient Air Monitoring Data. So, your going to
204 click on current data, right here, any of these, these current data fields will take you to the next
205 screen which is this popup over here, and this is going to show you the data at that site for an
206 entire day. and it's going to be the hourly averages. So we're going to post the hourly data that
207 our analyzers sample an average on this, on this screen. Um, there's also another option if you
208 go up here where you can do more detailed reports. You can run a monthly report, or a yearly
209 report for a site, and that data is also, you can if you want to download it or export it into
210 comma delimited and put it into Excel, it's also available for you there as well. And then, um
211 lastly, we do have photos of our sites. So, if you want to see what does an air monitoring site
212 look like? Um, it's going to have an overall view, and then all the cardinal direction photos
213 around the ambient air monitoring site. Ok, so that's how you get the data. We do have some
214 flyers on how to do this, and um if you didn't get one we have a few more on the table in the
215 back.

216 Clapping audible

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

217 **Doug Boyer:** Hey everybody, um my name is, there you go. My name is Doug Boyer. I'm with the
218 Air Quality Division. Um I'm going to briefly talk about how we use and interpret the air quality
219 data that Holly just talked about and how you can access that. Um, so we have a lot of different
220 ways that we do look at this data, but the main one is, is to determined compliance with the
221 federal health based standards, and so we, we take a look at the data, and then, use the
222 appropriate metric to see if it's, ah, if an area is meeting that standard or not. Um, diving down
223 a little bit deeper, we're going to analyze trends to see how things have been changing over
224 time, and certainly we 're going to evaluate days, um, or events that may have higher pollutant
225 concentrations. And then, we have some other programs that we're going to support as well.
226 Um, so I'm going to show just a couple of charts and graphics here, and so the first one were
227 talking about is comparing to the federal health based standards, and this chart shows the
228 different urban areas within the state of Texas, um, the, the left hand side has the Houston
229 area, um it goes to Dallas/Fort Worth, San Antonio, El Paso, and on there this is talking about,
230 ah, that federal health based standard for ozone pollution at ground level. And, Amy
231 mentioned earlier that the Houston area does not meet that, that standard, and so, its bar's
232 above the, that federal health based standard of 70 or 75ppb, and the same the Dallas/Fort
233 Worth, San Antonio, and El Paso. And a lot of urban areas within the country, um, have this
234 challenge, um but then you can see perhaps some of the other areas that are there within our
235 state, and this is preliminary data from, from this past year. And so, ah, this is one way that we
236 do, ah, take a look at the data. I'm going to show briefly here, ah, we talked about trends, and
237 so this, ah, shows some different time periods in the Houston area from 2012, on the left, to
238 2016 and 2021. And each of the dots there's a monitor that, that's measuring ozone within the
239 area. And then we have a colored spatial field that's, ah, representing the, the ozone
240 concentrations; and so you see on the far left, you have these warmer colors throughout a lot of
241 the city, and then as we move through 2016 and to last year those colors have become
242 significantly cooler. And that's, showing us the, the trend of ozone concentrations over time
243 and especially those higher values that are more important to our human health. And so, this
244 is, ah, a significant ozone decrease and that's ah, great. And it's also during the time when the
245 Houston areas added a significant, ah, number of people, the pollution has increased a lot; and
246 so, um, this is just one way that we evaluate some of the data that we have and look at trends.
247 Um, I also wanted to invite you guys to, to interact more with us and learn about our air quality
248 updates, and I have listed some, some different ways, and some different topics that you could
249 subscribe to via our Gov Delivery Service on our website. And so, any of these topics, um, you
250 can subscribe to and get emails about some of the air quality actions that the agency is
251 undertaking. And if you have any additional, ah, contacts for myself or, or Holly, our contact
252 information is there, and again I thank you guys for being here today.

253 Clapping audible

254 **Anita Keese:** Hello. How is everybody today? (Crowd replies, inaudible) It is freezing. I'm so
255 grateful y'all came out tonight. Um, my name is Anita Keese. I've been working for the TCEQ
256 about 19 years, and a good part of that time has been either taking or conducting complaint
257 investigations or talking about our complaint policy, because this is such a fundamentally
258 important thing that the TCEQ does, and we put a lot of emphasis on it. So, I have a lot to cover.
259 So, I'm going to go kind fast, bear with me. Alright, first of all we take complaints lots of
260 different ways. We have an online portal, where you can fill out a series of questions and
261 submit complaints to us that way, and that's 24/7, 365 days a year, right? Also, we have a
262 number of email addresses you can use to submit complaints to us as well. We have
263 complaint@tceq. You can also add an 's' to that, and it'll still get to us. We also have queja, and
264 we have quejas, so also if you add an 's', cause we know how people are and they don't always
265 remember, right? So, we're trying to make it easy for you guys. We also have a 1-800 number
266 that we take complaints also. You know any holiday, day or night, we will take complaints that
267 way as well. But sometimes you want to talk to a person, and if you want to talk to a human
268 being, you can contact any of our 16 different regional offices. You can call Austin, too,
269 definitely. So, we do have 16 different regional offices. Those folks live in your community.

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

270 They're affected by the same things you're affected by, and sometimes you just want to have
271 that one-on-one conversation. So, you're welcome to go on our website and contact any of the
272 regional offices and file the complaint that way as well. So, what can we help you with? There's
273 a lot of things TCEQ can do, but we can't do everything, right? So, I'm going to go through some
274 of these, and hopefully some of these peak some interest for you guys in terms of what we can
275 do for you. One of them is if you see water that may be polluted. And when I talk about water,
276 I'm talking about surface water bodies primarily. So, if there's a creek you like to hike by and
277 you see some dead fish, or if you somebody discharging anything or disposing of anything into
278 a water body, we really would love to know about that, right? So, that's a really good example of
279 a complaint that we can, we can absolutely handle. If you see or smell something unpleasant in
280 the air. So this one's a very common complaint we receive. If you live next to any kind of
281 industry but you are affected on your own property with some really unpleasant odors, please
282 let us know. This is what we do. Also, if you see land that's contaminated, and when I say land,
283 what we really looking for is spills of chemicals because we've, we've ended up because of some
284 complaints with some really interesting cases because sometimes you will have a small
285 business that's collecting waste, and they get overwhelmed by it, because it's expensive to
286 properly dispose of waste, and they put it on like 55 gal drums that don't last forever, and they
287 might not label those drums. So, these are the kind of scenarios that if you became aware of
288 this in your community, we absolutely can handle these scenarios, right? So, if you have
289 problems with your drinking water, this is another really common one. Drinking water is very
290 much a focus at our agency. If you, you know taste and odor is a very nuanced thing, but if you
291 do experience issues with your water, you find it unpleasant to drink, especially if it is cloudy,
292 that's really problematic for drinking water, let us know. We will come and do an investigation
293 and find out if that water has been treated properly and distributed without your water pipes
294 properly. So, also if you have information or evidence about an environmental problem. We run
295 into this sometimes with people who are very familiar with, um, environmental regulations, like
296 they're a consultant, or they work in the environmental field, um, where they have evidence
297 they want to share with us. Sometimes we get very interesting complaints that way, because
298 these people have, you know insider knowledge. Um, those kind of scenarios we can absolutely
299 help with right? Anonymously, as well, cause I know that is a big concern when people are
300 work, are in the industry. So, we are also a licenser agency. We issue licenses for a number of
301 different industries, primarily drinking water, wastewater, landfills. Um if, if somebody has
302 installed septic systems in your property, we license them too and irrigation systems as well.
303 So, if you have an issue and you believe they're not following environmental laws, we can
304 absolutely do a complaint investigation related to that as well. And finally, this happens a lot
305 where, your neighborhoods are changing and industry's encroaching into your property, and
306 you want to just know, you don't know if this facility has an appropriate license or permit, or
307 you don't know what permit they hold, or you're just concerned they're not operating properly,
308 give us a call, we can help you or walk you through that. And we get a lot of complaint
309 investigations that result in violations because of this last one, where folks are not licensed, or
310 not permitted properly, and don't have the appropriate authorization to, to be operating.

311 Alright, evidence. This, this is very interesting to a lot of people. So, we do have the ability to
312 cite violations based on evidence that you provide, that the public provides. However, if we get
313 in this scenario where you have provided evidence and we're going to have you actually be the
314 person who behaves as kind of our, um, expert witness, we're going to have, we're going to ask
315 some more things of you, right? That doesn't mean we want you not to submit us any
316 information because that might sound scary. I don't want to get on a court case and be an
317 expert witness. However, it is some cases we're not able to obtain the information that you
318 have, so it's very, very valuable information, and we're going to ask you to do these things, one
319 or more of these things. One of them is to sign an affidavit with a notary public to make sure
320 that you're meeting these other criteria. This is a common request that we'll send out to you
321 guys when we get some information or evidence from you guys. Um, there is a scenario, that's
322 very infrequent, but there is a scenario where we might have you guys actually testify in a court.
323 So, know that that's a possibility. And then, we do need to make sure that you have followed

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

324 TCEQ's requirements, because we have to follow those requirements. We have EPA
325 requirements, we have EPA methods we have to use for collecting and testing, say water. If you
326 take a sample from your water tap, we can't rely on, um, uncertifiable equipment. We have to
327 use certain kinds of equipment that we can calibrate. We have to make sure we're using the
328 appropriate method to test water. So, if you're going to be providing that information to us, it
329 stands to reason that we need to make sure you're using those same methods, right? That
330 makes sense.

331 And then finally we need to make sure we don't want anyone getting to trouble, gathering
332 information for our complaint investigations. We need you to certify that you have legally
333 obtained this information. No theft, no trespassing. We need to make sure this has been legally
334 obtained information. Right? And then finally, do understand that if we get to that point, and it
335 is fairly infrequent, but if we get to that point your identity may be disclosed. So, this is a
336 sticking point, and I just don't want it to discourage you guys from snapping a picture and
337 sending it to us, right? Because this is a fairly rare occurrence, but we do, we can benefit so
338 much from having the public cooperate with us in this way.

339 Alright, so examples of evidence. This is the kind of thing we're talking about right? Odor logs,
340 this is a big one where you guys can help us so much actually cite violations where it's been
341 very difficult for our staff to obtain. Especially odor logs because odor is transient, transitory
342 right? You'll smell an odor really, really strong at your home in the morning or late at night and
343 you tell us, 'I always smell this odor at 4am in the morning' and so, we'll get our investigators
344 to come out at 4 o'clock in the morning, and we come out three or four times, and we never are
345 there when it smells as bad as you have documented, right? This is how you can use your
346 evidence, your experience, documented on this form, according to TCEQ's policies, cause this is
347 a document we use to as investigators, and see if we can get a violation there. So, work with our
348 staff. I know we staff that are very patient, that will walk you through exactly how to fill out
349 this form. But it is fairly intuitive, and this is, again, the kind of situation that can really get us
350 to a better place with a facility that's really disturbing your peace, right? If you can't be in your
351 back yard, enjoying your own back yard, because of a neighboring facility, this is what we can
352 often use to get us there. Photographs. So we get photographs all the time, and this is the way
353 people are now. Everybody's snapping pictures constantly, it's amazing right? And sometimes
354 folks want to send us photographs. That's amazing! You know sometimes this is a wonderful
355 starting point for us to get evidence. If we start with a photograph that you have sent to us,
356 then we can begin an investigation, and a photograph is 1000 words, right? So, we get a lot of
357 information just receiving that photograph. Um, you know photograph of smoke, there is so
358 many different things that we get really good photographs from. So, copies of records. Copies
359 of records is one of those rare scenarios where if there unusually circumstances in which you
360 might have a competitor complaining against a competitor, or an employee filing a complaint
361 because they think that something's going wrong within the business that they work in, and
362 sometimes they will have copies of records. Again, legally obtained records. We want to make
363 sure nobody gets in trouble for providing us these records. But we can end up with some really
364 interesting complaint investigations because of copies of records, operational records. And
365 then an affidavit. So, I wanted to give you, show you a quick copy of an affidavit because this is
366 big one for us is to make sure that you're able to legal testify this is true factual information we
367 are giving to the TCEQ, right? And it does need to be signed in front of a notary.

368 So, the question everybody has is how long is it going to take for you to come out there? You
369 file the complaint with us, you take the time to let us know of something that's bothering you
370 in your community, how long is it going to take? You know we have 16 different regional
371 offices, and all those 16 different regional offices we have at least two people that are, that they
372 know their job is to run out the door if there's an emergency response. And some of your
373 complaints fall under that level, right, where we have heard your complaint out and we really
374 need to go and roll right away. So, we have people available to roll. However, most of the time
375 those complaints we usually try to get them done within 30 days, no longer, right? We try, we
376 have this um, set of criteria that helps guide how long it's going to take, but we try never to go
377 beyond 30 days. So, I did want to mention, also, that sometimes it's not within our jurisdiction,

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

378 sometimes we have a lot of local governments that do the same work that we do, and so we will
379 often refer these to a local jurisdiction. So, we might not necessary we do the complaint within
380 30 days, but we're going to refer it to somebody who can, right? And there's also some other
381 state agencies that have the authority to investigate your particular complaint. We'll let you
382 know who it is, and we'll let them know that you filed that complaint as well. So, you want to
383 know you took the time, again, you took the time to file a complaint with us, you want to know
384 what we decided, you want to know if your complaint resulted in a violation. We're going to let
385 you know. If you give us contact information, we're going to let you know once that complaint
386 is wrapped up. We have, ah, different ways of doing it now. We've, we've gone beyond just the
387 paper letter back to you, um so we, you might get an email instead. But we're going to let you
388 know the results. If you're anonymous, I'll show you the webpage where you can go and hunt
389 down your complaint, as well, and find out what the status was. Just because you're
390 anonymous, it's not a black hole, you can still find out what happened. So, if - and this is always
391 exciting - if we take, to conduct an investigation, and it results in an enforcement action, we're
392 going to notify you as the time goes because your going to, the enforcement actions sometimes
393 take two years, even longer in some rare cases, we're going to notify you periodically
394 throughout that process, so that you are aware of how that's all going down. You also will have
395 an opportunity to comment on the TCEQ Order before it's finalized. So, sometimes this is very
396 much of interest with somebody who has a particular violation in mind that they believe should
397 be in that order, you will have an opportunity to comment.

398 Alright, so here the, we call this whacky, internally we call this whacky, which I just think it's a
399 funny, funny, funniest little acronym. Um, but you can search your complaint here. This is
400 available on our public website. The most useful search for most people is the date and the
401 county. Of course, if we're in Harris County, you might want to drill down to program, cause we
402 get a lot of complaints in Harris County. So, this information you hunt down your complaint,
403 the day you filed it, make a note that of that, and you will be able to find your complaint and
404 see if we indeed cited a violation or even if it resulted in an enforcement action. So, you have
405 access to that information. So, what's really, really exciting for us, is be in that a lot, a lot of this
406 is because of these, this work that we've been doing, we're trying to modernize our complaint
407 receipt portal. So, you can now go in there and file a complaint, but there's a lot of things you
408 can't do right now. So, we've been working. We bought some, um, software, we've been working
409 to modernize our complaint portal website, so it largely because of complaints that we have
410 hear from the public. Um, first of all, I want you to know that TCEQ's internal complaint policy
411 is posted on our complaint website. So, you can actually see the same document that the staff
412 are obliged to comply with when they conduct complaint investigations, so you can actually
413 read our internal policy. Next is once we have our software we're going to have, that website's
414 going to be very different. You can submit complaints, and it will be a lot more user friendly.
415 You're going to receive this automated email. Right now the process is, you file your complaint,
416 and the regional offices get your email, and then you need to human being to type up a
417 response to you. Now it's going to be automated, that will point you to some important
418 information about what happens next, right? So, it standardizes that communication, and
419 everybody gets that communication right off. And then you can upload your evidence, right?
420 You can go ahead and upload those photographs. People want to do that now, they want to take
421 a picture of a, of smoke and send it right to us. You'll be able to do that now. We're very
422 excited. Videos, too. Videos has been a sticking point for us, too. Short videos, you can send
423 them our way. So, and it's, it's really user friendly. It, it accepts all different kinds of formats, as
424 well. So, most critical to this meeting is you'll be able to submit a complaint in the language of
425 your choice. We're going to be adding languages as we see the need to, but we're going to, we're
426 trying to start off with at least three additional languages beyond English. Which is great! We're
427 very excited. I, I know I'm very excited to finally see this happen. Um, you're going to have that
428 complaint with the questions in Spanish. You can complete it in Spanish, and then you can get
429 the reply back in Spanish. So, we will know by doing that, that you want to talk to somebody on
430 the phone in Spanish, too. So it will make that whole process a little less, um less cumbersome
431 for you guys. So, um, it's also important for us, because we say this a lot, we say that we

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

432 address every single complaint that comes in the door, but I know there's been these occasions
433 that, that always nag me a little, where somebody will say, I filed the complaint in February and
434 nobody did anything. And, those scare me because I feel like we, we put so emphasis, and we
435 try so hard to address this. I want to be able to go to a place and verify that you indeed
436 submitted a complaint on this website, right? We will finally be able to do that. Because now we
437 depend on people to enter in things on and data and we lose people periodically, and you know
438 we're human beings, we make mistakes. But, my goodness, we want to be so much better at
439 making sure that we capture every single complaint that comes in through our door. Alright, so
440 we also did an update to our complaint manual, this is a trifle? We have some in the hallway,
441 the older version, but this document we updated our 'do you want to make an environmental
442 complaint' document to be user friendly for a iPhone, right. So, um, it's got a lot of imbedded
443 links, it's got more language than they historically had been provided, and we have worked very
444 hard to make this a much more user friendly document for you guys. So, that's all I have. I
445 appreciate your attention and will be around afterwards for any questions.

446 Audible clapping

447 **Jason Ybarra:** Good evening, everybody can hear me? Thumbs up, alright. I'm Jason Ybarra. I'm
448 here with the Houston regional office of the TCEQ. So, we're right off of Polk and Wayside, just
449 down the street, and um, for me I've been here with the agency over 25 years. First job out of
450 college. So, you know born and bred here in Second Ward, so thanks for coming out. So, I'm just
451 going to kind give an overview of emergency response, kind of what we do here in the region
452 and like, Anita was saying, we have 16 regions so, we all kind of follow the same playbook. So,
453 emergency response. We do have dedicated emergency response coordinators, in every office
454 that are in the office 8 to 5, and are on call 24 hours a day, 365 days a year. And there's just
455 some, some of our investigators, coordinators that are doing monitoring outside or, you know,
456 kind of reviewing the incident. And you know, kind of when we do emergency response one
457 thing that, you know, we always, you know, evaluate the situation and, you know, diffidently
458 look at community monitoring, with, ah, the incident facility and additionally any local
459 jurisdictions that, that have that capability as well; and additionally you'll see, you know, we
460 taking water samples to, to verify drinking water standards. So, the types of emergency
461 response that come to, you know, our region and any region is just routine, you know, spills
462 and discharges that are on, you know, I10, 610 every morning when you hear the traffic reports.
463 A lot of those things are going on every day in our city. And ah you know, we review a lot of
464 those incidents and either the, you know, County Hazmat or City of Houston Hazmat, you
465 know, we'd be doing a lot of those, you know, vehicle accidents. So, kind of when we come into
466 play, is, ah, you know, incident facilities that are at petrol chemical facilities, or facilities that,
467 you know, blend those or manufacture those types of chemicals. We do fires and explosions at,
468 you know, kind of in our region and any large-scale incidents that, ah, would happen at our
469 refineries and petrol chemical facilities, then emergency response would be, you know,
470 forefront in any of those occasions. Natural disasters is a big thing that, that the agency does,
471 and what natural disasters, and any type of local jurisdiction, we all come together as a unified
472 command, and, you know, we all have different expertises and different rules and statues that
473 we follow, but we all come together at the end to, to evaluate it and get everybody back to their,
474 to their normal life. So, notifications. We get them all different ways. So, we have, um, what we
475 call the Natural, National Response Center, with is the federal notification that would come
476 through the federal channels that the state gives notification for, so a lot of federal rules or, ah,
477 federal transportation, a lot of the companies would have to call through that route. And then
478 we also have the State Emergency Response Commission that anything to do with state statues,
479 then they would call that number, and we would get that notification. And then we also get
480 notifications through the phone 24 hours a day. And when those notifications come in, you
481 know, we, we have, um, you know, different aspects of what's the chemical of concern, what's
482 going on, and you know, we'll talk with those environmental agencies that are out there, or the
483 incident at the, you know the commander at the facility and ask them those questions of, what
484 was spilled, how much, you know, is there air monitoring being conducted. If local jurisdiction's

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

485 there, there'll be doing are, you know, air monitoring, so we're all trying to, to see, you know,
486 how they've, you know, addressed the incident and, you know, what the state requires for them
487 to do to clean up as well.

488 So, deployments. Kind of like we talked before, we, we do a lot of, of natural disasters for, you
489 know, support functions as any hazardous substance that's spilt or, you know, vessel
490 assessments for, for boats, you know, petrol chemical facilities, orphan containers. The storm
491 surge will come in, push a lot of things around, so, so we come together and evaluate all that,
492 with, ah, the hurricanes or, you know, different winter storms and, and make sure that
493 everybody's following the rules for that. We do air quality assessments, you know, kind of in
494 our region, throughout the state of Texas where we do, um, you know, reconnaissance that we'll
495 do monitoring out there. Y'all saw kind of the, the rapid assessment vehicles that were out
496 there as well, so, so those are things that we use and, and, and do that in our, in our region.
497 And additionally, through kind of emergency response where we have a lot of the air
498 monitoring and, and different, you know, cool things that we use in the field to, to look at those
499 chemicals concern, you know, they'll support investigators in the field as well. So, as we had the
500 um, big van out there, and then the, you know, the, the other vehicle with the, the Jeep
501 Cherokee, if y'all saw it. You know those are the different aspects that we've added to, to our
502 fleet to, to look at, you know, air monitoring at a mobile level. So, so those vehicles, you know,
503 can look at, you know, targets that are in the area and chemicals of concern in kind of real time
504 through that equipment. So, if everybody saw the Jeep, it's kind of, you know, has, um, a UV
505 you know, a ray that they can look at volatiles that kind of pinpoint and drill down into the
506 volatile organics, like, ah, benzene, ethylbenzene, toluene, you know, different, different
507 aspects like that. So, we have one here in the region, and, and it can be deployed at any time.
508 And then there was a picture that, if y'all didn't see it out there, and then kind of what it does.
509 So it has that UV spectrum, and it's looking for the target chemicals, you know, of that incident,
510 or if we're doing reconnaissance, surveillance, surveys, any type of, you know, review of
511 industry and also, in-community monitoring. So, it's doing that, that real time, you know,
512 review, and it's picking up or not picking up, you know, benzene at the parts per billion, and
513 it'll show like a little kind of what we call, caterpillar trail, and they'll just drive and then start
514 taking the survey through that. And it'll drive through community neighborhoods, and, and you
515 know, collect that data. And you can see it, you know, kind of moving where the vehicle is, is
516 real time surveying, you know, for those analytes. And it will go through, you know, the
517 community in question or, or if we're looking at, kind of an incident we're looking down wind,
518 we're looking equal distance to, you know, what the weather is like, what the wind patterns are
519 like, and then we're going to focus to ensure that the community, you know, has that
520 protection. So, one other thing that, that we do, you know, through the state of Texas is, you
521 know, we have that Disaster Response Strike Team. So, me as a member of the Disaster
522 Response Strike Team, if any other region, you know - kind of like Anita was saying 16 regions
523 for the state of Texas - and anybody else needs help, then you know we're all specialized in all
524 different aspects, and we can go help out in any region through this, through the Disaster
525 Response Strike Team. So, like we're saying, we're all multimedia investigators, you know I can
526 plug in and plug, you know, at any incident that, ah, that I'm called upon or, or need, need that
527 assistance, and you know, we can do any area monitoring, water monitoring, or, or waste
528 analysis sampling. And, you know, kind of what it does for us is we have specialized individuals
529 throughout the state, so if we have something that, you know, we need assistance on, or, or
530 backup then we can just call them in and they can, you know, fulfill that, and plug right in. And
531 then also, as we have prolonged incidents, then we have another team that would come in and
532 do the same thing just so we can get a little rest, and then get back to the, to the incident. So, as
533 we talked about air reconnaissance, you know the things that we do is um we have, established
534 areas, you know, throughout, throughout our region that we'll do um, air monitoring with the,
535 the rapid assessment vehicles. We'll do area monitoring with handheld monitors, kind of like
536 the ones you saw at the emergency response table. And we're just kind of doing that review of,
537 a little, you know, the the fence line of facilities and, you know, additionally community
538 monitoring to see if any of these industries are affecting. And then at that point, you know it

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

539 gives us information to, to go knock on the door to start seeing if we see a pattern, you know,
540 for any of that reconnaissance that we're doing in different areas. And this is just kind of like,
541 you know, if you're driving around and you're seeing a truck and an individual, that's kind of
542 what they're doing. There're either doing air reconnaissance, or they're doing community
543 monitoring, if, if anything is happening, and you can just see these individuals anytime of the
544 day. And as we talked about, you know, handheld monitoring and sample collection, you know,
545 we're all, we're all trained and, you know, we're we have all the equipment at hand when we go
546 out on complaints, investigations, or any type reconnaissance to do kind of an array of
547 sampling or monitoring. And kind of what we do is we're going that information to verify, you
548 know, compliance with the rules and regulations or compliance with their permits that they've
549 received. And, you know, just to drill down a little bit more, you know, we do water parameters,
550 um 'inaudible', total suspended solids, PH and those, those are all different things that, you
551 know, we can do, you know, surface water, you know, water that comes out of fire hydrants,
552 anything that's, you know, within that water collection system, or discharge system, you know,
553 we have the availability to take those, those samples or screening parameters. And this is just
554 kind of, ah, you know, just some pictures of individuals out in the field taking samples, in the
555 ditch or taking um, you know, drinking water samples, or chlorine residual. And then we also
556 have, you know, different specialized, specialized equipment that deal with, ah, landfills. You
557 know, we can do, um, surface surveys, um, leaching collection system surveys, and, ah you
558 know, the gas collection systems. You know, we all have that type of equipment. And then if
559 y'all saw the um, if y'all went by the optical gas imaging camera, you saw the capabilities of
560 that. So just to kind of show you, yeah we have the landfill gas monitor, kind of in the corner,
561 the toxic vapor analyzer. And then you can see the, the optical imaging, where you have the
562 tank battery, and then you can, I don't know if you can see the color, where you'll see the levels
563 within that tank and then you can also check the emission points from, from those ah, stacks as
564 well. And then we have, you know, just individually doing a reconnaissance or a survey with um
565 the multi-ray and the area-ray at that given point. And it, you know, just gives us a little more,
566 you know, information that we can, you, know support our documentation with investigations
567 or complaints. So, if everybody saw the cool display with the optical gas camera, you know, it's
568 pretty amazing where, you know, it looks at the, you know, the source for, for the hydrocarbons
569 so you can see, you know, if valves are leaking or they didn't close it properly or if there's
570 some, you know, pipe thread or, or where that junction is that it may be leaking, you can, it may
571 be not be seen for the eye itself, but then once you put that camera on there, you can definitely
572 see that movement. And that's kind of the one y'all saw on the table. And, you know for, for
573 information that, that we have on our website, you know, as, as you go on to the, the website
574 where it's TCEQ.texas.gov, you'll see the tab on the left hand side where if anything's happening
575 within the state of Texas, that, you know, that we're responding to or have our attention on the
576 emergency response side, that tab will light up and move over. So, these are kind of just some
577 examples where, you know, we had Hurricane Laura or the City of Lake Jackson incidents, or
578 the ITC terminal fire, that that tab would light up. You can click on it, it'll take you to the
579 specific page, and it'll give you every information that you'll need, you know, for that incident.
580 So, kind of at that point, you know, we have our, our Title 6 information, and we'll be around
581 and I'll turn it over, and you know we'll get to the next step.

582 Audible clapping

583 **Laurie Gharis:** So, thank you for the presentations. Hopefully that was helpful, and now it's
584 your turn. We want to hear you from you. If you are interested in asking questions that from
585 what you've heard tonight or questions, other questions we invite you to go ahead and come up
586 to the microphone, and, um, the floor is yours.

587 **Azul:** Hi, I can start us off if that's ok? Um so my name is Azul, and I just feel like it was a lot of
588 information presented, which is great, but um think it's important to acknowledge other
589 people's learning styles. Um, ok let me get my thoughts together. So, I think overall one thing
590 that I want to ask is specific about complaints, and how communities are being engaged
591 intentionally. So, is there data collected about the amount of complaints in each community?

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

592 Um, and is there an assessment made to ensure equitable community engagement is being
593 done? And are there community liaisons?

594 **Laurie Gharis:** OK, go ahead. I think Anita is ready to answer that question about complaints.

595 **Anita Keese:** I think that is such a good question. And an important one. Um, it gets me
596 thinking about all the things we could be doing a little better. Um, but we do have an annual
597 enforcement report. We do track complaints very closely. We produce that information and
598 provide it publicly. It doesn't get down to the community level, it gets down to the region level.
599 Um, I do know that our regional offices do make attempts to reach out to the community. They
600 live in those communities. They go to public events and have outreach events as well. I think we
601 could do more. Like I think this is important to hear, because I really wish we could do more,
602 and we probably should put more focus on doing it more. But I wanted to ask you, when you do
603 say community do you mean, like neighborhood to neighborhood?

604 **Azul:** Yeah, definitely. Each neighborhood has its own specific needs, its own barriers to access
605 this information, so I think being able to utilize your resource as a state organization and the
606 network of partnerships, they all do have to be able to provide, um, kind of like, a plan ah
607 community by community to just make sure people show up and are aware of, you know, the
608 things that could impact them and their quality of life overall.

609 **Anita Keese:** Yeah, that's some really good feedback. Yeah, I think we need to take that back
610 and really think about how we do that better.

611 **Azul:** And I think the community liaison roles would serve the agency well. Um, I don't want to
612 take up too much space, but I have a couple more questions that I would like to ask? Um, and
613 this was in regards to a corporation making, um, an application for their permit. I don't think it
614 was clear about the format and time window to notify that community. So, what are the
615 specifics of that?

616 **Laurie Gharis:** Amy is going to go ahead and answer that.

617 **Amy Browning:** Um, so that can be different, for different types of permits. And again, we
618 don't have time today to go into every specifics for every type of permit. But, generally
619 speaking, speaking again kind of generally, for the first notice, the notice, ah, the NORI, the
620 Notice of Receipt of Intent to Obtain um a permit. When that notice comes out, that that notice,
621 generally speaking, goes out when we receive permit applications, and those permit
622 applications are what we call administratively complete. So, they're ready for the permit
623 reviewer to start reviewing the permit, right? To make sure that it, that it meets all of the
624 necessary requirements and it's protective of human health and the environment. Speaking
625 generally, there's generally a 30-day comment period on the NORI. And then for, ah types of
626 applications that require a second comment period, the NAPD, the Notice of Application and
627 Preliminary Decision, um, then again you would have a, again, generally speaking, another 30-
628 day comment period. There are types of applications where you might have a consolidated
629 noticed, so you might only have one 30-day comment period. There are some types of
630 applications, for example, some types of renewals of applications, where there is no actual
631 change in what the, um, what the company is going to do, but some of those have 15-day
632 notices periods. So again, we're speaking kind of in some, some broad generalities. But the
633 notice itself will tell you how many days you have to comment on the permit application, and
634 again, generally speaking, that runs from the date that the notice is published in the newspaper.

635 **Azul?:** Is there like, um, I guess like a network of partners that you reach out to, to distribute
636 the notice that they can, then share with their respected communities that they serve?

637 **Amy Browning:** So most notices, um, they have a newspaper ah publication requirement, and
638 then they're also posted on the Commissioners Integrated Database; and for permit
639 applications that are subject to Chapter 39, that were administratively complete on or after May
640 1st 2022, we also have a new page, um, that's, we have an index page, then it's, then it's, ah,

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

641 separated out into the different media, where those notices are posted both the NORIs, the
642 NAPDs, and also the plain language summaries for those particular permit applications.

643 **Azul:** And how is it, is it language inclusive? And if so, what does it look like?

644 **Amy Browning:** Yes. So, that we have alternative language requirements Chapter 39, and if
645 they, if the applicant is required to meet those alternative language requirements, then that
646 alternative language publication is also included in the posting, and it would be included in the
647 package that's mailed out to the mailing list. And again, to get on the mailing list, you tell the
648 Chief Clerk you want to be on the mailing list either for a particular permit number or for the
649 county. Now if you select the County, you will get all the applications for the whole county.
650 Which in a county like Harris, that can be a lot. Um, but those notices are also mailed to the
651 mailing list.

652 **Azul:** But shouldn't like if we live in a hyper-diverse, like popular community like Houston
653 shouldn't everything be language inclusive regardless of the application?

654 **Amy Browning:** So, there are, there are requirements in our rules that list when an alternative
655 language notice is required.

656 **Azul:** Okay.

657 **Laurie Gharis:** So, go ahead and ask one more question, and then we'll give the people behind
658 you an opportunity and then you can come back again if you would like?

659 **Azul:** Sorry about that, I just got so excited to just ask stuff.

660 **Laurie Gharis:** No, no that's ok. Good questions.

661 **Azul:** Um, so there was mention of public comments on the commissions website. Um, can we
662 see what other people are saying?

663 **Amy Browning:** Yes. Those comments are posted. People that submit formal comments, those
664 comments are also posted on the Commissioners Integrated Database on the permit
665 application.

666 **Azul:** Awesome. Thank you for your time.

667 **Laurie Gharis:** Okay, thank you.

668 **Deborah Walker:** Good evening. My name is Deborah Walker, and I'm president of Sunnyside
669 Community Redevelopment Organization, and I want to post this question to Holly and the
670 gentleman next to Holly, you was talking to you all about the air quality, and ah you were
671 showing on the computer the, ah, sites where all the monitors live. But we have, ah, Sunnyside
672 have a, um, um air monitor network in Sunnyside, and we, I didn't see any of those on that, on
673 those nodes on there. So, do y'all see other nodes, or y'all just only work focus on the TCEQ
674 nodes? Cause we on the City of Houston, um, dashboard ah, but we don't, I didn't see us in that
675 Sunnyside area.

676 **Holly Landuyt:** Right, so what we're posting on our Ambient Air Monitoring Network are, um,
677 the monitors that the TCEQ, um, is directly involved with, and then some of our sponsors; and I
678 kind of mention that earlier that we partner with um local government, we partner with
679 universities, we partner with some, um industry as well, and we post that data in addition to
680 ours on the TCEQ webpage. Now, some of the community-based monitors is not the kind of
681 data that we host on our webpage.

682 **Deborah Walter:** Okay.

683 **Holly Landuyt:** Most of the data that we are hosting um, goes back to those Federal
684 requirements, and remember when I said that the code of Federal regulations kind of dictates
685 the monitoring and the types of monitors, so those are more of what you're going to see on the

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

686 TCEQ Ambient Air Monitoring webpage. In addition to those state initiative monitors, which I
687 mentioned as well, like the volatile organic compounds and hydrogen sulfide.

688 **Deborah Walter:** Okay.

689 **Doug Boyer:** And, I follow up there just in terms of how we interpret other sources of air
690 quality data. So, when we're trying to look at our air quality plans, we're going to, um, look for
691 other sources of data, and those could be sensors within community networks, it could be
692 satellite data, it could be a lot of different things. And so, um, you know, I was grateful that you
693 came up and talked to us earlier, and so I've written down your information and going to look
694 to see what, what type of data is collected through your monitoring network and see if that
695 would be beneficial to some of our analyses.

696 **Deborah Walker:** Okay, that's good to know. And the next one, I think I mentioned this to you
697 Holly, but um, how could we get, um, put in for a regulatory monitoring in Sunnyside? I know
698 you told me, it's very expensive and everything, but I do believe we do need that in, ah,
699 Sunnyside to deal with what all the criteria that's out there. We don't know what all air
700 pollutants criteria is out there but, I think we do need one. Which one, one which was
701 supposedly designated to Sunnyside, but it never, it went, it ain't go to Sunnyside. They sent it
702 to Midtown. So, but we were like for our regulatory monitor be put in Sunnyside.

703 **Holly Landuyt:** Okay, so um I can appreciate that. Um, there's a couple of ways that, that we
704 would recommend that you, um kind of start that process, and the first thing can be um,
705 commenting on our Annual Monitoring Network Plan. And that's the plan that we present to the
706 public on an annual basis for 30 days. And um we put it out for public comment, and then, um,
707 we, ah, summary the comments and respond to the comments and attach the comments to the
708 finally document that we submit to the EPA on July 1st. So, typically that document goes out
709 for public comment about mid-April. Um, it's posted on the TCEQ website, under the spotlight
710 and if you sign up for Ambient Air Monitoring Announcements under the, um, on the first page
711 it says sign up for updates, ah you can also get a notice email of when that is posted.

712 **Deborah Walker:** Okay.

713 **Holly Landuyt:** So, that's a good first step. Um, something else that we recommend is, you
714 know, you can reach out to your council members, your representatives, your senator, and
715 those type of methods as well.

716 **Deborah Walter:** Okay. Thank you.

717 **Gisele:** Um, hi, I'm Gisele. I'm just a resident of Houston. Um, this question is relevant to, um,
718 your public involvement plan that you um very briefly touched on in the beginning of the
719 meeting, and it's sort of a loaded question, but it's just, um like, a thought. So, you emphasized
720 the modernization of imputing environmental complaints on iPhones and online, as well as new
721 technology being used to check the air quality, um, but a lot of the communities are in dire
722 need of these tools don't really have that much access to technology. So, how do you plan to
723 educate them on these resources and give them equal access?

724 **Amy Browning:** Um, so, you know, we are constantly looking at ways to make sure that we are
725 reaching out to communities and, you know, we, we are, you know, right now working on, ah,
726 improving those methods like you talked about, and it's, um, it's kind of an ongoing process.
727 Ah and that's, I understand that might not be an entirely satisfactory answer, but, um, that's
728 something that we are working on.

729 **Laurie Gharis:** Okay, can I, I want to just add that, um, for tonight's meeting we sent out 4000
730 postcards in both English and Spanish, so that we are, we're hoping that, ah, by getting that
731 information and being here with you, in, in person tonight, um, that we're making some of
732 those connections.

733 **Gisele:** That's great. Um, thank you for that. Um, so this is still relevant, um, and also still kind
734 of a loaded question, well, how many people typically attend your NORI meetings?

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

735 **Amy Browning:** Ha, ha, um so, I think Laurie might be better able to answer that.

736 **Laurie Gharis:** Yes.

737 **Amy Browning:** But I don't know that there's a typical answer.

738 **Laurie Gharis:** I think it's very much dependent on what type of permit it is and, and whether
739 the community is, is gathering support to attend those public meetings. Sometimes, we have
740 public meetings that are required were zero people attend, and sometimes we have public
741 meetings with well over 100 and sometimes over 200 or 300 people, and it's, it's just dependent
742 on whether that community, um, knows about that permit and has come in. Um, or if, um, if
743 applicant has potentially already met with the community, then they may, then the public
744 meeting may not have as many people because that applicant's already met with the
745 community.

746 **Gisele:** Okay, um so beyond your translations and, you know, your mapping of these
747 underserving, underserved communities in your public involvement plan, so how are you going
748 to be able to measure the involvement of these communities in your public notice hearings?
749 How will you be held accountable for that? Are you tracking the amount of underserved
750 communities involved in your hearings?

751 **Laurie Gharis:** Well, I would say that, I think this is a partnership too by, by I know that we
752 have, ah people who support and, um, represent their communities, and, um, it's good for us to
753 hear from you. And so we do, we do, um, follow our regulations, and Amy can talk more about
754 that, um, but and if we, we um usually we have a number on our notices where if you need
755 special, something special to help participate that you can call that, that number so that we can
756 try to accommodate. Um, but we're here, we want to work with you, and if, if, if people let us
757 know those opportunities are what they need, then we're going to do our best to, to work with
758 you and to support you.

759 **Gisele:** Yeah, thank you, and I think a lot of that comes with the community outreach aspects,
760 cause it's very hard to contest an opposition hearing if nobody shows up to NORI meetings and
761 much less, um, the underserved communities that are being directly impacted by these
762 industries so, thank you.

763 **Laurie Gharis:** Thank you. Good questions.

764 **Yvette Arellano:** Good afternoon. My name's Yvette Arellano, and I'm a community member in
765 Magnolia Park, but I'm also the founder and director of Fenceline Watch, an EJO, an
766 Environmental Justice Organization based here in the East End. Ah, first want to thank you for
767 providing the translation services to us today and to, um, Ms. Amy Browning, thank you for
768 always yourself readily accessible. Ah, I can't quite say that about every division within the
769 TCEQ, and I hope that this improves. My comments are on the complaint form. On your website
770 you have a complaint form. It's a little under 200 words, and it's in all English. I know you have
771 quejas at TCEQ.texas.gov and, ah, the complaints email, too. But knowing that you have an
772 English resource and you're working on translation and interpretation services, is TCEQ looking
773 to translate that portal, that is under 200 words, that for now over a year community
774 organizations like myself, and Fenceline Watch have requested this form be translated that is
775 under 200 words?

776 **Laurie Gharis:** So, if we want to hand the mic down to Anita.

777 **Anita Keese:** Yes, we hope to have that already in place today. And we've been working on it.
778 My, my partner in crime's over here in the corner. So, yes. We, we have purchased software, or
779 we're at the very end stages of purchasing the software to make that happen. Yes, it's, it's taken
780 awhile, but we know it's very important to happen. I do want to describe what it's going to look
781 like, because it really is, it's going to have a different look and feel than what we have now, ah
782 where, it - your going to be able to say, I want to complete this information in Spanish. The
783 questions will be in Spanish, the responses will be in Spanish, and then that gives us an

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

784 indication that whoever calls you back, the investigator who calls you back to discuss your
785 complain, should be able to speak to that complaintant in Spanish as well. So, we really wanted
786 to get this out already. I, my goodness we were gunning to get this done by today, but, yes, it'll
787 be on the horizon, right around the corner. We have people just waiting to get their hands on
788 that software to get it, get it all built. We're also going to be having it in Vietnamese and
789 Mandarin following, and then we're exploring other languages as well.

790 **Yvette Arellano:** Being that it's been over a year we've had this request onboard, do you have a
791 timeline for when that's going to go into effect? End of this year, beginning of next year?

792 **Anita Keese:** We're expecting it at the end of the month.

793 **Yvette Arellano:** Okay. My follow up question is, continues to be with the complaints form.
794 Now, when we call into TCEQ, like today, there's an odor event, and folks who came to this
795 event I'm sure smelt it. Um, whenever we call the complaints form, complaints and the air
796 division shoots us over to Harris County or the City. And I know you said you work with other
797 municipalities on trying to gather these complaints. When we're ushered away from TCEQ and
798 over to the City, and we file that complaint, is that complaint also being logged with the TCEQ?
799 Or do we have to request it to be logged with TCEQ, and then also 'inaudible' the city?

800 **Anita Keese:** So, historically we've had a process, of if we receive a complaint in the regional
801 office and it's not our jurisdiction, but you're right the locals share authority with us. So, you
802 have a strong environmental program within the local counties and cities, we're likely going to
803 refer that to them. They're, they're, they're overseeing the same set of rules that we are, right.
804 They have taken authority over, whether it's the county, or whether it's the city, they have taken
805 authority, um, to oversee the program there, right. We haven't traditionally documented every
806 one of those situations, and it's been a concern of mine, because I really want to have a record
807 of that, because of these questions that we get exactly like yours that there's a concern, that,
808 um, is it passing, you know, did we receive the complaint, do you have a record of receiving the
809 complaint, was it indeed forwarded to the local county, um so that we can prove it up, right. We
810 don't want this to be a casual activity, we want every step of that process documented.

811 **Yvette Arellano:** Yeah, and the reason why I ask that is because the TCEQ also gives
812 Environmental Stewardship Awards. So, if there's no track record from us being told, go call the
813 city or go call the county, and we're complaining, as we should too bad neighbors, and the
814 TCEQ continues to give out Environmental Stewardship Awards, then you don't have the proper
815 information. And so your painting the facility that could potentially be a repeat offender as an
816 environmental hero, because they don't have any complaints against them. Um, how does the
817 TCEQ, does the TCEQ use the complaints page to evaluate for that award?

818 **Anita Keese:** I think that is a really good question. I don't think I'm the correct person to ask
819 about the Environmental Excellence Awards. Um but I just, I just know that the new complaint
820 process will document every time we would get a complaint, even if it's referred to the local
821 jurisdiction. So, we will have a record of it that we can refer back to. Which is probably a nice
822 suggestion to, now that we have that information, if you file your complaint online, but it's just
823 being incredibly common now where folks are using our online portal to file complaints. It
824 wasn't even used that much five years ago, but now as you might expect the way we are, more
825 and more people are using that portal to file complaints. So now we will have a record.

826 **Laurie Gharis:** I don't know if anybody else, um I'm sorry.

827 **Yvette Arellano:** I have one more question and one comment, and I'm done. Um, my follow up
828 question is with, ah, the NAPD, ah sorry, the NORI process. So you said that there are two times
829 that there's a notice. The first time is with notice of intent, and the second one is the draft
830 permit or the draft decision. Currently the public only has the ability to comment on NAPD, the
831 second notice, is that correct?

832 **Amy Browning:** Um, No.

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

833 **Yvette Arellano:** Okay. How can we get engaged in commenting on the NORI? And if we
834 comment on NORI, do we also get response?

835 **Amy Browning:** So, all timely response, all timely filed comments are responded to in the
836 formal, ah, response to comments. And so, yes, you can submit comments on the NORI, the
837 same way you do on the NAPD, and that those comments are, um, included and considered and
838 answered.

839 **Yvette Arellano:** Thank you, Ms Browning. And then my last is a comment. So, I've been to, ah,
840 permit hearings by the TCEQ, and one of my concerns is that the technical review piece also has
841 a description of our communities that are impacted by the permits. And so many times we get
842 zoned, or, ah, designated as an 'industrial zone' or 'industrial area'. Acknowledging that
843 Houston doesn't have any zoning, with a description that technical provides, I have asked how
844 do you come to the description of saying that X community has three churches and two schools
845 that will be affected when your current technical team uses Google Maps to identify community
846 points of interest. Is TCEQ looking to have more in person, sort of going down into the
847 community, driving around and identifying these sites, because so many times a community
848 can have many churches and many daycares that don't show up on Google Maps?

849 **Amy Browning:** I don't think any of us here today would have an answer for that.

850 **Yvette Arellano:** Okay.

851 **Amy Browning:** But, thank you for rising the concern.

852 **Yvette Arellano:** And I just wanted to, once again, thank you for the translation serves and just,
853 um, leave with a can you quickly describe your Office of Public Interest for those of us who
854 aren't aware of what the Office of Public Interest does, thank you?

855 **Amy Browning:** Um, yes, so you did, ah the Office of Public Interest Council, ah, they are a
856 separate, um, separate office within the agency, and they represent the public interest. That's,
857 that's what they do generally speaking.

858 **Laurie Gharis:** And, we have a representative in the back. He might stand up or come up if he
859 would like to come up. So, if you have any questions, he's in the back.

860 **Priscilla:** Hi good evening. My name is Priscilla. I'm here representing the Super Neighborhoods
861 65 and 82, which includes Magnolia Park, Manchester, Smith Addition, and Harrisburg, which is
862 77011 and 77012 Zip Codes, which is this community here. Um I have, um I was following
863 through the, um, the slide show, about, um, how we can access information on the monitors.
864 And so just using my mobile phone, the Tamy, what's it called, the TAMI, TAMIS was offline,
865 and said it was offline for about 4 days or 2 days. How often does that happen? And um what
866 steps are taken, you know, to um, cover, while it's down for maintenance? And how often does
867 that happen is more important, my more important question?

868 **Holly Landuyt:** So, I'm not officially apart of the data group that manages that system, but I do
869 know that they have software upgrades from time to time that do require the system to be
870 down. And that actually TCEQ, in general, have a server upgrade not too long ago that required
871 the whole server for everything to be down for a few days over a weekend. So, it may be one of
872 those situations that you were experiencing. It does not happen very often.

873 **Priscilla:** Okay.

874 **Holly Landuyt:** Um, and I access the data all the time, in my job.

875 **Priscilla:** Sure

876 **Holly Landuyt:** So, it's very infrequent, usually with a software upgrade.

877 **Priscilla:** Okay, um. So, are those times, or those windows documented and what is done to fill
878 those gaps when things are not being monitored because it's being maintained?

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

879 **Holly Landuyt:** Oh, okay. I will clarify, that just because you can't access the data, um, because
880 TAMIS may be down, or the server is down, it doesn't mean our air monitors have stopped
881 monitoring.

882 **Priscilla:** Oh, okay.

883 **Holly Landuyt:** So, our air monitors are active 24 hours a day, in their air monitoring sites. And
884 we have a data logger that will be collecting the data, even if it's not communicating the data
885 through a modem to our, to our server. And they back fill that information.

886 **Priscilla:** Great, thank you. And the again I guess my second question.

887 **Laurie Gharis:** Just, just one second, um it is now 8 o'clock and we have told the school system
888 that we will be out by 8:30, so, um, wrap up your question, and we'll try to get another question
889 from each in line, but we will have to be out of here um by 8.30 as we've promised the school
890 system.

891 **Priscilla:** Um, so my second part is I heard a few times mentioning the gap between community
892 getting information and you all posting meeting information, um, because where I'm active with
893 the civil club and civil organizations here locally, some of us are registered with the Secretary of
894 the State Office, um, for our civil clubs. That's a whole database of access information that you
895 can, I said it backwards, I'm thinking of Spanish, um that's a whole directory that you guys can
896 access to have more information about civil clubs here locally, those of us who are very
897 interested maybe we don't check, um, the website that you all post that information on. And
898 sometimes those postings are too wordy, to be honest, but anyway that is a whole database of,
899 you know, directories that you all can reference to, to civic clubs here at the civic city level I
900 guess or different I don't know, but anyway, that's it. Thank you.

901 **Laurie Gharis:** Thank you for this information. It really helps for us to hear from you, so we
902 appreciate that.

903 **Oscar Lazaro:** Hello everyone, my names Oscar Lazaro. So, I'm a community coordinator for
904 THEA or Texas Health and Environmental Alliance. Um, I'm not really speaking on their behalf
905 today, I'm speaking on behalf of, you know, my own family, my community, um, but I just
906 wanted to make sure that, um, I state this concern, so it seems like we've heard a lot about
907 translations services, translation in general. I really do appreciate that, um, that means a lot to
908 those of us who come from Spanish speaking families who've been translating, you know
909 government documents our whole lives, that's a big step. Um but I wanted to ask, um, well
910 before I get that, it seems like a lot of this process, um, for people who don't speak English, a
911 lot of the burden of communicating falls on the community itself, um, and I think that, that
912 definitely needs some work. So my question is, does the TCEQ, I know we are all in different
913 departments, and there, it's, it's a big agency, um, but generally speaking, I was wondering if
914 the TCEQ places any kind of priority on hiring people of, you know, different multilingual
915 capacities. Um, I think that's a huge step in engaging in cities like Houston. I know Texas is very
916 diverse as state. Um, I just have not seen a whole lot of stakeholder engagement in languages
917 other than English and I think that wouldn't be too much to ask. So, is that a priority?

918 **Laurie Gharis:** So, I think I can help answer a little bit on that, um although it's, it's outside of
919 the commissioner's cluster. Ah, we do have, um, um, people going into school systems trying
920 to, um, get our next generations of employees from our diverse state. And so, we, we are
921 sending people out into the different schools to try to get people interested in coming to TCEQ
922 and to, so that we look like the communities that we're supporting. Um, and then I will also
923 note from the Office of Chief Clerk, for several of my positions, I put that speaking Spanish,
924 um, or a different is preferred. And so, that gives that person a step up, um, because we do
925 want people who are able to speak multiple languages, and, and, um, we do in the Office of
926 Chief Clerk have ah an interpreter that was a previous high school Spanish teacher that works
927 just for the Office of Chief Clerk.

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

928 **Oscar Lazaro:** Okay. I know it's a work force development question, so thanks for answering
929 that.

930 **Laurie Gharis:** Thank you.

931 **Juan Paras:** Good evening, and ah, also I'm glad that you're here. Ah, my name is Juan Paras,
932 and I lived in the Houston East End. Ah, several questions and I'll be quick, and you don't have
933 to answer if you don't have time. But ah, the RNP Rules - they were very publicly available and
934 they no longer are, and we were, we are told that they don't want it public because it could give
935 information to terrorists, you know people that are terrorist and may use that information to
936 bomb the Houston ship channel. But it is very important to our communities to know how risky
937 their lives are considering that should happen, so, I think that should public information. The,
938 the other issues, is obviously ozone - we keep talking about ozone, and I think we'll continuing
939 doing that for the next five or six years because there doesn't seem to be any real initiative to
940 address that. Every time I come to public meetings the ozone standards are still under
941 noncompliance, and nobody justifies it as to why it hasn't been met. So, I don't see any, any
942 changing in the future. Ah, and I was sad hear that the enforcement actions take two to three
943 years. I mean, some of us cannot wait two to three years, especially if you die in one of those
944 incidents. So, ah that was pathetic. Do you have an Environmental Justice Policy? Ah, nobody
945 mentioned ah, environmental justice communities, which is what Manchester and a lot of
946 communities that are on the fence line, are going through. And I don't know if the state has an
947 EJ policy, but if it does not, it should have one by now. That Executive Order was passed in
948 1994. Ah, let me see here. And I have more questions, but ah I will submit 'em in writing. But
949 again, again I'm glad to see you here, but, um strongly dissatisfied with having public meetings
950 and no action taken actually from the TCEQ. And, and if, that is ah, if it's not going to happen,
951 why have public meetings, okay? Thank you for your time.

952 **Laurie Gharis:** Thank you for the information.

953 Clapping audible

954 **Laurie Gharis:** I, ah, I think, think we could, do we have any? Okay go ahead.

955 **Jennifer Hadayia:** Good evening, my name is Jennifer Hadayia, I'm Executive Director of Air
956 Alliance Houston, and I think my question's probably going to go to Amy, cause I don't believe
957 there's anyone here from permitting, if I'm correct. Right?

958 **Someone:** not up here.

959 **Jennifer Hadayia:** Okay, alright. So, um, Air Alliance Houston submits formal comments in
960 opposition to permits, and so I was thrilled to see the slide about, why you should submit
961 comments, and I've read many RTCs. More than I can count over the last year. And at the end
962 of every RTC, which is responded point by point, in detail, there's usually a line that says 'even
963 with all of the above concerns formally submitted, the Executive Director has not changed their
964 opinion about the permit application'. Can you give us some examples, criteria, of when
965 comments submitted formally by those of us in the community can change the outcome of a
966 permit application at the Executive Directors level?

967 **Amy Browning:** Ah, so I will tell you that I have seen changes made to permits in response to
968 comments, and I have seen that documented in RTCs that I have worked on. I couldn't give you
969 an example off the top of my head, I've worked on a bunch, but, I have seen it, it does happen.
970 Ah, generally it is because you have identified an issue, and when we read the comment, and we
971 look at the issues, and then we look at the condition that you might be, um, that you might
972 specifically asking about, we see that, yes, that condition needs clarification or um, there was,
973 ah, a question about perhaps um, BACT, Best Available Control Technology, if it's an air permit.
974 Um, generally I work mostly on air permits, so I couldn't say too much about waste or water,
975 but I assume that the same thing is true there. So, it would be something that is specific, that
976 when the permit reviewer and the attorney reviewing it read it say, yes, there is an issue and we
977 need to look at that, and perhaps make a change to the permit application. Um, but also by the

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

978 time you get to draft permit process, that, that application has gone through extensive review
979 to determine that it's protective of human and health, and the environment by the time it gets
980 to that point.

981 **Jennifer Hadayia:** Can I do a quick follow up?

982 **Amy Browning:** Sure.

983 **Jennifer Hadayia:** So, I under, I understand that there's been reviews by the time the public
984 comment period happens, so could the public comment period happen sooner?

985 **Amy Browning:** Well, there's the comment. You can also comment on the application, the NORI,
986 so you can, submit comments throughout.

987 **Jennifer Hadayia:** which, which we do.

988 **Amy Browning:** But again, by the time you get to commenting on the draft permit, the draft
989 permit is a result of that extensive review that has already happened.

990 **Jennifer Hadayia:** So, at the point of the NORI, what is the most efficient way for community
991 members to get access to application?

992 **Amy Browning:** So the application is posted in the public place and at the, ah regional office,
993 and at Headquarters, and that information is provided in the notice, of where, where, and I just
994 say a public place because it is different depending on where in the state you happen to be. It's
995 often a local library, for example.

996 **Jennifer Hadayia:** Mmmh

997 **Amy Browning:** Is where it's posted.

998 **Jennifer Hadayia:** Okay. So, for comments to be considered before the draft permit's
999 completely reviewed, it has to be within the NORI 30-day after access the application at a public
1000 library?

1001 **Amy Browning:** Well, I mean, I, I think that if, if you want to, if you have a comment on the
1002 NORI, then, you know, you send in those comments, but it's all part of a process. But, so I'm
1003 not...

1004 **Jennifer Hadayia:** Okay.

1005 **Amy Browning:** I wouldn't say, that that's the only time your comment is going to be
1006 considered. Comments you submit on an application are considered when we review them
1007 when we draft the RTC.

1008 **Jennifer Hadayia:** Okay, alright. Thank you.

1009 **Shiv Srivastava:** Hello everybody. My name is Shiv Srivastava. I'm the policy researcher at
1010 Fenceline Watch. Ah, I'd like to take this moment to thank you guys for holding this meeting
1011 and realizing that y'all are real, and not just in a Zoom window. Um, so, ah, I have some quick
1012 questions, being mindful of time, and some comments. Um, firstly I was wondering what
1013 alterations or adjustments will TCEQ be making to, um, the attainment determination or the
1014 reasonable further progress, SIP, um as far as, how this is conducted? Um, in about six days,
1015 where going to be officially redesignated, um, as nonattainment for the 2008 and 2015, um,
1016 NAX ozone standards. Um, the request for extension by TCEQ was denied, by US EPA. Um, for
1017 each one, for the 2008 and the 2015 standard, several deadlines have been requested, some
1018 granted, some not granted. But, the modelling the TCEQ continues to put forward continues to
1019 fail each time to actually account for what's going on. TCEQ contends that, there's actually a
1020 downward trend in ozone. But despite this, they keep asking for one-year extensions, using
1021 photo chemical modelling and using weight of evidence, and RACT, and the other, ah, ah
1022 criteria, but it continually fails to actually see where things are heading. And so we continue to

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

1023 be noncompliant. So, is TCEQ considering changing the manner in which they conduct this, so
1024 that they can get a more accurate read on what's actually going on in our community?

1025 **Doug Boyer:** Thanks for your ah, comment, and I'm going to try and address the, the question I
1026 guess in a couple of ways. So, you're right we're going to start the new processes for the
1027 attainment demonstrations and RNP for both standards and, um at that point we have to follow
1028 the, the Clean Air Act and the guidance that that's set forth, right. So we have some processes
1029 that we have to go forward and do. Um, the agency's going to be evaluating the data that's there
1030 and trying to understand what's keeping the area in, in nonattainment to, to develop these
1031 plans that are coming. Um, you know we, we've, I want say we're conducting a lot of research to
1032 try and understand this problem as well. The agency was just involved in a, ah, air quality field
1033 campaign in the Houston area over the past two summers, to try and collect a lot more data to
1034 help us inform our plans more. Um, so we're going to try and take that with a lot of other
1035 information to bring forth the, the best plan that we can. I can't say specifically what's going to
1036 happen yet, you know, we're still trying to see what we can do.

1037 **Shiv Srivastava:** Okay. Um, kind of a follow up to that, um, as far as the 2015 standard with the
1038 ozone transport rule, kind of the good neighbor rule, will TCEQ be using the ah, four step
1039 framework put forth by the EPA, or are they going to continue to use the three step framework
1040 the TCEQ came up with?

1041 **Doug Boyer:** Um, I guess I don't know how, how things are going to progress with that, um,
1042 moving forward, so I don't have specific answer to that.

1043 **Shiv Srivastava:** Okay, um. Just two more really quick questions.

1044 **Laurie Gharis:** Wait, um, ah we, we have to finish. Like I said we have to be out of here by 8:30,
1045 and we have, and we're already 15 minutes over.

1046 **Shiv Srivastava:** Got it.

1047 **Laurie Gharis:** So, it's got to be a quick one, so I can get one question from each of the people
1048 behind you.

1049 **Shiv Srivastava:** Got it. Alright, so I will be brief, and this one is for you Amy, again, nice to see
1050 you in person. Um, so really quickly, um, I know that plain language summary seems to be kind
1051 of rolling out now, I know May 1st, 2022, um, you know the new rules kind of went into place.
1052 Ah, with the plain language, um, summary I kind of would like a little bit of clarity. So I know
1053 it's part of the public input process, the public input plan within the public participation plan,
1054 like the pip inside of the PPP.

1055 **Amy Browning:** Okay, so the, the yes. So, the plain language, there's a plain language summary
1056 that's a requirement of Chapter 39 for permit applicants that are subject to Chapter 39. That
1057 plain language summary is posted on our new notice website, along with the NORIs and the
1058 NAPDs, for each of the media. The public involvement plan, which is, um, something that's a
1059 subset of the public participation plan, um, we rolled out the form for applicants for that, um, a
1060 couple of weeks ago for them to start, start using. Um, and for applicants that may not be
1061 subject to Chapter 39, then they would have to come up with a plain language summary, but for
1062 applicants that are already subject to Chapter 39, they can use the plain language summary that
1063 they've already prepared.

1064 **Shiv Srivastava:** Okay, so just really quick. So, that portion would be for those that aren't
1065 actually cover by TAC 39, specifically.

1066 **Amy Browning:** Yeah, yeah.

1067 **Shiv Srivastava:** Okay, thank you. Appreciate it.

1068 **Genesis Granados:** Hello, I'm Genesis Granados. I'm a resident of the Second Ward and also the
1069 Environmental Justice Coordinator for Air Alliance Houston. And, I'm also going to be also
1070 asking about language access, as many other folks. As you can see it's actually a big issue in the

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

1071 work that we do. So, are you going to hold non-English speaking meeting in the future? We are
1072 thankful for interpretation, but just having interpretation present does not mean that the TCEQ
1073 is actually doing intentional language justice work and inclusion as well. Um, if the expectation
1074 is for the audience to be the only ones using equipments, that's not really inclusion. Um, you as
1075 presenters should also be using equipment. We only have English speakers, where are our
1076 Spanish speakers?

1077 **Laurie Gharis:** That's a good question, and if people have their, want to ask their questions in
1078 Spanish our interpreters will put, will say it um, will interpret for us. So, that they, anyone who
1079 wants to speak in Spanish, may speak in Spanish and the interpreters will interpret it and um
1080 so, and then we will answer back and the interpreters will, will interpret that. So, I know it's not
1081 always ideal, um, but that way, English or Spanish you hear. I don't if that, that helps answer
1082 some of your question.

1083 **Genesis Granados:** Um, it answers the fact that language seems to not be a priority for y'all
1084 considering that Houston is one of the most diverse cities and the fact that language seems to
1085 be always a constant issue. Just really shows that, you're not really putting the effort to connect
1086 with those communities. Thank you.

1087 **Laurie Gharis:** Thank you.

1088 **Ana Parras:** Guess I'm the last one huh?

1089 **Laurie Gharis:** But not the least.

1090 **Ana Parras:** Yeah. Um, good evening and thank you. I thank everyone here in attendance. Um,
1091 my name is Ana Parras. I'm the co-director of Texas Environmental Justice Advocacy Services.
1092 Ah, we have been doing this work in the community for about 30 years, and it's always fallen
1093 on communities to do translations, do the mailouts, and um we're glad this is happening, but
1094 um, and everybody's commented on pretty much every question I was going to ask. The
1095 opportunities for public involvement and it for being meaningful, will there be any technical
1096 assistance, ah, given to communities that are, well we've already had the comment, ah, they do
1097 much have the means to computers, ah, and, and that is an issue that we have in our
1098 communities, and particularly here in this area. Ah, I'm, I'm, we can advocate for this, we can
1099 try and, and come out with computers, but it is left to partners, and you refer to us as partners,
1100 and we've been here. Um, is there going to be any technically assistance for these communities
1101 to get maybe one or two laptops or something for them to start learning how to do this. And,
1102 also your air quality data - the ah, it should be accessible and easy. It's, it's very difficult, even
1103 for some folks that this is what we do, is try and follow. But it's, it's still not enough. It's a very
1104 complicated database, and it isn't enough. So, if ah, that's my question, and ah, I had a question
1105 on the ah, the complaint form that somebody else raised already, and you kindly answered the
1106 question that it's coming in a month, and I appreciate that. But, I think the state needs to do
1107 more. They need to do more for these communities on the fence line that have been suffering
1108 for a long time, and it's left to us, community organizations, schools, and everybody else here,
1109 to be doing the work that you should have been doing a long time ago. Thank you.

1110 **Laurie Gharis:** Thank you. So,

1111 Clapping audible.

1112 **Laurie Gharis:** We're at 8:21, one minute and then no more. We can't do anymore. So, there is
1113 one lady behind, and, ah, thank you Ms Parras. Um, and, and these are really great comments. I
1114 like the community liaisons, the ability to have, have computers in the community to get that
1115 technical assistance. We're listening, and, um, we'll bring it back to, to our offices, we'll see
1116 what we can do. It's um, I will say that...

1117 **Amy Browning:** I would just mention to, um, just to mention, EPA is putting a lot of things out
1118 there, too, that you might look at, and they are specifically putting grant opportunities and
1119 things out there for communities.

STAKEHOLDER MEETING
NOVEMBER 1ST 2022

1120 **Laurie Gharis:** So, this has to be, I'm sorry for the, the gentleman that has stood up, this has to
1121 be the last person. We can't have any more after this.

1122 **Amy Lagos** I will be very quick. So, mine is just a comment. I feel like, ah, my name is Amy
1123 Lagos. I am an educator and a resident of the east end of Houston. Um, I think it's very unfair
1124 for you to have, like that amount time with people sitting outside, just like talking to people
1125 and having us wait until 6:30 for you to rush us at the last moment, because you know that it's,
1126 you have a limited amount of time here. And so, I think that this should be put first. You
1127 should have your information first, and then your comments, and then afterwards if people
1128 want to talk to experts, then they can go and do so afterwards. But I think that it's very rude for
1129 you to, ah, cut the community short on things that should be important to y'all. We're trying to
1130 give you our comments. We're trying to give you our feedback, and I think it's very rude, um, to
1131 have all that time wasted in the beginning, when you could have left that at the end, and ah
1132 have enough time for everybody to ask the questions that they needed to ask. So, maybe try to
1133 readjust it for next time so the community can be heard.

1134 **Laurie Gharis:** Thank you. I, I understand that.

1135 Clapping audible

1136 **Laurie Gharis:** Um, so I'm sorry we have to stop. We do have to stop it, and

1137 **Gentleman:** Okay.

1138 **Laurie Gharis:** If you want to speak to one of the people afterwards.

1139 **Gentleman:** Speaking in Spanish.

1140 **Ms. Dimassi:** We're going to take all your comments, but it'll just make us late, ok?

1141 **Gentleman:** Speaking in Spanish.

1142 **Ms. Dimassi:** So that they understand what's going on.

1143 **Gentleman:** Speaking in Spanish.

1144 **Translator:** So, what I would like to see is not only you guys, but a member of the community
1145 here, um, talking about the complaints and the comments that they've received and also
1146 representing, um, the community from the complaints that you've previously received.

1147 **Gentleman:** speaking Spanish.

1148 **Translator:** Thank you for your time, and I would like to see more representation for my
1149 community up here with you guys. Thank you.

1150 Clapping audible

1151 **Laurie Gharis:** Thank you. Okay, I want to thank you for coming out. Um, this isn't your last
1152 opportunity to talk to us. You met some of our experts, hopefully you got their information.
1153 We're listening. You can email us. We had the Title 6 email address. Please feel free to reach out
1154 to us. Ah, we're here, this is just a start so that you can see us person to person. And um, so
1155 thank you for coming out. Thank you for TCEQ staff for speaking and also the school system
1156 for being here and our great interpreters for helping us. So, have a very good evening.

1157 Clapping audible